PREFACE ...................................................................................................................................................................i
Welcoming Speech .................................................................................................................................................. ii
Opening Speech .................................................................................................................................................... iii
Keynote Address ..................................................................................................................................................... vii
Quality Assurance Practices in Industry and Business: Implications for the Education Sector ................................................................. 1
Quality Assurance in the United Kingdom with Particular Reference to Scotland’s Enhancement-led Institutional Review (ELIR) ..................... 11
Institutional Self Evaluation: A pre-requisite for External Quality Audit .................................................................................. 34
Private Colleges and Leadership Efficiency of TVET with Particular Reference to Tigray ...................................................................... 48
Government Policies and Institutional Responsibilities of Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia ..................................................... 70
Perceptions of Public Educators about the Education and Training Provided by Private Colleges in Tigray ......................................................... 78
Partnership between Public and Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia: Some Key Policy Options ................................................................. 103
Public Private Partnership in Ethiopian Higher Education: an Analysis of the Support the Private Sector Needs to Fulfill its Potential Contribution to the Expansion of Higher Education ......................................................................................... 138
The Role of PHEls in Educational Provision and Organization for HRD & Socio-Economic Development ................................................................ 162
Cross-Border Provision of Higher Education: Challenges and Opportunities for Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia ......................................................................................... 181
The Relationship between Private Institutions of Higher Learning and Banking Industry in Addis Ababa ........................................................................ 200
A Comparative Study on the Impact of Instructor-Student Relationships, in Private and Government Higher Education Institutions on Students’ Learning: The Cases of St. Mary’s University College & Addis Ababa University, College of Commerce................................................................. 223

An Evaluation of the Implementation of Continuous Assessment (CA): The Case of St. Mary's University College ............................................................... 250

Student Engagement in Some Ethiopian Private Higher Education Institutions ........................................................................................................... 260

An investigation of the Major Causes of Student Attrition in St. Mary’s University College................................................................................................ 282

Personal Reflections on the Importance of Continuing Professional Development for Teaching Staff in Private Higher Education Institutions... 299

An Assessment of the Practicum as a Professional Development Among Private Higher Education Institutions in Tigray.............................................. 311

Developing Learner-Centered Approach Instructional Materials St. Mary’s University College’s Experience................................................................. 328

Closing Remarks........................................................................................................................................................................... 389
PREFACE

This proceeding is a compilation of papers presented at the 5th National Conference on Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia. The conference was organized and sponsored by St. Mary’s University College. The theme of the conference was “Private Higher Education in Ethiopia at the turn of the Ethiopian Millennium”.

In the conference held at the UN center on August 2007, local and international scholars presented various research papers. Members of the academia both from public and private institutions as well as other invited guests attended the forum. Some of the cross-cutting issues addressed were curriculum, methodology, assessment, quality assurance practices and perspectives, distance and cross border education and institutional partnership as well as governance in Higher Education Institutions.

In an opening speech, His Excellency Dr. Sintayehu Woldemichael, Minister of Education expressed his appreciation to St. Mary’s University College for having successfully organized such a conference for the fifth time in a row. None the less, he underscored the issue of quality and relevance of Higher Education as major challenges that ought to be addressed.

Ato Dagnachew Yilma, Board Chairman of the Association of Private Higher Education Institutions made a keynote address, explaining the growing share of the private sector in national Higher Education enrollment this day. Ato Dagnachew expressed the achievements, challenges and areas of improvements in the private sector and further mentioned the positive intervention made by the government to alleviate problems encountered by Private Higher Education Institutions.

With retrospection, the conference has given all participants a forum to reflect on the achievement and challenges of Higher Education in general and Private Higher Education Institutions in particular. The conference also enabled participants to define the tasks and the social responsibilities waiting ahead at the turn of the Ethiopian Millennium.

SMUC’s Center for Educational Improvement, Research and Quality Assurance acknowledges the contribution of all paper presenters and participants whose joint efforts have made the conference a success.
Welcoming Speech

(Wondwosen Tamrat; Asst. Prof)

Your Excellency Dr. Sintayehu W/Michael, Minister of Education,

Invited Guests,

Conference Participants,

Ladies and Gentlemen,

It is both an honor and a privilege for me and the St. Mary’s Community to welcome you all to the 5th National Conference on Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia.

This conference is held at a time when the Private Higher Education sector is observing a decade of service to the community, and the Ethiopian people are celebrating the coming of the third millennium. These are times when we will be reflecting on our achievements and challenges with a view to charting our future.

You are very well aware that, Private Higher Education is a recent phenomenon and an emerging sector in many parts of the world. To a large extent, the monopoly of public universities has been a common phenomenon for quite a considerable period of time. However, state sponsored development in general, and that of higher education in particular, was questioned from the 1980s onwards. As in many parts of the world, the 1990s saw the emergence of private sector institutions in Africa. It has been argued that this has been essentially the result of the deregulation policies adopted under structural adjustment programs, the financial incapacity of the state to expand Higher Education through public universities only, and the inability of public universities to respond immediately to market demand for certain marketfriendly courses. Currently this sector has become the fastest growing segment of higher education in many parts of Africa. The 2002 World Bank Report shows that between 1991 and 1999 only, 65 Private Universities were established in sub – Saharan Africa.
Although Ethiopia started after such countries as Kenya, Benin, Senegal, Tanzania, Uganda, Ghana, Mozambique and Cameroon, the private higher education sector has shown a remarkable growth within a single decade. The growth, in the last decade, of the Ethiopian private higher education sector is by far the highest in Africa and in some cases comparable to countries of transitional economies. If this growth is to be sustained, concerted efforts are needed from institutions, stakeholders and the government. Ethiopian Private Higher Education Institutions are expected to carry out their duties with a great sense of responsibility and commitment. Parents should ensure that value for money is high on their agenda. The Government should also treat the sector more as an alternative than a marginal academic appendix to the public sector.

In the last four conferences, St. Mary’s has managed to create similar forum where more than 100 research papers have been presented. We feel that the findings of the papers have been useful for policy makers, researchers, and the private sector by building a growing knowledge base in an area which has never been charted previously. This year’s conference adds 19 research papers including those from highly experienced local and international staff. The variety of papers presented will focus on such major issues as social responsibilities of PHEIs, Quality assurance practices and public private partnership. This conference, I hope, will give us another opportunity to reflect, at the turn of the Ethiopian Millennium on Ethiopia’s achievement in the private higher education sector. Our deliberations would also mean a lot in terms of determining the shape of the sector in the years to come.

I wish you a successful day and humbly request his Excellency Dr. Sintayehu W/Michael to declare the conference open.

I thank you for your attention.
Opening Speech

(His Excellency Dr. Sintayehu W/Michael State Minister of Education)

Dear Participants of this National Conference

Dear Organizers of the Conference

Ladies and Gentlemen,

First and foremost, I would like to express the great pleasure I feel this morning on behalf of the Ministry of Education and myself to be here to make a speech to this important national conference organized for the fifth time by St. Mary’s University College under the title “The 5th National Conference on Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia at the Turn of the Millennium”

Let me congratulate St. Mary’s University College on being successful in organizing continuously five annual national conferences at which various research papers that could help the Private Higher Education sector discharge its national responsibility are presented.

Ladies and Gentlemen:

It is almost sixty years since Higher Education in our country began. When we look into its present stage of development, we can understand that it has not substantially contributed towards the development of the country.

Prior to 1991, apart from its limited distribution and participation, Higher Education faced major challenges concerning quality and relevance. The training areas that were offered at that time were not evaluated in terms of their importance to the socio-economic development. In this respect, the curriculum was not, in a way, designed to address the acute problems of the country.
Up to the turn of 1991, there were only two universities in the country with their total number of students not more than 15,000 and their annual intake capacity of only 3,000. Of the two, the then Alemaya University of Agriculture, now Haramaya University, used to offer training only in agriculture-related areas of studies. The education and training policy that was put in place since 1994 has brought about a complete transformation of Higher Education in the country.

The multifaceted problems rolling in higher education for a number of years were adequately evaluated and strong remedial measures were taken. As a result, it has become possible to make a great leap in the sector. Higher Education Institutions nowadays are established across the country to ensure equitable distribution. The training areas are designed in harmony with the highly qualified manpower demand of the country for producing skilled labor force in order to effect the poverty reduction and fast economic development strategy. In this respect, various training fields have been opened in science and technology, medicine, agricultural engineering, horticulture and applied science; while, at the same time, strengthening the existing ones.

Ladies and Gentlemen:

As of recent years, private entrepreneurs have become beneficiaries following the favorable policy environment created for private investment. At the moment, there is an immense opportunity for private investors to work towards the development of the country and for their own benefit if they engage in education and training. To this effect, in a country where there was no a single private higher education institution 15 years ago, a large number of private colleges and university colleges have been opened. This has created education and job opportunities for a great number of people in its turn. To date, twenty-six private higher education institutions have been given pre-accreditation and accreditation to provide training in degree programs. This makes the number of degree offering private colleges over fifty.
Dear Conference Participants:

It is obvious that the participation of private investors in the education sector is quite seminal for the country and the investors as well. In this regard, there is a strong and a special need to be diligent toward producing highly qualified manpower ranging from enrollment to training and graduating students as they have a leading role in the country’s development endeavors.

Apart from the expansion of Higher Education, a special emphasis should be given to ensure its quality. The education provided in every Higher Education Institution is expected to be quality assured and eligible to produce efficient citizens built with knowledge, skills and scientific outlook for the international market.

Ladies and Gentlemen:

As I have tried to mention earlier, a wide range of work has been carried out following the government’s commitment to the expansion of Higher Education. The number of training fields and the intake capacity has increased massively. That doesn’t, at all, mean the Public Institutions would be able to produce sufficient manpower necessary for the efforts of ensuring sustainable national economy.

In this respect, the Private Higher Education Institutions have a tremendous role to play. With result-oriented activities, they should actively participate in areas where there is acute shortage of trained and skilled manpower in the country. It is well known that there are various training areas from which the country can benefit and which have not yet been offered so far. If the Private Higher Education Institutions work towards filling this gap, they would undoubtedly be demandable and effective.
As I have said earlier, I also like to reiterate now that Private Institutions have a vital contribution to the development endeavor of the country. While taking part in the development of higher education, they shoulder a prime social and national responsibility. Producing citizens built with scientific knowledge, patriotism, democratic principle and hardworking personality must be their primary objective. Their key concern should be with creating situations to be centers of conducting problem-solving researches and generating new ideas that can have a positive impact on nation building activities instead of running after profit.

**Ladies and Gentlemen:**

This conference whose theme is “Private Higher Education at the turn of the Ethiopian Millennium” shall have various research findings as its output. I do hope that participants will have in-depth deliberations on the research papers and gain valuable expertise.

Organizing a conference of this kind is quite essential to generate various new ideas necessary for national development through exploring ways of resolving problems. To this effect, I have a firm conviction that you would conduct an in-depth discussion during the course of the conference.

Finally, I would, once again, like to extend my gratitude to St. Mary’s University College for successfully organizing a conference of this type for the fifth time.

I wish you to have a fruitful conference and declare the conference officially open.
Keynote Address

(Ato Dagnachew Yilma; Chairperson, Private HEIs’ Association)

Excellency Dr. Sentayehu Wolde Michael, Minister of Education

Ladies and Gentlemen:

Higher education in Ethiopia has significantly been transformed during the last decade of the outgoing millennium. The number of Public Higher Education Institutions at the beginning of the last decade was only two, while there were literary no private providers. Now, at the turn of the new millennium, this number has increased to 21; and hundreds of Private Higher Education Institutions have emerged.

The FDRE in its Education Sector Development Program document has duly emphasized the need for expansion and massification of Higher Education with quality and relevance as a tool for the capacity building that is necessary to carry out the social and economic development endeavors of the country.

One salient aspect of this process is the rapid development of private provision of Higher Education. As in most countries, the phenomenon of privatization of higher education in Ethiopia is a logical consequence of the government’s inability to satisfy the growing needs of its citizens for post secondary education. Like elsewhere, these institutions took the responsibility to fill the gap created by the excessive demand over the supply.

Currently, higher education enrollment has exceeded the mark of 200,000 in both public and private institutions of higher learning. The share of the private sector has reached more than 22% according to the 2005/6 Education Statistics Annual Abstract published by the Ministry of Education. The participation of the private providers in Technical and Vocational Education and Training is by far higher than that of the public sector accounting for nearly 60% of the total trainee population. These official facts indicate that a central reality of expansion and massification is increasingly reliant on Private Higher
Education Institutions. When considering such developments, one shall take into consideration that these institutions are actively participating and are an integral part of the Ethiopian post secondary education system. In this respect, many issues need to be addressed. Among these are the availability of reliable information on the development of the private higher education sector, the impact of the labor market on the provision of Private Higher Education, and the role of Private Higher Education Institutions in the implementation of development and capacity building goals of the country.

However, Ethiopia's private institutions face problems typical of other countries where Private Higher Education is rapidly expanding. Despite government's vision about private provision and supportive policy, these institutions face a number of difficulties in their effort to play their role as development partners.

The problems include among other things:

1. Those related to attitude by different stakeholders manifested in the form of lack of recognition and appreciation for their role in the development of the country;
2. Lack of best and competent school leavers. Most applicants are students denied access to public institutions because of low scores at the school leaving certificate exams or university entrance tests;
3. Lack of appropriate teaching and learning environment due to the weak financial link in which these institutions historically emerged; and inability of the government to provide such support;
4. The imbalance between support and control, where control is prioritized over support;
5. Failure to implement the incentive mechanisms provided by law;
6. Discrepancy between Federal MoE and Regional Education Bureaus and/or between the latter offices in implementing the Higher education Bill; and
7. Failure to implement the TVET and Higher Education Bills of Ethiopia equally in both public and private institutions by the regulatory bodies.

These are only few examples. What is more important here is the positive intervention of the government to alleviate these problems in order to empower private institutions with the aim of helping them properly discharge their national duties. In this regard, it would be
most appropriate to consider the experience of Asian countries like India and China where
governments financially subsidize private institutions; and where they are neither
accredited nor approved by the government.

To overcome such challenges, these governments have put in place a variety of patterns of
support, control, supervision and qualification assessment mechanisms. In this regard, the
MoE and its regulatory bodies are urged to engage in stringent but fair and expedient
scrutiny not only for private institutions but for public institutions to ensure that the
investment made in the education sector would bring about a reasonable return for
individuals, the society and the government.

It is imperative that an emphasis be put on learning outcomes for developing outcome-
oriented systems as opposed to input-oriented systems of quality assurance and
enhancement induced in the dynamics of the relations between the private sector of Higher
Education and the Quality Assurance and Accreditation Systems. So far such dynamic
relationship has not been established between the quality assurance system and the private
institutions.

The theme of this year's National Conference on Private Higher Education in Ethiopia,
organized and sponsored by St. Mary's University College is “Private Higher Education in
Ethiopia at the Turn of the Ethiopian Millennium". The research items are expected to
dwell on the achievements of the private sector, the challenges faced so far and the way
forward. It is very important that the deliberations in this conference lead to a warm
discussion and debate on the above mentioned subjects with the objective of bringing about
a common understanding of the problems and coming up with positive suggestions that
would entail improvement for the engagement of private higher education for the
development of our beloved country.

Thank you
Quality Assurance Practices in Industry and Business: 
Implications for the Education Sector

Mesai Girma, 
Quality and standards authority of Ethiopia.

Abstract

"Quality" is, quite simply, what it takes to satisfy a customer. Quality is an attribute of a product or service which, as perceived by the customer, ensures that the product or service is attractive. Quality is not, as often assumed, an absolute property but rather a relative measure.

To managers of manufacturing and service organization, Quality is a good competitive tool which can win and keep customers as the life blood of their business. The achievement of a level of quality, which matches the expectations of the targeted customer group has a direct effect on long - term performance and has a much greater effect upon market share than does price. Most customers will pay to get the quality they desire, and this in turn generates profits.

An institution of Higher Education should be committed to the search for knowledge and its dissemination. Reference to the generic ISO Quality Management guideline indicates organizations that provide educational products should define their processes. These processes, which are multidisciplinary, include administrative services and other forms of support.

In this regard, standard criteria should be established for accrediting HEIs. These standards concentrate mainly on administrative and academic structure, curricular consistency, pedagogical competence, student accomplishment, ethical consciousness, environment conducive to learning, educational support ...etc

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------
1. Introduction

Our Lives depend on Products of different kinds. We meet them in a variety of contexts: Housing, Food, Communication, Health care, Education, etc. The products may be goods, which are concrete and tangible, or services, which are abstract and intangible. However, they are often combined in one product. For instance, education includes housing construction; educational includes housing construction, educational materials and the teaching service.

The reason why customers demand products is usually because they have certain requirements or needs they wish to satisfy. If a certain need is satisfied by a certain product, the customer will be satisfied and consider the product to be of an acceptable quality. If the product does not satisfy his or her needs, the customer will consider the product to be of poor quality.

Though we have tried to define quality on the basis of how needs are satisfied, it is important to note that needs can be stated directly by the customer (e.g. 1% fat milk) or indirectly by regulatory authorities (e.g. standards indicating level of contaminants in milk).

Thus, we can say, "Quality is the totality of characteristics of a product that bear on its ability to satisfy stated and implied needs".

The customer's perception of the product's quality could depend on how the product actually satisfies his/her expectations and demands (based on purpose, experience, price, good will and so on).

We may, therefore, also define, Quality as the ability of the product to satisfy customer expectations and demands". More objectively, the International Organization for
Standardization (ISO) has defined it as, "the degree to which a set of inherent characteristics fulfills requirements", a requirement being a need or expectation that is stated, generally implied or obligatory.

Two products which are used for the same purpose, but which are designed or specified in different ways could differ in Design (Specification) Quality. There would be a difference in their inherent capacity to satisfy stated or implied needs.

Design (Specification) quality is indicated in the design (specification) used when the product is manufactured or prepared.

A product may conform more or less closely to the design or specification. In such a case, the manufactured (conformance) quality may be said to be better or poorer.

Manufactured (Conformance) Quality may be defined as the degree of conformity between the product and the quality requirements for the product in question, which should be listed in the specifications.

To achieve the "right quality" an organization must actually know what the customer really wants (specification quality) and deliver the right product (conformance quality) which fit the purpose proposed by the customer at the right price and place. Often the desires of the customer may seem perverse, but if organizations are to be competitive, they must clearly understand and put customer needs at centre stage.

2. Evolution of the Quality Concept

It is generally recognized that the concept of quality has undergone some basic changes. The shift is from a traditional concept based on individual commitment to a modern
concept closely related to the overall management system. It is useful to follow these changes to gain some insight into the historical evolution of the concept of quality.

The concept of quality and the method for its achievement have evolved over many centuries. From the times of early civilization till the industrial revolution, quality was mainly the responsibility of the craftsman who conceived the product and made it for the market or to the order of a particular customer. With the beginning of the industrial revolution and the advent of factory production, quality progressively became the responsibility of the shop foreman or supervisor, who was usually picked up from among experienced workers and was responsible as well for production quantity.

The widespread of manufacturers interchangeable components was the starting point for the inspection departments in companies. They represented the separation of the quality and production functions and brought specialized inspectors and sophisticated measuring and testing equipment to the scene.

The dramatic increase in production, especially, of armaments during World War II lead to enhanced application of Statistical Quality Control which helped to reduce the huge cost of inspection work involved in military production.

The post-war period was characterized by an abundance of consumer products of different designs and strong competition between manufactures who wanted to win over more customers. The concept of quality changed again with the realization that customers’ satisfaction with a product or a service depended on nearly all activities carried out by different departments of a company that begin with the identification of the needs of the customer and continue till the assessment of whether those needs have been satisfied not. The different stages involved constitute what is called the quality loop, and the concept of dealing with all these activities to achieve quality was known as integrated quality control
or total quality control. These concepts prepared the way for two important concepts: quality assurance and total quality management.

*Quality assurance* should be understood as all activities needed to provide adequate confidence that a product or service will fulfill requirements for quality. *Total quality management* means a management approach centered on quality, based on the participation of all members and aiming at long-term success through customer satisfaction.

Currently quality is receiving increasing attention in industrial and commercial circles world-wide. In all the developed countries and in many developing countries, nation-wide quality programs have been established and are getting strong hold of organizational operations. The globalization of markets and the increasing liberalization of world trade are posing a serious challenge to the manufacturing and service sectors of developing countries, facing them increasing competition not only in export markets but also in domestic markets as well.

In order to survive amid these conditions, organizations need to become competitive. Competitiveness in markets rests on three bases: quality of products, their price and delivery time.

### 3. Quality in Education

Recent developments have brought the questions of quality and relevance of Higher Education at the forefront. Quality assurance and Accreditation both imply a search for ways and means of defining indicators to attest "quality" education.

In the education sector, quality is something that most people and organizations think they have, yet very few people can define what it is. People tend to think that the more expensive an educational service become, the better its quality will be. Quality is not a
function of how much a product costs, but rather how well a product consistently meets the expectations of those who purchase it. People always return to an establishment where performances tend to be consistent.

In an increasingly competitive marketplace, a number of HEI leaders and accrediting organizations are asking ways of improving quality of Higher Education. “Is there a better way to manage Higher Education?”

Today's students tend to choose HEIs which can offer better services, require lower costs, and have higher Quality. Parents now ask HEIs "What exactly are we paying for?" and they measure the quality of Higher Education in terms of their children's ability to get secured and well-paying jobs.

The bottom line is that parents and students are searching for HEIS that have gotten the message on price, access, and quality. HEIs can only build confidence in their customers through effective quality assurance systems which:

- Stipulateslear specification of roles, responsibilities, procedures;
- Enables institutional aims and objectives to be achieved;
- Informs decision making;
- Is free from individual bias;
- Is repeatable over time;
- Involves all staff;
- Includes the specification of standards and acceptable evidence;
- Prompts continuous improvement;

Higher Education Institutions are facing demands for increased societal relevance of teaching and research. They are forced to explicitly demonstrate to the society that they make effective and efficient use of their resources and that their activities are relevant to
the economy and the labor market. Therefore, quality and accreditation are major concerns in relation to education.

Quality systems in different forms are today an intrusive reality of the Ethiopian National Higher Education system and will be an important regulation and steering tool.

Today, there is an increasing diversity of rationales explaining why quality and the measurement of quality have assumed such an important role. Changing situations in Higher Education have a profound influence over the HEIs in their governance and management systems. However, there is an indisputable responsibility and legitimacy of HERQA in guaranteeing the quality of Higher Education.

4. Accreditation Methodologies

Accreditation is a process by which a given Higher Education Institution (HEI) is periodically submitted to an overall or partial evaluation of its educational activity. The aim of the evaluation is to determine whether and how the educational objectives of the institution are achieved. The results obtained should comply with certain standards which are specific to other comparable institutions of Higher Education at a given time.

The process of accreditation implies the action of an external accreditation body. This body, with the help of expert peers, assists HEIs which applied for accreditation in the evaluation and the improvement of their educational objectives. Finally, it reaches a decision as to the granting of the accreditation.
Types of Accreditation

One can distinguish between Institutional Accreditation and Specialized Accreditation, both to a large extent, being complementary.

Institutional Accreditation is the status granted to a higher education institution. It refers to the institutions, activities and programmes.

The elements listed below are evaluated during the process of Institutional Accreditation.

- Whether or not the objectives of the institution reflect its aims.
- Whether or not objectives are achieved satisfactorily.
- Whether or not the organization, the programmes, and the material and human resources meet objectives and satisfy standards.

There are standards for accrediting HEIs. One of these standards (ISO 9001:2000 in education) concentrates on processes, such as;

- strategic process to determine the role of the educational organization in the socio-economic environment;
- provision of the teaching capability of the learning providers;
- maintenance of the working environment;
- developing, reviewing and updating study plans and curricula;
- admission and selection of applicants;
- student's education follow-up and assessment;
- final assessment aimed to grant the student an academic degree, a degree that will be supported by a diploma, acknowledgement, bachelor's degree or certificate of competencies;
support services for the teaching-learning process carried out for the satisfactory accomplishment of their curricula, and support to the student until he/she can succeed in obtaining his/her academic degree or certificate;
- internal and external communication; and
- Measurement of educational processes.

**Specialized Accreditation** is the status granted to the distinct part of a Higher Education Institution (College, faculty, Program, etc). Specialized Accreditation is an assessment process resulting in defining the academic program, students’ capacity and aiming at assuring the fulfillment of the minimum quality elements of the educational processes at the level of the sector under consideration. The Academic Program would be assessed based on the specialized Accreditation Standard set.

In specialized accreditation, attention is paid to the following.

- Efficiency with regard to the achievement of the stated objectives;
- How the educational standards of quality are put in practice;
- The relations between the programs of the unit subject to evaluation and the program of the institution to which the unit belongs.

5. **Conclusion**

Generally speaking, the management of our HEIs relies upon systems which have taken decades to evolve. The traditional system is bureaucratic. Administrations apply and interpret rules. Managers devise the rules and persuade others to accept them.

The general situation being as such, we have not been entirely complacent in dealing with issues of quality, standards and accreditation in education.
Since its establishment, the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA) has introduced a range of strategies to ensure that the quality of educational product, academic support and student care are of the highest possible standard. A core strategic
goal for HERQA is to have quality systems in place to support the management, planning, internal and external auditing and legislative compliance of HEIs whilst ensuring students satisfaction.

There is a real difficulty in defining quality in the areas of learning and teaching, as outcomes are complex and not easily identifiable or quantifiable. If the quality agenda is intended to assure the public that the standards of our HEIs are largely comparable across the system, then we should look to a process-driven Quality Assurance in Higher Education. One such Quality System is the ISO 9001 Generic Standard.

The ISO 9001 Quality Management System Standard includes all aspects of the administration and management of a Higher Education Institution. It ensures that processes are regularly reviewed and optimized through structured evaluation of processes and outcomes. A major thrust of ISO 9001 is about documenting processes and being able to demonstrate that these processes are followed.

The importance placed on Accreditation in Higher Education would dominate the way HEIs operate in terms of management structures and in monitoring and evaluation of their learning, teaching and research.

Accreditation is a good closed loop approach to quality assurance, which looks not only at the processes but defines the expected outcome. The audit process is used as a means of assessing whether the HEI has performed its measurable functions adequately.

The aim of the accreditation process in explicit terms should thus be;

1. To assess whether the education, training and professional development programs of HEIs being reviewed:
   - are relevant to the objective and outcomes determined by the HEI,
   - are appropriate in terms of modern educational methods and practices.
2. To encourage further improvements and developments in the program being accredited and so enhance its educational quality.

3. To provide an opportunity for the HEI being accredited to review and self-assess its program.

4. To be focused on the achievement of objectives, maintenance of academic standards, public expectations and good outputs and outcomes rather than on detailed specification of curriculum content.

Reference:
NSAI (National Standards Authority of Ireland) 2000, ISO 9001 – Quality Management System.
Quality Assurance in the United Kingdom with Particular Reference to Scotland’s Enhancement-led Institutional Review (ELIR)

Philip Rayner

Abstract

In the past few years the United Kingdom has been undergoing a process of reassessment and development of its approaches to quality assurance, in particular there is a growing recognition amongst researchers that many commonly used quality assurance methodologies do not necessarily result in increased quality. This paper reviews recent research and the strengths and weaknesses of the main quality assurance methods that have been used in the UK in recent years, including inspection, institutional review, collaborative provision audit, professional accreditation and academic review.

The paper then focuses on enhancement-led institutional review (ELIR) currently being piloted in the Scottish higher education sector. The underlying philosophy of ELIR is examined and the five main elements of ELIR are explained:

A comprehensive framework of internal review at the subject level within the higher education institution. An agreed set of public information provided by the institution. The effective involvement of students in quality management. Quality enhancement engagements. These take the form of a structured programme of engagements each year which will involve the sector in a series of developmental activities on themes selected by the sector.

The institutional review process.

Finally the paper considers the benefits and costs of ELIR and what the Ethiopian higher education sector may learn from the Scottish experience.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Introduction:

The United Kingdom’s Higher Education sector is devolved to the four constituent countries of England, Scotland, Wales, and Northern Ireland (NI). Each country has its own funding system and quality assurance regime, with the UK’s national quality
assurance agency, the Quality Assurance Agency (QAA), having oversight of all quality assurance within higher education in the UK.

In line with many other countries, the UK’s higher education sector has been required to give increasing attention to the management of quality assurance. Becket and Brookes (2006:123) suggest various reasons for this:

- a growing climate of accountability;
- an expansion in the size of student populations;
- an increasingly diverse student population resulting from widening participation initiatives and targeting international markets;
- diminishing resources with which to deliver programmes of study;
- the increasingly competitive nature of higher education;¹
- greater expectations of students as paying customers;
- more flexible provision at both undergraduate and postgraduate level; and
- An increase in collaborative provision between institutions.

Most of these will be familiar to those working in higher education in Ethiopia and most, in varying degrees, will apply to the Ethiopian Higher Education sector, both public and private.

Although the need and benefits of some kind of quality assurance system both across the sector as a whole as well as internally within higher education institutions (HEIs) is now almost universally accepted in Ethiopia, there is still debate about what kind of quality assurance system should be implemented, what should be the particular purposes and focus of a quality assurance system and what methods would work best.

¹ This may already exist for private higher education institutions but does not yet exist for public higher education institutions in the way that it occurs in the UK for example, where universities have to actively compete for students and where funding depends upon student numbers. However with the establishment of the new public universities in Ethiopia prospective students in some areas of the country will have two or three possible universities close by.
Becket and Brookes (2006) review various approaches to quality assurance in the UK HE system and suggest that there is no consensus on how to measure quality in higher education and quality can be interpreted and measured in a number of different ways.

Both Whalen (2004) and Harvey and Newton (2004) suggest that assessing the impact of external quality evaluations in terms of quality improvement is difficult and that there is no clear evidence that the various quality assurance methods currently being used actually result in the raising of quality or lead to the effective transformation of the student learning experience. Elton (2001) suggests that assurance in itself is a negative concept:

…which can at best ensure that things are done well, but it can never ensure that things are done better or that better things are done (Elton 2001 quoted in Hodgkinson and Kelly 2007:79).

On the other hand, the main stakeholders in higher education expect some kind of evaluation in regard to the quality of provision offered by higher PHEIs and want reassurance that this provision is meeting their needs and expectations. For example Government will want to know that public money is being spent effectively and that PHEIs are meeting Government goals (in the case of Ethiopia, ESDPIII and the Sustainable Development and Poverty Reduction Programme (SDPRP)). Employers will want reassurance that PHEIs are producing graduates that meet the needs of the country’s industries and services. For faculty, quality assurance processes should be seen as an opportunity to promote and share good practice and to learn from others. (For more discussion on stakeholder expectations and the tensions that might occur in Ethiopian higher education see Rayner and Teshome, 2005).

In the past few years, the UK has been undergoing a process of reassessment and development of its approaches to quality assurance. Recent research (see for example Becket and Brookes 2006, Hodgkinson and Kelly 2007 or Harvey and Newton 2004)
suggests that ‘it is quality as transformational that is most closely aligned with quality enhancement activities’ (Becket and Brookes 2006:127) and that ‘Quality assurance should follow from quality enhancement’ (Hodgkinson and Kelly 2007:79). This has meant moving away from a system largely based on external inspection to one which encourages an internally-driven system that encourages HEIs to be more self-reflective and fosters a culture of continuous improvement and enhancement.

Traditionally the main quality assurance methods used, in various combinations, in England, Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland have been inspection, institutional audit, collaborative provision audit, professional accreditation or academic review.

Inspection

The use of inspection, where provision is assessed against externally set benchmarks, is largely being phased out in the UK higher education sector, except for initial teacher training but even for inspection-heavy regimes such as the Office for Standards in Education, Children's Services and Skills (OFSTED) which looks at teacher training provision the penetrative element of inspection is being replaced by a ‘lighter touch’ inspection and a more reflective approach. One of the problems with inspection is that it is based on the assumption that the ‘centre knows best’ and can determine content and methodology better than institutions themselves. This is untrue in a system where the centre does not have enormous experience and capacity in the subjects being looked at. In addition, a regime of inspection tends to lead to uniformity, a lack of innovation and a tendency to aim for mechanical compliance, where what gets measured is fixed (usually in the short term) to meet inspection targets.

It is also a methodology that is often seen as threatening and therefore unlikely to foster an atmosphere of cooperation, innovation or improvement. It is heartening to see that in Ethiopia the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Assurance
Agency (HERQA) has chosen not to develop as an inspection body but rather as an Agency that ‘aims to support an HEI by recognizing its good practices and by indicating areas where changes in practice can enhance the quality and relevance of its activities.’ (HERQA 2006:5)

**Institutional audit**

HERQA is currently in the process of undertaking a series of institutional quality audits of public HEIs and like HERQA much of the quality assurance system in England, Wales and NI is based on some kind of institutional audit based on the institution’s own internal self-evaluation.

This is a methodology that focuses on institution’s own quality assurance systems and the extent that the institution’s faculty and managers ‘know’ what is going on. Institutional audit looks mainly at processes and systems and their follow up rather than actual provision. Although in the case of HERQA there is some observation of teaching, the observation is not to evaluate teachers but to gain some knowledge of the teaching/learning situation. A problem identified in (say) minutes will be followed through an audit paper trail in order to ensure that the institution has followed up, monitored and rectified the problem identified. The same goes for institutional policies. Minutes and other documents will be looked at to see if there is evidence that policies are understood, being implemented and monitored. Some interviews with academic and support staff as well as students will occur to verify the written record.

This methodology is particularly suited to a mature higher education system where there is already a reservoir of experience and understanding in regard to quality assurance principles and practices and where, for example, everyone is confident that the content and methodology is satisfactory or better. This implies that all staff at all levels are at least familiar with, and hopefully committed to, the principles of quality assurance.
For example, in England where virtually all subject level assessments showed good quality, it is safe to assume that looking at institution-wide systems would be sufficient.

Ethiopia’s HEIs may not yet be sufficiently mature in internal quality assurance attitudes and processes for this institutional audit to provide reassurance as to the quality thresholds in individual HEIs. However, it is a good starting point and when used in conjunction with institutional self evaluations the institutional audit seems to offer a good basis to start building awareness of quality assurance issues amongst managers, faculty, support staff and students and will hopefully eventually lead to a more mature sector and more robust quality assurance attitudes and processes.

**Collaborative provision audit**

England and NI also have a process called collaborative provision audit. This looks at how a university monitors and assesses quality in its partner organizations (generally further education colleges, the equivalent of TVET. In the UK these offer some higher education equivalent to years 1 and 2 of a degree – called foundation degrees). This already occurs in one or two instances in Ethiopia where courses and qualifications are ‘franchised’ from overseas universities such as Curtin University of Technology in Australia. Currently it is the awarding university that takes responsibility for assessing quality thresholds for its courses taught at Addis Ababa University (AAU) for AAU students. Another example is the joint MSc in Forestry run at Wondo Genet College of Forestry, this was originally franchised by the Swedish Agricultural University who had responsibility for ensuring satisfactory quality but over time this responsibility has been taken over by Wondo Genet College itself.

As yet I am not aware of any similar franchising arrangements for Private Higher Education Institutions (PHEIs) but hopefully this will come in the future and the management of the PHEIs need to be aware that they will be judged by the processes and
Collaborative provision might also occur in Ethiopia if or when public and private HEIs offer joint degrees. For example, if MicroLink Info-technology College offered the first two years of an IT course where students then transferred to AAU for their final year where would the responsibility for quality assurance lay? With AAU as the awarding body? With MicroLink Info-technology College? Or could HERQA play a role? The answer I suspect is that AAU would be required to take responsibility, that MicroLink Info-technology College would be happy to share this responsibility and that HERQA might have a ‘light touch’ oversight role to ensure that quality assurance was being undertaken as intended.

**Professional Accreditation**

Other methods of quality assurance in UK include professional accreditation systems which focus on content and skills development to meet criteria set by a professional body to do a particular job or enter a particular profession. This looks only at subject level and is less interested in the institutional arrangements. It is not undertaken by the state or its agencies but rather by professional or trade associations. For example, degree courses in the training of journalists at University of Gloucestershire (my university in the UK) are accredited by the National Council for the Training of Journalists, an industry-based organization that sets certain standards and criteria for the ‘proper’ training of journalists (this includes curriculum, technical resources, library facilities and the background and qualifications of the teaching staff). With this accreditation it is easier to recruit students, students are recognized within the industry, are seen to have reached defined levels of skills and knowledge and therefore have a better route into employment.
In Ethiopia, at present it is not clear as to the capabilities of professional bodies to undertake this type of work and it may be possible that some professional accreditation does take place. However it is something that should be developed further in the future. It may be that in the interim a trial programme of professional accreditation can be undertaken for one particular subject area, perhaps a branch of engineering or business studies, using contacts and expertise already available in Ethiopia, for example the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit GmbH (GTZ) and The Center for Excellence in Engineering (CEE) or the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants (ACCA). The Ethiopian IT Development Association has been working at benchmarks for IT curricula while the Ministry of Health are looking to develop 'professional examinations' that graduates must gain before they can practice.

**Academic review**

All Higher Education provision in all four countries, England, Scotland, Wales and NI, was, until a few years ago, subject to regular review subject by subject. This was called academic review and still takes place for a few selected colleges in England and Scotland.

Academic review is the subject-level, peer review process that includes observation of teaching and direct observation of resources etc. This has now largely been superseded as it was found that nearly all university departments were qualifying for top or near top marks (21+ out of a possible maximum score of 24) and therefore it was no longer managing to discriminate between excellent and less satisfactory departments. It is still used in England however for directly funded Higher Education in further education colleges (TVET equivalent) offering higher education where quality remains variable and cannot be assumed. Academic review has been a useful mechanism to drive up standards, but it was found to be resource intensive and to take time and effort away from teaching and towards compliance, trying to anticipate the ‘correct’ answer.
For the Ethiopian Higher Education sector this might be too time consuming and expensive. Lack of staff expertise might also be a problem but academic review could perhaps be trialed in selected areas; for example, in health where organizations like the Carter Centre might be able to provide additional help and expertise.

**Enhancement-led institutional review (ELIR)**

In Scotland the main emphasis is now on a methodology called Enhancement-led institutional review (ELIR) introduced in 2003. It was felt that a new approach was required because previous external quality assurance activities had demonstrated that, in general, Scottish Higher Education institutions had in place effective quality management systems relating to the experience of students and the standards of their awards, and that the subject provision experienced by students was highly satisfactory or better. This meant that the next phase was to try and develop a quality assurance methodology that, not only encouraged the sector to build upon existing strengths and good practice, but also imbedded a system and culture that aims to produce an ethos of continuous enhancement of current provision.

ELIR takes the aims of the HEI as the starting point and looks at both the systems for quality assurance and actual experience of students and the provision of teaching and learning. The measuring stick is not an external one, but rather what the institution is trying to do and how it is seeking to enhance its performance and standards. ELIR is based on the premise that individual HEIs can be trusted and should be allowed considerable autonomy in determining their own quality assurance thresholds. In Ethiopia public HEIs are still learning how to use the autonomy granted to them in the 2003 Higher Education Proclamation and this notion of autonomy also has consequences for the Ministry of Education and the way it interacts with the Higher Education sector (see Teshome Yizengaw, 2007).
There is an underpinning assumption that the Scottish Higher Education is a ‘mature’ sector where:

- Institutions take a responsible approach to the maintenance of quality and standards;
- Ownership of quality and standards issues rests with the institutions and not with the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council (SHEFC), or with the QAA;
- Institutions are committed to the principle of continuous quality enhancement;
- Students should have a major involvement in internal and external quality processes;
- Students and other stakeholders should have access to relevant public information about the nature and quality of provision.

While there are commonalities of purpose, each Higher Education institution in Scotland has its own unique mission and will seek to meet the needs of its own particular students in its own particular ways. The ELIR strategies of individual institutions can, therefore, be designed to reflect these particular characteristics and the review process should engage with the enhancement of the particular learning experiences of students, in the context of the particular institution. This means that institutions are given both autonomy and responsibility to ensure quality provision but it is also the HEI’s responsibility to provide public information about the nature and quality of that provision.

ELIR requires HEIs to ask themselves 3 questions:

- **Where are we now?** How effective is the current learning experience of our students?
• **Where do we want to be in the future?** What are the patterns and mechanisms of supporting learning which the institution wishes to develop in order to enhance the learning experience of its students?

• **How are we going to get there?** How are we as an institution going strategically to manage the processes of enhancement that will allow us to move towards meeting our aspirations?

This new methodology is based upon a model of a high quality Higher Education system that is seen to contain the following key characteristics:

• A sector which is flexible, accessible, and responsive to the needs of learners, the economy and society;

• A sector which encourages and stimulates learners to participate in higher education and to achieve their full potential;

• A sector where learning and teaching promotes the employability of students;

• A sector where learning and teaching is highly regarded and appropriately resourced;

• A sector where there is a culture of continuous enhancement of quality, which is informed by and contributes to international developments.

This list may be contestable; for example, there is no direct reference to research and it is unclear to what extent research is implicit in the other activities listed. However, it does assume that HEIs are intrinsically committed to quality assurance and continuous improvement. It also puts learners firmly at the centre of activities.

ELIR does this by placing the student learning experience at the centre of its methodology. This is partly facilitated by the involvement of student members in review teams within the institutional review process; the requirement that students are represented at all levels within institutions and that there is training and support for student representatives on the review teams.
The ELIR model consists of five inter-related elements:

1. **A comprehensive framework of internal review at the subject level within the higher education institution.**

The nature of internal reviews will be decided by individual institutions but will share certain agreed features including the use of trained reviewers and as well as externality within review teams.²

For example, HEIs would need to ensure themselves that there is evidence that their quality enhancement systems are understood and used by all internal stakeholders, that there are processes in place for monitoring and adapting practice and that systems of consultation and participation are in place.

For Ethiopia to undertake this kind of review would require a pool of subject level specialists who were inducted and trained as peer reviewers and who could function as both internal and external reviewers. This will happen naturally as the work of HERQA develops but it would also be beneficial if national subject groups could be established to network, to share knowledge and practice and to perhaps set criteria for peer review. There could also be some discussion about the benefits of introducing something similar to the UK’s system of external examiners. This practice already exists in faculties of medicine in Ethiopia but needs to be expanded, perhaps informally at first. This could perhaps be trialed in one or two particular subject areas such as Health (again perhaps with the assistance of the Carter Centre) and might be able to attract donor funding to assist in the development.

² The QAA guide to ELIR for staff in Scottish HEIs at [http://www.qaa.ac.uk/education/ELIR/Staff%20leaflet%20version%202.pdf](http://www.qaa.ac.uk/education/ELIR/Staff%20leaflet%20version%202.pdf)
An agreed set of public information provided by the institutions.\textsuperscript{3}

For example HEIs are required to provide evidence that public knowledge of institutional practices and achievements is well founded and fair and that prospectuses tell students about how to be involved.

In Ethiopia this might include

- information for prospective students including admission arrangements and requirements, details of curricula, flexibility of course choice and the career options available to students for individual awards;
- information for current students including the curriculum coverage of their course and how it is delivered and assessed, complaints procedures and much of what is covered by information for prospective students;
- information for employer and employer organizations such as what knowledge and skills graduates with different awards will have achieved; details of industrial links and how institutions ensure curricula are up-to-date; and
- information for HERQA including the program and outcomes of internal subject review and the institution's strategy for quality enhancement (these could be based on the institution’s self evaluation).

Much of this is already provided in various forms and in variable quality by HEIs in Ethiopia but the question is how can this be improved?

2. The effective involvement of students in quality management.

This seems to represent one of the main innovations in the ELIR quality assurance process. The direct involvement of students in the review process would require similar

\textsuperscript{3} Guidance notes on public information for Scottish HEIs in provided at http://www.sfc.ac.uk/information/info_circulars/shefc/2003/he1903/he1903.html
induction and training to that undertaken by subject reviewers. In this case, it might be
the Association of Private Higher Education Institutions and/or HERQA to undertake the
necessary training for a trial group of student taken from the existing Student Councils to
work as external reviewers. ELIR also presumes that there is systematic representation of
students at all levels within institutions and that they have a place (and more importantly
a voice) on the relevant committees.ª

PHEIs would be expected to provide evidence that problems identified by students are
addressed and rectified, that students have a variety of ways of reporting on their
experiences, the role of the student representative is valued and rewarded and that
learning and teaching is a positive experience for students.

Experience in Scotland suggests that students find involvement in a review of a positive
experience (see the QAA interim report ‘Learning from ELIR’) but its success is
dependant upon student representatives who are prepared to speak out and ask questions
and check claims made by faculty and management. This might be difficult in a more
deverential culture such as Ethiopia. There would certainly have to be checks to ensure
that students did not feel threatened or penalized if they asked difficult questions.

3. Quality enhancement engagements.

These take the form of a structured program of engagements each year which will
involve the sector in a series of developmental activities on themes selected by the sector.
These themes may be drawn from the outcomes of internal and external reviews and the
outcomes of these engagements are likely to impact on the reflections of institutions as
they consider their own quality enhancement strategies.

ª The QAA has produced a student guide to becoming involved in ELIR is available at
There are currently six themes for the period 2005-2010:

- Integrative assessment, in particular 'Optimizing the Balance between Formative and Summative Assessment'
- The first year and how it can be developed as a transformative experience for students.
- Research-teaching linkages or on enhancing the learning experience of students through (widely-defined) research activities
- The effective learner
- The inclusive curriculum
- Progression and success.

The outcomes from each of these themes will be circulated to the sector both as downloads but also in hard copy and should provide the sector with good quality guidance. HEIs will then be expected to show evidence that teaching staff have learned and developed their skills by using the enhancement themes as a resource and that there is a clear relationship between the enhancement themes and the institutional practices and policies.\(^5\)

Again this might be something that would be useful to the Ethiopian higher education sector, for example the Association of Private Colleges and Universities or HERQA might, after consultation, nominate a particular theme and ask HEIs to focus on this for the next few years. It could, for example, be a means of getting all public information provided by HEIs up to a common format and satisfactory threshold. The Association of Private Colleges and Universities or HERQA could use their international contacts (such as the International Network for Quality Assurance Agencies in Higher Education

---

\(^5\) Details of the work undertaken so far on the first three themes is available at http://www.enhancementthemes.ac.uk/about/fiveYear.asp.
(INQAAHE)) to provide similar material from other countries as examples of good practice.

4. The institutional review process.

This is a peer review process which, while providing information on the security of the institution's management of quality and standards, is focused on the institution's strategic management of quality enhancement.6

HEIs are required to provide evidence that schools and departments are pro-active in setting their own agenda for ELIR, that it is used to improve institutional systems for the support of teaching and learning and that there is connectivity and coherence between the various sectors of the institution and their activities in the pursuit of quality.

The guidance that HERQA supplies on the institutional review process may be more appropriate and useful than that offered by the QAA and as with internal review a pool of trained reviewers will need to be developed as the work of HERQA develops.

‘Benefits’ and ‘costs’ of ELIR

According to critics, such as Harvey and Newton (2004), many external quality evaluation systems are too heavy-handed; they try to measure everything, they are expensive to implement (both for HEIs and the Agency), they are time consuming and are often punitive in character. External quality evaluation systems are also sometimes used as a means of ensuring compliance or, in the case of PHEIs, of control and as a limit to expansion. They also argue that they ignore ‘the complexity and the wider socio-political context of the quality phenomenon’ (Harvey and Newton 2004). They argue that

6 A copy of the handbook for ELIR is available at http://www.qaa.ac.uk/reviews/ELIR/handbook/scottish_hbook.pdf.
it is unclear what evidence there is for supposing the extent to which external quality evaluations improve academic quality:

Much seems to be taken for granted. What is the fundamental object of the evaluation, for example? Is it the educational provider, or the specific program, or the learner, or the output of the program or institution? Often this is unclear. While talking about the quality of the learner experience, most approaches seem to examine the provision. That’s a bit like evaluating the quality of a football match for spectators by examining the stadium, the pitch, the team sheet and the credentials of the coach. (Harvey and Newton 2004:150).

Others, such as Hodgkinson and Kelly (2007) and Elton (2001), suggest that a quality assurance model based on the notion of ‘fitness for purpose’ will focus largely on the quality of processes and in particular the learning experience for students rather than focusing on outcomes and what opportunities for enhancement can be identified and acted upon.

Many quality assurance systems have been criticized in that they do not encourage HEIs to improve or enhance current provision but rather result in them setting up complex systems that focus on the reporting on provision without engaging with it. According to Elton (2001),

- An institution dedicated to quality enhancement will provide quality assurance as a by-product; one dedicated to quality assurance has no incentive to extend this to quality enhancement.
- Quality enhancement can only happen if it is a credibly declared part of the mission of an institution. (Elton 2001 quoted in Hodgkin and Kelly 2007:79)

ELIR seems to offer the opportunity for the quality assurance process to form an intervention with current provision (part of the ‘What are we doing now?’ question) and
reflect on the ways in which this current provision may be improved (the ‘Where do we want to be in the future?’ question) and how to achieve those improvements (the ‘How are we going to get there?’ question). According to Harvey and Newton (2004) the outcome of the quality assurance process should be strategic and creative policies based on sound evidence rather than third-party reports.

It is also questionable how useful much of the data generated through current quality assurance methods are or the extent to which they are accessible and comprehensible to one of higher education’s main stakeholders, parents and students. They can find it difficult to work through large jargon-laden documents. This is why, for example, league tables are popular although I would not wish to endorse this practice.

It must, however, be recognized that there will be costs as well as benefits in choosing ELIR as a preferred method of quality assurance.

Enhancement comes about as a result of change which may include innovation and therefore risk. If properly designed and managed, institutions should be able to undertake new ways of doing things in a way that provides safeguards for current students and the overall health of the HEI. However, this is sometimes a tricky balance and the introduction of innovation can lead to short term difficulties before the longer term benefits are realized.

The state will have lesser control over content than with (say) inspection. The students and other stakeholders will have less information at subject level (except where a particular subject has been sampled in the review) than in an academic review. ELIR is more resource intensive (especially for the HEI) than institutional audit, and gives a qualitative picture of provision and its quality. This makes league tables and other simplistic comparisons impossible. It also frustrates some bureaucratic purposes, such as the funding of higher education according to quality assessments. Essentially the result is a subjective, but nonetheless valid, narrative about quality in the institution with
suggestions for areas to develop and improve and descriptions of good practice, rather a quasi pseudo objective ‘score’, or simplistic ‘excellent’, ‘good’, ‘satisfactory’, ‘poor’ results. Where the narrative uncovers a deep and systemic problem, the review can, nonetheless, require that the issue is rectified within a specified time or sanctions may be applied. The philosophy behind this review methodology is that, if the institution has identified its own weaknesses, and has a realistic plan to overcome them that is being implemented and monitored, it should be commended rather than criticized. This spirit encourages openness and collaboration rather than ‘playing the game’ which is often a problem with other methodologies.

In Ethiopia it seems unlikely that the Government through the Ministry of Education would relinquish all its power and influence over the higher education sector but it could, for example, exercise inappropriate influence over the higher education sector through HERQA and the ‘themes’ that the sector might be asked to address.

ELIR will not work where the institutional ethos of a HEI is to be satisfied with mediocrity; ELIR is premised on the desire within an institution for continuous improvement.

**Evaluation so far…**

Whilst recognizing that ELIR is still at a prototype stage in Scotland and the results have yet to be fully assessed it is possible to suggest that some key lessons can be learnt, namely that there are clear advantages if the principles of enhancement and improvement are integral to quality assurance systems and built into the system from the outset. As Hodgkinson and Kelly note:

The most significant aspect…in taking forward these models, processes and approaches is the importance of organizational culture. It is argued that…introducing any model,
process or approach will not, in itself, create or sustain a quality enhancement culture. To achieve this, appropriate structures, communication channels, the involvement of all individuals at all levels and from all aspects of a school's work need to be included. The enhancement of the school's work must be accepted as an on-going priority by everyone. (Hodgkinson and Kelly 2007:84).

It is also clear that developing a culture of systematic quality improvement across an institution or across a sector is a long and difficult process. However, according to the QAA’s interim report, the first three years of ELIR is resulting in the development of institutional strategies for quality enhancement that are driving policy development as well as practice that is increasingly learner centered.7

**Lessons for Ethiopia**

In Scotland, as in the rest of the UK, quality assurance is an established and mature system that can largely assume sophistication in HEIs regarding their quality assurance management and systems. This is not yet the case in Ethiopia.

In Ethiopia, HERQA is still a new organization and HEIs are still establishing their internal quality assurance systems. In the Ethiopian context quality assurance could be said to have a different focus and purpose i.e., to prove to stakeholders that the sector is accountable, has a sound and reliable quality assurance system and is training graduates to meet the needs of the country. However, there needs to be a continuing debate about what kind of quality assurance system would be best for Ethiopia, its particular purpose and focus and what methods would work best. (Clearly conferences such as this are an important contributor to that debate.)

---

7 The interim report is available at http://www.qaa.ac.uk/reviews/ELIR/learningFromElir/learningFromElir.pdf.
It is important, therefore, that to this end all HEIs in Ethiopia, whether public or private, address the status of quality assurance within their institutions. There is much guidance available from both HERQA and the Educational Quality Improvement Program (EQUIP) either in person, through workshops or through documents available in hard copy or downloadable from the website www.higher.edu.et.

In addition HEIs need to ensure that:

- Quality assurance has clear lines of responsibility, reporting and accountability to senior managers (President and Vice President level) to ensure that a holistic view can be developed. In future, the HEI’s committee structure might be modified to reflect a more collegiate approach to the learning experience, for example, by having a quality assurance committee of the Senate.
- Quality assurance has adequate resources (office, support, and staff) to do the job properly and quality assurance should not just be another tasks added to existing and already over-stretched resources.
- Quality assurance is understood and valued across the HEI and Faculty Deans play a particularly important role in ensuring that both ‘top-down’ and ‘bottom-up’ communication and understanding takes place.
- Quality assurance is collaborative with all staff and students developing a sense of ownership of the enhancement process.
- In public HEIs Academic Development and Resource Centers (ADRCs), although not responsible for quality assurance and enhancement in HEIs, are key resources and need to be funded appropriately.
Finally

Debates about quality assurance in Higher Education not only need to address questions of what is being reviewed but also who is doing it. Good and effective quality assurance systems will only really develop when those who review, the who, are also the what – in other words the quality assurance process has to be internalized, self-reflective and owned by those who make up the organization being reviewed. One of the central roles of HERQA is to ‘encourage and assist the growth of an organizational culture in Ethiopian Higher Education that values Quality and is committed to continuous improvement’ (HERQA 2006:3). In this context, ELIR may offer a useful model that could be adapted to the Ethiopian context.

ELIR claims to be unique in many respects:

- in its balance between quality assurance and enhancement;
- in the emphasis which it places on the student experience;
- in its focus on learning and not solely on teaching;
- in the spirit of cooperation and partnership which has underpinned all these developments.

ELIR presents an opportunity for Ethiopia to learn from the experiences of other more developed quality assurance systems, to learn from their philosophies, practices and methodologies, to decide what works for the Ethiopian context and to produce something that meets the needs of Ethiopia’s expanding higher education sector as well as contributing to the poverty-reduction program of the country.
References


See also:

INQAAHE [www.inqaahe.org](http://www.inqaahe.org)

HERQA [www.higher.edu.et](http://www.higher.edu.et)

QAA [www.qaa.ac.uk](http://www.qaa.ac.uk)
Institutional Self Evaluation: A pre-requisite for External Quality Audit

Tesfaye Teshome,
Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency

Abstract

The Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA) is mandated to assure the quality of public and private Higher Education in Ethiopia. Quality assurance agencies use the term 'quality assurance' to denote different practices. Each practice serves different purposes to suit the national contexts in which agencies operate and the purposes they desire to serve. Although the approaches differ to suit the national contexts, the basic essentials are similar and have the following common features: they base their quality assessment on predetermined and transparent criteria; they use an institutional self evaluation and an external review; they emphasize public disclosure of the outcomes and declare the outcomes valid for a specific period of time.

Most often quality assurance agencies follow a three stage process in their attempt to assure quality. The first stage requests higher education institutions to prepare a self-evaluation report and provide relevant information on the quality of educational programs they offer related to predetermined and well publicized criteria. The second stage focuses on a site visit by a team of external quality auditors to validate the self-evaluation report. The third stage is the final decision by the agency on the review team’s recommendations and disclosure of the audit outcome. To that end, the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency has reviewed experiences of quality agencies in selected countries and developed and publicized criteria for quality assurance in HEIs in Ethiopia.

To date seven public universities have carried out and submitted self evaluation reports to the agency and two universities have been audited. These are important steps in the development of quality assurance for higher education in the country and are learning experiences for all concerned. The agency and all HEIs are expected to continue to work hard to improve the quality of the self-evaluation reporting and in providing relevant information for judging the quality of institutions and their programs.

This paper describes the basic elements of the first stage of HERQA’s quality assurance system: a self-evaluation report of a Higher Education institution as a pre-requisite for an external quality audit. It outlines the purposes of an institutional self-evaluation, deals with the quality focus areas, the procedures to be followed for self-evaluation, the self-evaluation report and its use for quality enhancement.

--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
Introduction

The Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA) is mandated to assure the quality of Higher Education provided by public and private institutions in Ethiopia: (Higher Education Bill, No351/2003). Most quality assurance agencies use the term ‘quality assurance’ to denote different practices. Each practice serves different purposes to suit the national contexts in which agencies operate and the purpose they desire to serve. Although, the approaches differ to suit the national contexts the basic essentials are similar and have the following common features: they base their quality assessment on predetermined and transparent criteria; they use an institutional self evaluation and an external review; they emphasize public disclosure of the outcomes and declare the outcomes valid for a specific period of time (UNESCO, 2006).

Most often quality assurance agencies follow a three stage process in their attempt to assure quality. The first stage requests Higher Education institutions to prepare a self-evaluation report and provide relevant information related to predetermined and well publicized criteria on the quality of educational programs they offer. The second stage focuses on a site visit by a team of external quality auditors to validate the self-evaluation report. This results in a recommendation to the agency about the quality of the institution or a program. The third stage is a decision by the agency on the audit team’s recommendations and disclosure of the audit outcome. To that end, the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency has reviewed experiences of quality agencies in selected countries and developed and publicized criteria for quality assurance in HEIs in Ethiopia. The quality assessment criteria were presented to representatives from public and private HEIs, professional associations and other relevant organizations. Comments and suggestions were incorporated and finally the guidelines and assessment tools were endorsed by the HERQA Board for implementation.
HERQA distributed the manuals and procedures to all private and public HEIs offering degree programs and requested eight public universities to submit self-evaluation reports to HERQA to initiate the first external quality audits of Higher Education in the history of Ethiopia. To date, seven public universities have carried out self-evaluations and submitted their self-evaluation reports to the agency. The agency has carried out two audit visits and has scheduled to undertake audit visits to all the other HEIs that have submitted self-evaluation reports. These are important steps in the development of quality assurance for higher education in the country and are learning experiences for all concerned. The agency and all HEIs are expected to continue work hard to improve the quality of the self-evaluation reporting and in providing relevant information to judge the quality of institutions and their programs.

The purpose of this paper is to describe the basic elements of the first stage of HERQA’s quality assurance system: a self-evaluation report of a Higher Education institution as a pre-requisite for an external quality audit. It outlines the purposes of an institutional self-evaluation, deals with the quality focus areas, the procedures to be followed for self-evaluation, the self-evaluation report and its use for quality enhancement.

**Purposes of institutional self-evaluation**

HERQA envisages undertaking institutional quality audit in all HEIs to assure quality. An institutional quality audit is an in-depth assessment and analysis of the quality and relevance of programs and the teaching environment (HERQA Publication Series: 013, 2007). An institutional quality audit will also assess the effectiveness of a HEI’s system of accountability and the internal quality assurance mechanism put in place. The pre-requisite for the institutional quality audit is the preparation of the self-evaluation report by the institution. The preparation of a self-evaluation report requires a systematic investigation of the teaching and learning environment and identifies strengths and weakness. The HEI
should also identify effective mechanisms to monitor and enhance the quality and relevance of its programs. Not only that, a HEI should also identify its good practices (*i.e.* ways in which it enhances quality) and the ways in which these are disseminated to its various sections and the Higher Education sector as a whole.

HERQA’s institutional and program accreditation process in Ethiopian Higher Education is different for public and private HEIs. Currently the institutional and program accreditation of private HEIs is input based. However, the agency is interested in moving from an input based system to a process and output based system. An audit, for instance, may look into the staff profile and mix and experience to judge the quality of the teaching staff to teach as per the aims and objectives of a program (*an input*). In addition an audit may also look into the way students are assessed (*a process*) and the level of achievement of students (*a product*). The major task of HERQA would then be to look at the systems that control the inputs, processes and outputs to make judgments as to their appropriateness and functioning. The agency will also track quality care mechanisms put in place and confirm HEIs’ claims that such mechanisms help to enhance quality. HERQA gives high attention to how HEIs set standards for their awards, how they maintain these standards and how they check and assure whether their awards are comparable to national and international norms. The same procedure should also apply to public HEIs even though they are established by proclamation as autonomous HEIs. The launching of any educational program both in public and private HEIs should pass through rigorous accreditation and external quality audit processes. The issue of whether which one of them should precede is clear- quality audit should precede accreditation for private HEIs. To date HERQA is busy setting the direction and developing quality manuals and guidelines. HERQA has started to undertake external quality audit in public universities and has planned to do the same for private HEIs. It is therefore highly desirable for all HEIs to be prepared for institutional self-evaluation and external quality audits. Institutional self-evaluation is an in-depth analysis of institutional activity and serves as a stepping stone toward an external quality audit.
The role of HERQA in the institutional self-evaluation process

HERQA should determine the role it plays during the institutional self-evaluation process. This role should not be misunderstood as the owners of the intuitional self-evaluation are the HEIs. Upon the receipt of a Self Evaluation Document (SED), HERQA will consider not just what the HEI is doing but the circumstances in which it is operating. HERQA will expect the HEIs to do more than provide a good set of information but expects it to be self-critical and provide an analytical self-evaluation. HEIs will also be expected to develop useful improvement plans with detailed activities and resources required for implementation.

The underlining issue here is that quality assurance agencies should work with realistic expectation and clear goal in mind. HERQA's role should be to help HEIs become responsible for the quality of their work and the educational offerings they provide to the society.

In the initial phase of introducing external quality assurance in to a system, preparing a self-evaluation report may pose significant challenges to HEIs. HERQA should help HEIs to build capacity to develop self critical reports. If they are not helped the self-evaluation report could be incomplete and not provide a sufficient basis for an external quality audit. To that end, HERQA has given guidelines to facilitate a self-evaluation and the preparation of a self-evaluation report. In systems where the tradition of self-evaluation and external quality audit is well established a broad framework could be given by quality agencies in order to give HEIs some degree of flexibility. The self-evaluation guidelines of three quality agencies are given below for comparison (HERQA, New Zealand, and India)

Areas of focus for institutional self-assessment
The institutional self-assessment report focuses on ten agreed areas. HERQA has developed the procedures and details of institutional self-evaluation and submitted these to all public and private HEIs for implementation (HERQA publication series 13, 2007). These procedures as a whole and details of the ten focal areas were presented to representatives of public and private HEIs and professional associations where they had opportunities to offer their suggestions and comments. It is imperative that the top management of all HEIs is fully aware of these ten focal areas for self-evaluation before the actual self-evaluation is undertaken and the report is written. The team assigned to carry out the self-evaluation and write the self-evaluation report should also consult and involve all concerned bodies, particularly students, in order to get genuine information on the teaching and learning process, the overall quality assurance system that is in place and the level of academic achievements.

It is thus essential for all HEIs to note that a HERQA institutional quality audit will concentrate on the following 10 focus areas:

- Vision, Mission and Educational Goals;
- Governance and Management System;

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Guidelines for Self-Evaluation from QA Agencies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Country</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New Zealand</strong>&lt;br&gt;www.aau.ac.nz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>India</strong>&lt;br&gt;National Assessment and Accreditation Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ethiopia</strong>&lt;br&gt;HERQA <a href="http://www.higher.edu.et">www.higher.edu.et</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Examples of detailed information on staff profile and staff and student ratio required by HERQA

**Academic Staff Profile of University Faculty 1: Academic Rank based**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Professor</th>
<th>Assistant Professor</th>
<th>Associate Professor</th>
<th>Lecturer</th>
<th>Assistant Lecturer</th>
<th>Graduate Assistant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Academic staff profiles of University A Faculty 1: Academic Qualifications based**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>PhD</th>
<th>MA/MSc</th>
<th>BA/BSc</th>
<th>Advanced Diploma</th>
<th>Diploma</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>HERQA standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Academic staff profile of University A, Faculty 1: Student/Staff Ratio**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
<th>Number of Staff</th>
<th>Student/Staff Ratio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

✓ Infrastructure and Learning Resources;
✓ Academic and Support Staff;
✓ Student Admission and Support Services;
✓ Program Relevance and Curriculum;
Teaching, Learning and Assessment;
Student Progression and Graduate Outcomes;
Research and Outreach Activities; and
Internal Quality Assurance.

The above quality focal areas cover the activities of the HEIs in their entirety: inputs, processes and outputs.

**Quality assurance, quality care and enhancement**

PHEIs need quality assurance units or other responsible bodies that are responsible for assuring the quality of the educational programs, research and community services that they offer. The duties and responsibilities of a quality assurance unit should be well defined including its organizational set up. Quality assurance needs to be given importance if a HEI is to compete successfully and survive in a situation where industry and the general labor market demand guarantees and also a changing set of knowledge and abilities.

To cater for this HEIs need to have well staffed quality assurance units with adequate resources. Most of the universities in Ethiopia have a number of Senate Standing Committees responsible for several activities. For example, there are Senate Standing Committees for Student Admission and Placement, Senate Standing Committees for Staff Scholarships and Promotion but probably no Senate Standing Committees for Quality Assurance. Most universities have no quality assurance policy or developed strategy to assure quality.

In universities where the quality culture is well established such as the University of Bristol, UK and University of Malaya, Malaysia, strong quality assurance units exist and are chaired by a faculty dean and a senior staff member, respectively. The Quality Assurance Management Unit in the University of Malaya has more than 14 staff working
for more than 80% of their time. These institutions give considerable importance to quality and consider this as a mainstay for their existence.

Substantial efforts have been put into establishing Academic Development Resource Centers (ADRCs) in the nine public universities. The roles and responsibilities of the ADRCs focus on quality care, staff development, professional resource and service (HERQA-EQUIP workshop proceedings, 2005). The roles of ADRCs are thus more focused on quality enhancement than quality assurance. The preparation of the self-evaluation reports of HEIs seems to be left with no responsible unit. In general, the above roles and responsibilities appear not to be well understood by the ADRC members and the university community at large. HEIs need to clearly identify the roles of ADRCs and think of establishing a unit for quality assurance and thus responsible for self evaluation and the preparation of the self-evaluation report. These are demanding tasks that have to be done in a professional manner as per the HERQA procedures. The self-evaluation requires gathering of information and data through consultations with the management, faculty deans and department heads, staff, students, employers and graduates. It should also not be considered as a one time activity but as something that should be a regular event.

**Self-evaluation procedures**

PHEIs need to be clear about the procedures to undertake self-evaluation. The following procedures are identified to be adopted by all HEIs. An Institutional self evaluation may include the following procedures (HERQA publication series 13, 2007):

- Establishing a team for the self evaluation;
- Communicating a timetable for the self evaluation;
- Gathering and analyzing information for self evaluation;
- Reporting the self evaluation; and
- Making use of the self evaluation.
Establishing a team for the self-evaluation

All PHEIs are advised to set up a team responsible for the self-evaluation and reporting. Some higher learning institutions such as University of Malaya, Malaysia set up Quality Assurance Management Unit (QAMU) and follow up the maintenance of quality as a day-to-day routine including the write up of the self-evaluation report as per the procedures of the national quality agency (Aregash, 2006). In the absence of such a unit it is advisable to set up a team that includes senior staff representing different faculties, administrative staff, and staff representing support services, instructors, recent graduates, employers and student representatives. It is recommended that the team consists of five to seven members representing various groups (OAQ, 2003). The team for the self-evaluation should make sure that all concerned bodies are well aware of the planned activities.

The chairperson of the team should take responsibility to manage the self-evaluation process and draft the report. The chairperson should have the qualities needed for this demanding task and must be given the necessary resources.

Communicating a timetable for the self-evaluation

The self-evaluation team must have access to relevant documents. It must also make sure that the objectives of the self-evaluation, its procedures, its methodology and its purposes are understood and accepted. It may be that the team will wish to observe teaching, conduct interviews, arrange focus groups or issue questionnaires. Good communication helps avoid surprise requests and visits and aids the gathering of the required qualitative and quantitative data timely and confidently.

A well scheduled timetable which indicates the activities to be undertaken framed with specific dates and times, identified personnel to be interviewed and venues to be used must be communicated in advance to avoid confusion and ensure the smooth running of the self-
evaluation process. Such a timeline enables the team and interviewees to budget their time for various activities related to the self-evaluation. These include time for data and document collection and analysis and report writing and reflection of the findings to the top management of the HEI. A timetable must be flexible and open for opportunities of the top management and the university community to reflect their opinions and enrich the SED before submission to HERQA. As a result of this the SED will be owned by the majority of the university community and it will be easier for the HEI to plan institutional quality enhancement interventions.

Gathering and analyzing information for self evaluation

The quality of educational programs, research and outreach services a HEI offers are evaluated and judged through the institutional self-evaluation process. This can be successfully carried out if done against what the HEI planned to achieve and should be based on analysis of concrete evidence. Information for a self-evaluation can be obtained from several sources. The following are the most predominant ones: analysis of documents, statistics, survey of facilities, teaching observation, interviews, questionnaire survey and written comments. For instance, public documents such as the higher education bill and other regulation from the Ministry of Education should be consulted. Internal documents such as the HEI’s regulations, course catalogs, student handbooks and minutes of the Senate, Board and Senate Standing Committees are essential to a self-evaluation. The HERQA external quality auditors will certainly be requesting such documentation. The staff profile and mix should be analyzed to check the adequacy of academic and administrative staff to achieve the HEI’s objectives. This too will be looked at by the external auditors.

Reporting the Self-evaluation
On the basis of the quantitative and qualitative information collected, the self evaluation team members must sit together and discuss their findings, validate their judgments and agree on recommendations to make. The team leader will need to organize the drafting of the self evaluation report (The Self Evaluation Document = SED). The self-evaluation should focus on judgments of the quality of the provision of the HEIs and of the adequacy and effectiveness of the internal quality arrangements. The SED should be presented to the top management for comments on factual errors, misrepresentation, discrepancies and omissions before it is submitted to HERQA. The SED is a key document for the HERQA external quality audit and needs to be prepared appropriately. The structure of the SED is set out by the HERQA publication-Preparing a Self-evaluation Document (HERQA QA/04/06/V1).

Use of Self-evaluation

PHEIs are working under testing conditions and are demanded by their stakeholders to provide quality programs and prove that they are doing so. The SED is an important document for the institution as it describes its activities and presents its strengths and weaknesses. It should also have a detailed plan of actions for improvement. Consequently, the institutional self-evaluation encourages the institution to engage in systematic and continuous quality enhancement. The SED must recognize the achievements of the HEI and identify weak areas for improvement. It needs to be disseminated for information and for informed decision making among the university community and other stakeholders.

Conclusion

It is the sole responsibility of each HEI to assure the quality of the programs and services it offers. The contribution of institutional self-evaluation is immense in this regard. Self-evaluation assists a HEI to identify its strengths and weakness. The current accreditation
process for Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia is input based. Institutional quality audit will undoubtedly contribute in bringing paradigm shift from input based system to an input, process and output based accreditation system. The self-evaluation process is thus an important process a HEI should value as it recognizes its achievements and good practices. It also identifies weakness and details a plan of action for quality enhancement. Institutional Self-evaluation being a pre-requisite of external quality audit will thus play a great role in bringing real changes in quality assurance.

References

Private Colleges and Leadership Efficiency of TVET with Particular Reference to Tigray

Negus Kebedom, Mekele
College of Teacher Education, Mekele

Abstract

Education in Ethiopia has been made to be the concern of public as well as private sector since 1994 to the contrary of Article 54, 1975 confiscation of private schools in Ethiopia. Article 3.9.6 of the new Education and Training Policy (1994:32) States that “the government will create the necessary conditions to encourage and give support to private investors to open schools and establish various educational and training institutions.” To this effect, private colleges started flourishing in the country and practically share the burden of the government in educational expansion, in general, and in producing skilled labour in particular. However, media like ETV, Tigray people broadcasting service were highlighting disputes between the TVET commission and private colleges in Tigray. On top of this, one of the letters written to TVET (Ref No. 157/98, Date 30-05-98) depicts that “...Unless the response of the TVET to the programs commenced seems unwise because we have fulfilled what is expected of us. Therefore, documents in private colleges depict that there were inconveniences, misunderstandings and inadequate decisions, leadership as a process, never the less, secures the cooperation of others and influence towards the achievement of goals” (Campbell, & others, 1983:143; Rashid, & Arches, 1983: 210; Kinard 1988:328; and Stoner & other 1998:490.) Besides, research results vouched this must be learned through experience and practice and through the assessment of success and failure. From the disputes and letters written, leadership competence of both institutions seemed questionable. A model of leadership developed at the Ohio state University’s Mershon center summarizes leadership role in terms of eight competences; shaping vision; helping groups make decision; laying the foundation for outside support; group power; motivating members; resolving conflicts; attracting outside support and defending group advocacy; getting support from other groups (Woyach, 1992:4). Thus, this study investigated the efficacy of the leadership of TVET and private colleges in Tigray and ascertain whether they assure the leadership model. This study specifically is expected to address the following questions.

1. To what extent is the responsibility of TVET compatible to its institutional capacity?
2. What is the basis for the relationship of TVET and Private Colleges?
3. What is the effect of TVET leadership on the organizational climate of private colleges?
The major objective of this study, therefore, is to assess and analyse the effect of leadership on private college’s functions and contribute in the development of research based knowledge of the available four Private Colleges and TVET will be taken as sample of the study.

Introduction

1.1. Statement of the Problem

Effective leadership is essential to the performance of all organizations regardless of the objectives they strive to attain. More important, good leadership practices can be learned and applied. Thus, success in leadership depends both on a fundamental understanding of the principles of management and on the application of technical, human, and conceptual skills (Kinard, 1988:18).

According to Deverell (1985:16), the completely untrained administrator who is trying to learn the art of management is an expensive luxury which only an affluent society can afford. Even the trained administrator will of course ultimately have to learn some part of his trade “on the job”. But, she will learn it more quickly if he/she has a modicum of systematic training at a very early stage. Until recently, many people held that one could only master the art of management by experience, a slow and laborious road, the more so without guides.

At various levels of the education system, to have competent, well-trained, experienced and knowledgeable subordinates who can be trusted to take responsibility and make the necessary decisions at local level are necessary conditions for the success of decentralized management (Chandan, 1991 cited in Seyoum, 1996:29). Nonetheless, Seyoum indicated that unless there is required and relevant expertise working on decentralized management, it would have a severe consequence on the educational system. In a similar vein, Campbell et. al (1983) pointed to such relevance of expertise.
In this regard, in Ethiopia, with the formulation of the new Education and Training Policy (ETP), educational management was decentralized in 1994 (TGE, 1994). As per the policy, the intention of decentralizing educational management was to make it democratic and professional so that problems of relevance, quality, access and equity of education and training would be alleviated. To this effect, education in Ethiopia has become the concern of the public as well as private since 1994 contrary to Article 54, 1975E.C confiscation of private schools in Ethiopia.

Article 3.9.6 of the new Education and Training Policy (1994:32) states that “The government will create the necessary conditions to encourage and give support to private investors to open schools and establish various educational and training institutions.” To this effect, private colleges started flourishing in the country and practically share the burden of the government in educational expansion, in general, and in producing skilled labour in particular.

However, media like ETV and Tigray People Broadcasting Service were highlighting disputes between the TVET commission and the private colleges in Tigray. Documents revealed that problems such as inadequate and inconsistent supervisory support, loose professional interaction between the private colleges and TVET, and lack of attention and focus on the colleges’ problems, were prevalent. These problems were identified to have led to greater misunderstanding.

Though the overall intention of decentralization of educational management is to create efficient educational management, it will not be materialized unless a capacitated TVET as well as private colleges are established. The capacity of educational leadership at TVET influences the performance of private colleges.

Thus, this study intends to investigate the efficacy of TVET leadership in managing private colleges in Tigray. It is expected to address the following questions.
1. To what extent is the responsibility of TVET compatible to its institutional capacity?
2. How skilled are TVET officials (conceptual, human and technical)?
3. What is the effect of TVET leadership on the organizational climate of private colleges?

1.2. Specific Objectives

The study will specifically try:

- To explore the existing managerial skills and functions at TVET level in assisting private colleges;
- To assess how TVET considers responsibility and accountability in managing private colleges;
- To forward relevant recommendations with regard to prevailing problems.

1.3. Significance of the Study

The study is basically designed to assess TVET capacity in managing private colleges and its effect in the Tigray Region. Therefore, it is hoped that, by and large, this study may:

- Serve as a basis to assist planners and policy makers to assess the appropriate management arrangement and its efficiency.
- Assist higher educational officials to determine the functions and responsibilities of TVET and allocate appropriate resources.
- Provide new ideas to overcome the shortcomings of TVET in insuring the healthy development of interaction with private colleges, and
- Furthermore, the findings of the study may also serve as a reference material and initiate future researcher for in-depth investigation.
1.4. Delimitation of the Study

This study is delimited to an assessment of TVET capacity in managing private colleges. It concentrates on the managerial skills of TVET officials (i.e. conceptual, human and technical). It also focuses on factors such as educational background; experience, structure of TVET and the organizational climate of the private colleges.

1.5. Research Design and Methodology

To carry out this study, a descriptive survey method was used. This method was preferred on the grounds that leadership performance is effectively perceived from the opinion survey of subordinates, superiors and the leaders (TVET officials).

1.5.1. Sampling Procedure

There are 27 in campus private colleges in the Tigray Administrative Region. Of these, four (14.8%) were selected as study areas. This is intended to comply with the conventional argument that, “as sample size increases, the magnitude of the error decreases” (Best and Kahn, 1993:326).

The data for this study were collected from sampled private colleges’ personnel and TVET officials. These are chosen as data sources because: (1) they are the immediate referent groups of the TVET; and (2) they are frequently at college as well as TVET offices and are well versed on the performance of the TVET office. The samples were 10 TVET officials and 40, 10 each from Sheba Info Technical Collage, New Millennium College, Hashenge College and Greenwich College. Simple random sampling was applied to select sample for the study.
1.5.2. Data Gathering Tools

Multiple methods have a merit of supplementing one with others to counteract bias and generate more adequate data (Best and Kahn, 1993:207). Thus, survey questionnaire, and document analysis were used to gather data. While collecting the relevant data from respondents, ethical considerations and legal constraints that could hamper the research process were given due attention.

1.5.3. Statistical Tools

In this study, percentages mean, SD (Standard Deviation), and T-test were employed to analyze the data collected through questionnaires.

2. Discussion of the Results

2.1. Characteristics of the Sample Population

Based on the sampling procedure described 10 TVET officials and 40 private colleges’ personnel were included in the study. A total of 50 respondents filled out the questionnaire and all respondents returned them. Also, document analysis was made. The analysis was based on the information drawn from respondents as well as the document.
Table 1: Characteristics of the Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>N.o</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>TVET Officials</th>
<th>Private College Personnel</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Level of education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>BA/B.S.C</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>M.A/ M.S.C</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Ph.D</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Others</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Field of specialization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Generalist</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Subject specialist</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Educational Adm.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All respondents in table 1 item 1, i.e. 50 (100%), are males. Female participation in private colleges and TVET leadership in the study was found to be insignificant.

Concerning field of specialization, only a negligible size of the total respondents of both TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel i.e., 10% and 7.5% respectively, were trained in educational planning and management. Documents revealed that the number of personnel assigned under the unit for private colleges was only three. Besides, in the process of delegation from the MoE (Ministry of Education) the delegated personnel were not even trained for short period of time concerning the responsibility delegated. However, the primary purpose of administrators development program, i.e. field based preparation, is to increase professional and personal effectiveness while simultaneously increasing organizational effectiveness (Olivero, 1982:341; Kinard, 1988: 18; and Evers and
Gallagher, 1994:77). Therefore, there is a need to staff organizations with people who have the appropriate type and level of education as well as training.

In order to examine the performance of the TVET in carrying out activities related to policy issues, T-test was computed between the respondents’ scores. The data in Table 2 indicates that TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel significantly differed in perception in all the three items. This exists because private colleges’ personnel seem not to accept TVETs’ overall knowledge on the policy. The data also shows,

**Table 2. TVET Conceptual Skill Application as Perceived by TVET Officials and Private Colleges Personnel**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T. value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Knows the policy</td>
<td>T (N=10)</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>4.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N= 40)</td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td>.94</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Introduces the private colleges to the education policy</td>
<td>T (N=6)</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.88</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Uses the policy to maintain the private colleges work discipline</td>
<td>T (N=10)</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>.94</td>
<td>6.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Make the private colleges develop their strategic plan.</td>
<td>T (N=6)</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.37</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Shares its vision with private colleges.</td>
<td>T (N=10)</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>.99</td>
<td>4.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Consults on issues regarding the private colleges before giving decisions.</td>
<td>T (N=6)</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>7.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Applies group decision-making</td>
<td>T (N=10)</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>7.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Indicates significant difference at P<0.05 level-

TVET officials perceived TVET above average in implementing the education policy. However, the grand mean value for both respondents seems to reveal that TVET was average in introducing the education policy to the private college personnel, contrary to
the argument that, “the policy informing capability is the intelligence system that serves to inform the processes of governance” (Downey, 1988: 69). This reveals that private colleges are not effectively acquainted with the new education and training policy albeit that it is already 14 years old.

T-tests were computed between respondents’ scores in order to evaluate the performance level of TVET on educational planning. Based on these computations, significant difference was observed between the TVET officials and private colleges personnel in one of the two items with mean score (4.0, 2.37 and t=4.44). As their mean scores disclose, TVET officials perceived TVET was performing above average in initiating private colleges to develop their strategic plan. Nevertheless, the grand mean values for both respondents’ show that TVET was average (3.18) in initiating private colleges to develop their strategic plans and below average (2.86) in sharing its vision. However, college improvement, particularly in a situation where resource is scarce, is the result of and hinges on careful planning. It initiates leaders to constantly watch the progress of the institutions, plans and monitors conditions with certain flexibilities. This is indicative of TVET officials lacking skill and insight in educational planning as a result of which one cannot expect substantive contributions by TVET.

According to the data in Table 2, statistically significant differences were observed between the TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel on TVET decision-making skills. TVET officials based on this result perceived TVET as above average in applying group decision makings and in consulting the private colleges. The grand mean of both respondents on the other hand discloses the TVET are below average in consulting on issues regarding private colleges and group decision making. This finding conforms with that of Govinda’s (1997:45) whereby most of offices in developing countries operate solely as a ‘mailbox’, transmitting guidelines, decisions and rules from the central office down to the lower layer of the administration machinery. It is, thus, possible to conclude that TVET
seemed not to have the initiative in taking action, which results from fear of intervention. That is, TVET made decisions which were apparent to lose acceptance and commitment of private colleges due to lack of sharing. Kinard and Ronald (1988:140) have substantially pronounced the core value of decision making in all leadership functions. This is so because all other leadership functions can be interpreted best in terms of decisions made. In this sense, all the efforts of leadership whether to increase performance or efficiency or to raise productivity are to be achieved through employment of sound decisions.

Conceptual skills are skills that require a capacity to learn and a level of experience in observing and practicing acceptable behavior (Szilagyi, 1981:32). Contrary to this, most of the TVET officials were not trained in educational planning and management. Besides, they were perceived as being less capable in performing tasks, which demand conceptual skills.

In order to examine whether there were significant differences between mean scores of the two respondents on communication skill of TVET, T-tests were carried out. Significant differences were observed between the TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel in all of the four items. This shows, that, TVET officials have perceived TVET’s communicating capability as above average with mean scores ranging from 3.2 to 3.8 except one with mean score 2.5. On the other hand, the mean scores on Table 3 show that, private colleges personnel perceived the TVET’s communicating capability below average with mean scores ranging from 1.72 2.12.
Table 3. TVET’s Human Relation Skill as Perceived by Private Colleges Personnel and TVET Officials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T. value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Shows effectiveness in communication</td>
<td>T(n=10)</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>2.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P(n=40)</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Uses clear directions</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>.79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Overburdens the private college with message</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Shows strong mutual influence</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Considers private colleges leader’s thought</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Encourages private colleges to assume certain responsibilities</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>.63</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Contributes for positive atmosphere in the private colleges</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.22</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Acknowledges good performances</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.65</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*indicates significant difference at P<0.05 level

Ultimately, based on the grand mean value of both respondents, TVET as in Table 3, were below expectation in communicating the mission of private colleges, in providing clear directions, and in showing strong mutual influence. This indicates, TVET failed to employ two-way communication on the mission and other specific innovations attempted. This ineffectiveness was also an obstacle for private college to clearly understand as to what, when, how to do, and where to go. However, Terry and Franklin (1991:345); Davis and Linda (1994); and Bush and John (1994:245) assert the effectiveness of the transmission of what the leader knows, thinks, and feels highly affects and conditions leadership accomplishment. Therefore, leaders, planners and other experts at all levels of the education system are expected to be good communicators in order to introduce the innovations in education.
T-tests were also computed to examine the perception of TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel on motivating activities of TVET. As the data in Table 3 indicates, the tests computed between both groups showed significant difference on all four items. As this mean score portray, TVET officials perceived that TVET as performing above average in motivating activities whereas, private colleges personnel, perceived that TVET was performing below average.

However, motivation for Hunt (1992:5); and Tripathic and Reddy (1992;208) is a process whereby goals are recognized, and choices are made to channel inner drives of people towards the accomplishment of organizational goals. It is because people are more personally interested in their work with an organization when they have a say in what happens to them, as a result of which their work becomes meaningful and significant in contributing to higher purpose. Yet, TVET tended to strongly disagree with this noble idea and seemed to completely misunderstand that leadership is all about working with and through people or institutions.

T-tests were computed on TVET’s evaluation system. As to the results of the T-tests, significant differences were observed between TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel in all six items. The data in Table 4 indicates, TVET officials perceived TVET as above average in applying evaluation. Yet, TVET was perceived as below average in labeling private colleges precisely. For all of the stated evaluation activities, private colleges’ personnel perceived TVET to be below average.
Table 4. TVET’s Technical Skill Application as Perceived by private colleges Personnel and TVET Officials.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Evaluates the private colleges based on their objectives</td>
<td>T (N=10)</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>.51</td>
<td>6.72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P (N=40)</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>.96</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Applies formative evaluation</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>6.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Applies summative evaluation</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>4.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>.83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Evaluates the private colleges continuously</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>2.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Uses evaluation for corrective measures</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>.91</td>
<td>0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Labels the private colleges precisely</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td>2.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Arranges the number of supervisors in relation to the size of the private colleges</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>3.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Uses subject specialists in supervising the private colleges</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>5.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>.77</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Carries out classroom observation with the collaboration of the private colleges</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>5.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>.93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Provides feed back timely</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>.82</td>
<td>3.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>.87</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*indicates significant difference at P<0.05 level.

The argument on the essence of evaluation for Randell et.al (1984:11) evaluation is to make an organization more effective through making its members participative and the process must be cumulative rather than merely one or two observations. It should be continuous because things change rapidly in time.

As soon as one level of improvement is reached another emerges and the strategies for that particular level may not be the same as for the earlier one. Unlike this argument, the grand mean scores of both the TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel showed the evaluation system of TVET being perceived as fairly average. This means private colleges as organizations were not regularly evaluated in order to identify their actual strengths and
weaknesses. The implication is that TVET made organizational decisions based merely on incidents. In such a case, it would be unwise to think about anticipating improvement.

To determine the differences in examining supervisory roles of TVET T-tests were also computed, as in Table 4. Based on these computations for the TVET officials and private colleges’ personnel, significant difference was observed in all the four items. Besides, the private colleges’ personnel perceptions of TVET supervisory roles were found below average. In providing feedback TVET officials perceived TVET as average, this finding highly contradicts a letter written from one of the sample colleges. The latter was a replay of the feedback of supervision made having 37 pages of claims of mistakes and misunderstandings of TVET.

The grand mean values for both respondents for all items indicated below average, ranging from 2.47 to 2.9. Hence, it could be said that there was no adequate supervisory support for private colleges in the region. For Gold and Szemernyi (1999:147), supervisory teams ought to collectively contain sufficient all-round expertise to be able to discharge their functions effectively. Furthermore, the composition and the number of the supervision team need to synchronize with the size of the institution and the number of pupils on roll. By and large, it could safely be concluded that the aforementioned functions are indicative of the poor performance of TVET in these activities, which demand technical skill.

Table 5. Factors Affecting TVET’s leadership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Does the authority delegated to TVET enable to handle the responsibility vested?</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Do you think that the current organizational structure of TVET enable it to manage private colleges?</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>92.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Has TVET clearly defined intentions with private colleges?</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>92.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
An overwhelming majority i.e. 80% of the TVET officials agree with the ideas of the three items in Table 5. The positions of TVET officials seemed to influence their response and they responded “yes”. However, 20% of TVET officials and 80 90% of the private colleges’ personnel disagree with the ideas that the authority devolved to TVET commensurate with its responsibility; the current TVET organizational structure enables them to manage private colleges; and TVET has clearly defined intentions for private colleges. The reasons for ineffectiveness of the TVET organizational structure are stated in response to subsequent open-ended items. The major reasons were it is not organized with qualified personnel of different disciplines and no timely response.

Table 6. The Effect of TVET on Private Colleges’ Organizational Climate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>TVET</th>
<th>Private college personal</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Who do you think is accountable for the existing organizational climate of the private college?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. TVET</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21.4</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. DEAN</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Instructors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. College Community’s</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Others</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to Charlton and David (1993:47), climate influences what goes on, what the outcomes are and the level of satisfaction. In general, they have described the organizational climate as being the key independent variable for private colleges’ effectiveness. The existing organizational climate of the private colleges in the region was relatively closed. This seemed to negatively affect effectiveness of private colleges in accomplishing their functions properly and realizing their objectives.
As indicated in Table 6, a majority of total respondents revealed TVET as being accountable to the existing situation in the private colleges. An open-ended question was also included to establish the reason for their choice. Those who choose TVET justified as unfair decisions made 1998 Ethiopian Calendar (E.C.) inadequate supervision and untimely feedback that put stakeholders in state of confusion and disturbed the internal climate of colleges. On the other hand, those whose choices were college community stated their reason as colleges were simply running for profit without fulfilling necessary conditions. They didn’t care about the training given. Colleges were closed for external help.

3. Summary, Conclusions and Recommendations

This part is devoted mainly to the findings, conclusions and measures that should be taken based on the findings obtained by this study. This follows the brief summarized presentation of the central theme upheld all through the course of undertaking the research project.

3.1. Summary

3.1.1. All 50 (100%) of the respondents were males. Female participation as officials was found nonexistent.

3.1.2. It is reported that there was not even short term training which would enable delegated officials to lead private colleges in the region except a handbook guideline published in 1996 after most of the colleges emerged.

3.1.3. TVET had no skill and insight in educational strategic planning as a result of which one can’t expect substantive contribution from it.

3.1.4. Consequently, TVET seemed to be less capable in performing tasks which demand conceptual skill.
3.1.5. The study found that TVET its below expectation in communicating mission in providing clear directions, and showing strong mutual influence. This indicated TVET failed to employ two-way communications about its mission and other specific innovations attempted. This ineffectiveness was also an obstacle for private colleges to clearly understand what, when, how to do something, and where colleges themselves.

3.1.6. TVET didn’t encourage private colleges to assume responsibility. Thus, TVET seemed to misunderstand that management is all about working with and through people or institutions.

3.1.7. TVET looked down on their human relation skill and seemed to lack the executive ability to work effectively as members and to build cooperative effort with in the private colleges.

3.1.8. The study found that TVET failed to evaluate private colleges continuously, and to label private colleges precisely. Therefore, private colleges as organizations and their personnel were not regularly evaluated in order to identify their actual strengths and weaknesses. This implied TVET’s organizational decisions were based merely on incidents.

3.1.9. There was inadequate supervisory support to private colleges.

3.1.10. TVET unsuccessfully performed activities demanding technical skills.

3.1.11. The current TVET organizational structure perceived to be defective in managing private colleges. Besides, TVET and private colleges had no clearly defined intentions.

3.1.12. The study found that, TVET had a negative impact in the existing organizational climate of private colleges.
3.2. Conclusions

Based on the findings, the following conclusions are drawn:

3.2.1. The success of educational organizations highly depends on the adequacy of personnel they have. Therefore, there is a need to staff organizations with people who have the appropriate type and level of education and training. However, the findings of this study indicated that a large majority of TVET officials were not trained in educational planning and management, and the number of the responsible personnel was few.

3.2.2. TVET officials are expected to provide all kinds of support to private colleges need and to manage the education system efficiently. This could be accomplished as desired when they possess managerial skill. Besides, human capital is embodied in individuals’ skills and knowledge and can be created through educational opportunities. However, based on our study, TVET officials are less capable in performing tasks which demand conceptual skill; TVET officials seem to have problems in applying activities that needs human relation skill; and TVET officials poorly perform activities which demand technical skills. This shows that no attention is given to the importance of educational management as a discipline while every manager at TVET should have been equipped with the necessary managerial skills i.e., conceptual, human and technical skills in order to manage the education system efficiently and effectively. Therefore, it tends to be clear from the previous discussions/findings that TVET officials do not have the required skills to provide the necessary support to the private colleges.

3.2.3. Effective organizational structure gives life and health to organizations. Members are enabled to give their best and make the organization reach its objectives with efficiency. But the structure of TVET in our case seems to be narrow and didn't accommodate a position for different necessary disciplines. Also, there is no
clearly defined intention with private colleges, proving that the structure doesn't enable management of private colleges.

3.2.4. To wind up the overall assessment of the research has compiled results that answer its initial questions: though authority was devolved to TVET, they are not staffed with professionally trained personnel. Some of the private college themselves were not supportive to TVET; their organizational climate was relatively closed. That is, their leaders were not visibly involved in performing what was expected of them and teachers were not fully committed to the success of their students. Therefore, TVET officials and private colleges are unlikely to meet the expected outcomes of the policies unless they have a clearer idea of what it is that they can do that will make a difference.

3.3. Recommendations

In view of the findings and conclusion drawn, the following recommendations are forwarded:

1. The findings of this study vouched for the existence of a mismatch between the specialization of TVET officials and their number with the positions they occupy. TVET officials didn’t possess the managerial skills to perform efficiently their day-to-day activities. What’s more, it had a negative impact in private colleges’ climate. Taking these findings into consideration the researcher envisages the following areas of interest as a starting point in the move to deal with the problems thereof.

   a) To maintain and improve managerial skills of TVET, TREB should establish procedures to assess effectiveness and provide appropriate experiences, such as periodic evaluation, and in-service training programs, in order to strengthen weaknesses.
b) Collaborative decision-making seems to create a healthy school climate, which tends to foster a sense of community. Thus, TVET should consult private colleges while deciding on issues concerning them.

c) Regional Educational Bureau should give due attention to the contribution of private colleges and organize well staffed departments which is only responsible for private colleges.

d) In assigning personnel, focus should be made on those whose study related to educational leadership.

e) Rules, regulations and guidelines are the basis for the relationship of TVET and private colleges. To effectively accomplish what is expected of them, there is a need for revising the existing and to develop new ones. In doing so, private colleges and other stakeholder should be involved to the maximum possible.

f) There is a good start in developing educational standards in the region. This good practice should be multiplied to private colleges and collaboratively develop standards for private colleges’ outcomes.

g) Communication is basic for leadership functions, sound decision, influence people and others. Therefore, periodic evaluation of TVET officials and private colleges should be designed and could be quarterly.

h) TVET’s supervision should target supportive measures and bit-by-bit change to inbuilt supervision system.

i) Adequacy of internal environment is decisive for any organization. Therefore, private colleges’ leadership should work hard for an open climate and attract outside support.

j) Private colleges should balance income and quality service provision. Collaborative work with other and strengthen their collaboration through festivals sport or forums.
REFERENCES


Government Policies and Institutional Responsibilities of Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia

Teshome Yizengaw

Abstract

Private Higher Education provision which started in 1996 has come a long way in the very short period of its existence in Ethiopia. The policy of Education and Training subsequent education sector development programs, particularly the third ESDP, and the Higher Education capacity building strategies have highlighted, though sometimes in a passing, the importance of the private sector in Higher Education provision. It has accounted for about 24.8% of the 2004/5 overall (degree and diploma levels) enrolment and about 9.3% of the degree level enrolments of the national Higher Education system. It is currently providing access to a large number of the youth who could not join the public institutions, offering wide opportunities in terms of choice of programs, delivery modes (regular, evening, distance, etc.) and places of study.

The Private Higher Education Institutions have faced several challenges. The most critical among these, not necessarily characterizing all institutions, are declining student enrolment, particularly in some disciplines and institutions, limited capacity to fulfill requisite facilities and infrastructure, inability to expand mainly due to land problems, poor commitments to quality upkeep and enhancement, problems of meeting the expectations and/or satisfactions of the government and the society, and poor unity and utilization of their association to further objectives and influence stakeholders, including government.

However, there are sizeable number of institutions that have overcome these challenges through different mechanisms and won the trust of the students, parents, government and other stakeholders. There are also few that have failed to address the challenges of mainly playing their role of social responsibility and accountability.

The coming years would require both government and private providers to focus on meeting social demands and expectations in the higher education sector. The government is expected to provide more transparent and facilitating policies and strategies, as well as leveling the playing ground as it has done for other investment sectors in the last few years. On the other hand, private institutions are expected to focus on quality and relevance of curricula and courses, focus on producing responsible, knowledgeable and skilled citizens, and contribute to equitable access to Higher Education.
1. Introduction

Higher Education Institutions, both public and private, have a covenant, tacit or otherwise, responsibility to educate people to be the hope of the future and be leaders and providers for the welfare of society. Government and society look up to the institutions of higher learning, and to the men and women who graduate from these institutions whenever plans and strategies of overall socio-economic and cultural development of our country are considered. Education is an investment in the future- the principal tool and the means of assisting both individuals and nations to shape their destinies. Enhancement of human resource capacity, individual status and improvement of the level of participation towards sustainable economic and social development is largely made possible through Higher Education. It is therefore reasonable to expect that Higher Education Institutions and their graduates have wide-ranging responsibilities societal and national expectations of question the real returns of their investment, the need to fulfill these expectations is all the more urgent and critical.

The development of Higher Education in Ethiopia in the last decade has been significant – significant in terms of expanding access, diversification of institutions and programs, and geographic distributions. The contribution of the Private Higher Education institutions in the development of the sector is no less significant. Despite the expanded access, every one of us would question the impact that increased access to Higher Education has had on the overall development of our communities. Many of us often rise doubts as to the quality and relevance of the curriculum offered, question the commitment of graduates to social services and national goals, and doubt their readiness and maturity to take on the challenges of leadership in this increasingly complex environment. It is because we all grapple with these challenges and face the rumblings that I welcome the opportunity given to me here today to speak to a receptive, reflective and potentially proactive gathering. However, I can not address all issue possibly covered within the topic. It I indeed a tall
order to attempts that with my stature in the quality of education and training offered in Higher Education Institutions and their graduates.

Access to the increasing demand for Higher Education could not be fulfilled only by the investment in public institutions. In principle, I believe, with requisite follow-up and support Private Higher Education Institutions should be further encouraged to flourish with a mission to produce quality citizens. In this respect, several policies and strategies of the government have been instrumental in furthering the development of the Higher Education and specifically the Private Higher Education provision in Ethiopia. This will lead me to the first major theme of this paper-the policies of government.

2. Government Policies and Strategies

No one can deny that expansion of both Public and Private Higher Education Institutions and programs have taken place in an unprecedented pace, geographic distribution and program diversification. That has been witnessed since the adoption of the Education and Training policy in 1994 and the liberalized free-market economic and investment policies.

The education and training policy has stressed the importance of the private sector in expanding access and providing quality education and training, mainly by encouraging non-governmental organization to establish training programs (article 3.6.4), and that government will create the necessary conditions to encourage and give support to private investors to open schools and establish various educational and training institutions (article 3.9.6). Like wise, the Capacity Building Strategy and Programs indicates the need to encourage non-governmental organizations in establishing and providing Higher Education (page 189) to support the strategies of building capacity for successful national capacity building. Further more, the plan for accelerated and sustained Development to End poverty (PASDEP), Ethiopia’s guiding strategic framework or the 2005/06-2009/10 period,
has also highlighted the importance of the Private Higher Education Institutions toward meeting the planned expansion strategy.

The question may be how much these provisions were understood and implemented by various entities of Federal and Regional governments. Generally, with in their frame works both the implementation of the policies and the operation of the privet institutions are not without their specific flaws.

As much as there are large number of Federal and Regional government bodies that wholeheartedly support and assist the development of the private sector, there are many government entities and support units that do not appreciate the social and public responsibilities and contributions of these institutions.

The major problem may be associated with the perception that these institutions are for-profit and do not need any so perceived special support from a public body. This has also been exacerbated by the behaviors and activities of may institutions, as few were and are focusing on profit making rather than shaping a generation of leaders and professionals. This has largely contributed to failure to address may of the challenges of the institutions. These, in my opinion, may have resulted in the reversal of several positive towards support.

The Higher Education Proclamation provides for the establishment and support of privet providers of higher education and mechanisms to ensure quality and relevance of the education and training given by these providers. It has clearly articulated the objectives (article 6) and powers and duties (article 14) of higher education institutions, which also apply to the private ones,

In general, the Education and Training policy and the Higher Education proclamation are expectations from a higher education institution. These tand another theme of this paper are responsibilities of the institutions.
3. Institutional Responsibilities of PHEIs

It is relevant and worth mentioning few statements from the policies of the government in relation to the discussion topic-responsibility. The following are but few major extracts:

- The education and Training policy states that education provided need to promote democratic culture, tolerance and peaceful reconciliation of differences and that raises the sense of discharging societal responsibilities (art. 202.9). Furthermore, it stats that education shall (a) provide citizens who possess national and international.

- The Higher Education proclamation envisages that institutions need to provide higher education and social service compatible with the needs and development of the country (art. 2.2.14); (b) enable students become problem solving professional leaders in their fields of study and in overall societal needs (art. 3.24).

- The Higher Education Proclamation envisages that institutions need to provide higher education and social service compatible with the needs and development of the country (art. 6/5); and make efforts to develop and disseminate culture of respect, tolerance and living together among people (art. 6/8).

How much do higher educational institutions in Ethiopia clearly set set their missions towards contributing to societal development and service, as stipulated in the policies above? Do they wholeheartedly pursue the fulfillment of economic, social and political rights of people? Are the curricula, programs and other activities designed to respond to the needs of the society at large? Do they fulfill their obligation to offer academic programs of the highest standards, suitable to the professional needs and aspirations of their students, and by extension the society and the country? Does the faculty meet their responsibility of fulfilling their functions and academic roles with competence, integrity and to the best of their abilities, and in accordance with ethical values? Do the faculty and administration strive to inculcate the spirit of tolerance towards differing opinions, views
and positions, and enhance democratic culture? One could continue with more lists of inquires to seek answers to chart our future while helping institutions meet their responsibilities.

The issue of institutional responsibility of higher educational institutions, and by extension that of university graduates, has been the subject of debate, studies and reports. Institutional responsibility of providing equitable access, producing quality graduates, preparing them for the world of work, service to society and leadership are critical. Contribution to society through relevant research and studies is no less important. Some studies indicate that graduates lack exposure and preparations for the real situations after graduation. They even indicate he graduates lack concern for other, for society and their country, reasoning that they appear to be focusing on money and power with little regard to changing conditions around them and showing little readiness to face societal challenges. Others counter these assertions by saying that graduates are willing to serve the society; to give back what the society has given them but can not find ways to serve or the space and the opportunity to do so.

There is a lot to be desired from higher education institutions in terms of ensuring equity of access. Equity of access is not only about the access and completion of women and disadvantaged groups of society. It is also related to how much the higher educational institutions strive to reinforce their link with other levels of education. This is one weak area where our institutions have largely failed to should responsibility. Other important areas where institutions have not fulfilled their responsibilities include inability to create, advance and disseminate knowledge and preserve and promote cultures through research; educate citizens for active participation in society (life long learning); and foster partnership with the world of work. Many institutions are occupied in the teaching and learning processes with a largely neglected research wing. All theses, however, are related, in my opinion, and hopefully you would agree, to whether higher education institutions are effectively fulfilling their missions of social responsibility or not.
By the time our students enter the workforce, they will be expected to hit the ground running and to function in a situation dominated by the specter of challenges. They face challenges of poverty, food insecurity, natural resource degradation, resource misuse and mismanagement, ineffective governance, corruption, and generally changing times and increasingly competitive situations. In this time of unprecedented changes and expectations, technological advancements also increasingly dictate the pace at which we live our lives and manage our work as society is driven towards becoming more knowledge-based. This makes higher education institutions more central as a strategic resource educating and training people that create and/or utilize knowledge effectively and provide the necessary leadership. The responsibilities of higher education institutions are therefore no longer confined to their immediate environment.

Parents, students, as well as the larger public are increasingly investing in higher education charting the future. Life long learning is becoming a necessity for all. Products of higher education institutions will be required to continuously adjust to and address pressing societal problems, not only with their technical and professional ability, but also with enlightened leadership skills and preparations. So, institutions have the responsibilities to prepare students to lead us with vision, with their feet firmly on the ground. The caliber and commitment of the teaching staff, the quality and relevance of the curricula, programs and delivery, the capacity and standard of facilities and infrastructure and the extra curricular activities that inculcate relevant values and skills become critical to fulfill these responsibilities, which institutions are expected to discharge.

Private higher education institutions need to recognize, readjust and fulfill their social responsibility in terms of providing quality and relevant education and training, inculcating democratic culture, sense of social responsibility and proactive leadership skills in their graduates; and prepare them appropriately for their evolving responsibilities. This is why, in the opening paragraph of this paper, I said, society will call upon the higher education
institutions to prepare their students to rise to challenges. Higher education institutions and their communities, including the management, are increasingly required to keep close to our hearts and minds that we need to educate and train our students with sense of responsibility – as these students will be our leaders, source of inspiration and pride. Who needs ineffective, un-inspired and reactive leaders? Who wants to see graduates with no sense of social purpose and contract? Who does not want self-fulfillment? I believe none of us would like to see and have such leaders. We all want to have self-fulfillment could only come if and only if we have a social responsibility and contract to serve for the betterment of the society. It is my firm belief that private, as well as public higher education institutions, will fully and timely recognize our central role, come to grips with the daunting tasks and deliver as per expectations of society with a sense of purpose. There is always a shift in the landscape of higher education and a shift in societal sense demands - we need to constantly adjust and meet these demands and changing challenges.

In **Conclusion**, the private sector needs to be encouraged with appropriate support, guidance and follow up, and not control, as genuine development partner in the higher education expansion and development program of the country. Policies should not be directed towards control and discouragement. Rather they should embody a public-private partnership for the betterment of the system and its contribution to societal development.

**Reference:**

Perceptions of Public Educators about the Education and Training Provided by Private Colleges in Tigray

Gebrekidan W/Gebrel, Hashenge College, P.O.B 1828, Tele 0344411370, Mekelle, Tigray, Ethiopia

Abstract:

It is observable that Higher Education in Ethiopia faces many problems both in terms of quantity and quality of provision. Collaborative and concerted efforts by different partners in education that include private enterprises organized as for-profit businesses are still necessary. However, many public educators in Tigray seem to view the private colleges with distrust, likely for the mere reason that one of the colleges’ aims is making profit. This paper, therefore, investigates the participation of Private Higher Education Institutions in the management and resources support to current adult education in Tigray and how private colleges are usually viewed by the public education sector. Hence, the objective of this paper is to explore whether there exists major differences in perceiving positively or negatively the educational opportunities being provided by private colleges in Tigray. The researcher employs descriptive research method mainly focusing on both quantitative and qualitative primary data. Data on the perception of people concerning the private colleges was gathered by the following data collection techniques: observation, interviews/questionnaires and document analysis. Informants were randomly selected from public and private institutions. Available secondary data sources from current documents were collected and integrated with the data obtained from primary sources. Percentages were computed to analyze the data. The findings of the study suggest that the participation and contributions of private colleges to higher adult education are significant, which indicates that more household contribution to education can be gained which is essential for learning and further development. However, the study evidenced that the public educators mistrust private colleges for low quality of educational service provision, while the causes of the problems of quality of education and training cannot be problems of the private sector alone. There appears to exist lack of commitment to participate from the education administrators’ side to facilitate essential conditions for true participation in education. They need to share their authority and responsibility to various actors in education, outside of the system, if rapid development is to be achieved.
1. Introduction

Equalization of educational opportunities and reducing regional disparities has become the top priority of the Ethiopian education system. The government designed the Education and Training Policy (ETP) in 1994 from which developed the Education Sector Development Program (ESDP) to improve quality and access to education in rural and under served areas, and to achieve universal primary education by 2015. It is mobilizing resources from multi-lateral and bi-lateral donors; local communities, parents, the private sector and indigenous and/or international NGOs to fill anticipated financial gap (MOE 1999).

Participation in the diagnosis of needs, in the development and implementation of school policy, the design of education content, or the delivery or evaluation of such content is usually seriously constrained. This indicates that the concerned people of poor countries like Ethiopia need to organize and mobilize the local community for contribution of resources to compliment the efforts of their governments in their respective countries in order to achieve a better life by providing quality education.

As stated in the BESO project preliminary plan (BESO, 1999:20), on the one hand Ethiopia is trying to expand access rapidly and to improve the quality of education on the other hand. The questions of quality often compete for resources with the need for rapid expansion, particularly in poor countries like Ethiopia. It is observable that Higher Education in Ethiopia faces many problems both in terms of quantity and quality of provision. Although encouraging results have been gained with the collaborative efforts made by government, private enterprises, non-government organizations (NGOs) and local communities, their concerted efforts are still necessary. The Ethiopian population is growing rapidly. On the contrary, its socio-economic and political features are persistently linked to drought and war. Financial, material, and human resource constraints are
common in the Ethiopian Education System. To meet the demand for greater coverage and access for Higher Education combined with the need for improving its quality and efficiency requires the involvement of the private sector, the local communities and the NGOs intervention and support through projects and participation.

Many public educators (i.e. employees working for government educational institutions), however, seem to dislike talking about profits. But, it is a common knowledge that the motive for many providers of post secondary learning opportunities is profit. New colleges and universities are flourishing, organized as for-profit businesses, and are providing educational opportunities for regular and continuing adult education learners. Concerning adult education, people from all over Ethiopia can be enrolled in credit courses and earn certificate, diploma and degrees, without having to leave their homes.

This paper, therefore, investigates the participation of Private Higher Education Institutions in the management and resource support to current adult education in Tigray, and how private colleges often have been viewed by the public (i.e. government) education sector.

2. **Study Methodology**

The method that the researcher adopted is the descriptive statistics. The data collection techniques include: observation, interviews/ questionnaires, and document analysis. The data source for the study mainly focuses on primary data of both quantitative and qualitative types. In addition, the perceptions of the target population about the educational opportunities of higher learning are well assessed and analyzed.

2.1. **Observation:** Personal observation was used in a qualitative data collection method. Sufficient time was spent with the different groups in the study areas to gain first hand experience and ample field notes were documented during the observation time.
Different questions were forwarded in an informally open way in order to hear what the different target groups think about the training services provided by private colleges in their locality. Observation also included the assessment of training and educational materials available in computer centers, libraries and laboratories, and how they are used and by whom. Thus, the personal observation was used as source of validation.

2.2. Interviews/questionnaires: The Questionnaires mainly focused on the perceptions of the interviewees about the contributions of Private Higher Institutions concerning resource support and management of education in the sub-sector and how they view the private colleges (i.e. colleges owned by private investors) found in their areas.

2.3. Secondary data: Literatures on issues that are facing private colleges concerning recognition, quality, and competition of programs and funding and acceptance by adult educators was read. Current information available on various sources from documents found in the respective offices was collected and integrated into the data obtained from primary sources.

2.4. Sampling Technique and Sample Size: - Sample selection or purposive sampling technique was used. This was done for the convenience of access to private colleges where most of the main campuses of almost all regional private colleges are located in Mekelle. Accordingly, Mekelle-the regional capital and three woredas’ towns namely Adigrat, Shire-Endasselassie, Setit-Humera were included in the study. Two private and 2 public colleges and the Regional Education Bureau (that included the Tigray TVET Commission and the three Woreda Education Offices) were selected for this sample. The colleges included in the study are, from public Mekelle Mid-Level Health Professionals Training Institute and Mekelle College of Teachers Education; from private Poly Institute of Technology and New Millennium College. These colleges and offices were selected by using availability and random sampling techniques. The informants were selected in a manner that ensures best possible representative mix of people in terms of government and private organization they are working for, occupation and the like that enabled the researcher to draw acceptable conclusions on perceptions of people towards private colleges.
The sample population consisted of a total of 55 respondents. These included 20 employees and 20 trainee of both public and private colleges and 15 education officials and experts working at various levels from woreda to regional level in the study area. The employee informants were selected using availability sampling technique in order to include individuals who were closely connected to the education and training services of the region’s colleges. The student respondents were selected using the systematic random sampling technique whose list was obtained from the respective colleges of study.

2.5. Instruments for data collection

For data collection questionnaires/ interview, and documents analysis were used. Two sets of questionnaires were prepared, one for education officials/experts and the colleges’ staff. The second set of questionnaire was for students in the concerned private and public colleges (i.e. colleges run by government).

3. Results and Discussion

3.1 Results

3.1.1 General Characteristics of the Respondents

Questionnaires were distributed to 10 trainees and 10 employees of private colleges; 10 trainees and 10 employees of public colleges; 15 education experts and officials from Woreda to Regional level. In this study, a response rate of 89 was achieved.

As shown in Table1, out of the 49 subjects in the sample, 20 percent are women. The dominance of males is more conspicuous among the workers than among the students. There is only one woman out of the 29 surveyed at these levels.
With respect to age, 98 percent of the respondents are between 17 and 49 years of age. The remaining 2 percent are above 50. This indicates that the highest percentage of age distribution, i.e. 90 percent of the trainees in public colleges is in the lower age position. This is a little larger compared to that of the private college trainees (70 percent). This justifies that some private college students are enrolled at a later age as compared to public university colleges.

Table 1. General Characteristics of the Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics of The Respondents</th>
<th>Pr.C.E</th>
<th>Pu.C.E</th>
<th>E.O.E (REB/WEO)</th>
<th>Pr.C.T</th>
<th>Pu.C.T</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No %</td>
<td>No %</td>
<td>No %</td>
<td>No %</td>
<td>No %</td>
<td>No %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>5 83</td>
<td>13 100</td>
<td>9 90</td>
<td>7 70</td>
<td>44 80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>0 0</td>
<td>1 17</td>
<td>0 0</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>3 30</td>
<td>5 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>6 100</td>
<td>13 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>49 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17-27</td>
<td>7 70</td>
<td>2 33</td>
<td>1 8</td>
<td>7 70</td>
<td>9 90</td>
<td>26 53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28-38</td>
<td>2 20</td>
<td>2 33</td>
<td>5 38</td>
<td>3 30</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>13 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39-49</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>2 33</td>
<td>6 46</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>9 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-60</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 8</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Above 60</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>6 100</td>
<td>13 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>49 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Literacy Level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA/MSc</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>1 17</td>
<td>1 8</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>3 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BA/BED/BSC</td>
<td>9 90</td>
<td>5 83</td>
<td>10’ 77</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>24 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>2 15</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>2 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate Year I</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certificate Year II</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>4 40</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>4 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma Year I</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma Year II</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>2 20</td>
<td>3 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma Year III</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>8 80</td>
<td>9 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Year I</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>2 20</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>2 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Year II</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree Year III</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 10</td>
<td>- -</td>
<td>1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>6 100</td>
<td>13 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>10 100</td>
<td>49 100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Regarding the level of education of the respondents, the share of subjects with MA/BA/BED/BSC degree qualification is 49 percent; and 6 percent of the sample are MA holders. All respondents in both samples of private and public colleges (100 percent) are BA/BED/BSC degree holders and above. This implies that there exists technical expertise.
and supervisory skills at colleges, which are centers where the actual educational and training activities are practiced.

3.1.2 The views of education officials/experts and the private/public colleges’ employees towards the education and training provided by private colleges

As Table 2 shows, 76 percent of the respondents reported their agreement that private colleges address the needs of adult students. A greater proportion of education officials (23 percent) and public college employees (17 percent) seem to disagree with the above idea than the private college employees (10 percent). In addition, some proportion of education officials (8 percent) and public college employees (17 percent) do not differ from the private college employees.

Table 2. Responses on Addressing the Needs of Adult Students

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>E.O.E</th>
<th>Pu.C.E</th>
<th>Pr.C.E</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private colleges accommodate the growing number of adult students.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Strongly Agree</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Agree</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Disagree</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. No idea</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Provision of 29% and 100% 84
Table 3. Responses on the Availability of Varied Flexible Training Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To what extent do you think private colleges have varied flexible training programs?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. High</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Significantly</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Moderately</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Little</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Nothing</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. No idea</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Concerning the availability of varied flexible training programs, diversified answers are observed in the percentages as table 3 reveals. Over half (65 percent) respondents on aggregate have reacted “high”, “significantly” and “moderately” added together.

Table 4. Responses regarding the Availability of Varied Skill Training Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To what extent do you think private colleges have varied skill training programs?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. High</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Significantly</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Moderately</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Little</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Nothing</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. No idea</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Similarly, in answering the question of whether private colleges have varied skills training programs or not, the following results were obtained. On the education officials and experts side, responses were 38 percent each for ‘significantly’ and ‘moderately’ and 24 percent for ‘nothing’. The responses of public and private college employees to the same item were represented by ‘moderately’ and ‘high, which accounted for 50 and 60 percent, respectively.

In Table 5, respondents were asked to what extent they understand that private colleges’ participation is necessary and beneficial for adult learners to enhance their education and to learn the skills necessary to enter into a particular career. The majority of education officials and experts as well as public college employees have similar feelings that they reported medium or low (54 percent) and (83 percent) respectively. The responses of private college employees to the same item was represented by ‘very high’ or ‘high’ which

Table 5. Degree of Necessity and Benefit of Private Colleges Participation in Education for Adult Learners.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>E.O E</th>
<th>Pu.C.E</th>
<th>Pr.C.E</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To what extent do you think private colleges’ Participation is necessary and beneficial for adult learners?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Very High</td>
<td>2 15%</td>
<td>- 17%</td>
<td>3 30%</td>
<td>5 17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. High</td>
<td>4 31%</td>
<td>1 17%</td>
<td>6 60%</td>
<td>11 38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Medium</td>
<td>4 31%</td>
<td>2 33%</td>
<td>1 10%</td>
<td>7 24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Low</td>
<td>3 23%</td>
<td>3 50%</td>
<td>- 6%</td>
<td>6 21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13 100%</td>
<td>6 100%</td>
<td>10 100%</td>
<td>29 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
accounts 90 percent. This indicates that private college employees have positive and public colleges a negative attitude towards this issue.

The item in Table 6 asks if private colleges are under constant attack or not by the public education sector in Tigray. Out of the 29 officials/experts, public and private institutions’ workers 46 percent, 67 percent and 50 percent respectively reacted ‘yes’. This indicates that private colleges are not being encouraged. And this shows that due attention should be given to the private colleges by all concerned; they will lose interest and confidence, otherwise.

Table 6. Reaction to the Current Possible Reasons as to Why Private Colleges Are under Constant Attack by the Public Education Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are private colleges currently under constant attack</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>by the public education sector in Tigray?</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. no response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To further clarify things, inquiries were made on what the respondents perceive about the level of seriousness of reasons for private colleges being attacked by the public sector (see Table 7). According to the responses reasons for attacking private colleges can be labelled as failure in admission requirements. Second standard and/or quality problems and third unhealthy competition.
Table 7. Responses on the Level of Seriousness of the Current Possible Reasons as to Why Private Colleges Are under Constant Attack by the Public Education Sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Possible Reasons</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th>Very Serious</th>
<th>Serious</th>
<th>Less Serious</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports of students receiving low quality education and training</td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admission of students who are not academically prepared simply to get profit</td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unhealthy competition over similar programs between private and public colleges</td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Competition between public and private colleges to take the largest share of the community’s money resources</td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The private colleges do not meet/fulfill the standards of the accrediting commission.</td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A question was asked as to whether the Regional Bureau of Education organizes meetings to discuss issues on resource contributions of different private colleges to minimize duplication of effort (Table 8). Accordingly, the majority of respondents (82 percent) complained that such meetings are rarely and/or never conducted. In this case, the Bureau does not seem to give due emphasis in making use of conferences and symposia so as to facilitate information exchange among different partners.
Table 8. Frequency of Meetings Organized by REB to Discuss about Resource Contribution of Private Colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How often does the Regional Education Bureau organize meetings to discuss issues on resource contribution of different private colleges?</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Always</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Sometimes</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Rarely</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Never</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. I don’t know</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In related matters, an inquiry was made concerning the relationship mechanism that exists to exchange information with different private colleges (see Table 9). This table reveals that 31 percent of the respondents either ‘strongly agree’ or ‘agree’ and 69 percent either ‘disagree’ or ‘strongly disagree’ all together. When seen separately, 69 percent and 50 percent of education officials/experts and public college employees ‘disagree’ and ‘strongly disagree’ on the existence of relationship mechanism, respectively. Eighty percent of the private college employees ‘disagree’ on the same issue. This shows that the type and frequency of reports written and the way meetings are organized are not well developed as the respondents explained during the informal discussion in field observations.
Table 9. Existence of Relationship Mechanisms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does the Regional Education Bureau has formal relationship mechanism to exchange information with different private colleges?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Strongly Agree</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Agree</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The item in Table 10 inquires whether private colleges add varied inputs to cover part of the cost of higher education sub-sector. Out of the education officials/experts, the public and private college employees 62 percent, 66 percent and 70 percent reacted ‘yes’, respectively. In addition, a higher proportion of the respondents 38 percent, 34 percent and 30 percent said “no”, respectively. This indicates that all categories of respondents are dissatisfied with the inputs added so far.

Table 10. Availability of Contributions of Varied Inputs to the Cost of Higher Education

| Question Item                                                                 | Respondents                                                                 |
|                                                                               | E.O E | Pu.C.E | Pr.C.E | Total | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  |
|                                                                               |       |        |        |       | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  |
| Do private colleges add varied inputs to cover part of the cost of higher education sub-sector in your locality? |       |        |        |       | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  | No | %  |
| A. Yes                                                                        | 8     | 62     | 4      | 66    | 7  | 70  | 19 | 65  |     |     |     |     |
| B. No                                                                         | 5     | 38     | 2      | 34    | 3  | 30  | 10 | 35  |     |     |     |     |
| **Total**                                                                     | 13    | 100    | 6      | 100   | 10 | 100 | 29 | 100 |     |     |     |     |
Concerning the extent of contributions, the education officials/experts, and the public college employees seem to have a similar understanding (see Table 11) that 46 percent and 100 percent said, respectively, that the private colleges’ contribution is moderate and/or little in terms of cost. But employees of the private college around 80 percent said their contribution is high and/or significant. There appears a difference between employees of the public and the private colleges on this issue.

Table 11. Extent of Contribution of Private Colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O E Pu.C.E Pr.C.E Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No % No % No % No %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To what extent do you think the private colleges contribute in terms of cost to the higher education sub-sector?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. High</td>
<td>1 8 - - 3 30 4 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Significantly</td>
<td>1 8 - - 5 50 6 22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Moderately</td>
<td>5 38 2 50 1 10 8 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Little</td>
<td>1 8 2 50 1 10 4 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Nothing</td>
<td>- - - - - - -</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. No idea</td>
<td>5 38 - - - - 5 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13 100 4 100 10 100 27 100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

But private colleges’ contribution has a considerable share in terms of student enrolment and job opportunities. Among the four sample colleges (Appendix E) 50.9 percent student enrolment and 49.1 percent of employed personnel goes to the private colleges’ share. The public educators seem to deny the reality that commitment and support to collaboration, participation and partnership among various actors should prevail. Education administrators should have the capacity to reflect administrative and political will to support the private sector which appears to be insufficient.
Table 12. Reaction to the Suspicious View of Many Public Educators on Private Colleges

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E.O.E</td>
<td>Pu.C.E</td>
<td>Pr.C.E</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think many public educators usually view the private colleges with suspicion in your area?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>13</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To further clarify things, an inquiry was made to ascertain whether many public educators view private colleges with suspicion (Table 12). The table shows that the majority (72 percent) of respondents reacted ‘yes’ that they usually view the private colleges with suspicion. Besides, many of the education officials/experts and public college employees give the following reasons for this, in an open-ended question that private colleges’ grading is inflated, there are admission requirement and standard problems, focus is on profit and attracting customers rather than on the quality of education.

3.1.3 The views of private/public colleges’ trainees towards the education and training provided by their respective institution

In Table 13, respondents were asked how helpful education and skills they have gained in their respective colleges to enter into a particular career are. A majority of the respondents have similar understanding and answered ‘very high’ and ‘high’ (80 percent). This positive attitude towards their respective colleges shows that there is no much difference between the public and private colleges’ in educational services they are providing.
Table 13. Responses concerning the education and necessary skills gained

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.T</td>
<td>Pu.C.T</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How helpful do you think are the education and skills you obtained to enter a particular career?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Very High</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. High</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Medium</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Low</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The item in Table 14, inquires whether timely and adequate information about accreditation status is given. Out of the private and public college trainees, 80 percent and 90 percent reacted ‘yes’, respectively. This indicates that there is almost a balanced transparency on this issue in both types of colleges.

Table 14. Responses on the provision of adequate information about accreditation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.T</td>
<td>Pu.C.T</td>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does your college give timely and adequate information about its accreditation status?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A question was raised to both private and public colleges’ trainees to ascertain attitudes towards admission requirements in the colleges they learn. Table 15 shows that higher proportion i.e., 40 percent of the private, 20 percent of the public college respondents
accepted that there is a failure in admission requirements. But the problem seems to double in private colleges concerning this issue. This could be because older and part-time students are enrolled in private colleges and such students appear to be more interested in career preparation and advancement than public college students.

Table 15. Responses on Admissions Procedure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does your college enrol students who do not fulfil admission requirements?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 16 Deals with the aspects of standards of accreditation. In both types of colleges the private (90 percent) and public (80 percent), reported that the standards of the accrediting commission are met.

Table 16. Responses on Standards of Accreditation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr.C.T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think your college meets the standards of the Accrediting Commission?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 17 shows that there is similar understanding between the private and public colleges trainee respondents. In other words, 80 percent and 90 percent of the private and public
colleges, respectively, reacted ‘yes’, that the respondents of teachers in the respective colleges are qualified to the level they are teaching and use appropriate methods.

Table 17. Responses regarding the Qualifications of Instructors and Methods of Teaching

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr. C.T</td>
<td>Pu. C.T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do you think the instructors’ qualification and method of teaching are suitable to the level they are teaching?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This indicates that there is little difference between the two types of colleges with knowledge and skills transfer to trainees.

Table 18. Responses regarding the Use of Working Time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question Item</th>
<th>Respondents</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pr. C.T</td>
<td>Pu. C.T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How do you evaluate most of your instructors in using Classroom sessions appropriately?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Very Good</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Good</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Bad</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Very Bad</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As Table 18 reveals, 50 percent of the private and 20 percent of the public college trainees reported that use of classroom time is ‘very good’. In addition, 40 percent and 60 percent of the same respondents, respectively, reported ‘good’. In general, 90 percent and 80 percent of the private and public colleges, respectively, qualified the use of classroom time in their respective colleges as either very good or good.

3.2 Discussion

As it is evident from the results, private colleges are enrolling a higher proportion of older students between 28 and 38 years of age (30 percent) compared to the public colleges of around 10 percent. These older students could be more part-time students with families and job responsibilities, academically under prepared students and students who are primarily interested in occupational preparation and growth. Private colleges must be prepared for such changes of adult learner profiles, as these trends have been documented by several studies, (Shearon, Templin, and Daniel, 1976; Shearon and others, 1980; Warren, 1995; in Merriam and Cunningham, 1989:327).

With regard to the qualification of teachers, 100% of the respondents in both private and public colleges indicated that teachers are BA/BED/BSC holders and above. According to their responses the required qualification of instructors is fulfilled in both types of institutions. The results of the document analysis seem to substantiate this finding that all trainers in the lists of the respective institutions, except in the health institutes evidence this. Thus, technical expertise and supervisory skills are not as such a problem at the private colleges under study.

However, from their answers to questions referring to the necessity and benefit of private colleges’ participation in education for adult learners, we observe that the respondents from
governmental institutions differ in their view. In the result section, we have seen that a majority of the workers in the public sector seem to point out that the benefit of the participation of private colleges is either low or medium opposed to the response of the private colleges represented by very high or high accounting 90 percent. This suggests a positive change of attitude is required from the public sectors towards the private sector involvement.

We have also seen the difference between the public and private college respondents concerning the extent of contribution of private colleges to the cost of higher education sub-sector. The respondents from private institutions reported high and/or significant (80 percent). Opposed to this, respondents from government sectors (46 percent and 100 percent), said the private colleges contribution is moderate and/or little, respectively.

As to the suspicious view of many public educators on private colleges, it is made clear in the result section, the majority (72 percent) of all respondents from both sides accepted that many public educators usually view private colleges with suspicion. But they differ in the reasons for this suspicion. In an open-ended question, the public educators argue that private colleges’ grading is unfair and inflated; there are admission and standard problems. And a majority of them, they say, focus on profit and attracting customers without bothering about the quality of education.

On the other hand, private colleges’ staff and administrators said the reasons of public educators to distrust private colleges is that they do not go beyond the competition to share the scarce resources of the community. The private colleges argue that they meet the standards of the accrediting commission as do the government colleges, if not more. They further go on to say that they provide timely information to students regarding length and cost of courses, and entrance requirements. They also argue that they recruit qualified
instructors and use appropriate teaching materials and equipment which they say can be
witnessed by their clientele trainees. When the four colleges under study were observed,
the two private colleges had by far better educational facilities and equipment than the two
public colleges. What has puzzled the researcher in this study is how could the issues of
quality and standard bring such a negative perception of the private investment on
education by the category of public educators target groups?

According to Shaeffer S. (1994:13) many case studies give evidence that greater
participation of private enterprises can help the quality as well as the demand for
education. In addition, Shaeffer goes on to say (ibid: 32) that although the politics of a
nation wishes to encourage participation, the administrative side of government may do the
opposite. The bureaucracies and bureaucrats in education ministries may posses
characteristics, which work against more participatory approaches to development, among
which are characteristics identified as particular weakness of the intermediate (regional,
district, sub-district) level of government.

This indicates that devolution of power may not be easily accepted by the administration of
education officials. It requires the sensitization and training of government staff focusing
on the ability to work with the private sector as development partner, how to give some
autonomy to it, and the willingness to trust and support private investment activities.

By inference from the above statements, responses of the subjects and other previous
discussions, the researcher has concluded that: public educators have a negative perception
on the education and training provided by private colleges in Tigray because of lack of
commitment to participate.
The public institutions’ education administrators do not seem to surrender control to the private colleges. Thus, the crux of the problem lies in the difference in understanding the role of the private sector in education and development. Of course, the issues of quality may have an influence on this, but it cannot be a determining factor by itself since we have seen that there could be educational quality problems in both the private and public colleges.

4. Conclusion and Recommendation

4.1 Conclusion

The preceding results and discussions of the study point to the following specific conclusions:

4.1.1 The private investors’ response and involvement towards higher adult education activities are commendable. The private colleges’ contribution has a considerable share in covering the costs of higher learning in Tigray. The contribution to the cost of the sub-sector as obtained from the two private colleges show (Appendix E) that their share of student enrolment and job opportunity is 53.6 percent and 49.1 percent, respectively. This can be supported by the PHRD office (1996:86) reports showing at the time that non-governmental organizations can add more resources to education. This contribution is so young that it needs to be strengthened further. Nevertheless, we can conclude that the private colleges are achieving their objectives in stimulating adult learners and this is promising in solving the high demand of adult higher education. Adults must upgrade themselves if society is to function properly.

4.1.2 As private colleges’ employees confirmed 80 percent ‘disagree’ and/or ‘highly disagree’ that the REB has a formal relationship mechanism to exchange information with different private colleges. In addition, the REB ‘rarely’ and/or ‘never’ organizes meetings to discuss issues on resource contribution of different
private colleges. Accordingly, of the total respondents 82 percent complained that formal and clear mechanism of information exchange among the major stakeholders of higher education is not fully developed. Therefore, more effort is required from the REB to bring about closer working relationships among different partners of the higher education sub-sector in order to minimize duplication of efforts in resource contribution.

4.1.3 Employees working in the public (governmental) education sector institutions show negative attitudes toward education and training provided by private colleges. Whereas the private colleges’ employees are found to have positive attitudes, almost all the trainees in both the public and private colleges have no difference in their educational needs satisfaction. In both the private and public institutions, most the teachers are qualified; except in the health institute where 50 percent of the trainers’ are diploma holders as noted in the field observation. This situation, of course, can be tolerated for there is a scarcity of required professionals. The conditions that satisfy the trainees’ educational needs in both cases are more or less the same. However, in spite of these conditions, a significant number of the public educators reported that most private colleges are mainly concerned with profit.

Of course, the causes for the negative perceptions of the public educators may be many and varied. In most cases, they can be attributed to lack of willingness to trust and support private colleges.

4.2. Recommendations

In view of the findings and conclusions drawn, the following points which are assumed practical are recommended so that the identified problems can be solved or minimized.
4.2.1. The finding that the private colleges are contributing significantly to adult higher learning opportunities is an important implication for the region in facilitating and strengthening private sector support to the higher education sub-sector. To support quality higher education, it is necessary to mobilize additional resources from the many providers of adult learning opportunities motivated by profit. Such contributions are critical in making rapid progress towards the millennium goals of poverty reduction strategy which should be supported. To realize greater private sector participation organized as for-profit businesses, strategies that meet the capacity and needs of the potential beneficiaries should be developed by the regional education Bureaux. This can be applied by reinforcing private and public sector partnerships through the means of regular open communication and cooperative planning.

4.2.2. In designing training programs for adult learners of higher education, the need for better coordination of the multiplicity of resources of higher learning courses calls for wholehearted efforts. To minimize duplication in resource contributions, there is an urgent need for education officials and experts at different levels in the region. They are required to facilitate transparency and information flow among the relevant local government authorities, the concerned private investors running the private colleges and the intended beneficiaries: adults, business and industry, and the community at large. Education administrators should establish and strengthen a TVET counsel and occasionally organize conferences and symposia. This can help to communicate and disseminate information on investment priorities, standards of the accrediting commission, admission requirements, and other related issues like potential problems that might arise in relation to participation when implementing the education and training programs.

4.2.3. The study evidenced that private colleges have often been viewed with suspicion by the public education sector of the region as if they are putting profit above education. But documents on the other side show (Appendix E) that numbers of
student enrolled in the private colleges should be the ultimate gauge by which all schools in higher education are measured. Therefore, to improve this phenomenon.

4.2.3.1. The regional TVET commission/education bureau have to be based, as they should be, upon continual onsite visits to the private colleges or establish a standardized quality control mechanism.

4.2.3.2. The suggestion of Seaman and McDivitt in Merriam and Cunningham (1990:420) can be applied here that the private colleges shall also consider their for-profit motive as the very strength of their existence and growth. Due attention must be given by the private colleges to continue to capitalize upon flexibility and ability to respond quickly to adults’ educational and market oriented training needs. However, the scope of the involvement of the private colleges will depend upon how the aforementioned issues are addressed by legislators, by accrediting commissions and by the potential adult students themselves.

References


Partnership between Public and Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia: Some Key Policy Options

Haileleul Zeleke W.

Abstract

“PARTNERSHIP BETWEEN PUBLIC AND PRIVATE HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS IN ETHIOPIA: SOME KEY POLICY OPTIONS” presents possible options for the advancement of partnership between public and private higher education institutions in Ethiopia. This consultative research also describes the challenges in forming the partnership. To collect the views of the executive management of private higher education institutions (PHEIs) using stratified and cluster sampling procedures, a questionnaire was distributed to the top management of a cluster of nine (old) public universities. The respondents included were the presidents of the Universities, vice presidents, faculty deans and campus deans, officers of the university and heads of departments. With great concern, all executives responded urgently to the questionnaire except a single university management team. Parallel to this, the views of selected managers of 41 private higher institutions were included in the study. The major criterion for selecting these PHEIs was membership of the association of PHEIs, years of establishment, location and type of program. In-depth interviews, focus group discussions, a consultative seminar which was attended by 44 institutional delegates and document analysis was made to gather data. After the consultative seminar which was attended by delegates of 44 institutions, finally, possible policy options were further refined. These policy options are assumed to advance the partnership between private and public higher education institution in Ethiopia. The partnership, in turn, can support massification and advance the quality of higher education. On the basis of these options, to advance the quality of private higher education provision, the following recommendations were made: promotion and implementation of public private partnership options for Ethiopian Higher Education Institutions aggressively, establishment of the Ethiopian Council for Public and Private Partnership (ECPPP), provision of government incentives to quality PHEIs, creation of access to donor support, improving options for overall management and creation of international/national twining (linkage).
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

A significant number of researchers assert that economic and social indicators put Ethiopia as one of the poorest countries in the world. The real per capita GNP for the year 1998 was $100. The figure for low-income economies for the same year was $520 and that of Sub-Saharan Africa was US $480. Using purchasing power parity, which is most indicative of People’s buying powers in their countries, Ethiopia’s real GDP per capita for 1998 amounted to $500, which is the third lowest figure in Africa that is only higher than those of Sierra Leon and Tanzania [The World Bank, 1999]. [The World Bank, 2004].

Realizing this, the country is struggling to break the poverty trap and improve its economic performance through implementing various economic policies. The government has introduced an economic reform plan that emphasizes the use of a free market system and liberalized trade laws to encourage investment in all sectors including education.

In this whole process, it is becoming clear that educating the Ethiopian mass at every level boost the desired economic growth. Education can change the working culture and performance of a society, whereby productivity and individual income will increase. The decomposition of labor productivity into its major components (skills, capital, geography, investment climate, firm size) reveals the importance of each component.

Studies have revealed that a more important source of the shortfall is the difference in skills, as measured by differences in years of schooling, which explains a much larger share of the gap (21 percentage points).

The argument is to emphasize the need for education to come out of the very poor situation under which we are living. For real success, as stipulated in ESDP III and widely discussed in the reviewed background documents, a unified effort has to be made by all stakeholders
sooner rather than later. Educating the masses immediately is the key to increase work productivity in every walk of life; from office to fieldwork and from agriculture to industry.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

No policy framework exists on partnership between public and private higher education institutions in Ethiopia. This absence has reduced the relevance and quality of higher education. Each block has followed its own route. In isolation, each has made significant contributions to the education of Ethiopians. In the absence of policy framework private HEIs have been unable to gain various forms of government and donor support.

The belief that private higher education institutions are established for profit only gives rise to public higher education institutions not sharing the same vision, resources and struggle toward similar goals: quality and relevant education provision for all Ethiopians. Pvt. HEIs are not receiving support from the government or donors as are public higher institutions. All in all, a gap in the partnership exists. This urgently requires a shared partnership policy framework.

1.3. Objective of the Study

This research work has the following major objectives:

- Explore and define partnership policy options for private and public HEIs.
- Identify those options that bring about relevance and quality of education both in public and private higher education institutions.
- Create shared vision and responsibilities among HEIs so that they can jointly work to provide quality education.
1.4. Significance of the Study

This consultative policy research work was conducted to contribute to the development of a partnership policy for public and private higher education institutions. The research, therefore, will help quality higher education delivery modes by private higher education institutions, reduce the cost of training incurred by the MoE, and reduce the cost of training settled by students of Private HEIs. Significantly, HESC, the Association of Private Higher Education Institutions and policy makers can use the recommendations to draft partnership policy document. All in all, teachers, students of both public and private higher institutions, the community and employers can benefit from the outcomes of this policy research.

1.5. Limitation of the Study

Due to critical shortage of time, the responses of relevant ministers of education and donors could not be included, though they received the questionnaire and were invited to seminars.

1.6. Research Methods and Sampling

Procedures

The following research tools were employed to collect data:

i. A questionnaire with 30 questions was distributed to executive management staff of all nine public universities, board members of Pvt. HEIs, three education state ministers, leaders of 41 private higher institutions, 36 experts from Addis Ababa Education Bureau, Oromia Education Bureau, MoE and Capacity Building Bureaus,
and an expert in capacity building. A revised form of the questionnaire focusing on
donor support was sent to: The World Bank, NUFFIC, UNDP, UNESCO, VESO and
some selected potential employers.

ii. A consultative seminar which was attended by 44 delegates of various institutions at
Desalgen Hotel. The seminar was funded by HESC and the Association of Private
Higher Education Institutions.

iii. In-depth interviews with some private HEIs board members, Addis Ababa Education
Bureau, NGOs, employers and graduates.

iv. Descriptive statistics were used to interpret the data.

Context Analysis: A Review

A comprehensive study based on research findings on Higher Education Institutions (HEIs)
that include a large number of colleges and universities in countries of the five continents
had been documented in “Private Higher Education: A Global Revolution” (Altbach P.G.
and Levy, D.G. [2005]). The study was a collaborative undertaking of the Ford Foundation
and the Centre for International Higher Education (CIHE) and the Program for Research on
Private Higher Education (PROPHE). The rise and fall of HEIs all over the globe had been
visited and explicitly examined. The cultures and traditions as conditions of development
are presented. The source of finance, style of management, strengths and weaknesses are
extensively examined. In some cases, higher education is successful when managed by the
public sector while in others it is doing well under private operators. In most of the cases
studied it is hard to understand in whose hand HEIs can become successful. This is so
because in some public higher education institutions (Pvt. HEIs) successes are remarkable
and in others, there is a distasteful failure, which of course is equally applicable to the
private sector.

In the Ethiopian context, the Higher Education System Overhaul (HESO) document
underscores that higher education is a people-based business. This implies that
management of HEIs is central to the success of the operation. With respect to human resources management, the new situation of autonomy and accountability places new burdens and responsibilities on managers and boards within HEIs and presents them with new opportunities for improvement.

In addition, the HESO team has identified a range of other supporting and inter-related recommendations for the Ministry of Education, HEI managers and boards, the Ethiopian Higher Education Strategy Center (HESC), the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Assurance Agency (HERQA), the National Pedagogic Resources Center (NPRC) and the Public and Private University Associations. According to HESO, these recommendations should be seen as an organic whole, which if implemented as a coherent program could lead to significant change and development within Ethiopia’s higher education.

The Education Sector Development Plan III (ESDP III) outlines activities and goals to be achieved over a span of the five years 2005/6-2010/11. Like previous education sector development plans it will also be summarized in a program action plan that will be an output of a nation-wide planning process involving the centre and the regions.

ESDP III indicates that Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and tertiary education (TE) are two areas where private higher education institutions can participate. According to this document, the government is also encouraging private investors to take part in tertiary education. There have been consultative meetings of government and private higher learning institutions over the last five years focusing on higher education leadership and management, monitoring and evaluation of plans and performance, expansion and problems encountered. A concerted effort has been exerted to improve the quality of higher education. As a result, overall management and service rendering in higher education is becoming student-centered. Students and staff are being heard in the management and the evaluative process.
Private delivery of higher education will be encouraged through facilitation of quick access to incentives (for example, land, tax exemption, etc.), provision of technical support and short-term training provided to public institutions. Moreover, joint experience sharing modalities with national and international HEIs will be devised. Mechanisms to foster public private partnerships will also be developed. The annual intake capacity of private institutions is expected to be at least 45-50 thousand by the end of the planning period.

Not ignoring the targeted growth at the base level of the Ethiopian education, the most relevant areas of interest for this research work are the TVET and the tertiary education. These two sectors are discussed in various sections of the ESDP III document. Fields of specializations have reached 25 in government and 16 in non-governmental institutions. The number of TVET institutions increased from 17 in 1996/97 to 158 in 2003/04 and enrollment from 2,924 to 87,158 out of which 47.5% are females. Since the launching of TVET program, 15 TVET institutions were upgraded to diploma level and 3 teacher education colleges at three diploma level expanded to offer additional training programs. Based on the government’s economic and social development strategic plan new training programs are identified, and occupational standards were prepared for 50 priority trades. The contribution and the role of industry and other private partners in the planning, management and delivery of education and training will be maximized.

In the accomplishment of all the plans and programs laid in ESDP III, it is essential that all the available resources within reach have to be genuinely mobilized. In this regard, the private wing of the higher education has to be part and parcel of the whole process. However, the document says little about the future role of the private HEIs explicitly. Even then, it is not too late to consider the full participation of the private institutions. In this same document, it is clearly stated that the enrollment of female students in private higher institutions is higher as compared to the male students. This is indicative of its coherence to the principle of is like enlightening the whole society.
The existence of a public-private partnership policy for higher education institutions has been a worldwide debate. In countries like Canada, the debate resulted in the establishment of the Canadian Council for Public and Private Partnership. Reasons for the need for public-private policy have been sensitive and debatable. In this regard, Levy (2002) argues that the policy is required mainly:

1. To expand supply without changing the product offered by public higher education.
2. To treat similarly what is essentially similar.
3. To make the private public sector more similar.
4. There is private-public distinctiveness but it rests too much on undesirable pursuits or performance. Examples include low quality, for profit or other market excesses and fragmentations that undermine social unity.
5. Alternatively, diversity can be achieved through other institutional divisions.

Therefore, in those countries where there is a firmly rooted and shared policy, private higher institutions can access government funds for staff training and soft loans for the purchase of land, books, and other facilities. Private colleges that access government funds on a soft loan basis may repay part of the debt in kind through the provision of free scholarship to economically disadvantaged students for study at their institution. The debt repayment would be equal to the amount of tuition fee forgone by the colleges (Ashcroft, 2005.) In many situations, private higher education institutions have only one bloodline: collecting tuition fees. Other income-generating mechanisms are negligible. Since income-generating mechanisms are not systematic, they cannot cover all costs of the institution. In some countries, they receive financial support from the government. In India, for example, most undergraduate study is given in private colleges that receive significant support from government via universities with which private colleges are affiliated. Private universities in Japan, the United States and some countries are eligible for various kinds of governments support (Altbach, 2005:18). According to Altbach and Levy (2005) private higher education institutions have numerically dominated higher education systems of Japan, South Korea, Taiwan, and the Philippines for almost a century enrolling about 80%
of all students. In Japan, South Korea, and Taiwan government highly regulate private higher education. In all three countries, a few well-regarded private universities rank close to the top of the academic system (Altbach, 2003).

The part of the world which is least touched by private higher education is Western Europe, where the large majority of students study in the public sector perhaps 90 percent of the total. However, state support has not kept pace with the expanding enrollments; and educational standards have declined in some countries. Private institutions are gradually serving as specialized niches of the higher education market (Ibid).

The regions of Central Europe, Eastern Europe and Asian countries once part of the Soviet Union and dominated by communism now find themselves in the forefront of the expansion of the private sector. In these countries, previously fully public higher education systems have opened up to the private sector (Ibid).

In Latin America an extraordinary breakthrough in research has been concentrated outside the university. Private Research Centers (PRCs) have led a revolutionary surge in social and policy research. These are juridical private and freestanding institutions that do not distribute profits. They usually rank higher in government finance and governance. Attention to PRCs is a vital part of higher education, which can provide new perspectives on the universities to which research centers have formed such attractive alternatives (Levy, 1996).

Many Asian countries have had considerable experience in managing large private higher education sectors, which others are still seeking to establish appropriate structures. In India, where the large majority of undergraduate students attend private colleges, schools are largely funded by the state governments and are closely controlled by the universities to which most are affiliated. The universities are all public institutions and have key administrative and academic control over the privately owned undergraduate colleges.
India’s pattern of public-private management and control is unique and worth studying (Altbach, 2005).

In China private universities were built from scratch. They do not have well-trained faculty and staff who have worked there for decades and have spent their life shaping the culture and soul of a campus. While the older faculty members work only part time to gain extra income, younger faculty staffs who are fresh undergraduates do not have any prior teaching experience and are hired as helpers. Every year, 5-10% of faculties are let go, and the rest have to renew their contracts. Tension and anxiety are thus high due to the uncertainty. Private universities are also disadvantaged by a government regulation allowing these to admit students only after public universities have done so Lin, 2005. The State Education Commission worries that private higher learning institutions will encounter financial problems for which they turn to the government for economic assistance Yang, 1997.

In Malaysia, international linkages, such as accredited programs, twinning programs, credit transfer, and foreign branch campuses were very much exercised by private higher education institutions. It is true that in a rapidly globalizing education and human resource market, higher education and training are no longer confined within national boundaries. In this new borderless educational arena, students and academic staff move to and fro across nations (Lee, 2003).

The government support strategy assumes many forms. In Malaysia, for instance, the support is made through twining arrangements. Since 1997 the Malaysian government has approved private colleges to offer programs in which students can study the whole three-year foreign degree program in Malaysia, without going abroad to the twining partner's campus, Lee (2003).
These private higher institutions get support because the above-mentioned countries have public-private HEI policies. Secondly the institutions are acknowledged for their contributions to the nation’s development. As the institutions are part of the development and change process, they are supported to pass the quality assurance thresholds. Some developing countries have created favourable situations for the expansion of private higher institutions.

Developing countries, which have made good economic progress, have relied on private higher education to contribute the expert workforce that such countries need. These include the Philippines with (80%), Korea (75%), Indonesia (70%), Brazil (65%), Jordan (40%) and Chile (35%) share of private higher education. In the former socialist countries of the Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland and Romania where no private HE existed in 1990, private enrollments averaged 22% of the total in 2001 (Ashcroft, 2005).

The above are indications that developing countries have relied and still depend on private higher institutions for their development process. One should also ask why private higher institutions are not expanding in highly developed countries like Germany. Countries like Germany, unlike the United States, can afford to offer higher education to their citizens freely. Germany also provides free education to other developing countries.

Many of the challenges facing Africa’s private higher education institutions are those confronting its public institutions, though often in different ways and magnitudes. African private higher education primarily plays a supportive role to public sector institutions. If this role is vital, then public policy issues arise over governments lending a supportive hand, trying to shape growth toward meaningful social development. Issues also arise over how both public and private institutions might address challenges together in their systems. Similarly, issues emerge over how best to pursue human resource development, with what mix of competition and cooperation between the two higher education sectors. To approach
such matters intelligently, public higher education institutions, the citizenry, and governments need to take note of the patterns of development, achievements and limitations of the region’s private higher education institutions (Mambizela, 2004).

Research shows that the private revolution is much clearer and more dramatic in developing than in developed regions. Western Europe remains the region with the least number of private higher education institutions, though interesting changes are emerging there, too, and private higher education now has a notable place in New Zealand and Australia. United State private higher education holds rather steady, around 21% but dramatic is the risk of for-profits as well as a more general commercialization of non-profit (and even public) institutions. Japan has just begun to experiment with for-profits (Levy, 2005).

So the private higher education revolution is not about numbers alone. It is also about profound changes within the sector. Beyond “fit” is even the question of leadership: how much, and where does private higher education lead major higher education changes? Additional issues, often crucial for policy analysis as well, concern intersect oral cooperation has in many countries gone as far as formal private institution partnerships with public institutions [Levy, 2005].

**Causes of Massification of Private Higher Institutions in Ethiopia**

In Ethiopia, the expansion of private higher education is a recent phenomenon. The causes for the expansion are not complex. The following are the major causes for the "proliferation" of private HEIs in Ethiopia:

1. **Free Market Economy.** The free market economy demanded highly skilled manpower. This demand could not be satisfied by a handful of higher institutions in the country. Free market economy has promoted private participation in education. Both
government and private sector work to supply highly skilled manpower. To this end, privatization and decentralization policies encouraged private partnerships. The free market economic context of the country, in turn, stimulated the desire for profit, which became the cause for expansion.

2. **Rapid Increase in Ethiopian Population.** Twenty years ago, the population was 25 million. There were only three universities: Addis Ababa University, Alemaya University and Asmara University and a handful of public colleges. In the year 2005, the population reached 73 million. Consequently, to accommodate the educational needs of the growing population, the expansion of the private higher institutions was demanded.

3. **Government Education Policy.** Change in the government education policy framework has become one major factor for the fast growth and expansion of private institutions starting from kindergarten up to private university colleges. The education policy now allows the involvement of the private sector.

4. **Decentralization of Accreditation System.** The establishment of the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Assurance Agency (HERQA) has created transparent systems for accreditation and the legal framework for degrees providing Pvt. HEIs at national level. HERQA accredits colleges and provides policy frameworks of quality. Decentralized systems have been established to assure the relevance and quality of Private HEI’s providing diploma and certificate courses at the regional level. Private HEIs providing diploma or certificate courses can apply for accreditation at the regional level. Consequently, accrediting a small college in a regional level facilitated the expansion. This has other risks. Quality has been compromised in many situations though mass education has been successful.

5. **The Desire to Develop the Country.** There are dedicated Ethiopians who wish to see a prosperous Ethiopia. Some of the Ethiopians who want to educate enable citizens contribute to poverty reduction initiatives of the government have opened colleges. They are committed to invest in higher education in order to reduce AIDS, illiteracy,
unemployment, and ethnic degradation and violence, and emigration to developed countries.

6. **Globalization.** Expansion of the private higher education is a global phenomenon in the millennium. Globalization has been supported by the fast expansion of information and communication technology. Therefore, access to the Internet has created e-learning courses, certified and accredited postgraduate programs and availability of internet resources. ICT has made information, curriculum, course material, books available which in turn promote the expansion of private HEIs.

Therefore, because of these conditions, enrollment to both public and private higher institutions increased recently. The enrollment has expanded rapidly from 1996/7 to 2004/5. The total enrollment to public institutions has increased from 42,132 to 172,111 in the period. It has also been vividly stated in ESDP III that the intake will increase in the planning period, which ends in 2010/11. In the document, it is stated that the yearly enrolment capacity of private higher institution is expected to reach 45,000 at the end of the planning period. In the sector development plan it is presented that:

The Ethiopian government, in its ESDP III plans the intake to Pvt. HEIs to reach 45,000 by the year 2010/11. There are indications that although there are new private higher institution being opened and accredited in the year 2006, the increase in the number of the institutions does not imply an increase in student population.

**ANALYSIS OF SURVEY RESULTS**

The Ethiopian Government has shown great interest in the massification of education and quality tertiary education so as to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), and the reduction of poverty and AIDS. One of the successful paths to the realization of these golden goals has been the involvement of private higher education in Ethiopia. This has been practical primarily because of good quality higher education will support the
development of the country. Those private HEIs with relevant curriculum and courses may respond to the skills shortages in various sectors. In addition, higher education brings benefits to students that can significantly improve their life circumstances.

The policy options presented below are chosen as possible means to an expansion of quality and relevant higher education.

3.1. Questionnaire Response

3.1.1. Qualities of Good Private HEIs as Criteria for Partnership

In receiving the support from the government or entering into the partnership, a private higher education institution must have fulfilled the quality assurance criteria and reached an acceptable standard. HERQA should lay concrete criteria to prioritize and rank all qualifying private HEIs on the basis of quantifiable variables. This research suggests ranking them alongside public institutions to give a full overview of quality issues. It implies that HERQA should rank all public higher institutions. The following variables of quality were presented to the leaders (presidents, deans, department heads) of old Ethiopian universities, private higher education leaders (presidents, deans, department heads) and three education bureau department heads and experts as shown in table one.

The table one shows that all the partnership criteria have been accepted by the leaders of HEIs included in the study. While interviewing leaders, however, some concern exists about the issues of land holding. It was indicated that land has been the least concern for many HEIs. Other issues raised also include student’s retention capacities, and the number of female teachers and students should be included as partnership criteria.
**Table 1:** Partnership Criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Type of Partnership Criteria</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No concern</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>HERQA Accreditation for All Programs</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>95.0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>PHEI with Its Own Land and Building</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>62.6</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>25.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Quality of the Library and other Resource Centers</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Quality of the Academic Staffs</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>95.1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Strong Academic Commission and Senate</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Social Responsibilities and Interaction</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>86.2</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Self Governance and Autonomy</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Staff Security and Retention</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>86.9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Skill and Knowledge Level of the Students</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>89.4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*F: Frequency

Therefore, partnership can be made with those private HEIs, which fulfill these quality measures. Those institutions, which gain high points in a quality examination, can proceed to the partnership engagement with public higher institutions. This process of ranking the best higher education and training provider is also recommended for public universities. The public institutions should also qualify in quality measures and ranking.

This process of supporting the best private HEIs will advance quality and relevance. The fittest will survive to contribute to quality education. However, it is also noted that those small specialist colleges contributing and functioning with quality should also be supported.
3.1.2. Student Enrollment and Accreditation

Due to a sharp increase in the price of educational aids, books and other related facilities, private HEIs have faced serious challenges of resources. Many of them rely on tuition fees as the major and sole source of income. The burden can be bearable when the government controls the intake and allows resource sharing to good quality private HEIs. Similarly, Kate recommends that, “If the private sector is to make its full contribution to the training of Ethiopia’s labor force, there will need to be mechanisms to integrate the expected enrollments in the private sector with those in the public sector. This requires systems to be set up for the overall planning of student numbers, with discussion of those that will be educated in the private sector and those within each public sector HEI” (Kate, 2005).

In order to obtain their responses, the following options were presented to the leaders of HEIs through the designed questionnaire as shown in Table 2. From the table two, it can be observed that all the recommendations were accepted except two issues:

1. Government should not fund public expansion in order not to duplicate programs offered by quality private HEIs; and
2. Government should approve cost sharing schemes in private HEIs.

It was commented that these are issues, which should be decided by each institution and stakeholder. The other contestable issue was that MoE should assign students to Pvt. HEIs was accepted. To increase student’s enrollment to private higher education, an open discussion is recommended by Kate as follows: “The Ministry of Education should hold a planning meeting with the presidents of all the public-sector HEIs. At this meeting these data should be discussed, HEIs should present evidence of demand for new programs that they wish to develop or expand. Heads of private HEIs should be invited to meet the vice minister to discuss their plans on a case-by-case basis and the information should inform the targets for intakes to the public sector. The outcomes of the meetings should include refined intake targets for the coming academic year for public sector HEI” (Kate, 2005).
Table 2: Student Enrollment and Accreditation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Options for Overall Management of Student Intakes and Access to Resources</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Total Fs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Government should not fund expansion in order to duplicate program offered by quality private HEIs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>37</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>MoE should support distance and extension programs offered by quality Private HEIs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>96</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>MoE should place students to private HEIs on the basis of merit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>84</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Students, especially female students, should be sponsored to study in private HEIs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Student from public higher education should be allowed to use the resources in private universities.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>92</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Students from public higher education should be allowed to use the resources in private HEIs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>77</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Government should allocate a certain amount of budget to private HEIs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>85</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Cost sharing schemes in private HEIs should be approved by government.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>57</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Accreditation should be given by an independent body for both private and public higher institutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>105</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.1.3. Public and Private Partnership

The crux of this research project is to suggest key partnership policy issues, which advance the partnership between public and private higher institutions that in turn can stimulate quality education provision in Ethiopia. Table 3 shows the responses for this particular part of the questionnaire.
Table 3: Public and Private Partnership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Public Private Partnership</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No concern</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Joint employment of academic Staff</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sharing Resources</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Joint Research</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Joint Publications</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sharing Curriculum</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Joint Curriculum Development</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Preparing joint Conferences</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Staff exchange and shadowing</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Establishing a student council for PP</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Joint Quality Assurance Undertakings</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Establishing Ethiopian Council for Public Private partnership (ECPP)</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Team Building</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The table above shows that the leaders of HEIs (respondents) have shown their interest in forging the partnership engagement. All 11-partnership variables above have been well accepted by the public and private higher education leaders. The only partnership issue, which was not well accepted by both parties, is the establishment of a student council for public private institutions.

**Government Incentive**

Private higher education institutions have been paying tax on imported items. To support these institutions, the investment authority has been issuing licenses to them so that those accredited colleges could import mini buses and ear marked items. Many have enjoyed the tax-holidays for a maximum of three years. However, quality could be achieved when imported educational materials are delivered tax-free so that education becomes less expensive and less painful for both the students and owners. Tax free items implied include
books, computers, buses for students’ service, instructional soft wares, journals, projectors, lab equipment and reagents, models for clinical and pharmacy courses. Cars for deans should not be allowed.

The other equally important support is provision of land. The support proposed includes provision of land on long-term lease and with soft bank loan to own building. In the Ethiopian context ownership of building and land signify sustainability, progress, and dedication of the owner’s long-term investment. This argument implies that a college with its own building and land is more sustainable. If land is given to a private HEIs, it should be returned to the regulating body if the institute fails to function.

The next significant question here is who should get these tax freedoms and leased land support? According to Kate’s recommendation:

“The government should provide security of tenure to good quality private HEIs for property or land which is or will be used exclusively for educational purposes. This benefit may take the form of a grant of freehold over the land or property or ‘leasehold’ for the land over a period of 25, 50 or 100 years. This benefit will be restricted to good quality private HEIs that have maintained that quality for at least five years and have at least ten shareholders, of whom none owns more than 40% of shares (Kate, 2005:10).”

In these support systems and partnership engagement processes, it is argued that none of the shareholders including the share of family members should exceed 40%. This will ensure right decision, making decision on the basis of votes. This naturally restricts unfair distribution of donations and scholarships. Beyond 40% share holding will lead to an implied decision to lend support to the biggest shareholder or individual. The responses from HEIs leaders are given in Table 4 below.
The responses to all the six incentive provisions are high; except the point of allocating students to private HEIs on a cost sharing basis. This indicates that there is a need for further study on the issue. Finally, it is to be recalled that the government incentives outlined and debated above have also been in line with the MoE as clearly stated in ESDP III.

Private provision of higher education will be encouraged through facilitation of quick access to incentives (e.g., Land, tax exemption, etc.), provision of technical support and short-term training provided to public institutions. Moreover, joint experience sharing modalities with national and international higher education institutions will be devised. Mechanisms to foster public-private partnerships will also be developed. The annual intake capacity of private institutions is expected to be at least 45 50 thousands by the end of the planning period, (ESDP III, 2004:37).

Table 4: Government Incentive

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Type of Government Incentive</th>
<th>Agree F</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Disagree F</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Neutral F</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>VATS And Import Tax Exemption</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>84.2</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Provision Of Land</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>94.4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Provision Of Government Bank Loan of Low Interest For Those Private HEIs In Which None Of the Shareholders Owns 40%</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Access To National Higher Education Connectivity Plan (ICT)</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>95.9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Allocating Students To Private HEIs On Cost Sharing Basis</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>66.9</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>24.4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Take Part In National Research Works</td>
<td>111</td>
<td>97.3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Publicize the Roles of Good Private HEIs</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.5. Donor Support

Public higher education institutions can prepare proposals to MoE to get World Bank sponsored projects like Development Innovative Funds (DIF) unto September 2009. A total of 40 million dollars was credited to the government. Therefore, on competitive basis through DIF and Institutional Development Grant (IDG), donor supports have been given to nine public universities. Through UNDP support, many expatriate staffs have come to Ethiopia to curb the shortage of qualified teachers in higher public institutions. Currently, management capacity building programs have already begun through NUFFIC. Many scholarships are also available. It is strongly recommended that donor supports should be shared with good quality private higher institutions. The response to this vital issue is summarized in Table 5 below.

Table 5: Donor Support

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Donor Support</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Percentage (Average)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Access to staff training (local)</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>90.9</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Scholarship</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>87.3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>DIF (Development innovative Fund)</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>88.8</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>11.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>IDG (institutional Development Grant)</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>UNDP Support</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>83.3</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>NUFFIC Support</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>83.0</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>17.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Research Support</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>96.6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Staff Exchange Support</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>86.0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>14.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Capacity Building Support</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>92.0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fair distribution of donor support can be made available on the basis of fair competition, quality ranking procedures and considering the size of student intake. The respondents also agree that donor support will bring about quality and the desired educational effects.

3.1.6. International/ National Twining

Other partnership can be facilitated through twinning arrangements. A local good quality college can be twinned with a nearby university for various reasons. To facilitate accreditation, set exams, share staffs, curriculum and train staffs. The twinning can also be made with an overseas university. A summary of the type of twining is presented in the table below.

The table above shows that various linkage programs with local or overseas universities can also build the capacity of good quality private higher education institutions. Once twining arrangements between the local higher institutions are made, tripartite arrangements with overseas universities could be established later on.

Table 6: International/ National Twining

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>It. No</th>
<th>Twining</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>No Concern</th>
<th>Total Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Conduct Programs on Behalf of a Foreign Higher institution</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Design and Conduct Exams for a Foreign Higher institution</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Twining Programs</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Credit and Program Transferability</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Conduct Programs on Behalf of a Foreign Higher institution | 80.1 | 9.8 | 9.8 | 122 |
| Design and Conduct Exams for a Foreign Higher institution | 76.3 | 7.6 | 16.1 | 118 |
| Twining Programs | 91.4 | 2.6 | 6.0 | 116 |
| Credit and Program Transferability | 94.0 | 0.9 | 5.1 | 117 |
The Recommendations of PPP Workshop Participants at Desalegn hotel

The workshop participants were divided into five syndicate groups to deliberate on issues and recommendations made by the researchers. After the deliberations they had in their respective syndicate groups, they presented their recommendations to the plenary. Below are a summary of the recommendations:

1. Group One: Government Incentives for Private Higher Education

Government incentives should be given both to public and private institutions.

- Land, soft and long-term loans with low interest rate for constructing self-owned campuses and facilities.
- Criteria for access to government incentives should be developed with the involvement of stakeholders and be made public.
- Equal student recruitment opportunity to both public and private institution
- Introduce special education tax.
- Exempt tax on imported educational inputs.
- Criteria for access to government incentive
  - Broad-based ownership and shared responsibility.
  - No shareholder should be allowed to own more than 40%. If individuals are allowed to have more than 40% and if they can manage to obtain the support of another 11%, then they can monopolize the decision-making process. This will, in turn, discourage others from taking part in the activity.

2. Report of Group Two: "Sharing Resources And Responsibilities"
What are the recommendations identified from the report?

- Sharing: buildings, infrastructure, teaching facilities based on mutual benefits and responsibilities.
- Students should have the right to be enrolled in private higher education institutions with the privileges of government subsidies.
- Create the opportunity of access to educational support materials and teaching/learning resources through various means.
- Support private higher education institutions in human resource development (e.g. scholarship, training, and capacity building).
- Private higher education institutions should have access to government-allocated research funds and be involved in collaborative research endeavour.
- Deregulate the control on the pool of potential higher education institutions that creates critical shortage in supply.
- Allow the private higher education institutions to be part of HE Planning team.
- Promoting private education institutions as genuine and socially responsible bodies based on their performance.
- Strengthen the role of private HEIs in quality assurance.
- Establish an independent national examination board that certifies graduates of both public and private higher education institutions.
- Implement joint appointment of academic staff. Relevant directives should be in place to that effect.
- Fostering participatory joint curriculum development.
- Sharing resources should be based on mutual benefits and responsibility (win-win situation).
- Provided that a positive attitude towards public-private partnership is in place, the following are the priorities.
  - Land
• Loan
• Human resource development
• Joint (collaborative) research


- Support and build the capacity of private higher education institutions as real partners to the public higher education institutions.
- Strengthen the programs of private higher education institutions
- Encourage partnership between public and private higher education institutions.
- There should be a policy on how to get funds from the international donors as well as from the government.
- The two parties prepare projects jointly to be funded by government and other donors.
- There should be a body (e.g. a board) that is formed by both parties which can facilitate and regulate the national educational process and goals.
- There should be a regulation that treats the functions, shares, and roles of both institutions.
- Encourage both institutions to conduct joint programs and research.
- Provide scholarship opportunities for private higher education institution staff in Public Higher Education Institutions.
- Create an opportunity or environment where private higher education institutions get expatriate staff for their programs.
- Support should be made according to the rank order of quality of education provided by the HEI Institutions.

4. Report of Group Four: "Programme Collaboration And Student Exchange"
(The Group modified the topic and focused on Student Enrolment)

Recommendation from the report

Government support should be extended to:

- Programs that are not duplicated;
- Distance education and extension programs;
- Sponsoring female students;
- Allocating budgets;

Resource sharing should be based on:

- Public students – Private;
- Private – Public.

The government should approve cost-sharing schemes in private higher education institutions. This issue is not clearly discussed in the report.

**Major Issues for Private-Public Partnership**

- There is a need for joint planning between the private and public institutions and the process should be transparent;
- Environment of specific groups should be undertaken particularly of female and the physically challenged;
- Students placed in private higher education institutions by government should be allowed to participate in cost-sharing and education loan schemes;
- Certain areas of training should be reserved for private higher education institutions;
- Measures for influencing quality/cost through direct/indirect support should be undertaken. These should include: support for quality, best student enrolment, and cost-reduction measures undertaken and better access.

The following were identified as the advantages of national twining arrangements.

- Physical resource sharing;
- Human resources sharing;
- Credit and program transferability;
- Recognition of degrees;
- Co-researching and sharing research outputs; and
- Capacity building.

**Interest of the Government and the Public**

- Service delivery (upgrading of the skill of staff);
- Financial benefits (rent, service charges, etc.);
- Enhancement of national educational and research delivery standards;
- Sharing the vision of national development.

**Interest of public universities**

- Joint appointment option for staff and institution
  
  Stability;
- Increase internal revenue.

**Priorities: (Top priorities)**

- Physical resource sharing;
- Labs;
- Workshops;
- Libraries;
- Classrooms;
- Human resource sharing;
- Staff (joint appointment);
- Training of staff;
• Transferability of credits and recognition of degrees;
• Upgrading of the quality of national educational delivery; and
• Shared national vision.

Conclusion And Recommendation

Conclusion

It has been argued throughout the research that some criteria should be followed to forge public and private HEIs partnership. The survey shows that the following ground criteria were positively accepted (as is shown in the percentage) as a requirement for partnership: HERQA’s accreditation for all programs (95%), PHEI with its own land and building (62.6%), quality of the library and other resource centers (98.4%), quality of the academic staffs (95.1%), strong academic commission and senate (86.1%), social responsibilities and interaction (86.2%), self governance and autonomy (78.9%), staff security and retention (86.9%), skill and knowledge level of the students (89.4%). Each HEI should fulfill these basic requirements to enter into partnership engagement.

The research shows that government incentives can boost the partnership between public and private higher education institutions. Accepted incentives include: VAT and import tax exemption (84.2%), provision of land (94.4%), provision of government bank loans of low interest for those PHEIs in which none of the shareholders owns 40% (81.8%), access to national higher education connectivity plan (ICT) (95.9%), allocating students to PHEIs on cost sharing basis (66.9%), take part in national research works (97.3%), and publicize the roles of good PHEIs (98.2%).
The research also shows core partnership areas. These key partnership areas include: joint employment of academic staff (71%), sharing resources (96%), joint research (89.5%), joint publications (83.3%), sharing curriculum (86%), joint curriculum development (88.4%), preparing joint conferences (89.4%), staff exchange and shadowing (74.4), establishing a student council for pp(62.9%), joint quality assurance undertakings (88.8%), establishing an Ethiopian Council for Public Private Partnership (ECPP) (92.6%), and team building, (87.6%).

The study has indicated that it is high time to work hand-in-hand as a single body in order to be onboard the contemporary globalization train. The ESDP III document has explored in depth the education need of the nation in order to efficiently expedite poverty reduction and capacity building programs. The already launched TVET and tertiary education institutions are signs of commitment towards changing the very poor situation under which the country is struggling to survive. In the past, enrollment of tertiary education was dictated by the available space in HEIs; not to the successful completion of candidates in their secondary education. In this case, many eligible youngsters are forced to discontinue their studies. At the moment the education sector in Ethiopia is growing very rapidly at the base level in many different forms; under such circumstances there is no guarantee that tertiary level education resources will suffice to absorb upcoming students unless options are sorted out as of now.

In this case then, it is very important for the government to encourage various stakeholders to take part in educating the masses. As it was extensively narrated in the literature review there are various models of regions and countries from which much could be learnt. Since education is resource intensive and time taking by its nature, any hesitation in acting can harm the society for many years to come. At the moment, it is very impressive to see the private HEIs struggling to make a difference in the enlightening process of the Ethiopian population. The major stakeholder of the education sector (the government), has to make
use of this opportune moment to make an astonishing move in order to enable the private sector to provide all the genuine services it is ready to render. For the time being, public and private partnership seems an immediate positive response as it is exercised the world over. Surely, unless we put our resources into one efficient and strong system, as with the rest of the world. Fulfilling the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) seems impossible.

5.2. Recommendation

On the basis of the conclusions reached, the following recommendations were made.

5.2.1. Aggressive Promotion and Implementation of Partnership Options for Public Private Ethiopian Higher Education Institutions.

Specific options recommended include: joint employment of academic staff, sharing resources, joint research, joint publications, sharing curriculum, joint curriculum development, preparing joint conferences, staff exchange and shadowing, joint quality assurance undertakings, establishing an Ethiopian Council for Public Private Partnership (ECPP), and team building. This recommendation will help build shared vision. The synergy will contribute to a rare combination of massification and quality.

5.2.2. Provision of Government Incentives

Shared understanding must be created before government incentives are given to a good quality Institution. One must strongly believe that the private sectors are really benefiting the society. Only then can these specific recommendations be implemented. Governmental incentives recommended include: VAT and import tax exemption, provision of land, provision of government bank loan of low interest for those private HEIs in which none of the shareholders owns 40%, access to national higher education connectivity plan (ICT),
allocating students to private HEIs on costs sharing basis, taking part in national research works, and publicize the roles of good private HEIs.

5.2.3. Creation of Access to Donor Support

On the basis of quality ranking, the size of student population and the quality of proposals, proportional donor support should also be given to the private sector. Donor support recommendations include: access to staff training (local), scholarship, DIF (Development Innovative Fund), IDG (Institutional Development Grant), UNDP Support, NUFFIC support, research support, and staff exchange support and capacity building support. The support should be made directly to the best Private HEIs.

5.2.4. Improving Options for Overall Management

It was generalized that enrollment of the best students to private higher education has relatively decreased. Therefore, to balance quality and reach the desired effect, the following specific recommendation were made: MoE should support distance and extension programs offered by quality private HEIs, MoE should place students in private HEIs on the basis excellence or merit; students, especially female students, should be sponsored to study in private HEIs, student from public higher education should be allowed to use the resources in private universities, and the vice versa. Also, the government should allocate a certain budget to private HEIs.

Creation of International/National Twining (Linkage)

Support systems can be established through twining arrangements. The twining arrangements recommend include: conducting programs on behalf of a foreign higher institution, design and conduct exams for a foreign higher institution, twining programs, credit and program transferability. All in all, these recommendations will create shared
responsibility and vision so that quality should not be compromised at the expense of massification.

References


Higher Education System Overhaul (HESO), Addis Ababa: Ministry of Education.


Strategic Development Plan for Somali, Tigrai and Oromia regions, (Year of Publ. as well as Publisher missing).


Public Private Partnership in Ethiopian Higher Education: an Analysis of the Support the Private Sector Needs to Fulfill its Potential Contribution to the Expansion of Higher Education

Kate Ashcroft

Abstract

This paper is based on a report from the Higher Education Strategy Centre (HESC) to the Ministry of Education in Ethiopia produced by the Public Private Task Force: ‘Interim Report: Options for Support of the Private Higher Education Sector in Ethiopia’. The Task Force was set up by the Minister in 2005. It is also based on a follow up study by Dr. Ing. Kassahun Admassu and Haileleul Zeleke ‘Policy Options on Public-Private Partnership (PPP) for the Ethiopian Higher Education Institutions’. Both reports were submitted to and discussed by the Higher Education Strategy Centre (HESC), the Ministry of Education and the Association of Private Higher Education Institutions.

The paper analyses the benefits of public-private partnership, the process of research underpinning the two reports, looks at their main recommendations and considers what may be done to encourage more action.

The paper suggests two mechanisms should be established to ensure private public partnership supports the implementation of the key recommendations from the two reports:

1. An Ethiopian Council for Public Private Partnership (ECPP) to work out detailed and concrete specifications for consideration of Government, including:

   • The definition of a ‘quality Private Higher Education Institution (HEI)’
   • Ways that the two sectors (Public and Private Higher Education) should cooperate together and the ground rules for sharing facilities and resources
   • Specific and detailed means for allocating government sponsored students between public and private higher education and ground rules for their financing
   • Specific suggestions for improving labor force planning with respect to higher education provision

---

8 Prof Kate Ashcroft is Visiting Professor at the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff and at the University of Northampton. She is Co-Director of Ashcroft and Rayner Consulting Ltd. From 2003/5 she was Acting Director of the Ethiopian Higher Education Strategy Centre and Higher Education Management Advisor to the Ministry of Education in Ethiopia. Until 2003, she was the Deputy Vice Chancellor of the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff.
2. A small working group, the Fiscal and Other Benefits Working Group, set up by the Ministry of Education to develop detailed specifications for financial and other benefits for consideration of Government, including:
   - The financial support for Private Higher Education and the conditions under which is may be allocated
   - Fiscal arrangement and concessions and related qualifying conditions
   - Conditions under which private HEIs may be included in Government-supported twinning arrangements
   - Conditions under which private HEIs might receive donor funds negotiated by Government.

Background

Higher education enrolment in Ethiopia expanded rapidly from 1996/7 to 2004/5: the total student numbers increased from 42,132 to 172,111. The number of public sector universities funded by the Ministry of Education grew from two to nine and is now expanding again by the addition of twelve new universities. At the same time, the established universities have each doubled in size and are expected to grow by a similar amount in the planning period to 2010/11.

During the Derg, Private Higher Education was banned. Since then the private HE sector has developed rapidly. The World Bank (2006) reports that in recent years, a number of private colleges have evolved to meet the demand for university level education. There were virtually none ten years ago and now there are more than 200 private colleges engaged in both diploma and degree programs, with enrolment capacities ranging from a few hundred up to thousands, although HERQA reported in 2006 that only 19 of these were accredited for higher education degrees and a further 28 were at the pre-accreditation stage (cited in Teshome Yizengaw, 2007). Nevertheless, private sector students enrolled in degree level education have quadrupled between 1991 and 2004 and now account for about 9.3% of the total (Teshome Yizengaw, 2007).
In order to meet the Ministry of Education’s sector plan (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 2005), Private Higher Education must continue to expand rapidly from its present base. The annual intake capacity of private institutions is expected to be at least 45-50,000 by the end of the planning period; however, there is anecdotal evidence from a consultative meeting of the Association of Private Colleges and Universities that recruitment to private higher education is not growing, but actually declining as public sector HEIs have expanded.

The Ethiopian government was, and probably still is, keen to support the private sector meet its expansion targets. It needs the private sector to help it meet its own targets and the demand in the country for higher education. To that end, the Minister of Education requested the then Director of HESC and the author of this paper to lead a task force to make policy recommendations as to how to public private partnership could be strengthened to this end. This paper reports the outcomes of this task force (the Interim Report) and a follow-up research study commissioned to complete it. It also reflects on the lack of progress in private public partnership and suggests reasons for this and ways forward.

**The International Context**

Some other developing countries with thriving Private Higher Education sectors include the Philippines (where 80% of higher education is private), Korea (75%), Indonesia (70%), Brazil (65%), Jordan (40%), and Chile (35%). These are supported in various ways: direct government funding to the private sector; tax and other concessions to students for their study needs or to the HEIs themselves; student bursaries; or part payment of student fees. Most students study in private HEIs in Japan, South Korea and Taiwan, (Altbach and Levy 2005) and some of these private universities rank towards the top of the academic system (Altbach, 2003).
In some countries the distinction between Public and Private Higher Education is blurred: in the UK, public sector HEIs charge students up-front fees and in Australia, high school graduates who reach the matriculation standard but are not offered a subsidized place within a public HEI, may pay full-cost fees in order to secure a place at that institution. In many countries, the private sector is eligible for donor funding. In others, private colleges can access government funds for staff training and post-graduate education, or ‘soft loans’ for equipment purchase and/or building construction.

In some Asian countries, support includes long term loans for capital and estates improvement; assistance in payment of salaries; staff secondments; subsidies for the development of research facilities; opportunities for private HEI staff to compete for post graduate bursaries; tax exemptions on expenditure or donations to the HEI; and participation in cultural linkages projects (see for example, Johnstone: 2004).

In most developed countries, in awarding contracts for any service including training, public sector organizations must consider which organization provides ‘best value’, whether or not it is in the public sector (see for example World Bank Procurement Processes).

In Ethiopia, Private Higher Education is hampered by questions of land tenure. In most countries that have a well developed higher education system, most land is not owned by the state and may be freely purchased by private organizations, so this is not such an important issue. Where a local authority or other public body does own land, very often it will sell or rent it on a long lease at a reduced rate. Planning rules in many countries take account of the social value of education and so it may be easier to get planning permission to build an educational establishment than for other purposes.
The Benefits of Public Private Partnership

If Private Higher Education is strengthened through public private partnership, students, the country, government and public and private HEIs will accrue a variety of benefits.

There are strong incentives for students to choose Public Higher Education rather than private: in terms of tuition fee, food and lodging and the facilities and quality of education provided by some public universities. On the other hand there are benefits to students of a strong Private Higher Education system. The best private HEIs have good standards, facilities and instructors and more students (especially female students) can study close to their home. Private HEIs can employ staff on a casual basis, and only renew the contracts of those that prove to do a good job. It is likely that private HEIs can be more flexible in their curriculum, respond to employer and other needs more quickly. Many are more focused, developing expertise and mastery in a limited range of subjects and deep relationships with employers in particular sectors, rather than trying to be comprehensive universities. They may therefore find it easier to ensure high quality pedagogy and relevant curricula.

There are some aspects of higher education offered by private sector HEIs that are valuable to the country over and above adding to the numbers of educated professionals, particularly the education of women. Proportionately more women are educated in the private sector (Teshome Yizengaw, 2007). The ‘value added’ to society of higher education for women may be greater than for men (see for example, Morley et al: 2005 and Hertz: 2004).

From the point of view of the country, a thriving Private Higher Education system is likely to raise standards. Private higher education institutions give students choice: choice brings many into the higher education sector who would not otherwise study at that level. If the education in a college is substandard, students will be less likely to sign up for courses.
The operation of market forces, therefore, makes it likely that the better private HEIs will survive in the longer term and poor quality institutions will go out of business. In the public sector, students in Ethiopia are sent to a particular HEI (they cannot exercise consumer choice). Of course, for the market to operate well, students must have good information about quality and employment outcomes. This is where assessments by the Higher Education Relevance and Quality Agency (HERQA) adds real value to the system and will be an essential driver for quality enhancement. Another advantage of a healthy private sector is that it is less bound by tradition and bureaucracy and tends to have a leaner and more efficient administration: it can show the system as a whole new ways of doing things (examples include St. Mary’s University College as the first in the country to undertake a full quality audit and Microlink Information Technology College’s on-line administrative systems). In addition, the private sector may be more flexible, able to adjust their systems to make them more efficient in areas such as procurement that act as a break to public sector institutional development.

The government has an interest in a healthy private sector since it provides the professionals the country needs at no or very little cost to the state. It also helps to meet government targets for progression from secondary school and the higher education of disadvantaged groups. They will accept students with lower school leaving scores than the public sector institutions, thereby allowing opportunities too many who otherwise would be denied them. As secondary education has expanded the demand for higher education increases. The private sector helps to ensure that not too much of this demand is frustrated. In addition, the Government wishes to raise the GER (general enrolment rate) in higher education from 1.5% towards the 3% that is average for Sub Saharan Africa (Teshome Yizengaw, 2007). Private HEIs can help to achieve this ambition.

The government is likely to find that it is in its interest to support Private Higher Education financially and in other ways to prevent fees in private sector institutions from rising too steeply and to support quality. If such help is not forthcoming, students will be discouraged
from attending private sector institutions and apply in greater numbers to public sector education. If this happens to any great extent, the state will end up educating students free of charge whose families can well afford to pay for their education. This is a drain on the state coffers.

Once a quality higher education is offered in private colleges and certified as such by HERQA, Government will need to support its continuation by employing its graduates without discrimination. If it does not, again, it will find that the tax payer is funding education that could be financed by students from relatively wealthy families themselves. This would create an indirect subsidy to the richer section of the community by the poor: something that a developing country such as Ethiopia should avoid.

The private higher education sector should also benefit from public private partnership. Most quality private higher education is to some extent idealistic. There is a strong ethos within many institutions of care for students and the desire to serve the interests of the county. Public private partnership should help these missions to be realized. At a more pragmatic level, such partnerships should reduce the barriers to achievement and expansion, for instance through fiscal and land tenure reform.

On the other hand, the private sector must be clear that there will be costs as well: government support is bound to result in some loss of autonomy and sharing of resources with public HEIs. It will take management time and result in some inconveniences as well as benefits.

If the sector goes into such partnerships cynically, looking just for what they can get out of them, the benefits outlined above will not be realized and the partnerships will end in disillusion and frustration on all sides.
Methodologies for the Two Studies

By 2003, the Government has accepted the desirability of a strong, healthy and influential private higher education system. This was signaled in various ways: through the provisions of the 2003 Proclamation (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 2003); the place given to the expansion of private higher education in ESDP3 (Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, 2005); the places on the Boards of HESC and HERQA reserved for nominees from the private higher education sector; and finally by the setting up of the private public task force in 2005 to come up with concrete proposals as to how the sector might be supported in its expansion which is reported in this paper.

The Interim Report was conducted through a review of literature and what was intended to be an intensive period of study and reflection by a representative group. Unfortunately, due to a variety of reasons (such as the imminence of elections and the Public Sector Association of Universities failing to nominate representatives), the group was not established for some time. When it was finally established, attendance was very poor. In the end, the report was largely completed by the Chair, based on a review of previous reports in the country (for instance Ashcroft 2004), international literature about practice elsewhere in the world and intensive work with a small focus group, which met weekly with full attendance, consisting of the following members:

Prof Kate Ashcroft (Chair): Acting Director of HESC
Kebbese Tika: President Kunuz College
At Solomon Shiferaw: President Adama University/Vice Director Designate HESC
Dr Kebebe Yadetie: President Zega Business College
Professor Eshetu Wanceko: President Alpha University College
Dr Daniel Kitaw: President NECAT TVET College
Because it was recognized that this methodology could identify only the broad parameters for possible action, and because the Chair of the group was about to finish her term of office within Ethiopia, it was agreed that the results should be considered an interim report and a further research project should be undertaken to build on these foundations and firm up recommendations. A tender was put to the public and private universities and two researchers were identified to do this work: Dr. Ing. Kassahun Admassu and Haileleul Zeleke.

These researchers produced a study and recommendations based on the following methodology:

- A questionnaire distributed to the executive management of all 9 higher education institutions, public universities, and board members of private HEIs, three education state ministers, leaders of 41 Private Higher Education Institutions, 36 experts from Addis Ababa Education, Oromia Education, MoE and Capacity Building Bureaus, and an expert in capacity building. A revised form of the questionnaire focusing on donor support was sent to: The World Bank, NUFFIC, UNDP, UNESCO, VESCO and
- some selected business people. (It should be noted that not all of these were returned – see below.)
- Focus Group discussions with the owners of private HEIs and key donor organizations.
- In-depth interview with board members from some private HEIs and members of Addis Ababa Education Bureau, NGOs, employers and graduates.

This means that, between them, the two studies had the benefit of an in depth look at the Ethiopian and international contexts, the views of a range of stakeholders and in depth consideration of the issues by a highly expert panel.
The Interim Report

The Ethiopian Government is interested in supporting the expansion of private higher education, not as an end in itself, but primarily because an expansion of good quality higher education will support the development of the country. In addition, higher education brings benefits to students that can significantly improve their life chances and that of their families. The options outlined below were included in the Interim Report as possible means to support an expansion of quality and relevant Private Higher Education.

Recommendations for student intakes within the higher education system

The Interim Report suggested that, if the private sector is to make its full contribution to the training of Ethiopia’s labour force, systems will need to be set up for the overall planning of student numbers. If substantial practical and financial support is to be given to private higher education by Government, there should be a mechanism to plan for the resulting contribution by the sector and this plan should be integrated with that for the public sector HEIs, focusing for example on different areas of expertise nationally and locally.

In Ethiopia, at the present time, there are insufficient data for labour force planning. Nevertheless, the report recommended that the Ministry of Education should obtain such data as are available about projected labour force needs. It should develop a broad picture of the pattern of student numbers across the whole sector and create draft intake targets for particular HEIs that it considers desirable. Once a year, the Ministry of Education should hold a planning meeting with the Presidents of all the public sector HEIs. At this meeting these data should be discussed, HEIs should present evidence of demand for new programs that they wish to develop or expand. Heads of private HEIs should be invited to meet the Vice Minister to discuss their plans on a case by case basis and the information gained
should inform the targets for intakes to the public sector. The outcomes of the meetings should include refined intake targets for the coming academic year for public sector HEIs.

There are some indications that this recommendation is beginning to influence Ministry policy, albeit indirectly. The HESC is due to undertake some labour market analysis in order to inform intakes into higher education. However, there seems little involvement of the private HEIs in national intake analysis. Ideally, a deeper analysis of labour force needs will start to influence which courses both private and public HEIs develop and expand at the expense of others.

**Recommendations for cooperation between public and private sectors at the local level**

The interim report recommended that the Government should enforce its target intakes in various subject(s)/programme(s) for each public sector higher education institution through the funding formula. Since the funding formula has not yet been introduced, this recommendation has not been implemented.

The report suggested that there are advantages if the local public sector HEI does not expand intakes in subjects and programs that are offered in the good quality private HEI, since the private sector can produce the graduates that system needs for no cost to the state (or little substantive cost). It therefore recommended that where there is a good quality private HEI in an area offering particular courses, the Government should negotiate a rate of expansion in those subjects with the private HEI to meet local demand. In return for the achievement of this rate of expansion, the government should not fund expansion of the intake of a local public sector HEI in these courses. It also recommended that, where a public sector HEI is found by the HERQA to be offering poor quality provision in two consecutive quality assessment visits in particular subject(s) or programme(s), and where there is a good quality private HEI able to expand its provision in those areas, the
Government should terminate funding through the funding formula to that public sector HEI for further intakes into those courses.

HERQA’s quality audits are at an early stage so it cannot be expected that these recommendations have yet had much effect.

Sometimes students wish to study a combination of subjects (engineering and business for example) that are of use to the country’s economy and which cannot be offered in a private institution because it lacks the facilities to teach one of the subjects. There are advantages to the country in HEIs offering a wider range of joint degrees (i.e. those with two or three subjects). Research for the 13 new HEI project undertaken by the HESC (Ashcroft 2005b) indicates that employers in particular would welcome graduates with such combinations of subjects. The report therefore recommended that, in areas where there are a public sector HEI and one or more a good quality private HEI, a joint committee should be set up to investigate and facilitate cooperation and sharing of curriculum, staffing and other resources.

The government and local authorities have a vested interest in securing the best and most suitable training for their staff (for example, those working in public sector HEIs, ministry’s, national authorities and services and regional bureau). The report therefore recommends that, when looking for trainers for their workforce, public bodies should be required to undertake a ‘best value assessment’ that takes into account quality and relevance as well as price to assess whether a local good quality private HEI or a public sector HEI should be offered the contract for that training. ‘Best value’ should be determined by standard procedures developed by procurement specialists. It also recommended that staff within good quality private HEIs should have access to training and other support provided by donors for strengthening the higher education sector. Around 20% of such funds should be set aside for this purpose. The mechanism for distributing the benefit should be negotiated as each project is set up. In addition, a
maximum of 10% of available scholarships should be made available to staff in the private sector. These scholarships should be publicly advertised. Each candidate for such scholarships should be asked to make a case based on how the award of the scholarship to that candidate would benefit the country.

**Recommendations for private HEI access to donor support**

The report found that other donor funded projects allocated on a competitive bases, such as the World Bank Development Innovation Project (DIF), could increase quality and it recommended that 20% of such funds should be set aside for good quality private HEIs. Such HEIs should be expected to compete for access to the fund on the same basis as public HEIs.

Good quality private HEI should have access to workshops and evaluations organized in connection with such funds and to be represented on the review panels and other bodies regulating such funds and that up to 10% of such funds might be allocated to be shared amongst good quality private HEI, provided either:

a) Such an allocation is supported by an action plan showing how the funds allocated will enable the HEI to attain government objectives (for instance in terms of expansion, new undergraduate or postgraduate subject areas or relevant research).

b) Such an allocation requires ‘repayment’ in the form of tuition waiver scholarships for female or disabled students who could otherwise not afford to attend a private institution. When the sum total of the scholarships (calculated on the basis of the value of the fees waived) reaches the amount of the grant awarded, the ‘debt’ will be considered to have been repaid.
Recommendations for Government incentives for the expansion of private higher education

Private sector PHEIs must pay import tax and VAT on a variety of goods purchased for educational purposes. This makes the education more expensive than it would otherwise be and discourages investment in educational equipment and materials. The report therefore recommended that good quality private PHEIs should be issued with a certificate to enable them to reclaim VAT and import duty on particular items to be used for the support of educational purposes (teaching and administration). Ministry of Education staff should facilitate the import of such goods. Customs officials should be provided with documents that ensure that particular categories of imported goods ordered by named good quality private HEIs are processed quickly and easily.

Private sector HEIs have to invest in capital and plant to provide good quality facilities for their students but they have no security of tenure in their property or the land on which it rests. This discourages investment. The report recommended that the government should provide security of tenure to good quality private HEIs for property or land which is or will be used exclusively for educational purposes. This benefit may take the form of a grant of freehold over the land or property or ‘leasehold’ for the land over a period of 25, 50 or 100 years. This benefit should be restricted to good quality private HEIs that have maintained that quality for at least five years and have at least 10 shareholders, none of whom owns more than 40% of shares.

It also recommended that the Government bank should offer discounted (soft) loans of 2% to any good quality private HEI for the purchase of equipment, buildings or capital for educational purposes, provided that the HEI has maintained that quality for at least five years and which has at least 10 shareholders, of whom none owns more than 40% of shares.
If the private sector is to fulfill its role of providing graduates with the necessary skills and qualities for the workforce, students and instructors will need access to good ICT connectivity. The report recommended that the needs of the private sector should be built into the national higher education connectivity plan and the HESC should include the private higher education sector within its reports into the higher education ICT strategy.

**Access incentives**

Ethiopia needs greater access to higher education for a variety of disadvantaged students for social and political reasons. These cannot always be accommodated by a local public sector HEI. Private HEIs are in a good position to meet local access needs for higher education. They tend to be smaller and more specialised and so can afford to set up in towns that could not support a comprehensive public university. Many have also developed extensive distance learning programmes that could be expanded.

The report therefore recommended that, where there is a good quality private HEI in an area where there is no public sector HEI, the Government should pay 100% of the fees of a set number of women students, poor students and those with disability to study within the good quality private HEI and 100 birr per month towards their living costs. The Government should determine the criteria for the selection of such students and the HEI should advertise the scheme in their area, set up a fair and transparent selection scheme and should administer the scheme. Where the HEI has received donor funds for direct institutional support (see above), they should not receive the fees directly from Government, but rather set them against the repayment of their ‘debt’ in relation to the grant.
The Follow-Up Report

The follow up report echoed many of the recommendations from the interim report, but added considerable detail and additional specific suggestions. They are briefly summarized below:

Aggressive promotion and implementation of public private partnership options for Ethiopian higher education institutions

Like the Interim Report, this study suggested that there should be more cooperation between the public and private HEIs. It suggested some of the following options: joint employment of academic staff (already possible, but underutilized); sharing resources; joint research; joint publications; sharing curriculum; joint curriculum development; preparing joint conferences; staff exchange and shadowing; joint quality assurance undertakings; and team building. It went further to suggest a mechanism for this: an Ethiopian Council for Public Private Partnership (ECPP). This suggestion is taken up and expanded upon in the conclusion to this paper (see below)

Provision of government incentives

Like the Interim Report, this study recommended that governmental incentives should be provided including VAT and import tax exemption; provision of land; provision of low interest bank loan by the government where none of the shareholders owns more than 40%; access to national higher education connectivity plan (ICT); allocating students to private HEIs on costs sharing basis; taking part in national research works; and publicizing the roles of good private HEIs.

Create access to donor support

Like the Interim Report, this study suggested that private HEIs should be able to access donor support in relation to access to staff training (local); scholarships; DIF (Development
Innovative Fund); IDG (Institutional Development Grant); UNDP Support; NUFFIC support; research support; staff exchange support; and capacity building support.

**Improve options for overall management**

In order to improve student access to higher education, the report recommended that the Ministry of Education should support distance and extension programs offered by quality private HEIs by allocating students to private HEIs on the basis of excellence or merit. It further recommended that students, especially female students, should be sponsored to study in private HEIs and that students from public and private universities should share the resources of both types of institution with the government allocating a certain amount of budget to support such sharing.

**Create international/national twining (linkage)**

The report recommended that private HEIs should be included in twinning arrangements. This would enable them to conduct programmes on behalf of a foreign higher institution, design and conduct exams for a foreign higher institution, twining programs and credit and program transferability.

**Conditions for Government Support**

No government will give the private sector a blank cheque to support its expansion. There must always be conditions and some ‘pay back’ in terms of quality and contribution to public priorities. In Ethiopia, it must be recognised that there is considerable variation in the quality of education offered by private PHEIs. The experience in other sectors in Ethiopia and in education on other parts of the world indicates that competition can improve quality, but for this to be certain and to protect the public interest, HERQA must establish a more rigorous form of licensing and accreditation for private higher education.
This system will need to distinguish between those PHEIs that are ‘good enough’ for accreditation and those that qualify for an extra ‘good quality’ rating and so can benefit from the incentives discussed in this paper.

In the Interim report it was recommended that the HERQA would certify an HEI as a ‘good quality private HEI’ when it had achieved the following:

1. Accreditation procedures have been successfully completed for its programs;
2. The institution has conducted a quality audit according to HERQA guidelines, with the assistance of outside facilitators.
3. The institution has developed a quality action plan building on the recommendations of the audit.
4. The institution has achieved a good quality assessment report from HERQA in the higher education subject(s)/program(s) it offers and at institutional level.

If HERQA ultimately decides to focus only on institutional review as seems likely, this last criterion will need to be modified.

In a developing country where resources are scarce and subsidy to one area such as higher education means an opportunity denied to another (e.g. primary education or health), higher education cannot be supported as a good in itself, nor because it advantages students, but only if it benefits society, and in particular reduces poverty and aids development. It is likely that an expanded private higher education sector is of benefit to the country, but the private sector tends to focus on the social sciences and those technical and professional subjects that are not resource intensive to deliver. It is generally less involved in subject areas that are capital intensive and expensive to teach. This means that private higher education is useful in-as-much as it educates students without cost to the Government in certain subjects, freeing resources for the public sector to focus on more expensive areas but less useful in supplying much needed scientific and engineering skills. Private HEIs may wish to think about a more balanced portfolio to convince Government
that it is worth investing more in their sector. Of course, part of the quid pro quo is that the student pays for most or all of the costs of tuition in the private sector and so the taxpayers of Ethiopia are not paying for the education provided.

There is, of course, no mechanism in a democracy for enforcing the targets agreed by the private HEIs apart from the withdrawal of incentives. The Government must rely on their good will and best efforts, or develop contracts in return for benefits such as financial support and tax concessions. This is not the case for the public sector institutions, since Government funds them directly and so can demand certain outputs. In order to regulate the system and ensure an appropriate supply of graduates in particular areas to meet the social and development needs of the country, many governments provide HEIs with intake targets for each subject or programme. The private sector must expect to accept some targets if the government is to invest in it. This implies there needs to be some sort of ‘social contract’ between the private HEIs and government,

**Conclusion**

It must be admitted that there were weaknesses in the two reports. In the case of the interim report, the Task Force was not successful in that meetings were poorly attended and most members did not contribute to the preliminary report in any meaningful way until it was replaced by a smaller focus group. This group did work intensively and produced some useful thinking.

Neither set of report authors had the time nor the resources to properly research what might be the factors that would provide the engine for the expansion of quality private HE. In the case of the second report, the time allotted to finalize the research was one and half month. Ministers of Education and some donors did not respond to the request to fill in the survey and time did not allow follow up. The timing of the study has also coincided with the European Christmas and New Year, which made it difficult to get information from NGOs and other development agencies.
Despite these difficulties, the two reports in combination provide a useful expansion of thinking about private public partnership in higher education and how it may be developed to support both expansion and quality across the sector. Nevertheless, progress has been very slow. This lack of progress may be the result of a variety of factors:

- There was a change of leadership within the Ministry of Education at the time of the Interim Report’s publication. This may have meant that, since they had not commissioned the report, Ministers had less of an interest in its outcomes.
- The exploration of public private partnership might not have been a direct interest of the government, but rather a means of appeasing donors who wished to see more recognition of its role by government as a condition of increased funding.
- The new leadership in the Ministry may have been distracted by other priorities in their first months in office
- There might be a residual suspicion of the private sector and its ability to deliver quality higher education in some parts of government.

It is the belief of the author of this paper that the reasons above are unlikely to have been the main obstacles to progress. It is more likely that the reason is that the two reports contain such a plethora of suggestions that the government and public sector HEIs do not know where to begin. Each suggestion is complicated to implement and requires more management and leadership time and expertise than may be readily available within the Ministry of Education. For this reason, this paper suggests that the way forward may be to focus first on mechanisms for action. Below two suggested mechanisms are put forward:

1. It may be useful to set up an Ethiopian Council for Public Private Partnership (ECPP). This would need to be set up and funded through the Ministry of Education, perhaps with the financial support of the donor community. This could be a non statutory body that reports to the Presidents from both sectors (through quarterly reports to the monthly meeting between the Presidents of the public universities and the Minister and to the Private HEI Association) and comes up with carefully phased, detailed and concrete
formulations as to how the two sectors could work together to mutual benefit. These suggestions could include a limited number of pilot projects for cooperation that might be extended at a later date.

As a second stage, this body could also come up with specific suggestions as to mechanisms, rules and draft contracts for the allocation of government sponsored students between public and private higher education and the sharing of resources.

Since the public and private HEIs and the Government would each have an interest in this cooperation and since there would need to be some allocations from the higher education budget, it is suggested that this group should be a small working committee consisting of people from the public and private HEIs and the Ministry of Education.

This body should work out carefully phased, detailed and concrete specifications for consideration of Government. At a minimum these should include:

- The definition of a ‘quality private HEI’
- Ways that the two sectors should cooperate together and the ground rules for sharing facilities and resources
- Specific suggestions as to the allocation of government sponsored students between public and private higher education and their financing
- Specific suggestions for improving labour force planning with respect to HE provision.

2. The provision of various ‘official’ benefits and incentives will be more complex than it appears at first sight. It seems sensible for a small working group, the Fiscal and Other Benefits Working Group, consisting of key representatives from each of the private HEI Association, the MoFED and the Ministry of Education to look at each of the recommended financial, fiscal, twinning and donor benefits in the two reports and come up with detailed recommendations, rules, contracts and guidelines to Government. This group should be a non statutory body that reports to the Presidents in the same way as the ECPP.
These recommendations should be carefully phased to make their consideration and implementation feasible. They should include how and the conditions under which the benefits would operate to ensure the country receives appropriate social and economic payback. They should specify how these benefits should be monitored and quantified. Again, this group should set up and funded through the Ministry of Education, but could be supported by the donor community.

This body should work out detailed and concrete specifications for consideration of Government. At a minimum these should include:

- The financial support for private HE and the conditions under which is may be allocated
- Fiscal arrangement and concessions and qualifying conditions
- Conditions under which private HEIs may be included in Government supported twinning arrangement
- Conditions under which private HEIs might receive donor funds negotiated by Government.

These two groups must be careful in developing recommendations as a phased programme. The Ministries in Ethiopia and the higher education sector have capacity problems and overly complex or too numerous recommendations may not be achievable. It is therefore suggested that the two groups each develop one recommendation at a time, think through all the ramifications, come up with detailed guidelines and rules for its implementation and discuss these with all stakeholders. Once a recommendation has been fully developed, understood and accepted, the group may start work on the next one. This means that these groups will operate for some considerable time and the public and private higher education sectors will need to be willing to support them in terms of personnel commitment and adequate per diems for the members. This investment seems to the author of this paper to be well worth while and that it should be supported by all who have the interests of Ethiopia and poverty reduction at heart.
There are many advantages to a development of public private partnership in Ethiopian higher education. It is particularly appropriate a time when the country is expanding the number of enrolment into higher education in order to create the professionals it needs to secure its poverty reduction strategy. What the country needs is for the two sectors to work in partnership for the benefit of the country as whole and to create an integrated, coherent system, rather than to develop along two parallel lines that never meet.

References


Kassahun Admassu and Haileleul Zeleke W 'Policy Options on Public-Private Partnership (PPP) for the Ethiopian Higher Education Institutions'. Higher Education Strategy Centre, the Ministry of Education and the Association of Private Higher Institutions, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia


The Role of PHEIs in Educational Provision and Organization for
HRD & Socio-Economic Development

Yalew Ingidayehu
Addis Ababa University

Abstract

At present there are many highly recognized PHEIS making educational provision and services in equity and quality at regional and national levels in Ethiopia. This alone has made a great contribution to the development of higher education in Ethiopia by proving wider and greater educational opportunities for those who are denied to access to government HEIs. Similarly, PHEIS of today can play significant roles in the provision and organization of basic and continuing education for socio-economic development and HRD of the count.

The purpose of this paper is, therefore, to investigate the vision, mission and prospects of PHEIs in addressing socio-economic and human resources at the turn of the Ethiopian millennium based on the following basic question.

1. What are the major models of development that can be addressed in PHEIs education system?
2. What type of education programs and courses need to be designed and implemented by PHEIs to address the envisaged basic and continuing education for development?
3. What mode of educational delivery system need to be utilized in the provision of this development oriented course?

The methodology of the study is a descriptive survey based on the data collected through document survey, questionnaire and interview. Finally, based on the data and information gathered and analyzed, the highlights of the findings, conclusions and recommendations are presented.

-----------------------------------------------
Background of the Study

The greater challenges of higher education institutes is their reluctance in accepting the fact that in the age of globalization “development is…education driven” (Syoum, 2006:2) as clearly stated by Kidd (1978:53) below:

“Development and education are related processes of purposeful and organized change. Thus, whether overtly or not development is always interwoven with education.”

Many universities and colleges in both developed and developing countries (like the United Kingdom and Tanzania) are engaged in the provision and organization of programs and courses that address the socio-economic development needs and demands of individuals, society and the nation at large. For instance, many universities in the United Kingdom (like University of Ulster NATingham and Sussex) have basic education extra-mural programs and continuing education programs parallel to their liberal and elitist centered programs. Particularly, the Continuing Education Institute of Ulster University in United Kingdom has a foundation program that provides basic skills oriented agricultural and vocational as well as technical courses for adult learners. It has also higher level continuing education programs (leading to a higher level diploma and degree) that are geared to training high level technicians, vocational workers and professionals to meet the middle level and higher manpower needs of and the nation at large.

In this connection, Alan Rogers (1994:190) in his book Adult Learning for Development stressed the educational roles that PHEIs can play in the social economic, cultural and political development” of these individuals and the nation at large. The purpose of this study is, therefore, to investigate the major challenges and opportunities of HEIs (PHEIs, in particular) in organizing and providing education and training that is tailored for the socio-economic development of Ethiopia.
Specific objectives

Based on the foregoing discussion, the specific objectives of this study are:

- Identifying the major challenges that PHEIs face in the provision and organization of development oriented programs and courses; and
- Exploring the possibilities and opportunities (PHEIs) that exist and can be generated for designing and organizing development oriented courses.

Research Questions

Accordingly, in order to address the objectives stated above, the following basic questions are taken as a frame of reference for the analysis and interpretation of both the primary and secondary data of the study.

1. What are the major models of development that can be addressed in PHEIs education system?
2. What type of education programs and courses need to be designed and implemented by PHEIs to address the envisaged basic and continuing education for development?
3. What mode of educational delivery system need to be utilized in the provision of development oriented courses?

Methodology of the Study

The methodology of the study is a descriptive survey and comparative case study approach. The sample population includes teachers and students who were randomly selected from the four PHEIs. Data was collected by close ended questionnaires and structured interviews.
Out of the 200 questionnaire sent to teachers (100) and students (100), 95 (95%) and 96 (96%) respectively were filled out and returned. Similarly, 20 structured interview questions were prepared and handed over to concerned educational leaders (including deans, coordinators, and one associate president) of the four PHEIs, and the researcher was able to contact only 10 of the concerned educational leaders of the four colleges to gather their interview report (These include* SMUC (4)* AUC(4), *ADUC (1) and UUC*(1).

In addition, two senior academic staff members of AAU were interviewed.

2. Review of Related Literature

As stated earlier the relevance and quality of modern HEIs is mainly determined by the dynamic and progressive educational policy and goals that are stated explicitly and clearly to address the socio-economic needs and demands of individuals and society at large. Accordingly, the literature review of this study is presented in two parts as follows:

2.1. The Concept of Development in Relation to Adult Education

* Development is growth plus change; change in turn, is social and cultural as well as economic; and qualitative as well as quantitative. U. Th. anp (cited in Yalew. 1985:29).

* Education is central to the process of development (Shaw, R. Yalew. 1985:29).

* SMUC=St. Mary University College
* AUC= Alpha University College
* ADUC= Admas University College
* UUC=Unity University College
These two statements provide the conceptual framework for development in relation to education. They, therefore, form the initial basis of this report. In this study, development and adult education are seen as interlinked process with similar dynamic elements. Both involve purposeful social, economic and cultural change. Both encourage movement from the present state of functioning to a more advanced state. Both imply a negotiated relationship between an agent (a developer, planner, and educator) and a client (a nation, community, and student).

In both developmental and educational processes, the common denominators are individuals and groups, which interact with each other. This suggests that education can lead to lasting development in society. Development involves a mobilization of human potential in all aspects of life: the growth within individuals and communities of a critical awareness, of social reality, and ability to understand, control and shape their future. It also involves a more equitable distribution of resources, locally and nationally. Thus, development covers a wide range of interrelated social, cultural, economic and political factors, as opposed to the narrow and traditional definition which focuses solely on “growth or a rise in the gross national income”.

Contemporary writers on economics and development define ‘development’ as a multidimensional process, which involves:

(a) basic changes in social structures, attitudes and institutions;
(b) acceleration of socio-economic as well as cultural growth;
(c) the reduction of inequality, including fair distribution of resources;
(d) the eradication of absolute poverty.

This corporate definition implies that development is not merely a function of economic, but also concerns the interaction of the interrelated factors listed above in order to bring about change for the benefit of human beings.

With special reference to developing countries like Ethiopia, the immediate and crucial goal of development tends to be:

(a) the fulfillment of the basic needs of the people;
(b) the development of human resources and potential to meet these needs.

As stated earlier, essentially, Ethiopia’s development goals cater for economic, social and cultural advancement, which is intended to meet the needs of the society and the nation as a whole.

Different approaches have been advocated for development program geared towards improving the quality of life of the majority of the population in the Third World. In an Adult Education and Development conference (1984) at Magee University College, N. Ireland (UK), three development strategies were stressed by well-known educators:

(I) Grass roots Development Approach

This approach focuses on “a new small-scale ‘alternative structure’ based on community enterprises and activities”. (Tlacey cited Yalew. 1985:32)

(ii) Basic Human Needs Approach of development based on a “need related curriculum” (Bown, cited in Yalew 1985:31).
(iii) Social Action Development Models: This approach may include two main clusters:
   a) “those which rely upon changes in the quality of life meeting the basic human needs or human resources development”;
   b) And those which think in terms of ‘liberation’, providing for the ‘oppressed’ access to resources of all kind”. (Rojers cited in Yalew 1985:31).
   (I) the human resource development (HRD);
   (ii) The integrated approach of development.

The writer believes that all these approaches could prove viable in Ethiopia, depending on the economic, social, and cultural condition of various regions. All the development models mentioned above can be related to the concept of “room-for-maneuver”. According to Professor Lalage Bown (1984), this concept is becoming “common currency among those people concerned with development studies and it does imply the notion of alternatives, the notion of trying to widen ways forward for individuals and groups in society”.

(iii) Development and education are related processes of purposeful and organized change. Thus, “whether overtly or not, development is always interwoven with education”.

2.1. The Role of Education for Development

Given that education plays a pivotal role for development this part of the literature review specifically focuses on the developmental roles of adult and C.E. According to a. Rogers (1994), adult education plays major socio-economic roles as indicated below.
**Economically**—parents and the community at large may want to be involved in at economic growth and modernization, and higher agricultural yield or more efficient individual and exploitative processes, of resource preservation.

**Socially**—may be aimed at communicable harmony or justice or welfare of environmental or social in-harassment (quality of life)

**Culturally**—they may be aimed at preserving and increasing access to richness.

**Politically**—they may be aimed at increasing awareness and participation and structural change.

**HRD**—for recurring employment, increasing productivity, achieving economic self-reliance. (Rogers, 1994:94-95).

To address the above developmental goals of both private and public HEIs of developed and developing countries need to design courses and programs that are geared to socio-economic and cultural development of individuals and their respective nations at large. In this regard, the challenges and experiences of some developed and developing counties are presented below.

In United Kingdom HEIs some of the traditional universities tend to focus on liberal and elitist education as divorced from productive education that caters for socio-economic development of individuals and the nation. In reference to the United Kingdom earlier education system G. Pickering states. “It is common to speak of a liberal education as a special characteristics of a university and a gentleman (liberal) in its grammatical sense as opposed to service” (1967:129).

However, modern universities in the United Kingdom (e.g., the unverses of Sussex, Ulster and Nottingham) are engaged in extra-mural and continuing education programs.
For example, the University of Ulster (N. Ireland) and the University of Nottingham provide development oriented foundation and extramural courses as well as continuing education courses respectively. Stressing this point, Rogers asserts that “university extramural departments (EMDs) in the UK” (1994:52) represent university based development oriented programs.

Many Western European universities and Prussia does not exist! possess good systems of industrial education for the masters and managers of factories and workshops” (Pickering, 1967:142).

Similarly, the United States, Germany and Russia have incorporated vocational and polytechnic education in their universities’ education system for training middle and higher level technicals, vocational workers and professionals who could be employed in various factors and business enterprises for enhancing the socio-economic development of their respective nations (Pickering, 1967:144-145).

In developing countries of Africa, the problems of modern universities go far beyond economic challenges. Colonialist and imported models University (without any adaptation and revitalization in the context of African culture) would produce an Afro-European elite on African soil with absolutely no educational contributions for the socio-economic of African Countries.

Accordingly, as stated by J. Ngrere (1970), the first and foremost role of a university is to impart productive and practical knowledge and skills that generate liberated ideas, thinking and action. In this context, in speech at Dar Es Salaam University, he forwarded the following definition and functions of an African university.
“A university is an institution of higher learning, a place where people’s minds are trained for clear thinking, for analysis, for independent thinking and for problem solving of higher level. Given this definition; a university has three major and important functions:

First, it transmits advanced knowledge that serves as a basis of action or as a spring board for further research. Second, a university is a center to advance the frontiers of knowledge and third, a university through its teaching, provides high-level manpower to the society.”

Similarly, modern educators in South Africa strongly advocate a liberated African university from that of the Apartheid system and educational policy and practices of the colonialist legacy. The major challenges of a South African university is changing the way that knowledge is constructed and communicated based on African values and culture. In this context, Brock Une (2000) says the following:

“Creating favourable research conditions for the academics in these universities might be the best way and strengthen the hub [and] …to build a South African culture for all South African… on African soil. This would really be de-colonization of the African value.”

3. Discussion

The rational of this study is based on the assumption that PHEIs are now faced with the challenges of providing and organization of development oriented programs and courses; and their contributions in this sector tend to be minimal. This basic assumption forms on
initial forum to investigate the major problems and opportunities of PHEIs in the provision and organization of development focused education and training.

The discussion of the results of this study is, therefore, based on the secondary and primary data gathered and organized from documentary sources, questionnaires and interviews. The data obtained from primary sources are discussed in two major subsections that include: Types of development courses /programs and mode of delivery of these courses.

3.1. Types of Development Programs and Courses

The major sources of data for this study are students and teachers respondents from four PHEIs in Addis Ababa. The respondents were provided with a list of four types of development focused courses/programs that include.

a. Community development program/courses;

b. Knowledge based agriculture program/courses;

c. Vocational and technical program/courses;

d. Higher level PSD*. And HRD* program/courses.

And their responses for each sub-section is presented and discussed categorically and collectively as follows:

As indicated in Table I, the majority of teacher and student respondents affirm that the community development courses (including health, education, local medicine, civic education, family planning, home economics and service management) are being and need to be provided by PHEIs with average percentage response of 97%, 88%, 92%, 94% and 95% respectively.

* HRD= Human Recourse Development
* HRD= Human Recourse Development
The number of respondents who said that such community development courses need not be provided is insignificant as clearly shown in the table. This implies that despite the situational administrative challenges they might have faced PHEIs have had ample opportunities for organizing and providing such development oriented courses/programs. PHEIs managers and leaders who were interviewed also declared that they have the commitment and devotion to make such training schemes part and parcel of their program and agenda.

Similarly, respondents were asked if their PHEIs could address agricultural courses/programs (related to seed selection, terracing, shifting cultivation, irrigation, insecticides and pasting). Interestingly, both teachers and students strongly favoured the participation of PHEIs in the provision and organization of these courses and programs. Such endeavours by PHEIs need to be given due attention by the community and government in particular whose central development policy is agriculture led industrialization.

The other major point which should be given due attention and consideration by PHEIs is related to their potentiality in the provision and organization of technical and vocational courses or programs in their respective institutions. Both teacher and student respondents tend to favor both middle level manpower training for technical and vocational facilitator to satisfy the middle man power needed for the nation, on the one hand, and to provide basic technical and practical knowledge and skills to marginal societies who are denied access to mainstream development. Such training can be given by PHEIs mainly based on IK and ITC. They also reported that PHEIs can provide higher-level development oriented training for HRD and PSD.

Finally, the respondents were asked what type of training and which mode of delivery system can PHEIs effectively address. The four categories of development issues discussed
above. Both teachers and students respondents highly commended the need for HRD through the following type of training programs.

- Training social workers and community leaders;
- Training agricultural extension agents in the most modern and conventional way; and
- Training educators and coordinators of development programs for the various levels of the economic sectors of the country.

With regard to the mode of delivery, both teachers and students responded in favour of the four modes of delivery system as presented below in order of priority based on the average response for each mode of delivery.

1. In-service 84%
2. In-housed 56.5%
3. Distance 49.9%
4. Extension 49.7%

**Interview Report**

In addition to the original survey through questionnaires, structured interview were conducted with 10 educational leaders and coordinators in the four PHEIs under study as well as with two senior staff members of AAU.

The purpose of the interview was not only to get additional information for crosschecking the data obtained through questionnaires, but also to gain expertise and experiential information from concerned educational leaders and senior staff members of PHEIs and AAU respectively.

Accordingly, the highlight of the interview report is briefly presented below. Regarding the major missions and goals of PHEIs in the provision of development oriented courses, the
interviewees reported that PHEIs have the responsibility and obligation to: train and produce highly qualified and certified professionals, technicians and vocationals; provide demand-driven productive knowledge and skills to adults; and technocrat jobs in the world of work.

Promoting and satisfying the country’s trained manpower demands that, the capacity building endeavor for socio-economic development of the nation at large be accelerated.

2. With regard to the type of development oriented programs and courses, the interviewees reported that:

PHEIS have the need and interest to be partially engaged in the four sectors of development courses that include:

- HRD development courses;
- Agricultural courses; and
- Industrial and vocational courses.

Despite their deep concern and interest in the provision and organization of such courses, the interviewees reported that the PHEIs have their own problems and limitations in being directly involved in the provision and organization of development courses and programs. Such limitations can be attributed, partially, to their limited human and material resources to initiate and provide development oriented courses with quality and capacity.

The other challenge for PHEI is administrative and bureaucratic problems related to policy issues from MoE the green light for giving such development oriented programs.
4. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendation

The major challenge HEIs, particularly PHEIs, is the provision of quality education in type and content. Due to their limited commitment and interview, PHEIs contribution to the provision and organization of development geared program courses is minimal and nominal.

In order to address the following issues, questions are designed.
1. What are the major models of development that can be implemented by PHEIS?
2. What mode of delivery system needs to be employed to address development courses and programs?
3. Regarding the type of development courses, the overwhelming majority of the respondents reported that:
   - Community development course (including health education, education and home economics) must be provided;
   - Agricultural courses are poorly addressed by PHEIs. And most of them favored the provision and organization of such courses in quality and quantity; Industrial and vocational courses are particularly addressed in some PHEIs. The respondents therefore declared their view that vocational and technical training needs to be provided;
   - Similarly, human resource development courses (that include training manpower as facilitators and extension agents) are all seen as essential components of the training programs;
   - Regarding the models of development that can be employed in training the coordinators, facilitators, trainers as well as consumers of such development activities the survey has identified;
The BHN model of development, the grass-roots approach of development for small scale industry and the HRD for higher level vocational and professional services and the socio-change model of development;

Regarding the mode of delivery system, the respondents indicated their favor of the following modes of delivery as presented in order of priority.

- In-service training
- Distance learning
- Extension
- In-house training

Interestingly, Rogular Barham is findings match that of the interviewer’s reports. However, the information obtained through interviews has provided the following additional important views and impressions. First, the interviewees observed the minimum involvement of PHEIs in designing and organizing development oriented programs and courses that may be attributed to their lack of awareness and information about the available opportunities and strategies for initiating such programs/courses. Second, the reluctance and indifference reflected by PHEIs managers and deans to face and confront the challenges that deter them from opening their doors for development oriented courses.

I cannot because I’m not an expert in this field and I cannot always understand the unclear writing.

**Conclusion**

The overall picture of the findings discussed above reflects the following conclusions.

- From the findings it has to be noted that PHEIs tend to be very passive, reluctant and too reserved in the provision and organization of development oriented courses. This may be mainly attributed to their lack of awareness and information that could have helped them to find a number of possibilities and
opportunities for initiating and endeavoring development courses in their programs.

- The second major conclusion drawn from the finding is the reluctance and lack of confidence of PHEIs in facing the academic and administrative challenges and their lack of insight and wisdom in programs and organization of development granted courses.

**Recommendations**

Based on the discussions of the documentary survey and summary of the findings, the following recommendations are forwarded:

- It appears that managers and deans of PHEIs lack awareness information and, most important, the commitment in designing, organizing and providing development-oriented programs. It is therefore strongly recommended that PHEIs learn more about the concepts and roles of education in the socio-economic and cultural development of the country, particularly regarding their potential institutional roles. They have to learn from both developed and developing countries and universities as discussed in the literature review and background discussion of this study.

- Regarding the type of courses to be provided, PHEIs need to take the following strategies and actions. They need to survey and study courses / programs that are being provided within and outside their county. For example, the development study programs in the United Kingdom and the other development courses and activities in AAU would enlighten their vision and mission. AAU has development based institutes (like IDR) and faculties (like engineering) out of which PHEIs can learn and design and organize development oriented courses.

- Having had such basic experience, PHEIs can select and inject the type of delivery system (such as, INSET D. E) related to development issues and programs.
Having had the adequate experience, orientation and information from model universities like AAU, they need to employ any one or all of the following models of development.

- The BHN model of development

Beneficiaries of such programs are poor people who are unable to satisfy their basic survival needs. Necessary PHEIs, therefore, can design a program for training coordinators and facilitators of such programs. The other model of development is the grass-roots model of development based on the skills and knowledge required for small-scale industry that can be addressed to marginal societies who are given access to the mainstream of development. For this sector of society two levels of training can be addressed by PHEIs.

The first strategy is providing basic technical and vocational training to this marginal society where they reside or at a nearby community school.

The second is giving training to facilitators and coordinators of this sector of the development program. In both cases, all training activities need to be based on local IK and ITC.

- The model of development that can be addressed by PHEIs is the HRD model. This model of development can be designed, organized and provided for higher level vocational, technical and professional training to satisfy middle and higher level manpower need of the country.
References

Hinzen, Hahundorie (eds) (1982) Education for liberation and development the Tanzanian experience UIE, Hamburg


Cross-Border Provision of Higher Education: Challenges and Opportunities for Private Higher Education Institutions in Ethiopia

Bob Campbell
VSO Volunteer
Higher Education Quality and Relevance Agency, Ethiopia and Department of Educational Studies, University of York, UK
rmcl@york.ac.uk

Abstract

The need for expansion of Higher Education in Ethiopia has been recognised with increased allocations of students to the Public Universities, the foundation of New Public Universities and establishment of Private Higher Education Institutions (PHEIs). Demand for Higher Education is predicted to continue to grow. Demand that cannot be met by national providers may be catered for by Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) based in other countries. This Cross-Border provision in which the learners are located in a country different from the one where the qualification awarding institution is based offers additional study opportunities for students. However, Cross-Border Higher Education also carries risks for students unless the relevance and quality of the provision can be assured and the qualifications awarded are recognized nationally and internationally for employment and advancement.

While Cross-Border provision may offer new opportunities and some possible risks to students, it poses a potential threat to local PHEIs. This is acute if students see the quality and relevance of the programs offered by Cross-Border providers as better than that of local PHEIs and the currency of the qualifications gained as of greater value in the national and international employment market. With strong competition from Cross-Border providers some PHEIs may seem less attractive to students.

On the more positive side, while Ethiopian PHEIs have established themselves primarily to provide Higher Education to Ethiopians in Ethiopia, there is no reason why they too cannot be involved in Cross-Border education. Cross-Border provision thus offers new opportunities for PHEIs in Ethiopia to engage directly with learners in other countries and/or join with HEIs outside the country in partnership or franchise arrangements to offer Cross-Border programs in Ethiopia and/or elsewhere.
This paper expands on the topic of Cross-Border Higher Education with respect to Ethiopia and elaborates on the challenges and opportunities for the Private Higher Education Institutions in the country.

Introduction

Higher Education is a service industry. Some of this education service is provided by state institutions and some by private providers. Like many other service industries, Higher Education is an international industry. This is true of both the public and private sectors.

Internationalism in Higher Education has a long history. Teachers travel. They do so to teach and so share their knowledge. Some countries, Ethiopia included, seek to attract, recruit and employ foreign teachers to help staff their Higher Education Institutions (HEIs). While the presence of international scholars in HEIs may be seen as just making up the numbers to staff programs adequately, this is a very narrow viewpoint. An experienced international teaching force can bring in new subject knowledge, introduce new ways of teaching, learning and assessment and generally advance the curriculum. Some nations (the UK being one) are concerned that the teaching staff in some of their HEIs are not sufficiently international and the potential benefits of an international work force are not being perceived and pursued.

While there is international mobility of Higher Education staff this is small when compared to that of student mobility. Students have always studied outside their own countries. This is particularly true for students from developing countries, many of whom have traditionally ‘gone abroad’ for their Higher Education, particularly post graduate studies. This is not just a legacy of colonialism but characterizes the pattern of Higher Education in many countries, including Ethiopia. Study abroad can offer opportunities to study subjects
not available at home; the prospect of ‘better’ facilities and tuition; the award of a qualification that may be seen as of greater prestige and currency that one from a home institution and; the chance to study in the company of students of another country or countries who can enrich the student experience. In the past decade or so the level of student mobility has increased. This is particularly the case in Europe where the European Union has developed schemes to encourage students to study in countries of which they are not nationals for all or part of their degree programs. It is not that unusual for a European student to do a first degree on one country, a Masters in a second and a Doctorate in a third. But this is also true for some Ethiopian students. What is not well developed in Ethiopia, but is quite common in Europe, is for a student to study different courses for a first degree program in different countries. While the bulk of the study period may be in one country the program can involve stays of a semester or a year in different countries. The award of the degree is usually by the student’s home institution and this HEI recognizes the courses offered by other HEIs in other countries and accepts the grades gained by the student in the student’s overall assessment. So there is not just mobility of students but also mobility of curriculum, student assessments and qualifications.

The above are examples of the Globalization of Higher Education. It occurs via international students studying courses and full degree programs, student exchange schemes, inter-university collaboration and the hiring of international staff. It is characterized by outreach beyond national borders and by institutional linkages. It is not a new phenomenon. What is new is the rising level of activity. A report of student mobility (IDP, 2002) predicted that this would increase from 1.8 millions in 2000 to 7.2 million in 2005.

Higher Education serves two sets of stakeholders. The first stakeholders are the students who enroll for courses and programs of study. Students undertake Higher Education studies for a host of reasons but prominent among these is a thirst for knowledge and
understanding, a wish to improve their earning potential and a desire to be of value to society. The second stakeholders are the citizens who need the services of graduates to manage the affairs of state and provide essential services whether through public or private bodies. These stakeholders are represented in government who devise policies to develop and manage Higher Education in the best interests of the country. In the case of developing countries such as Ethiopia, such policies are quite naturally geared to the economic and social development of the country. But can national provision and international movement of students cope with the demand for Higher Education in countries with a high population and a current low enrollment level? Many think not and much activity and experimentation is going on with a range of alternative provisions of Higher Education being offered to students. This involves new delivery systems, new types of provider and new forms of collaboration within countries and across national borders: trans-national or Cross-Border Higher Education.

**Cross-Border Higher Education**

Cross-Border Higher Education is defined by the UNESCO/Council for Europe *Code of Practice in the provision of transnational education* as the following:

All types off higher education study programmes, sets of courses of study, or study services (including those of distance education) in which the learners are located in a country different from the one where the awarding institution is based. Such programmes may belong to the educational system of a state, different from the state in which it operates or may operate independently of any national system.

(UNESCO and Council of Europe, 2001)
The motivation for providing educational services is often commercial and the provision of an education service to other countries, including developing countries such as Ethiopia, can be a ‘for profit’ activity.

The World Trade Organization (WTO) General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) distinguishes four modes of international supply of educational services.

**Mode 1:** Cross-Border supply (distance education, virtual educational institutions, educational software and corporate training through ICT delivery)

**Mode 2:** Consumption abroad (students studying abroad)

**Mode 3:** Commercial presence (i.e. local university or satellite campus, language training companies, private training companies) or program or institutional mobility.

**Mode 4:** Presence of natural persons (professors, teachers, researchers working abroad).

This paper is concerned with Mode 3 in which the service and not its consumer cross the national border. Such services can both complement and compete with local national provision. Where they provide education that cannot be provided locally, Cross-Border provision can be an asset. Where they encourage local providers to enhance the quality of their provision, they can also be seen as of benefit. However, where they respond to demand (or create demand) by providing low quality, high cost programs that do not lead to a recognized qualification they are of great concern.

The potential ‘market’ for Cross-Border Higher Education in Ethiopia is large. The need for expansion of Higher Education in the country has been recognized with increased allocations of students to the Public Universities (PUs), the foundation of New Public Universities (NPUs) and establishment of Private Higher Education Institutions (PHEIs). Both public and private sectors are in a phase of rapid growth. Even so, demand for Higher
Education outstrips supply and is likely to continue to do so into the next Ethiopian Millennium. One reason for this is the expansion of the school system that will require more teachers and generate more students prepared for and seeking entry to Higher Education. Demand that cannot be met by national HE providers may be catered for by Cross-Border providers. However, Cross-Border Higher Education carries risks for students unless the relevance and quality of the provision can be assured and the qualifications awarded are recognized nationally and internationally for employment and advancement.

Providers and forms of Cross-Border Higher Education

The work of Machado Dos Santos (2002) indicates that Cross-Border providers of Higher Education fall into one of the following categories:

- regional or international consortia of institutions and/or organizations and companies
- virtual institutions with no ‘campus’
- regular universities with international outreach operations

Knight (2005) has developed a typology of Cross-Border providers as shown in the table below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Branch Campus</td>
<td>A provider based in Country 1 sets up a satellite campus in Country 2 to provide courses and programs to students in Country 2 (and possibly also to students from Country 1 taking study abroad courses). The qualification is awarded by the provider in Country 1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent Institution</td>
<td>A provider in Country 1 establishes a stand alone institution in Country 2 to offer courses and programs. The qualification is awarded by the locally established institution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acquisition/Merger</td>
<td>Provider in Country 1 purchases all or part of a HEI in Country 2. The qualification is awarded by the local institution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Center/Teaching Site</td>
<td>Provider in Country 1 establishes study centers in Country 2 to support students taking their courses and /or programs. These may be independent or in collaboration with an institution in Country 2. The qualification is awarded by the provider in Country 1.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Providers collaborate through innovative partnerships to deliver courses and programs in their own and other countries through distance and/or face to face modes. The qualification is awarded by one or more of the collaborating partners or by ‘the network’.

Provider in Country 1 delivers courses and programs to students in one or more different countries through distance education modes and generally does not have a local support service for students. The qualification is awarded by the provider in Country 1.

The nature of the courses and programs offered by Cross-Border providers can also be categorized in relation to the ownership of the curriculum, the control exercised by the provider and the award of the qualification. This is shown in next the table (after Knight 2005).

The alliances that have been established cross not only national boundaries but also span the perceived public/private divide and also include business corporations. This is particularly the case in the provision of courses and programs in areas such as accounting, business, management and information and communications technology.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Franchise</td>
<td>Here a provider in Country 1 authorizes a provider in Country 2 to deliver their courses and/or programs in Country 2 and/or other countries. The qualification is awarded by the provider in Country 1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twinning</td>
<td>Here a provider in Country 1 collaborates with a provider in Country 2 allowing students from Country 1 to take courses in Country 2. The qualification is awarded by Country 1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Double/Joint Degree</td>
<td>Here providers in different countries collaborate in program provision so that students receive a qualification from each provider or a single joint award from the collaborating providers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulation</td>
<td>Here various arrangements are established so that students can gain qualification credit for courses taken from any of the collaborating providers. The qualification is awarded by a student's 'home' institution.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validation</td>
<td>Here a provider in Country 1 grants another provider in Country 2 authority to offer courses and programs that lead to an award from the provider in Country 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virtual/Distance</td>
<td>Here providers deliver courses and/or programs to students in different countries via distance education by tradition and/or on-line electronic means. Provision may include some in-country support for students via study centers.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In considering Cross-Border Higher Education it must be recognized that the ‘export’ of Higher Education is not exclusively a north to South activity with the route being from the developed to the developing world. Countries considered to be part of the developing world also export Cross-Border Higher Education to other countries (and not just to their near neighbors) so that the activity can be seen as multi-directional.

Before turning to the challenges and opportunities of Cross-Border Higher Education for the Private Higher Education Institutions (PHEIs) in Ethiopia, it is important to consider some global concerns related to the growth of the provision.

**Concerns about Cross-Border Higher Education**

One major area of concern is that of quality and standards. Here the absence of national regulatory systems or the existence of weak and/or ineffective systems can permit the operation of providers who offer poor quality and issue qualifications that are sub standard and are of little or no worth. Added to that, the curriculum may not be relevant for students or to the needs of country. A case in point is the Cross-Border provision of MBAs in South Africa. When the South African Quality Assurance Agency began to look at the programs offered by foreign institutions, less than half were up to the required standard and were contextualized to the needs of the students and the nation. Providers of inappropriate programs were prevented from operating in the country.

Linked to quality and standards are qualifications. It is not unknown for Cross-Border providers to offer qualifications that are not recognized in their own country. Many such providers will not have sought recognition in the countries where they operate and so their qualifications are unlikely to be accepted, particularly when their ‘graduates’ seek employment in government agencies or international organizations, far less seek to pursue study or employment opportunities outside their own country. This is seen as a particular
problem with distance education providers and on-line operators who have no in-country presence. Some so called ‘rogue providers’ offer accredited qualifications but the accrediting body is not recognized internationally or even nationally and is often a commercial organization to which providers pay a fee for accreditation based on superficial evidence of their operations. These accreditation agencies parallel the ‘diploma mills’ that award qualifications for payment and essentially are fraudulent bodies. Having said that, it is important not to confuse the many genuine and highly respected accreditation bodies (such as those that accredit college programs in the USA) with the more unscrupulous operators. Of course, the potential students of Cross-Border Higher Education providers are seldom in a strong position to distinguish the rogue from the genuine! They need the help of their home quality assurance agency to protect and guide them. Additional help may also be provided by the country of origin of the Cross-Border provider. For example, the UK Quality Assurance Agency (QAA) assures not just the quality of provision of Higher Education in the UK but also the international operations of all UK HEIs. One of their recent publications reports on the Cross-Border activities of UK HEIs in China (QAA, 2006). Australia is another country where the national HE quality agency has a concern for the quality of Cross-Border courses and programs of their institutions.

The concerns related to Cross-Border Higher Education outlined above are matters of consumer protection. Just as citizens have a right to be protected from dangerous and inferior goods, so too do they have a right to be protected from poor quality education and worthless qualifications. This is a role for Higher Education quality agencies. However, they face a very difficult task in seeking out Cross-Border providers, regulating their operations and assuring their quality. Martin (2006) describes a series of country case studies that serve well to illustrate the difficulties involved.

National HEIs, both public and private funded, tend to be stable entities that expect to operate indefinitely. Indeed, regulations governing the establishment of private HEIs
normally require strong evidence of stability so that students who embark on a program do not find that they cannot complete it because the HEI has closed the program or the HEI itself has disappeared. Similarly, employers of graduates or HEIs that receive applications for graduate studies can normally refer to the HEI to check on a graduate, a course or a program. Not so for all Cross-Border providers some of whom may have a short term existence in a country (or no real existence at all) and have little commitment to enrolled students if the operation becomes unprofitable. Students who start but are unable to complete a program because the provider has pulled out will not gain the desired qualification and will have wasted their money.

When Cross-Border providers have a strong profit motive then they may charge high fees, often much higher than local public and private HEIs. This may be perceived positively by potential students as they consider that because they are paying a high fee they will get a high quality learning experience, superior tuition and a qualification from a foreign institution that will give them a competitive advantage in the home labor market and an entry to international study and employment. Regrettably, this is not always the case. High fees also mean that access is restricted to more privileged students who can meet the costs.

It is not only a high fee that can restrict access to Cross-Border Higher Education. Foreign providers with an in-country presence tend to focus on centers of population and so restrict access to students that reside there or can arrange to do so. On-line study requires that students have regular access to the Internet. In developing countries that have yet to establish reliable, nation-wide electronic communications and where few people have computers and home access to the Internet, this is an obvious barrier.

While there are some major concerns about Cross-Border provision of Higher Education the critique must be balanced by mention of advantages and recognition of the very many genuine, reputable international providers who provide high quality courses and programs
and offer qualifications that are accepted worldwide. Cross-Border Higher Education can provide otherwise unavailable opportunities for study, it can supplement national provision, it can help and support the development of local systems, encourage innovation and act as a driver to promote relevance, enhance quality and raise standards of the programs offered by local providers.

In Ethiopia, the UK Open University, recognized internationally for the high quality of its distance education provision, has for some years been offering a Cross-Border MBA program. Its graduates include the Prime Minister. More recently the University of South Africa (UNISA), another major provider of distance education, has established a presence. There are also other examples of Cross-Border Higher Education in Ethiopia from providers on other continents.

**Ethiopian PHEIs and Cross-Border Higher Education: the challenges**

But how do the PHEIs in Ethiopia relate to the provision of Cross-Border Higher Education in the country? What challenges are posed by these trans-national operators? While, at the moment, there may be few Cross-Border providers offering course and programs in the country, the number is likely to grow and the challenges to local PHEIs are there. It is recognized that there are two main areas of challenge. The first is concerned with students and the second with staff.

While the market for Higher Education is still expanding it has to be recognized that Cross-Border providers will seek to take a share of this. The foreign operators will target those potential students seeking courses and programs perceived to enhance their employment opportunities and which they (the providers) can offer at low cost and with few resources. They will not look to provide a comprehensive curriculum portfolio but will seek a niche market. They will market their provision vigorously and advertise extensively with
inducements such as scholarships and ‘free’ study materials. PHEIs are likely to face some fierce competition for students, possibly in areas where they already offer courses and programs at marginal cost benefit. Because the Cross-Border providers may be much larger than Ethiopian PHEIs (they are international) they have better economies of scale. They may also be able to avoid the current Ministry of Education accreditation requirements demanded of local PHEIs.

If the Cross-Border providers are ‘international HEIs’ with a well established good reputation, other things being equal, they are likely to compete strongly and successfully against many local PHEIs on terms of prestige if nothing else. But, there are other factors that may make the Cross–Border providers more attractive to students than local PHEIs. The most important factor is recognition of a high quality of provision and the standard of the award, particularly where the quality assurance of the Cross-Border provision is undertaken by the home country of the Cross-Border provider, as is the case for UK and Australian based institutions. Even if quality is at a par with that of local providers, a perception of higher quality may prevail. It is a similar situation with regard to the standard of an award and its currency.

If, as it may be argued, the experience of many Cross-Border providers is such that they can provide a higher quality than Ethiopian PHEIs and this is evidenced by successful students, then they will become even more attractive to those potential students who can afford to make the choice. The threat to Ethiopian PHEIs is the loss of students to Cross-Border providers with a consequent impact on their profitability and possible viability. The challenge to Ethiopian PHEIs is to demonstrate that their provision is every bit as good (if not better and more appropriate) as that of Cross-Border providers and that the qualifications that they award are, at the very least, equal to those offered by foreign institutions.
As indicated above, it is not just students that are attracted to Cross-Border providers of Higher Education. A Cross-Border provider may also be a magnet for staff and so draw staff away from the PHEIs. It is well known that, in Ethiopia, many staff employed in public universities also work part-time for the private sector. If a Cross-Border provider offers a better part-time package than the Ethiopian PHEI then the sector may be drained of some of its experienced part-time staff. Cross-Border providers may pay a higher salary, provide greater fringe benefits, offer better opportunities for staff development and further study and give access to new course materials and texts that staff can use in their regular teaching. Importantly, employment with a well known international university may be seen as a more prestigious addition to a CV than being on the staff of an Ethiopian PHEI that may not be well known outside the country. The threat to Ethiopian PHEIs is the loss of staff, not just those employed part-time but also their full-time academics and administrators. The challenge to Ethiopian PHEIs is to find ways to attract and retain staff against not just local but international competition.

The PHEIs in Ethiopia have an important role to play in the planned expansion of Higher Education. This is embedded in government policy. It is thus not unreasonable that the PHEIs should seek some protection from any corrupt or unfair practices of Cross-Border providers. They might also seek to argue that Cross-Border providers should be required to be accredited in the same way as they must be if they are to operate legally and professionally. Of course, this is much easier said that done. While the matter may be straightforward for providers that have a physical presence in the country with such as a satellite campus or a study center, it is not the case for distance education and on-line providers whose operations can be, and are often, difficult to detect: far less to regulate.
Ethiopian PHEIs and Cross-Border Higher Education: the opportunities

But what of the opportunities that Cross-Border Higher Education provides for Ethiopian PHEIs? There are several. While it does not require a 'beat them or join them' attitude, there are ways in which Ethiopian PHEIs can work with and learn from experienced Cross-Border providers. They can also launch their own Cross-Border operations either individually or in partnerships with one or more other providers in Ethiopia or in one or more other countries. It is understood that at least one Ethiopian PHEI is already active in the provision of Cross-Border Higher Education.

One way in which local PHEIs can engage with Cross-Border providers is to allow them to make use of their services and facilities. Many PHEIs in Ethiopia have very well developed printing and distribution systems for distance education materials. These could be of value to Cross-Border providers of 'traditional' paper-based distance education. A number of Ethiopian PHEIs have established regional bases and study centers. Again, these could be of use to Cross-Border providers as could the staff that manages the facilities. Cross-Border providers may also welcome the opportunity to use PHEI campus facilities for face to face sessions with their students and for access to library resources and computer technology. It would be up to PHEIs to negotiate appropriate financial and other arrangements.

The above can be seen as a strictly service level arrangement between a local PHEI and a foreign provider. It offers little benefit to a PHEI other than financial. More ambitious PHEIs may wish to pursue academic linkages with Cross-Border providers. These could take a variety of forms. A starter position could be to seek a franchise to run courses and/or programs developed by the Cross-Border provider and using the curriculum and resources of the Cross-Border provider but taught by the staff of the Ethiopian PHEI using their facilities. As indicated in an earlier table the qualification awarded would be that of the
Cross-Border provider. The advantage to the Cross-Border provider is that it would have a reliable in-country partner and would gain a franchise fee. The benefit to the Ethiopian PHEI is that it would attract students to an 'international' course and/or program, and retain a portion of the fees they pay. An important additional benefit is that they would have access to a curriculum and curriculum materials that they otherwise would not have and could use this to model improvements to their own curriculum. Furthermore, there could be important staff development outcomes as staff engage with alternative curricula and new teaching, learning and assessment regimes. This could lead to quality enhancements of the courses and programs offered by the PHEI.

A further benefit of a franchise arrangement is that students registered with the Cross-Border provider in its home country or in another country where it operates may be encouraged to study a course with the Ethiopian PHEI and so enrich their learning experience. The benefit to the Ethiopian PHEI, in addition to any financial gains, is that this brings an international dimension to the learning experience of their students by having them study alongside foreign students. This can be attractive to Ethiopian students and also of value to PHEI staff as well as students.

Keeping in mind that many PHEIs in Ethiopia offer courses and programs by distance education and that this is a common delivery mode of Cross-Border providers, there should be scope for co-operation between local PHEIs and trans-nationals. It was stated earlier that South Africa did not allow a number of Cross-Border providers of MBAs to operate in the country as their programs were not tailored to the national need. Ethiopian PHEIs must be in a strong position to work with foreign providers to adapt their distance education materials to the local situation and so make them more relevant and acceptable. Of course, this is also true for the curriculum and the resources for 'regular' students. For the PHEI there are potentially important gains in knowledge and experience in such as curriculum development and resource design that can be mainstreamed into other areas of their
operations. As with any good arrangement there are gains for both parties. However, this should not obscure the main purpose of any educational venture *i.e.* to provide a high quality and relevant educational experience to students and reward their success with a qualification that has credibility and portability.

A further arrangement that an Ethiopian PHEI may wish to seek is to gain recognition by a Cross-Border provider of its own curricula. This might initially be a single course but could lead to full degree programs. The validation by foreign institutions of degree programs offered by Ethiopian PHEIs would be an important landmark in establishing the international quality and standards of private higher education in the country and could help attract more foreign students to study in Ethiopia. In addition to its cultural richness, Ethiopia has two big attractions to foreign students. The first is that the language of tuition is English. The second is that the cost of tuition and the cost of living are modest when compared to most English speaking countries. At the moment, foreign students are difficult to attract as they are uncertain of the quality of the curriculum, the level of tuition, the nature of the learning experience and the standard of the award.

Finally, Ethiopian PHEIs may wish to take on the role of Cross-Border provider themselves. This is a major step to take both academically and financially. While some PHEIs may wish to go it alone and seek to market their courses and programs beyond Ethiopia, others may wish to join forces with an experienced Cross-Border provider. In such a partnership the Ethiopian PHEI might contribute most to the curriculum and delivery system while the foreign partner might provide essential expertise in Cross-Border operations. Of course, just as a foreign provider might seek to offer its courses and programs in Ethiopia in association with an Ethiopian PHEI so might an Ethiopian PHEI wish to offer its courses and programs in another country in association with an HEI in that country. Just as foreign providers can become involved in Higher Education provision in Ethiopia in many ways, so too can Ethiopian PHEIs become involved in Cross-Border
Higher Education provision in other countries, either individually or collectively and with and without foreign partners.

**Decision making about Cross-Border Higher Education**

In considering providing Cross-Border Higher Education, Ethiopian PHEIs may wish to give careful thought to the courses and programs they will offer and the countries in which they will be offered. It seems sensible to build on academic strengths established at home rather than try to develop new areas for Cross-Border curricula. It may also be wise to target countries where there is an Ethiopian Diaspora who are most likely to know of the PHEI and/or countries which have strong links with Ethiopia and/or are located in the same geographical region.

There are also other considerations that deserve careful attention when embarking on Cross-Border Higher Education. Quality and Standards are of paramount importance. A HEI that is deemed to provide poor quality and set low standards in its Cross-Border provision damages, not only its own reputation but also the reputation of Higher Education in its home nation. Where a country guards the quality and standards of its Higher Education system by a regulatory body (such as a quality assurance agency) and an Ethiopian Cross-Border provider fails to meet the established criteria for approval of its Cross-Border activity that too is very damaging for the HEI and for Ethiopian Higher Education.

Reputations in Cross-Border Higher Education can be established and lost with the choice of partner organizations and HEIs. If an Ethiopian PHEI is seeking to join forces with a Cross Border provider to offer Cross-Border education in a foreign country or to facilitate a Cross-Border operation in Ethiopia then that partner needs to be selected with great care. The choice of a poor quality, low standard partner operator by an Ethiopian PHEI would
not be helpful, the choice of a 'rogue' operator would be a disastrous error! Ethiopian PHEIs interested in participating in Cross-Border Higher Education are advised to become familiar with the Guidelines for Quality provision in Cross-Border Higher Education prepared by UNESCO (UNESCO, 2005). They should proceed only if they and any potential partners can comply with these guidelines.

PHEIs have choices to make with regard to their reactions and actions on Cross-Border Higher Education. As in other matters, choices should be based on good information and a consideration of the advantages and disadvantages of various actions and inactions. If this paper has alerted PHEIs in Ethiopia to the growth of Cross-Border Higher Education, provided some useful information, indicated challenges and opportunities and prompted them to the need to consider their position and take action, whether this be to act or not to act, then it will have served its purpose.

References
The Relationship between Private Institutions of Higher Learning and Banking Industry in Addis Ababa

Tiruneh Legesse and Zenegnaw Abiy
St.Mary’s University College

Abstract

In the globalizing world, the speed of innovation in technology and information has accelerated. In this situation, there is demand for qualified and skilled human resource capable of responding to changes in the structure of their job or technological content. Specialists who are able to respond to a higher level of work and greater complication of a specific type of job are necessary. For instance, in developing countries if one looks the provision of graduates to industry and service sector, over the past many years, the reality has been a mismatch between skills and knowledge acquired in the classrooms and the world of work requires. By the same token, the contribution of the banking industry to the education sector has been insignificant. The objective of the study was to assess the level of cooperation between the banking industry and PHEIs. An effort was also exerted to identify weaknesses and strengths of the partnership and to point out ways to rectify the existing weaknesses and maintain or improve the existing strengths. Two types of questionnaires were distributed to eight banks and ten PHEIs. Descriptive analysis is done through tabulation and percentage.

From the findings of the study, the researchers conclude that the relationship is weak in the following areas: teaching-learning process, consultancy activities, and internship and employment creation. On the other hand, their relationship is found out to be strong in selection, training and development of employees. At organizational level, the following points are recommended. The two parties should work together in identifying research topics, providing research inputs to researchers, sponsoring research, arranging forums for presentation of research outputs, and communicating findings to pertinent organizations by involving practitioners in the development of course contents, in delivering classroom lectures, in and fostering educational tour programs PHEIs and banks can jointly make the teaching-learning process fruitful. The two parties can also benefit a lot by co-operating in consultancy activities, in the provision of internship and employment of opportunities.
1. **Introduction**

1.1. **Background of the Study**

The central function of a given higher education institution is teaching. Through educational activities, human resources necessary for socio-economic development are produced and opportunities of higher education that match individual needs and abilities are created. One of the important roles of higher education is thus to enhance the level of human resources necessary for socio-economic development and, by sending them out into the world of work, to contribute to economic growth.

The following other contributions of higher education to the industry were identified such as conducting collaborative research, material preparation, curriculum development and engaging in human resource exchange.

To realize such broader general objectives of the country, tertiary level of education in Ethiopia started in HaileSelassie I university. Then after, other public educational institutions with different levels flourished. Currently there are 21([www.moe.gov.et](http://www.moe.gov.et)) public universities engaged in providing course in different fields of study and programs.

With the down fall of the Derg regime, Private Higher Educational Institutions were established under the proclamation No. 351/2003. Currently there are more than 50 private higher education institutions providing different undergraduate training programs. The PHEIs provide trainings in different fields of study, mainly business, information technology, medical science and law.

The major employers of business graduates of these institutions are private and public banks. The relationship between these parties, banks major employers and PHEIs as producers of professional graduates is compulsory. However, the relationship seems to be
weak. This study, therefore, reviews the relationship between the banking industry and the PHEIs and assesses the level of cooperation between the two sectors.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

With the rapid technological innovation and structural changes in the industry, the human resource needs are also changing. Yet, despite this, one cannot deny that higher education has been unable to adequately respond to these changes.

In the world of information, the speed of innovation in technology and information has accelerated. In this situation, there is demand for human resource completing higher education that are generalists and have mastered knowledge and skills that enable them to respond to changes in the structure of their job or technological content. On the other hand, specialists who can respond to a higher level of work and greater complication of a specific type of job are also necessary.

The level of relationship between higher education sector and the banking industry not only differ among countries, region and type of industry they also vary on the basis of future economic and social prospects. Whatever the case might be, strengthening cooperation between higher education and the industry is necessary. Because the needs of the industry are varied and change now and then, building mechanisms to prevent miscommunication such as having industry participants in the managing apparatus of higher education institutions and human resource exchange between university researchers and industry technologists have to be in place. It is also necessary to conduct education and research aligned with the needs of the industry—which can be accomplished by having people from the industry join discussions about curriculum development of higher education institutions, by promoting collaborative industry-university research and by designing long-term human resource development in collaboration with industry. Furthermore, cooperation with industry is necessary for improving the employment
opportunities to graduates. Also, the industry must provide employment information, implement internship opportunities and teach and develop entrepreneurial skills.

Because of weak relationship between the banks and the PHEIs, the banks incur additional costs for training for the would-be staff. Thus, PHEIs need to fill the gap. What does "close the gap must enter a new graduate into a training program and fill the difference between the skills that the graduate comes to the job with and what traditional liberal arts colleges have prepared them for. PHEIs close this gap by listening to industry's needs and providing the necessary practical experience students need to begin their careers. Closing this gap means that PHEIs are expected to provide their students, and then their graduates with a challenging, meaningful academic experience both in and out of the classroom.

1.3. Objectives of the Study

The objective of the study is to assess the level of cooperation between the banking industry and PHEIs. An effort is also exerted to identify weaknesses and strengths of the partnership and point out ways to rectify the weakness and maintain or improve the strengths.

1.4. Significance of the Study

This research is believed to have the following importances:

- highlights the weaknesses of the existing relationship between banks and PHEIs and helps both parties to come out of this situation;
- helps policy makers and curriculum formulators to take the job requirements of the banking industry to incorporate in the curriculum;
- enhances the bilateral relationship between the banking industry and private higher education institutions;
• helps the industry and business to keep their doors open for internship programs of PHEIs;
• helps the industry realize the contributions of the learning institutions in their performance and return their contributions;
• helps Higher Education Institutions to close the gap between the knowledge instilled by traditional teaching methods and the high skill levels needed from a productive workforce.

1.5. Research Methodology

Two types of questionnaires were distributed to eight banks and ten PHEIs. Of the total questionnaires distributed, only five from each were collected and used for the analysis. Finally, descriptive analysis was done through tabulation and percentage.

Review of the Related Literature

2.1. University-Industry Relationship in Research Undertakings

The relationship between educational institutions and industry in research undertakings are complex. The complexity arises from the difficulty in measuring the costs of the research and the benefits derived out of the research. Research activities can be considered as part of knowledge creation and sharing of knowledge; however, the results may be in many more ways beneficial than simply providing new information.

Studies have found out that research produces a number of benefits to the economy is general and to innovation in particular. Some of these benefits are tangible outputs of research, while some are in the form of sources of strategic value. These benefits and sources of strategic value, and the relationships between firms and research come about through various channels (as noted by eminent authors such as David and Hall 2000 and Cohen et al. 2000).
There are seven benefits that accrue from research undertakings for innovation (Martin, Salter et al. 1996; Salter, d’Este et al. 2000; and also Salter and Martin 2001). The benefits are:

1. producing new scientific information
2. training skilled graduates
3. supporting new scientific networks and stimulating interaction
4. expanding the capacity for problem-solving
5. producing new instruments and methodologies/techniques
6. creating new firms
7. Providing academic knowledge.

Recent literatures add the eighth benefit as access to unique facilities. The new addition to the list of benefits is where industry gains access to unique facilities held and developed at universities.

Apart from providing the tangible benefits outlined above, publicly funded research is also a source of strategic value that help to improve qualitative research skills and the creation of options and diversity. Knowledge and research skills can be seen as capabilities embodied in researchers and the institutional networks within which they work. Research also plays an important role in supporting the creation of diverse options. In summary, the themes of capability, variety and capacity outline the main sources of strategic value provided by public research.

In order for the benefits of university research to be expressed in the economy, the university research system has to be connected with the economy. Much of the economic literature assumes that such connections a result from ‘spillovers’ – side effects or ‘externalities’ of public research.
A common theme in the literature is that interactions between public researchers and their counterparts in firms are required in order to build strong relationships and effective communication.

2.2. Collaboration in Staff Selection, Training and Development

The human resource of any organizational set up plays a prominent role in the accomplishment of organizational objectives. Banks and other employers need to delegate this function to educational institutions in order to recruit and employ new staff. Educational institutions prepare standardized exams, administer it, correct the papers and show the performance of the examinees to the employer. Usually, educational institutions (colleges, universities, or university colleges) serve as testing centers for the creation of competent personnel in organizations.

2.3. Collaboration in the Teaching-Learning Process

The teaching-learning process is the major function of PHEIs. In this major function, PHEIs need to collaborate with the banks so as to make the education practice problem solving. The banks and PHEIs may collaborate in the involvement of practitioners in the development of course contents. Practitioners may also serve as guest speakers to relate classroom learning with the actual work and as facilitators in conducting educational tour programs, and the like.

2.4. Collaboration in Consultancy Activities

The other major aspect of cooperation between private educational institutions and the banking industry is in consultancy services.
III Data Analysis, Interpretation and Finding

This part of the research paper presents the findings of the study. The researchers used two types of questionnaires for different groups of respondents. Respondents were selected from PHEIs and Banks using purposive sampling technique. Five PHEIs and five banks were involved in the study. To obtain the necessary data for analysis, one person (member of top management) has been selected from PHEIs; Public Relation Office Heads of the banks have also been intentionally selected as subjects. This is done on the premise that these people are spokespersons of their respective organizations and are believed to have the necessary information required for the research.

3.1. Collaboration of PHEIs and the Banking Industry in Research Undertakings

3.1.1. Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

It is an agreeable fact that one of the major functions of PHEIs is research. The research might be conducted for academic purposes and at the same time it is believed to solve problems of the industry. It is believed that the cooperation between the banks and the PHEIs should be strong. In this regard, the researchers attempted to gauge the level of collaboration between the PHEIs and the banking industry and obtained the following responses. The responses are summarized hereunder.

As indicated in the table 1, the collaboration between PHEIs and banks is found to be poor in terms of various aspects of research undertakings. As clearly indicated by respondents, the cooperation is weak or almost nonexistent in identifying research topics, provision of research inputs, sponsoring researches, arranging forums for presentation of research findings, and direct participation of academicians in research undertakings.

Table 1: Responses of PHEIs regarding Collaboration with Banks in Research Undertakings
Lack of such strong relationship in research areas can be viewed as severe problem. Because organizations may identify problems encountered in their daily practices and identify research topics and communicate them to the institutions so as to get possible recommendations which could be sound solutions to their problems.

**Analysis of Responses of Banks**

The table two shows that participation of the banking industry in research, especially in collaboration with PHIEs is minimal. From the total number of respondent banks, none of them provided research topics based on the existing problems of the bank to PHEIs. It is imperative that all of them participate in provision of relevant data for students. As far as awarding of sponsorship to researchers is concerned, the majority of them do not do so. Arrangement of forums for presentation of research outcomes, applying findings of researches and employees’ direct participation in research are seen as not significant in the banking industry. Banks have shown cooperation in the provision of data for student researchers.

Table 2: Responses of Banks on the Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Research Undertakings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No (%)</th>
<th>DK (%)</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Identifying research topics</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Assessing existing problems of organizations</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Providing research inputs</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Sponsoring research undertakings</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Arranging forums for presentation of research outcomes</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Communicating findings of research to organizations</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Direct participation of academicians in research undertakings</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Responses of Banks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Providing research topics based on existing problems of the bank</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Providing pertinent data for student researchers</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Sponsoring research</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Arranging forums for presentation of research outcomes</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Applying findings of research</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Employees’ direct participation in research</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2. Collaboration of PHEIs and Banks in the Teaching-Learning Process

3.2.1. Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

The teaching-learning activity of educational institutions in general and PHEIs in particular need to be practice-oriented and should be geared towards solving the existing problems in the sector or it should be tailored beyond that. Attempts were made to know the collaboration of the two parties in terms of the teaching-learning process of the PHEIs.

Table 3: Responses of PHEIs regarding Collaboration with Banks in the Teaching-Learning Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>High</th>
<th>Medium</th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Involvement of practitioners in the development of course content</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Willingness of practitioners to serve as guest lecturers/speakers</td>
<td>2(40%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5(100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Acceptance of educational tour programs</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>2(40%)</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Provision of necessary explanation to students in the educational tour</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As many of the respondents indicated, the partnership between the banks and the PHEIs in relation to the teaching-learning process is weak. Especially the involvement of practitioners in the development of course contents, provision of necessary explanation to
students in the educational tour is rated low. Acceptance of educational tour and willingness of practitioners to serve as guest lecturers/speakers is also minimal.

Such a weak relationship between the two parties in the teaching learning process has its own implication to both parties. The PHEIs lose the confidence of employers on the competence of their graduates. Such lack of confidence may lead to the extent of making graduates worthless to the industry. Also, it has its own implications to the banks, i.e. they may incur additional costs for training due to inefficiency of graduates.

Private Higher Education Institutions and banks thus need to cooperate in the teaching-learning process so as to boost the effectiveness of the process.

2.2. Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

In order to see the partnership between the banks and PHEIs in the teaching-learning process, the same questions were addressed to the banks and the banks confirmed that the relationship stands low.

Table 4: Responses of Banks regarding the Collaboration of PHEIs with banks in Teaching-Learning Process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of Banks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Involvement of practitioners in the development of course content</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Sending experienced employees as guest speakers/lecturers</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Providing educational tour opportunities to students</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The involvement of banking industry in the teaching-learning activities of PHEIs is a prerequisite for meaningful learning outcomes. However, direct involvement of the banking industry in the teaching-learning process is not considerable. Involvement of
practitioners in the development of course content and provision of educational tour opportunities for students are not being taken by the banking industry at all. Of the total banks interrogated, only one participated in the teaching learning process by sending experienced employees to higher education institutions as guest speakers or lecturers.

3.3. Collaboration of PHEIs and Banking Industry in Consultancy

The other aspect of relationship in which the PHEIs and the Banking industry might have is consultancy. Academicians in PHEIs may provide various consultancy services to the banking industry. In any ways there must be collaboration between academic institutions and the banking industry so as to get the best from their partnership. Questions have been raised to respondents to know the level of their cooperation with regard to Consultancy services.

Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

As confirmed by the respondents, the relationship between the PHEIs and the banks is found to be weak in terms of provision of professional consultancy services. Faculty members provide consultancy services to industries so as to assist their walks towards success. An effort has been exerted to know the level of cooperation between the two parties. The findings, as depicted in the table above, indicate that the level of cooperation between the two is weak.

Table 5: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Professional Consultancy Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>Totals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Formulation of organizational policies</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Preparation of organizational structure</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Preparation of organizational rules and regulations</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Preparation of standardized organizational manuals</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conducting feasibility study</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thus, 80% (4) of the respondents indicated, the faculty members of PHEIs do not participate in the formulation of sound organizational policies, preparation of organizational structure, and preparation of organizational rules and regulations. Again, 60% of the respondents indicated that academicians of PHEIs do not participate in conducting feasibility study and preparation of standardized organizational manuals.

3.3.2. Analysis of Responses of Banks

There are positive trends in involving academicians in the areas of consultancy by the banking industry. In formulation of organizational policies, rules, regulations and organizational structures, the participation of academicians seems encouraging to some extent but still not as expected.

Table 6: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Professional Consultancy Services

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of Banks</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Formulation of organizational policies</td>
<td>2(40%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Preparation of organizational structure</td>
<td>2(40%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Preparation of organizational rules and regulations</td>
<td>2(40%)</td>
<td>3(60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Preparation of standardized organizational manuals</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Conducting feasibility study</td>
<td>1(20%)</td>
<td>4(80%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.4. Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in the Provision of Internship and Employment Opportunities

As 80% of the PHEIs respondents indicated, banks, which are the major employers, do not view graduates of private educational institutions and graduates of public institutions equally. To the contrary, 100% of the banks respondents confirmed that graduates of PHEIs and public institutions are treated equally.
3.4.1. Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

As the majority of the respondents have indicated, the level of collaboration between PHEIs and the banking industry is encouraging. This has been manifested in the provision of job for graduates, accepting of apprentices, assignment of apprentices in jobs related to their areas of study. On the other hand, in appropriate follow-up and evaluation of apprentices, and lack of reliance on apprentices seen to affect the relation negatively, which this might be a hindrance to the implementation of apprenticeship and practicum programs.

Table 7: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in the Provision of Internship and Employment Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of PHEIs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. providing job opportunity for graduates</td>
<td>4 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Refusing to accept apprentices</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assignment of apprentices on job unrelated to their areas of study</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Inadequate follow-up of apprentices</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Inappropriate evaluation of apprentices</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Lack of reliance on apprentices</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: No respondent responded No regarding this question.

3.4.2. Analysis of Responses of Banks

There seems to be a strong relationship between PHEL, and the banking industry is terms of creating or facilitating internship and employment opportunities. Respondents orrented that they provide job opportunities for PHELs. Graduates, assign them for apprenticeship, follow up and evaluate them performance and relie on apprentices.
Table 8: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Provision of Internship and Employment Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of Banks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Providing job opportunity for graduates</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Accepting apprentices</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Assignment of apprentices on jobs related to their areas of study</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Follow-up of apprentices</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Evaluation of apprentices</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Reliance of apprentices</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.5. Cooperation between PHEIs and Banks in Selection, Training and Development of Employees

Private Higher Education Institutions can assist banks in selection, training and development of their employees. This is one major area of cooperation between the PHEIs and banks. In order to know the experience with regard to such and related activities, the respondents were asked about current practices. Their responses are summarized hereunder.

3.5.1. Analysis of Responses of PHEIs

Unlike most of the other aspects of partnership, the cooperation between the banks and PHEIs in the selection, training and development of their employees is said to be encouraging, though this has not been supported by bank managers involved in this research as respondents.

Table 9: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Other Affairs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of PHEIs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Screening of applicants</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Provision of continuing education opportunities</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Provision of short-term training</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 (40)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Totals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.5.2. Analysis of Responses of Banks

Staff recruitment and selection is one of the major functions that banks undertake so as to have a competent human asset. In the areas of staff hiring and development in the banking industry, PHEIs’ involvement is not that significant. All of them do not allow participation of PHEIs in applicant screening and the majority of them, 80%, do not consider PHEIs in provision of short term training for their staffs. More than half of all respondent banks consider PHEIs in provision of continuing opportunities for their staff members.

Table 10: Collaboration of PHEIs with Banks in Other Affairs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of Banks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Applicant screening</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Provision of continuing education opportunity</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Provision of short term training</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.6. The Role of PHEIs in Creating Awareness on National and International Issues

In addition to the teaching and learning undertakings, PHEIs have the responsibility of organizing awareness creation sessions on national and international issues. This is expected to be one function that must be performed by PHEIs. In order to know whether they are discharging this responsibility or not, respondents were asked and their responses are summarized here-in- below:

Table 11. Joint Arrangement of Awareness Creation Sessions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Responses of PHEIs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. New proclamations</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. New policies</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. New regulations</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As revealed in the above table, PHEIs and banks are not working together in creating awareness in national and global issues such as introducing newly enacted proclamations (tax and educational proclamations etc.), new policies, and new regulations.

Similarly, the responses from banks imply that when new proclamations are proclaimed, policies or regulations are issued; most banks do not prepare venues for students to introduce them with such things. Only 1 of the representative respondent of banks said they planned to take the initiative on this area while 4 (80%) do not involve in such things.

3.7. Job Placement Center

PHEIs need to have job placement centers for their graduates in order to connect the job seeking graduates and the job offering banks. This has an advantage to the PHEIs and the banks. The PHEIs can increase the employability of their graduates and the banks can get the best candidates without going through the lengthy procedures of recruitment, selection and placement of new graduates.

As the responses reveal, the majority percentage (60% of PHEIs respondents), have a job placement center. However, still significant numbers of PHEIs (40%) do not have a well organized job placement center. This means that they are lacking the major unit which may serve as a bridge to connect the banks and the PHEIs.

Of the total banks which participated in this study, 4 (80%) have no relationship with job placement center of PHEIs. One bank did not respond to this question.

3.8. Cooperation of Banks and the PHEIs in Fostering Further Studies of the Employees of the Banks

Different questions have been raised to know the level of cooperation in providing and facilitating human resource development of banks. The questions and their answers are presented in the following table,
Table 12. Cooperation of Banks and the PHEIs in Fostering Further Studies of the Employees of the Banks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Does your institution offer scholarship opportunities for employees of the industry and public organizations?</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Does your institution make tuition payment arrangements for banking industry?</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
<td>1 (20%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Does your institution make arrangements of class and exam hours considering the employees office hours</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As respondents indicated the cooperation of PHEIs and banks in facilitating their efforts to the staff development programs of banks is considered as high. This strong cooperation needs to be maintained and improved to a possible level best.

The banking industry makes some positive adjustment for its employees so as to help them pursue their further education. Some 3 (60%) of them arrange leaves for their employees who attend class at PHEIs. It is also found out that all the banks make loan arrangement or cover tuition fees for their employees.


Educational institutions should listen to the needs of the banking industry in their activities. The heart of every educational system is the need of employers, who are basically business organizations and public organizations. In this research, an attempt was made to know the extent to which PHEIs try to incorporate the needs of employers of their graduates in their curriculum and work towards bringing the desired behavioral change.

As one can see from the table, PHEIs have the freedom to incorporate the needs of the industry in their degree program curriculum. So, they can work hand in hand with the industry to keep abreast of the fast changing work environment taking place in the industry. To the contrary, the private higher education institutions have no freedom to
incorporate the needs of the industry by their discretions in the TVET program. It is tailored by the Ministry of education (MoE) and imposed on the educational institutions. So, there is no room for PHEIs to manipulate the curriculum and incorporate the needs of the banking industry in the TVET curriculum.

**Table 13. Incorporation of Needs of Banking Industry in Curriculum Formulation and Development**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question items</th>
<th>Responses of PHEIs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q. Does your institution incorporate the needs of banking industry in the formulation and development of curriculum for …?</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. TVET program</td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Degree program</td>
<td>4 (80%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**3.9. Tracer Study**

After sending their graduates to the world of work, PHEIs are expected to conduct a tracer study to know the whereabouts and the level of performance of their graduates. The subjects of this study were asked to reflect on the issue and their responses are summarized as follows:

**Table 14. Tracer Study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Does your institution conduct a tracer study to know the whereabouts and level of performance of the graduates?</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>DK</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 (40%)</td>
<td>3 (60%)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>5 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As the responses indicate, the majority of PHEIs do not conduct tracer study. What does this imply? It implies that the PHEIs are getting limited feedback about the position of their graduates and their level of performance at work. Conducting a tracer study helps the PHEIs to know their position in terms of their efficiency in providing applicable knowledge to students. At the same time the feedback obtained by a tracer study helps
PHEIs to identify the weaknesses of the graduates and to improve that for others who are still in the system. The graduates are performing well at work means it is a pride to the institutions and indicative of the value of education it is providing for students.

In response to the question whether there exists a gap between skills and knowledge of graduates and the required skills and knowledge in the world of work, 4 (80%) confirmed that there exists a gap. The provision of training, both in-house and otherwise.

Job rotation and provision of further educational opportunities were sited as possible solutions considered by the banks in order to fill the existing gap in this area.

All the banks have also indicated that there exists a gap in the skills and knowledge of graduates of PHEIs and public higher education institutions.

The majority (60%) of the respondent from banks, have confirmed that their organization allows implementation of new ideas by graduates while 1 (20%) requires graduates to be geared to the already existing practices of the banks.

From the five banks studied, three (60%) of them consider experience of academicians as relevant while one takes it as irrelevant.

In response to the above question, 4 (80%) of the banks provide loan facility to PHEIs while 1 does not provide this service. It is also noted that some banks undertake credit worthiness analysis for PHEIs as they do for any other client.
Conclusions and Recommendations

4.1. Conclusions

From the findings of the study the researchers came to conclude the following:

- Collaboration of PHEIs and banks in the teaching-learning process is weak;
- Collaboration of PHEIs and banks in various consultancy activities is weak;
- Collaboration of PHEIs and banks in various internship and employment opportunities is weak;
- Collaboration of PHEIs and banks in the selection, training and development of employees is fairly good;
- The practice of PHEIs and banks in arranging awareness creation sessions on national and global issues is low;
- PHEIs do not have room to flexibly incorporate the needs of the industry in their TVET programs. However, there is a room to modify the curriculum of their degree programs;
- PHEIs do not have well established job placement centers so as to meet the needs of job seekers and employers;
- PHEIs do not conduct tracer studies to know where their graduates are and their level of performance at works is;
- Banks and PHEIs have confirmed that there is a gap in the knowledge and skills of graduates and the skills and knowledge required in the world of work;
- Majority of the banks respondents believe that the experience of academicians is not relevant; and
- Collaboration of PHEIs and the banks in various aspects of research undertakings is weak.
4.2. Recommendations

- PHEIs and banks need to cooperate in conducting research undertakings. Academicians of PHEIs and practitioners of banks may join up and conduct meaningful research. At organizational level, the two parties may work together in identifying research topics, providing research inputs for researchers, sponsoring research, arranging forums for presentation of research outputs, and communicating findings to pertinent organizations.

- PHEIs and banks can jointly make the teaching-learning process fruitful. This can be done by involving practitioners in development of course contents, inviting practitioners to deliver classroom lectures, and fostering educational tour programs of PHEIs.

- Consultancy is the other function where PHEIs and banks can accrue substantial benefits. Areas of cooperation may include formulation of sound organizational policies, preparation of organizational structures, preparation of organizational rules and regulations, and conducting feasibility studies.

- PHEIs and banks need to cooperate in provision of internship and employment opportunities. Banks shall provide equal job opportunity for graduates of PHEIs, accept apprentices in the process of training, assign apprentices in jobs related to their areas of training, properly followup and evaluate apprentices, and develop confidence on apprentices of PHEIs.

- It is advisable for banks to use PHEIs as testing centers in the selection of competent personnel. Besides, banks can make arrangements with PHEIs so as to effectively utilize their staff development programs.

- Banks and PHEIs can also jointly work in arranging awareness creation sessions pertaining to national and global issues such as new proclamations, new policies, and regulations, and other current issues.

- PHEIs need to continuously involve the banking industry during the revision of their curriculum so as to satisfy the ever changing needs of banking industry.
PHEIs, is collaboration with the banking industry, need to conduct constant and organized tracer studies in order to know the whereabouts and level of performances of their graduates.

PHEIs and banks are also required to narrow down or fill the gap between the skills and knowledge of their graduates and the skill and knowledge instilled by the existing teaching methods.

Banks are also required to consider experiences and knowledge of the academicians and facilitate sharing of employees. Such a practice can serve as a potent tool for making classroom learning outcomes more meaningful.

Bibliography


G. Steven McMillan & Robert D. Hamiston, III (2003), the impact of publiclyt funded Basic Research; An integrative extention of Masfin & Salter, IEEE Transactions an engineering Management Volume 5 – No.2
A Comparative Study on the Impact of Instructor-Student Relationships, in Private and Government Higher Education Institutions on Students’ Learning: The Cases of St. Mary’s University College & Addis Ababa University, College of Commerce

Aderajew Mihret, St. Mary’s University College, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Abstract

Instructor-student relationship is an important element in the teaching-learning process. An instructor not only teaches but also interacts with his/her students. Nor does a student learn as though he/she were receiving his/her information from a teaching machine. Each has feelings toward the other, and a significant number of studies show that positive instructor-student relationships facilitate the learning process while negative ones interfere in students’ learning. However, the impact of lack of relationships on learning do not appear to have been periodically documented. This study was specifically designed to examine the impact of Instructor-Student Relationships in Private and Government Higher Learning Institutions, on Students’ Learning. The study examined the nature of relationships that exist between instructors and students in St. Mary’s University College (SMUC) and Addis Ababa University College of Commerce AAUCC and identified the factors influencing such relationships. It also tried to assess the professional distance maintained by the instructors in both institutions. To be able to examine and compare the impact of Instructor-Student Relationships on Students’ Learning, in the chosen institutions, in a questionnaire was administered to both prospective graduating students and senior instructors found in SMUC and AAUCC. The survey summarized all activities carried out the process followed? and recommends the most workable findings, which if appropriately addressed are believed to maximize students’ participation in the teaching learning practices.
I. Introduction

As many research papers show, instructor-student relationship is an important element in the teaching-learning process and such relationships start in the classroom. During class, instructors are able to identify students who are interested, enthusiastic, and determined to success. Accordingly, they need to work hard to maintain students’ interest in learning. Classroom is a great place to develop relationships with instructors, but students also have opportunities to get to know their instructors out of classrooms. Students could meet their instructors at their offices by attending conferences where they present their research reports, book reviews, coordinate educational clubs and develop appropriate relationships with them. Such relationships help students to augment their classroom discussions.

2.1 Objectives of the study:

The study is therefore an attempt to assess the extent of existing relationships inside and outside the classrooms between students and their instructors and the impact of such relationships on students’ interest in learning. To this effect, how instructors were performing their tasks in line with the university college guidelines, procedures and/or principles as well as the way they maintained their professional distance were also examined as these variables were thought to bear impact on students’ interest learning.

This study was specifically designed to:

- examine the nature of relationships that exist between instructors and students in SMUC and AAUCC;
- identify factors influencing such relationships;
- assess the professional distance maintained by the instructors in both institutions;
- analyze the impact of relationships on students’ learning; and
- Possibly draw conclusions and recommendations on the basis of the findings.
I.3. Methodology

A Significant number of studies show that positive instructor-student relationships facilitate the learning process while negative ones interfere. However, little inquiry has been made to compare as to how such relationships are made on the impacts they bring about in private and government institutions. This paper reports on a small scale comparative study done on the impact of student-instructor relationships on students’ learning. It is a case study made in two purposefully selected institutions one private (St. Mary’s University College (SMUC)) and the other is government (Addis Ababa University, College of Commerce (AAUCC)). 250 prospective graduates and 40 senior instructors took part in the study from both institutions. The study examined the interactions of students with their instructors both inside and outside the classroom, student’s interest to learn and the motives for developing relationships with their instructors. The practice of instructors in line with the institutions’ procedure and guidelines together with their professional distance were also addressed. Tabulated data is presented. Both qualitative and quantitative analyses have been carried out. Based on the findings of the study, conclusions and recommendation have been made.

2.2 Respondents

- Prospective graduates from SMUC and AAUCC; and
- Senior instructors who had taught five years and above from SMUC and AAUCC.

2.3 Sampling technique

- 115 students from SMUC and 135 students from AAUCC and 40 senior instructors (20 from each institution, who had taught five years and above were randomly selected for the study.
2.4 Instruments employed

Two types of questionnaires, one for the students and the other for the instructors, were prepared and used in this study.

2.5 Data analysis

Data obtained from sample students and instructors were tabulated based on sex, program and division of study (in the case of students) and in the case of instructors, data was compared to judge the awareness of instructors on the necessity of performing tasks in line with guidelines, procedures and principles of the university college and on the appropriate professional distance to be maintained in the teaching learning process.

Review of related literature

“Much like other relationships, student-instructor relationships need to be built on communication, understanding and respect.” Many students are intimidated by instructors and are afraid that they will judge them; they will appear to other students to be a “teacher’s pet”, or become a bother to their instructors if they try to develop relationships. This couldn’t be far from the truth. In fact, if a student fails to develop relationships with his/her instructors, he/she will miss out opportunities to greatly aid his/her learning process and deepen his/her college and/or university experience. An instructor with whom a student has great relationship can serve as a mentor and offer her/his students advice on how to do better in class and in college in general; help in determining career goals; in getting recommendation letters and references and the like. Instructor-student relationships start in the classroom. During class time, instructors are able to identify students who are interested, enthusiastic, and committed to success.
Classrooms are great places to strengthen relationships with instructors, but students also have opportunities to get to know their instructors out of classrooms. Instructors are expected to perform their tasks transparently and plainly so that they can facilitate their students’ learning.

According to Code of Ethics of Illinois State University, USA, 2005, in order to develop positive relationships with students instructors should: adhere to course content, clearly explain the objective of their courses, clearly explain methods of evaluation, regularly meet their assigned classes as scheduled, communicate to their students policy regarding attendance and consequences of non-compliance, Post and observe a reasonable number of regular office hours to consult students, not act to interfere with academic freedom of students, not utilize the services of the university college in pursuing non-academic concerns, make reasonable effort to create a climate which fosters honest academic conduct, grade students based on their academic performance, respect the confidential nature of their relationships with their students, should exploitation of students for their private advantages both inside and outside the classroom, etc.

While performing their tasks in line with these policies, procedures and guidelines of the college/university, instructors need to maintain a certain professional distance. It is a reserve maintained by the instructors to control the interaction between them and their students. Control is essential if the instructor wishes to insure his/her success in training each student to move on. The instructor must control not only the technical aspects of imparting knowledge, but also every element of teaching that can facilitate or interfere with the process. The relationship or personal interaction between instructor and student is one such element. An instructor may be friendly with each student or may develop such a close friendship that it interferes with the teaching/learning process. If the relationship is too close, the instructor might not insist on performance standards he/she would expect from other students. He/she might not want to hurt the feelings of the student by telling
him/her that he/she is not doing well in a lesson. In addition, the student might be lax in carrying out instructions because a good friend would overlook mistakes.

The possibilities for teacher/student non-lesson contacts are endless. But whatever they are, they will add to the complexity of the relationships and consequent ability to control the interaction and with outcome control, the instruction process may suffer. It is, therefore, necessary that any instructor should do what he/she can to control anything that affects the relationship and the outcome of the training. Gower and Walters (1983) stated that instructors can promote instructor-students rapport by showing personal respect for the students, being interested in their progress, asking for comments in a class, having the right manner, knowing all students by name, ensuring that students know each other, allowing plenty of group work, using activities that students enjoy, etc. Though it is not the purpose of this paper, it is important to mention, here, what Jones and Jones (1990), suggest: “Teachers trying to foster good relations with students will also need to take steps to help students get along with classmates as such relationship encourage students to learn from each other” and “develops their attitudes toward the class and toward themselves” (Moscowitz, 1981).

III. Results and Discussion

In the section that follows, responses obtained from the two groups are presented.

**Socio-demographic profile of the sample students and instructors**

As indicated in Table-1, among the sample students, female students are larger in number (56.5%) in SMUC while male students are larger in AAUCC. When we consider their program of study and division, about 65.2% are of diploma students. The rest 34.8% of the respondents are for degree students (SMUC) and all of the 135 students of AAUCC are degree students. Similarly, of the sample students, 52.2% are extension students while 47.8
% are regular students (SMUC) and for AAUCC, while 57% are regular, 58% are extension students. Among the sample instructors, 90% are male and 10% female (in SMUC) and 20 of the sample instructors are male (in AAUCC). In this regard, the absence of female instructors in the sample did not mean that there were no female instructors in AAUCC; however, in both institutions their number is minimal and is serious in AAUCC. In both institutions, the larger number of service years is (5-10) (45%) with 75% to MA/MS.C/LLM level and none higher than that.

Table-1: Distribution of Socio- demographic profile of the sample students
(N = 250) and sample instructors (N = 40)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>SMUC</th>
<th>AAUCC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>50 (43.5%)</td>
<td>89 (66%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>65 (56.5%)</td>
<td>46 (34%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>115 (100%)</td>
<td>135 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Program of study</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Degree</td>
<td>40 (34.8%)</td>
<td>135 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>75 (65.2%)</td>
<td>- (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>115 (100%)</td>
<td>135 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Division of study</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular</td>
<td>55 (47.8%)</td>
<td>77 (57.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension</td>
<td>60 (52.2%)</td>
<td>58 (43.0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>115 (100%)</td>
<td>135 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Instructors</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>18 (90%)</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>2 (10%)</td>
<td>- (0%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Years of services</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5-10</td>
<td>9 (45%)</td>
<td>9 (45%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11-15</td>
<td>7 (35%)</td>
<td>5 (25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; 15</td>
<td>4 (20%)</td>
<td>6 (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Level of education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.A/B.Sc./LLB</td>
<td>5 (25%)</td>
<td>3 (15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M.A/M.Sc./LLM</td>
<td>15 (75%)</td>
<td>17 (85%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ph.D. and above</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
<td>20 (100%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2. Practices of students that foster and affect relationships with their instructors inside the classrooms

This section presents how the sample students interacted with their instructors inside the classroom. Table-2 (refer to the annex) presents the findings were assessed against those assumed standard performances of students.

If one carefully observes Table 2, one can obtain the following information:
Both sexes from the two institutions responded that were asked questions freely, addressed their instructors properly and showed respect to their opinions, accepted instructors criticism without challenging them and asked for permission to perform every type of activity in the classroom. However, large number of female students from AAUCC responded that they didn’t ask questions freely. Female students from both institutions sought constant permission from their instructors. Both female and male students of SMUC and a relatively larger number of female students of AAUCC said that they didn’t see instructors’ evaluation as punishment; however, nearly half of the male students of AAUCC saw it as venting negative feelings. A small number of SMUC students refused to accept their instructors’ suggestions while a larger number of AAUCC students responded that they accepted any form of suggestion given by their instructors.

In relation to program of study, larger numbers of SMUC degree students responded they were free to ask questions, addressed their instructors properly, showed respect to their views, accepted their criticisms without resistance and asked for permission for any form of activity in class. AAUCC students also responded that they were relatively free to ask questions, addressed their instructors properly and with respect and showed respect to their opinions, accepted criticisms and asked for permission to perform classroom activities. But a reasonable number of AAUCC students (42.2%) refused to accept incorrect criticism. While 77.5% of SMUC degree students rejected the use of instructors’ evaluation for punishment, nearly half of AAUCC degree students (48.1%) reflected that
this venting negative feelings. SMUC diploma students seemed to be acting in the same way as degree students; however, they related to baseless criticism and non-teaching suggestions. In relation to division of study, regular students of SMUC appeared free to ask questions (87.3%) as compared to AAUCC students (only 57.1%). Students from both institutions responded that they addressed their instructors’ with respect: Regular students from both institutions responded that they accepted criticisms; however, AAUC students seemed to react somewhat. While larger number of SMUC regular students rejected the use of teachers’ evaluation as punishment, though not large, about 57.1% of regular students of AAUCC answered they did.

Extension students of both institutions responded that they were afraid of asking questions though not as serious in SMUC addressed their instructors properly, showed respect, and asked for permission for classroom activities.

They also didn’t see evaluation as punishment AAUCC students seemed to embrace suggestions and groundless criticisms while SMUC students (51.7%) refused.

**Practices of students that tend to foster or affect their relationships with their instructors outside the classroom**

The sample students were also asked to provide their opinions on student/teacher interaction outside the classroom. Table-3 (refer to the annex) shows the responses of the sample respondents.

As it is indicated in Table 3, **in relation to sex**, both sexes were not making appointments with instructors for discussions during office hours. However, SMUC male students (59.6%) seemed to have done it. Both male and female students showed a relatively equal interest to meet their instructors right after class; however, larger number of SMUC female students (54%) insisted on it. Both sexes responded that they didn’t participate in
instructor-led clubs. It was, however, serious in AAUCC. Only SMUC male students (59.6%) said that they participated in extracurricular events. Female students seemed to be better in trying to reverse negative attitudes of instructors by improving efforts to learning. A large number of male and female students said that they neither received nor insisted on invitations from their instructors. They also said they neither wanted to attack their instructors nor bothered if they came across instructors in recreational places. Female students from both institutions, however, said that instructors showed lack of interest to greet them outside of class.

In relation to program of study, degree students of both institutions responded that they didn’t insist on meeting their instructors’ right after the class, didn’t participate in clubs, acted to improve negative attitudes of their instructors, didn’t receive invitations from their instructors, didn’t care if they met instructors in recreational places, didn’t intend to challenge instructors who had given them a bad time during the learning process. While larger number of diploma students of SMUC (57.5%) took appointments from instructors for tutorials, degree students of the two institutions seemed unable to take advantage of this. About 51.8% of degree students of AAUCC said that they came across instructors who were reluctant to greet them. 52.0% of SMUC diploma students of seemed to insist on meeting their instructors’ right after classes. Larger number of students responded that they were participating in extracurricular events and came across instructors who refused to greet them.

In relation to division of study, larger number of regular students of both institutions responded equally that they didn’t participate in clubs and extracurricular events, acted to improve negative attitudes, didn’t receive nor insist to invitations from instructors, and didn’t intend to challenge their instructors for wrong decisions. However, while 55.8% of AAUCC students were unable to take advantage of instructors office hours, 56.4 % of SMUC regular students used of it. Extension students of both institutions, though there was some differences, reflected that they didn’t take appointments insisted neither to meet their
instructors’ right after classes nor to be invited by their instructors and strongly deny the intention of attacking instructors for vendetta. 53.3% of SMUC extension students participated in clubs which were led by instructors and in extracurricular events while 77.6% of AAUCC students responded to have participated in clubs and extracurricular events.

### 3.3 Students’ interest to learn

Students were asked for their opinion on student/instructor interaction. Table 4 (refer to annex)

As one can easily see in Table-4 (as shown at the annex), in relation to sex, relatively larger numbers of female and male students from both institutions had the following points in common: attend classes regularly and arrive for class as on time prepare well for assignments and/or projects show interest in courses, are punctual for tutorials (but 52.2% of AAUCC female students missed it) lose interest in learning when deprived of instructors’ attention (serious for SMUC female students) show interest to learn despite negative attitudes of instructors, and work hard to please their instructors. However, participation of SMUC students in classes (82%) was higher than AAUCC (58.5%). Both female and male students of AAUCC seemed not to take advantage of their instructors’ office hours for tutorials purposes. AAUCC students (larger number of both sexes) said they missed ‘Laughty’ instructors classes. However, only male students of SMUC (59.6%) said that they chose to miss such classes.

In relation to the program of study, degree students of both institutions answered the following. They almost equally attend classes regularly, arrive for classes on time participate in class discussion (higher in SMUC 82.5% and less in AAUCC, 57.8%) prepare well for assignments/projects show interest in their instructors courses are were punctual for tutorials; lose interest when deprived of attention of instructors; were interested in attending classes despite the negative mood of instructors; and work hard to
please their instructors. However, while 57.5% of SMUC degree students said that they took advantage of their instructors’ office hours, 58.5% of AAUCC students said that they did not. Similarly, while 71.1% of AAUCC students missed classes of ‘Laughty’ instructors, only 57.5% of SMUC did. Despite missing classes of such instructors, diploma students of SMUC showed interest in learning.

**In relation to division of study,** regular students of both institutions said that they attended classes regularly and arrived for classes on time prepared well for assignments or projects; showed interest in courses; were punctual at meetings with instructors for tutorials (AAUCC students need to work harder to improve this); missed classes of ‘Laughty’ instructors; lost interest when not encouraged; showed interest in attending classes despite negative attitudes of instructors; and worked hard to please their instructors. AAUCC students, however, showed less interest in class participation while it was about 89.1% for SMUC students. Many showed interest in participating in class. Many AAUCC students failed to take advantage of their instructors’ office hours (which was reflected only by 39%). In both institutions, extension students responded in the same way. They attended classes regularly and arrive on time (better for SMUC, 90%, and 60% for AAUCC); prepare well for assignments/projects; showed interest in instructors’ courses; were punctual for academic consultations (better for SMUC students, 80% than AAUCC students, 65.5%); lose interest in the absence of attention from instructors; and work hard to please their instructors. However, 85% of SMUC students responded that they participated in class whilst it was only 57% of AAUCC students did the same. AAUCC students largely didn’t take advantage of their instructors’ office hours (only about 44.8%). 79.3% of AAUCC students missed classes with a large number of SMUC students being in dilemma.
3.4 Motives that encouraged student to foster relationships with their instructors

In order to have a complete view of the impact of instructor-student relationships on the students’ learning, the researcher believed that factors that drive students to foster relationships with instructors should be known or identified. Accordingly, the sample students were asked to give their opinions on motivation or other reasons that contributed to their relationships. Table-5 (shown in the annex), presents the responses of the sample students (in percentage) based on their sex, program and division of study.

As can be easily seen from Table-5, in relation to sex, with some slight differences in percentage of responses, both sexes from the two institutions responded that they need to foster relationships with their instructors to get appropriate guidance and counseling, get better grades (though it seemed not highly exaggerated by female students of SMUC), build trust with their instructors, are in fear of low grades (AAUCC female students were more concerned i.e., 76.1%), imitate best practices of instructors (higher in SMUC) get help in determining career goals, get recommendations/references for employment. Both sexes in AAUCC showed little interest in having love affairs while in SMUC, 71.2% of male students and 63.5% of female students. Economic support seemed to be the concern of SMUC students (both sexes).

In relation to the program of study, degree students of both institutions said that they needed to develop relationships with their instructors to get appropriate guidance and counseling get better grades; get trust from their instructors; to banish of law grades; imitate best practices of instructors (higher in SMUC, 87.5% than AAUCC, 72%); get help in determining career goals and recommendations and/or references for employment (higher in SMUC). Diploma students of SMUC reflected that they needed the relationships to take advantage of what degree students suggested but were less a lesser concerned with better grades, fear of law grading of grades and economic support.
In relation to division of study, regular students of both institutions responded equally (despite certain differences in their magnitude) that they needed the relationships to: get appropriate guidance and counseling; get better grades; get trust from their instructors; the fear inappropriate grading (highly concerns AAUCC regular students, 74% than SMUC, 63.6%); economic support (a little higher in AAUCC regular students, 67.5%); imitate best practices of instructors; get help in determining career goals and recommendations and/or references for employment. SMUC regular students, however, said that they needed to establish a love affair with instructors (71.29%). Extension students of both institutions responded, despite the differences in the magnitudes): to get appropriate guidance and counseling and their instructors trust; get better grades (students of AAUCC had higher concern, 65.5% than SMUC, 58.3%). In both institutions, students showed the interest to imitate best practices of their instructors; the fear inappropriate grading; get help in determining career goals and recommendations and/or references for employment (however, SMUC extension students had a big interest in these issues). Both didn’t show much interest in economic support and love affairs were given due attention by SMUC extension students, 63.3% while AAUCC extension students awarded it only 39.7%.

Practices of the sample instructors in line with the university/college guidelines, procedures and principles

As it was explained in the objectives of this study, the professional distance that instructors maintain in the learning process should be assessed as it was believed to have effects on their students’ learning. Sample instructors were, hence, requested to provide their opinions on how they were performing their tasks in line with the university college guidelines, procedures and principles as well as what their professional distance looked like. Table-6 and Table-7 below present the responses of the sample instructors.

As it is clearly indicated in Table-6, the sample instructors from both institutions reflected almost equally, that: they adhere to the course content; regularly meet their classes as
scheduled; make every reasonable effort to be impartial to their students; maintain objectivity in assessing students’ performance and respect the confidential nature of relationships with their students. While larger numbers of SMUC instructors (60%) tried to explain almost always what was expected of students (objectives of their courses), AAUCC instructors seemed to practice irregularly. And while larger numbers of AAUCC instructors (80%) tried to explain to students methods of evaluation almost always, SMUC instructors (60%) seemed to do so rarely. Though it seemed to be nearly identical in their

**Table-6:** Percentage distribution of the responses of the sample instructors (N = 40) on their practices in line with the university college guidelines, procedures etc

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumed practices of instructors</th>
<th>Rated responses in % (based on institution)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SMUC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explain objectives of the courses</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adhere to the course content</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Explain methods of evaluation</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return commented assignments/proj</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post, announce office location</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate policies regarding</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regularly meet classes as</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post, announce office location</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make every effort</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

237
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>5</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>0</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>to be impartial to all students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maintain objectivity in assessing students’ performance</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect confidential nature of relationships with students</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:** 5 = always; 4 = often; 3 = sometimes; 2 = rarely; 1 = not at all; 0 = not applicable
Table-7: Percentage distribution of the responses of sample instructors (N = 40) on the professional distance they have maintained

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assumed items showing instructors professional distance</th>
<th>Rated responses in % (based on institution)</th>
<th>SMUC</th>
<th>AAUC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Controlling every element of teaching is necessary</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeping away young female/male students who infatuate with instructors is appropriate</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing close relationship with students contributes to lackadaisical manner on their learning</td>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Close friendship makes students to be lax in carrying instructions</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendliness to students positively interferes with their learning</td>
<td></td>
<td>40</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructors should become totally formal in their interaction with students</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Receiving invitations from students suffer the instruction process</td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respecting students brings a respect to instructors</td>
<td></td>
<td>95</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Key: 5 = agree; 4 = moderately agree; 3 = disagree; 2 = moderately disagree; 1 = neither agree nor disagree

(N = 40) on their practices and professional distance that they had respectively.

practices of returning commented assignments, projects and exams, SMUC instructors showed somewhat better performance. Regarding communicating to students policies concerning attendance and the consequences of the non-compliance to it, and arranging
extra time to support students’ learning outside the classroom, SMUC instructors seemed to perform better but in posting and announcing office location and hours, AAUCC instructors performed better.

Similarly, Table -7 shows that larger number of instructor respondents almost equally reflected that they believed respecting students brings about respect to them; keeping at a distance young female/male students who could become infatuated with their instructors was found necessary; and close relationships with students contributes to lackadaisical manner to students’ learning and to be lax in carrying instructions. However, while AAUCC instructors believed receiving invitations from students for a cup of coffee, tea, and a lunch or to a party would be detrimental to the instruction process and that instructors should be formal in their interaction with their students, SMUC instructors did not seem to take it seriously. It was also found that about 10 instructors were not in a position to say as to how close relationships with their students contributed to the carelessness of students in their learning.

4. Conclusions and Recommendations

In accordance with the objectives of the study, the main points were discussed in line with the accepted behaviors that the researcher identified. This section, hence, presents the major conclusions of the study.

1) On student-instructor relationships in classrooms:

a) Based on sex

Larger numbers of female students from the two institutions were found to interact with their instructors positively; however, quite large numbers of female students of AAUCC were not free to ask questions in the classroom. Reasonable numbers of male students from
AAUCC seemed to evaluate their instructors improperly while it seemed to be good at SMUC. About 55% of female and male students of AAUCC said they accepted any form of suggestions given by their instructors; in SMUC, about half of the sample students refused to do so.

c) Based on program of study:

Degree students (SMUC) were found to have good relationships with their instructors inside the classroom while in AAUCC students seemed to have poor classroom relationships as larger numbers of students were not free to ask questions, reasonable numbers of students refused to accept incorrect criticisms, and nearly half of the students used instructors evaluation to vent negative feelings. About 60% of AAUCC students also responded that they were afraid to asking questions. Diploma students (SMUC), however, were found to have very good relationships in classrooms.

d) Based on program of study:

Regular students of SMUC were found to have very good relationships in classrooms while a reasonable number of AAUCC regular students reflected not to have been free to ask questions and saw instructors’ evaluation as punishment. Except for the fact that extension students in both institutions were afraid of asking questions, AAUCC extension students seemed to have very good relationships while relationships in SMUC extension students seemed fair. The reasons behind this were the reactions of the students to incorrect criticism, and suggestions given by their instructors.
2) On student-instructor relationships out of classrooms

a) Based on sex:

Except for SMUC male students, in both institutions larger number of students did not take opportunities of instructors’ office hours; and except for SMUC male students, larger number of students from both institutions did not participate in clubs and extracurricular events where instructors play certain roles. Both sexes did not want to attack their instructors, and larger number of female students said that they came across instructors who did not want to greet them outside the school. Female students of SMUC said that they insisted on meeting their instructors immediately after the class. Both sexes from the two institutions seemed not to have fun outside the school compound with their instructors. Except for male students of SMUC, both sexes of AAUCC and female students of SMUC seemed to have poor relationships with their instructors out of classrooms.

b) Based on program of study:

Except for 57.5% of SMUC degree students, others missed the advantage of using instructors’ office hours. In both institutions, students seemed not to take part in clubs and/or extracurricular events, they did not insist on meeting instructors right after the class, acted to improve negative attitudes that their instructors had about them. 51.8% of degree students of AAUCC said that they came across instructors who refused to greet them. Students seemed to fail to develop relationships with instructors except for SMUC, where 57.5% achieved this. However, students were seen as not insisting that they meet their instructors right after the class and trying to improve negative attitudes that their instructors had. Larger number of diploma students of SMUC, however, insisted on meeting their instructors’ right after the class and took participation in clubs and extracurricular events.
c) **Based on division of study:**

Regular students of both institutions did not take advantage of clubs and extracurricular events (SMUC was a little better); acted to reverse the negative attitudes of instructors; AAUCC students did not take advantage of instructors’ office hours. It could be said that SMUC regular students had somewhat better outside relationships. Extension students of both institutions did not take the advantage of instructors’ office hours; showed no interest in meeting instructor’s right after the class and neither receives nor insisted on inviting instructors when seeing them off the school compound. SMUC extension students seemed to participate in clubs and extracurricular events. Though one can say that SMUC extension students had somewhat better relationships out of classrooms, extension students of the two institutes failed to develop good external relationships.

3) **On students’ interest to learning:**

a) **Based on sex:** both sexes of the two institutions seemed to attend classes regularly and arrive for class on time; prepare well for assignments, projects as well as homework; showed interest to their instructors’ courses; lost interest in learning when deprived of attention of instructors; and did not want to miss classes despite negative attitudes of their instructors. However, classroom participations were seen to be less in AAUCC (58.5%) and higher in SMUC students (82%) and while 67.3% of SMUC male students took advantage of their instructors’ office hours, female students of SMUC and both sexes of AAUCC students did not. Both sexes seemed to have positive interest to their learning except for classroom participation of AAUCC students and lack of taking advantage of office hours of instructors’.

b) **Based on program of study:** degree students of both institutions seemed to have positive interest in their learning; however, classroom participation and the habit of taking advantage of instructors’ office hours were less in AAUCC degree students and while there seemed to be some in SMUC degree students of around (57.5%) of
the respondents. Diploma students showed higher interest to their learning but nearly half missed classes of arrogant instructors.

c) Based on division of study: regular students of both institutions showed strong interest in their learning, however, AAUCC students seemed not to be punctual at appointments with their instructors, meant to augment their classroom learning, had poor classroom participation, and poor experience in using office hours of their instructors for learning. In comparison, extension students of SMUC showed higher interest in their learning, AAUCC extension students showed less classroom participation, failed to take advantage of instructors’ office hours and largely missed classes of arrogant instructors. This could mean that extension students of AAUCC had relatively less interest in their learning.

4) On the motives of students to develop relationships with their instructors:

a) based on sex: larger number of female and male students of both institutions seemed to develop relationships with their instructors for: appropriate guidance and counseling in their learning; better grades, trust, help in determining career goals, recommendations and references for employment, fear of low/inappropriate grades was found higher in AAUCC female students and to imitate best practices of instructors. Reasonable number of SMUC students of both sexes responded that they needed to develop love affair with their instructors. Both sexes seemed to be forced to develop relationships to obtain academic benefits with of course that large numbers of them reflecting that they needed better grades one way or the other and had fears of losing them.

b) Based on program of study: degree students of both institutions needed the relationships for appropriate guidance and counseling in their learning, better grades, trust, and fear of low/inappropriate grades, to imitate best practices of instructors, help in determining career goals, recommendations and references for employment. However, large numbers of SMUC students seemed to look for economic support too
and have a love affair with their instructors. Except for fear low/inappropriate grades, the interest for better grades, and economic support, diploma students of SMUC showed positive attitudes toward educational advantages.

c) **Based on division of study:** regular students of both institutions, nearly commonly, said that they needed the relationships for appropriate guidance and counseling in their learning, better grades, trust and the fear of inappropriate grading which is relatively high concern of AAUCC students, 74% to imitate best practices of instructors; recommendations and references for employment. However, regular students of SMUC reflected their relatively large interest to have a love affair with their instructors 71.29% while it was average in AAUCC regular students of around 50.7%. Largely regular students of the two institutions needed to develop relationships to generate educational advantages; however, they also mentioned that they were afraid of denial of better grades which might force them to look for it. Extension students of both institutions responded that they needed the relationships for appropriate guidance and counseling in their learning, better grades higher in AAUCC, trust, and the fear of low/inappropriate grading, recommendations and references for employment higher in SUMC. Here too, extension students needed to develop relationships to generate educational advantages. At the same time, they also mentioned that they wanted the relationships to avoid their fears of being denied better grades, which might falsely find.

5) **Performances of sample instructors in line with university college guidelines and principles:**

Sample Instructors of both institutions (SMUC and AAUCC) seemed to perform their tasks properly; however, SMUC instructors showed better practices in: explaining objectives of their courses to their students; returning commented assignments, projects and exam papers to students for inspection and discussion; communicating students on policies regarding attendance and consequences of non-compliance; arranging time to support students
outside classrooms and AAUCC instructors were better in posting but communicating locations and time for consultation of students.

6) Professional distance maintained by sample instructors:

Sample instructors of both institutions respected students, keeping infatuated students at a distance; not being so close to students was expected of instructors so that successful accomplishment of tasks could be achieved. However, while a large number of instructors from AAUCC believed that receiving invitations from their students adversely affected instruction process and their interactions should be formal, SMUC instructors (largely) did not take this seriously. About 10 instructors said nothing on how close relationships with students might contribute to a lackadaisical manner in students learning. AAUCC instructors (largely) seemed to have more distance from their students, while SMUC instructors (largely) seemed to be close and friendly to their.

Recommendations

Under the conclusion section of this report paper, the major findings were identified and brief conclusions were made for each behavior which was selected to address the objectives of the study. Recommendations would be forwarded and addressed by the responsible bodies.

As many research works show, student-instructor relationships affect students’ learning either positively or negatively. Students could maintain their interest in learning if they have a conducive environment. One of the factors that contribute to students’ interest in learning is their relationships with instructors both in and out of classrooms. Based on the findings, recommendations are forwarded as follows.
I. Concerning students:

a) Relationships inside classrooms:

- Female students of AAUCC, both in regular and extension divisions, should be encouraged to ask questions and participate in class discussions;
- Both female and male students of SMUC, in both divisions, ought to be guided to positively challenge their instructors’ suggestions, opinions and views;
- Male students of AAUCC, in regular division, might be counseled as to how they evaluate their instructors’ performance in the teaching learning process;
- Degree students of AAUCC, regular and extension, as well as diploma students of SMUC should be directed on how they could present correct ideas to instructors;

b) Relationships outside classrooms:

- Both female and male students of AAUCC, in regular and extension divisions, and female students of SMUC, in regular and extension divisions, should be encouraged to take advantage of instructors’ office hours to augment classroom learning;
- Female and male students of AAUCC, in regular and extension divisions, and female students of SMUC would need encouragement to participate in clubs led by instructors and in extracurricular events where instructors present research reports, book reviews and lead conferences;
- Female students of SMUC, in regular and extension divisions, should be advised when they are able to discuss points of interest with their instructors;
- Diploma students of SMUC should be advised to make appointments to discussion with instructors, to meet them using office hours and to be punctual for appointments;
c) How and why students need to foster relationships with instructors:

✓ Students of both institutions should be oriented, on a termly basis, on the rules and regulations of the university college;
✓ Students of both institutions should have corrected and commented exam papers, assignments and projects for inspection and discussion;
✓ Students of both institutions should be communicated with transparency, as to how grades were awarded;
✓ SMUC should design a mechanism for provision of economic support to the needy;
✓ SMUC should initiate a counseling service where students can confidentially discuss personal and learning issues.

II. Concerning instructors:

✓ AAUCC instructors would do better in explaining to their students the objectives of each and every courses thought; return corrected and commented exam papers, assignments and projects to their students for inspection and discussion; communicate to students policies regarding attendance and consequences of non-compliance to them; arrange more time to augment discussions in classrooms;
✓ SMUC instructors would do better in posting and announcing office locations and times for consultation and make use of them;
✓ SMUC instructors should give due attention to closeness to their students maintaining appropriate and personal relationships;
✓ SMUC instructors might think of formalizing their interactions with students;
✓ A large number of AAUCC instructors and some SMUC instructors might show interest in greeting their students off the school compound;
Almost all AAUCC instructors and some SMUC instructors should encourage their students to attend to conferences where they present research papers, and to participate in clubs which they lead or coordinate;

Instructors of the two institutions should understand the differences between being friendly becoming close to students;

Those instructors who said nothing on the effect of close relationships with their students might contribute to lackadaisical manner of students in their learning should refer to research papers which address this issue and take advantage of it.

References:

1. Jack C. Richards (2003); A Practicum in TESOL: Professional Development through Teaching; Cambridge University Press, USA
2. Linda Darling-Hammond (1999); Teacher Quality and Student Achievement: A Review of State Policy Evidence; University of Washington; USA
4. Code of Ethics of Illinois State University, USA, 2005 Life During College
An Evaluation of the Implementation of Continuous Assessment (CA): The Case of St. Mary's University College

Bekalu Atnafu
St. Mary’s University College

Abstract

Students' achievement might not be fully measured through a single or a couple of written tests (examinations). Various types of assessment methods should be in place. Alternative ways of assessing students take into account variation in students' needs, interests and learning styles (Shaaban, 2001). The objective of this study is to evaluate the practices of continuous assessment at St. Mary's University College. To this end, data were collected through questionnaire, document analysis and interview. The results of the study showed that teachers appeared to have good perceptions about CA but they did not use various tools of CA; instead they relied on the traditional modes of measuring students i.e., testing. Conclusions were drawn on the basis of the results obtained.

Introduction

The traditional paper-and-pencil tests no longer cover the variety of activities and tasks in the classroom situation. As a result, the field of evaluation has witnessed a major shift from strictly summative testing tools and procedures to a more humanistic approach using informal assessment techniques that stress formative evaluation (O'Neil, 1992, as cited by Shaaban, 2001).

Unlike terminal assessment which is carried out at the end of a course or a major unit for summative purpose, continuous assessment is done on an on-going basis while students are actually working their way through the course or major unit (Singer 2003). That is, it is the process of gathering appropriate information regularly for making educational decisions (Nitko, 2004). Obviously, to make such decisions, we need to use high-quality information- information that is highly valid and highly reliable for the decisions at hand (Nitko, 2004).
Assessment serves a variety of functions in the classroom situation. To mention but few, it measures student achievements, provides a means of feedback to the teacher and students, motivates and directs student learning, helps to evaluate teaching methods, and is a useful means of over learning (Ebel, 1979; Hopkings and Stanley, 1981).

In doing so, there are different types of continuous assessment tools or techniques. These are tests, assignments, examination, quiz, projects, presentations, questioning, participations in class, group reflections, discussions, portfolio assessment, term paper, self-assessment, observation, interview, peer assessment, attendance, role-playing, fieldwork/practical work, homework and the like.

Continuous assessment is process-oriented, learner-involved and self-referenced in nature. In other words, continuous assessment has the following characteristics (AED /BESO II, 2006).

- It is an ongoing process of gathering information about students' learning progress.
- It uses a variety of assessment techniques.
- It provides timely feedback to students about what they need to improve their learning.
- It is aligned with curriculum goals and objectives.

To conduct an effective and appropriate continuous assessment, the following conditions are mandatory (Shepard, 2000).

- The teacher must be equipped with an adequate knowledge and capability about different assessment techniques.
- The assessment activity should be planned.
The assessment procedure should be based on the actual condition, social factors of the class, and pupils' level of knowledge and the nature of instruction.

Variety of assessment techniques should be selected and applied.

There should be up to date record keeping.

In line with this, Singer (2003) stated the following points as advantages of continuous assessment:

- It provides an on-going picture of how individual students develop and mature as they work their way through a course.
- It places less emphasis on pure memory than terminal assessment.
- It encourages regular, systematic study and discourages last-minute cramming.
- It provides early warnings of which students are having problems with a course.
- It can provide early indicators of the likely performance of students.
- It renders warning of any problems or weaknesses, thus enabling them to take appropriate measures to improve matters.
- It reduces the intense stress that many students experience when preparing for and sitting terminal examinations.
- It provides a more natural assessment environment that is better matched to the situations in which students will find themselves working in later life.

To this end, utilizing continuous assessment is of paramount importance to obtain reliable and valid information since traditional one-off exam leads teachers to make an erroneous decision. In view of the points stated above, the issue of continuous assessment is imperative in the educational setting since it renders regular information about the teaching process and it is vital to judge the quality of an individual's work.
As a result, the issue of continuous assessment like active learning and Higher Diploma Program has got much attention in the Ethiopian education scene. Even in the policy document, it was stated as one of the objectives of teacher education in Ethiopia (MoE, 2003). In view of this, continuous assessment has been regarded as an integral part of teaching. Owing to this, the main aim of this research work was to look into the practice of continuous assessment at St. Mary's University College.

**Methodology**

In St. Mary's University College (SMUC), the total number of lecturers in the regular program is more than one hundred fifty. Of the total number, forty lecturers participated in the study. The majority of the lecturers (85%) were MA holders whereas the remaining (15%) were first-degree holders. Again, the majority of the lecturers (75%) have had education background. In addition to the lecturers, department heads took part in the study. Survey Questionnaire was administered to secure relevant data. The questionnaire was both open and close-ended. In addition to the questionnaire, two interviews were conducted to gather information from department heads.

The data were then coded, categorized, organized and carefully analyzed. In analyzing the data, descriptive statistics were used to describe the outputs.

**Results and Discussion**

As shown in the table one, most lecturers (50% +40%) believed that continuous assessment is beyond testing. And the majority of the lecturers (45%+10%) considered continuous assessment to be more than giving paper/pencil tests. This showed that the majority of the instructors seem to have good understanding regarding the concept of continuous assessment. This finding does not corroborate with similar findings made in other
institutions. The findings of Muluken (2006) revealed that his respondents considered continuous assessment as simply giving series of tests for pupils to measure their performance. Furthermore, the finding of Mulu (2005) as cited by Muluken (2006) found out that continuous assessment is interpreted by instructors of AAU as continuous testing. This difference arose due to the fact that, at St. Mary's University College, various workshop, training and seminar have been given for the staff that enlightened the instructors about the concept of continuous assessment.

Table 1: Instructors’ perceptions about continuous assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Number of respondents and percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe that continuous assessment is beyond testing</td>
<td>20 (50%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I consider continuous assessment as merely giving paper /pencil tests</td>
<td>4 (10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I feel that using continuous assessment improves pupil's learning through feedback.</td>
<td>28 (70%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most instructors (70%+5%=75%) felt that continuous assessment improves pupils' learning through feedback (table 1). Contrary to this, the findings of Seyum (2006) revealed that students receive feedback from instructors only in the form of grades and, the majority of instructors are not willing to show the results of the students. Absence of smooth interpersonal relationship between students and teachers might minimize the students' comfort zone and hinder them to know about their progress. It is a fact that providing students with regular feedback on how they are doing is an essential part of the education process.
Table 2: Instructors' perception regarding the function of continuous assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Number of respondents and percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Strongly agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I believe that continuous assessment motivates student's learning.</td>
<td>12 (30%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous assessment enables me to review or correct my teaching</td>
<td>8 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>methods and the instructional materials as well.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continuous assessment is used only to grade students.</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most instructors (80%) believed that continuous assessment motivates students to learn (table 2). It was repeatedly indicated that continuous assessment encourages students to learn more and the teacher to work on the refinement of the process of learning rather than its product (Shaaban, 2001). This finding is in contradiction to the results of Seyum (2006). Seyum reported that motivating students on the assessment result is not much important because students are considered to be adult. Regardless of the learners' age, motivation that is an internal state that arouses, directs and maintains behavior, is important to success.

The majority of the instructors (70%) stated that continuous assessment enabled them to review their teaching methods (table 2). Assessment tools and procedures are essential for evaluating students' progress and achievement and, moreover, it also helps to evaluate the suitability and effectiveness of the curriculum, the teaching methodology and the instruction (Shaaban, 2001).

The majority of the instructors (65%) indicated that continuous assessment has diverse functions in addition to grading students. Contrary to this, a substantial number of instructors in Dilla College of Teacher Education indicated that they are using continuous
assessment results only for grading students (Seyum, 2006). If learners could not consider assessment as an integral part of the teaching-learning process and if the purpose of assessment is to judge their abilities in relation to their classmates, the assessment procedure can cause a great deal of anxiety that affects students’ learning and self image (Shaaban, 2001).

All instructors stated that they have been frequently measuring their students' performance. However, the result revealed that the majority of the instructors (77.5%) provided two or three tests as assessments for a course in a semester (table 3). All instructors (100%) indicated that they were frequently measuring their students' performance. But this is not observed in the response given in table three. Providing two or three tests could not be considered as continuous assessment. Singer (2003) stated that continuous assessment can take place in the form of daily work (e.g. essays, quizzes, presentation, participation in class projects/term papers and practical work). In the same vein, Muluken (2006) citing Farant (1980) contended that continuous assessment is practiced on a day-to-day basis to judge the quality of the individuals' performance. This being the case, two or three tests or number of assessment could not be considered as continuous assessment. Here, it should be understood that continuous assessment is an integral part of the learning process.

Table 3: Numbers of assessments/tests/ given for a course in a semester

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Responses &amp; No of respondents with percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How often do you give periodic testing or assessment?</td>
<td>Once in a semester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the open-ended responses, most instructors reported that large class size; Shortage of time; lack of commitment; tight schedule; broad course content and teaching load hamper the implementation of continuous assessment. However, all the respondents (100%)
reported that they used various tools or techniques of continuous assessment, although the
techniques in table 4 below might not be in line with the point at hand.

Table 4: Tools of continuous assessment frequently employed by instructors (from
very high to very low frequency)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Techniques of CA</th>
<th>Very high</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Very low</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N0. %</td>
<td>N0. %</td>
<td>N0. %</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tests</td>
<td>38 95</td>
<td>2  5%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignments</td>
<td>28 70%</td>
<td>7 17.5%</td>
<td>3 7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examination</td>
<td>26 65%</td>
<td>9 22.5%</td>
<td>3 7.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quizzes</td>
<td>20 50%</td>
<td>6 15%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projects</td>
<td>20 50%</td>
<td>8 20%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentations</td>
<td>14 35%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2 5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Questioning</td>
<td>10 25%</td>
<td>20 50%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participations</td>
<td>8 20%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1 2.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Group reflections</td>
<td>6 15%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussions</td>
<td>2 5%</td>
<td>1 2.5%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portfolio assessment</td>
<td>1 2.5%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Term paper</td>
<td>1 2.5%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3 7.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All the respondents (100%) stated that they employed various tools of continuous
assessment; however, Table 4 shows that subjects used few types of tools, of which tests
are dominated. This finding was in line with the results of Muluk (2006) and Seyum
(2006). The majority of the respondents, in Muluk's and Seyum's studies, considered
continuous assessment as simply giving series of tests for pupils to measure their
performance. Needless to say, tests alone cannot measure the innermost competence of
students, thus, using one or two types of continuous assessment tools might not give the
real picture of the students' performance. Teachers' reliance on testing denies many learners
the opportunity to demonstrate their true potential (Papworth, 2005 as cited in Muluk,
2006). Furthermore, teachers' heavy use of tests as a measure of pupils' performance
encourage rote and superficial learning (Black and William (1998) cited in Muluk
Tests, assignments, examination, quiz, projects, presentations and questioning were the most widely used tools of continuous assessment (table 4) whereas participation in class, group reflections, discussions, portfolio assessment and term paper were types which were rarely used as tools of continuous assessment. On the contrary, self-assessment, observation, interview, peer assessment, attendance, role-playing, fieldwork/practical work and homework have never been used as tools of continuous assessment by any of the instructors.

Conclusions

On the basis of the findings, the following conclusions were drawn:

- Instructors at St. Mary's University College seem to have better understanding about the concept of continuous assessment. Furthermore, it was found out that the majority of the instructors have got a reasonable insight into the various functions of continuous assessment.

- Although participants of the study reported that they frequently evaluated the students' performance, it was explored that instructors gave only two or three tests for a course in a semester. Thus, it appeared reasonable to conclude that participants of the study did not practice continuous assessment though they were aware of its importance. Along with this, instructors listed down the potential factors that hamper them in the implementation of continuous assessment. These are large class size, shortage of time, lack of commitment, tight schedule, broad course content and teaching load.

- Though the participants claimed that they used various tools of continuous assessment, the data showed that they employed only the most traditional instruments such as tests and examinations. Since human competence is intricate and diversified, it cannot be easily assessed by a single form of assessment. But, the study found out that teachers mainly used testing as a major assessment
technique. In addition to this, there are certain assessment tools, which have never been used by the instructors. The traditional mode of assessment in which they passed through might have influenced teachers in practicing limited assessment techniques.

References


Student Engagement in Some Ethiopian Private Higher Education Institutions

Dawit Mekonnen
Bahir Dar University

Abstract

The quality of higher education has been an overriding theme in the area of higher education since decades. Yet, controversies on how to ensure quality in higher education still dominate educational research and literature. Total quality management (TQM) has been borrowed from industries and widely applied in higher education. Recently, however, there is the contention that although TQM fits properly to the service provision of higher education, it is deficient to address the educational purpose of higher education. Consequently, new approaches have been forwarded and student engagement is argued to be one of the most appropriate approaches in explaining quality educational provision. It is also a very useful proxy for assessing ‘added values’ on students by higher learning institutions. The basic premise of student engagement is the assertion that high quality programs contribute to learning experiences that affect students’ development positively. In view of this theoretical basis, this study assessed the status of student engagement in Ethiopian higher learning institutions using a questionnaire. Data were collected from students and findings that give evidence on the extent of academic challenge, the prevalence of active and collaborative learning and the quality of faculty-student interaction were unveiled. It is argued that external monitoring mechanisms for accreditation such as quality and quantity of buildings, availability of books, number and type of staff do not attend to significant issues that are imperative for ensuring quality higher education; hence, they need to be coupled with various approaches such as student engagement.

1. Introduction

Quality in Higher Education

Quality is so a pervasive issue in higher education that it recurs consistently in various higher education journals and conferences. Due to its ambiguous nature, the term quality has resulted in different conceptualizations and definitions which at times are competitive
and contradictory (Milliken and Colohan, 2004). Citing a number of scholars in the field, Milliken and Colohan (2004) identified some conceptualization of quality in higher education. Some consider it as “fitness for purpose”; others view it as “excellence in educational provisions”. Still others equate quality with “conformance to requirements” and “standards that should be met to achieve the specified purposes to the satisfaction of customers”. Routed on its fluidity and being ‘value-laden’, methods to ensure quality in higher education are divergent and controversial. Quality assurance, though complex and controversial, is an important issue in higher education due to different reasons. Monitoring and improvement of programs, benchmarking and market demands, accountability, funding, and policy development depend on information gathered through quality assurance (Coates, 2005). Borrowed from industries, total quality management (TQM) has been dominantly used in higher education since the 1980s (Sahney, Banwet, and Karungs, 2004). TQM is grounded on the principle of customer satisfaction. To this end, managers and employees must work on improving operations, management processes, and products (Berry, 1991). TQM mingles quality control, quality assurance, and quality improvement and addresses the needs of internal customers, suppliers, and other stakeholders (Peach, 1994 cited in Izadi, Kashef, and Stadt, 1996). When applied to education, TQM aims at satisfying students, parents, employers, and taxpayers by addressing their needs and involving them in the planning and execution of educational programs. Students should be allowed to communicate freely with staff and be involved in the planning of courses. In general, some believe that TQM has “applications for educators in virtually every aspect of their mission” (Izadi, Kashef, and Stadt, 1996:36).

Recently, however, there a the contention that TQM is unfit to the educational purpose of higher education — learning — and meets only the requirements of service provision (Holmes and McElwee, 1995; Bensimon, 1995; Harvey, 1995) although others consider this argument to have stemmed from academics desire to monopolize decision making in higher education (Lindsay, 1994 cited in Izadi, Kashef, and Stadt, 1996). The argument is TQM focuses on ‘the quality of the delivery by measuring, monitoring, and continuously
improving the processes which in education are not easily measurable and identifiable in advance (Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2005; Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2003). TQM, critics contend, has a place in educational service provisions such as libraries, enrolment, and cafeterias but is inappropriate in academic processes (Holmes and McElwee, 1995; Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2003). According to them, quality management in education has to emphasize the process of learning — interaction among teachers, students, and administrators — rather than looking at the process of delivery. Hence, they proposed a ‘holistic model’ of quality management in education whose service provision draws much from TQM and whose pedagogical efficacy rests much on the engagement, transformative, responsive university and the learning university models of quality management (Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2002). These models respectively emphasize learning experiences for students that have positive effects on their development, empowering students by emphasizing learning rather than teaching, addressing community needs and working collaboratively to meet community demands, and building organizational culture that fosters learning and inquiry. While each of these approaches suggests various methods for ensuring the quality of higher education, they converge with regard to the emphasis given for students learning and the collaborative approach needed to that end.

According to Srikanthan and Darlymple (2002), one basic difference between TQM and the holistic model which is referred as quality management education (QME) is the emphasis given to students. While TQM considers students as customers, QME assigns them “the key role of participants…and focuses on the empowerment of a course team across all the boundaries to facilitate dialogue centered learning” (Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2002:221). The QME centers on transformation of learners, by adding value and empowering them. To this end, higher education institutions need to build an organizational learning culture and collegialism by challenging recent trends of ‘managerialism’ and ‘cloisterism’ which are argued to be the consequences of TQM (Srikanthan and Darlymple, 2003).
It is not the intention of this paper to examine thoroughly the arguments that revolve on the two methods. Nor is it intended to argue that QME is a better model of quality assurance for higher education than TQM. Such debates in education have usually ended up in substituting one management fad by another with no noticeable influences on the practice of higher education. Yet, it must be made clear that quality assuring methods in higher education have long focused on indicators which have little to do with the learning of students. Adherents of student engagement point out a number of limitations to these methods (Coates, 2005; Kuh, 2002). With regard to institutional resources, it is believed that high quality physical, financial, and human resources in higher education institutions provide higher opportunities for students’ learning. The assumption is the quality of the classrooms, laboratories, and teaching staff is related to the quality of the student learning experience (Coates, 2005). Kuh (2003:24-25), however, indicated that “students can be surrounded by impressive resources and not routinely encounter classes or take part in activities that engage them in authentic learning.” Coates (2005) argue that though institutional resources may create opportunities for student learning, they are not casually related to student learning. Reputations, according to him, are also ‘based on beliefs and stereotypes rather than evidence’ which are mainly drawn from tradition, history and location, with no current evidence on the add on effect they have on students. What is very promising of student engagement is that it is based on pedagogical principles and educational research. As such, student engagement holds water under different propositions.

**Student Engagement as Indicator of Quality Higher Education**

Student engagement has recently become a common research agendum in higher education because it is significantly correlated with personal and social development. Also, it is used as an indicator of collegiate quality (Kuh, 2003; Pascarella and Terenzini, 1991; Porter, 2006). Austin’s (1985) argument that student involvement on the teaching learning process
is an indicator of quality higher education is the foundation for student engagement. Coates (2005) contended that quality assurance methods — focusing on teaching and other institutional factors — have marginalized student engagement from the indicators of quality higher education. According to Coates, student engagement is a direct indicator of educational processes and a proxy for measuring educational outcomes. Kuh (2003:24) noted that many studies in recent years show that students learn most when they invest their time and energy in educationally useful activities. Hence, “to assess the quality of undergraduate education at an institution, we need good information about student engagement: the time and energy students devote to educationally sound activities inside and outside of the classroom, and the policies and practices that institutions use to induce students to take part in these activities” (Kuh, 2003:25). Pascarella and Terenzini (2005:602) assert that “If, as it appears, individual effort or engagement is the critical determinant of the impact of college, then it is important to focus on the ways in which an institution can shape its academic, interpersonal, and extracurricular offerings to encourage student engagement.”

Defining high quality programs as those that provide students with learning experiences that have positive effect on students’ development, Haworth and Conrad (1997) as cited in Srikantan and Dalrymple (2002) suggested that students, faculty, and administrators should invest in five areas which create conducive situation for student engagement. These are interactive teaching and learning, participatory cultures and organizational learning, involvement in various activities of the institution by faculty, students, and leaders, integrated program development and provision of adequate resources. Coates (2005) also stated that student engagement is based on the constructivist assumption that learning is a result of students’ participation in educationally purposeful activities. Institutions and staff should create opportunities and expectations for students to be involved in activities that lead to quality learning. Coates mentioned activities such as active learning, involvement in enriching learning experiences, seeking guidance from staff and collaborative learning with staff and students. Indicating that student engagement is necessary even when
institutions are reputable and well resourced, Coates contended that students participation in educationally useful activities may suffice for learning even when resources are scarce. Kuh (2006) indicated that student engagement represents the amount of time and effort students put into their studies, and into other activities that lead to the experiences and outcomes that constitute student success and the ways the institution allocates and organizes its resources, learning opportunities, and services to induce students to participate in and benefit from such activities.

Recent research on student engagement uses five benchmarks in assessing student engagement at various institutions: Academic challenge, active and collaborative learning, student-faculty interaction, educational experiences, and supportive campus environments (Porter, 2006, Kuh and Gonyea, 2003; Kuh, 2003; Kuh, 2007, Coates, 2005b). Active and collaborative learning represents the contention that students learn more when they are actively involved in learning and work together with others (peers, staff, and community members) in solving problems or learning (Kuh, 2003). Such learning helps students not only to master learning material but also prepares them to deal with life problems which they encounter later on. Some of the indicators used to assess this benchmark are involvement in class discussions, working on projects, and class presentations. Student faculty interaction refers to the quality and frequency of non-classroom interactions with faculty. Working with instructors (in committee, projects) gives students opportunities to experience first hand problem-solving process and promotes lifelong learning. Some of the dimensions of student-faculty interaction are talking about career plans with a faculty member, discussing ideas from readings or classes with faculty members outside of class, working with faculty members on activities other than coursework, and getting prompt feedback on academic performance.

Enriching learning experiences refers to students’ involvement, in and outside the institutions, in academic and non-academic matters that complement the institution’s goal. Studies indicate that involving students in institution’s jobs and committees increases their
leadership and problem-solving skills and develops sense of belongingness towards the institutions (Kuh, Kinzie, Schuh, and Whitt, 2005). Visits to other colleges and universities, internships, using internet for learning, and interacting with organizations to broaden learning are some of the examples under this benchmark. With regard to academic challenge, there is the assumption that challenging intellectual and creative work is central to student learning and collegiate quality (Kuh, 2007). Pace cited in Kuh (2007) also noted that students need to expend a certain ‘quality of effort’, to challenge themselves to learn, to interact with new ideas and practices and to practice the communication, organizational and reflective skills that should help them learn. Reading books, writing papers, and application of higher order thinking skills are some of the components of this benchmark. Supportive campus environment such as availability of books, offering guidance and counseling, and addressing students’ daily life problems is also an integral part of student engagement.

The assertion that student engagement is one of the best indicators of quality higher education programs is also supported by empirical evidence. Carini, Kuh, and Klein (2005) reported that student engagement is correlated with critical thinking and grades although the relationship was not strong. Kuh et al. (2007) also indicated that student engagement has statistically significant positive effects on persistence and grades, the underprivileged students making a lot out of student engagement.

Research indicates that there is variation in student engagement among institutions and more within an institution (Kuh and Pasacrella, 2004). Porter (2006), for example, reported substantial effect of institutional structures on student engagement. The institutional structures that were found to have impact on student engagement were acre size is terms of the number of students in the campus, and programs and practices of institutions. Some also contend that selectivity based on students’ achievement in pre-college examination affects student engagement (Kuh and Pascarella, 2004). This contention is based on the assumption that student engagement is highly influenced by peers. Exposure to highly able
and competent peers has effect on how students spend their time and the extent they discuss educational issues. However, in a study conducted among students comprised of 272 baccalaureate offering colleges and universities, Kuh and Pascarella (2004) reported that there was at ‘best trivial relationships between selectivity and the various measures of student engagement’, demonstrating that student engagement and selectivity are fundamentally unconnected (Kuh and Pascarella, 2004: 56). In fact, selectivity was found to contribute to institutional level variance in 10 of the 20 items used to measure student engagement in colleges and universities of the USA by the National Survey on Student Engagement. Interestingly, however, its contributions on some of the components of student engagement – number of essay exams on courses and provision of feedback – were negative.

Another factor that is commonly believed to affect student engagement is institutional size (Porter, 2006; Kuh, 2003; Kuh and Pascarella, 2004). Smaller institutions engage their students in educationally useful activities more often than large institutions. This has to do with the distance between faculty and students. This seems to have some truth seen in Ethiopian situation. With the expansion of higher education, students and faculty frequently refer to the sparing interaction between students and faculty members. Kuh (2003), however, noted that there are large institutions which are as engaging as small institutions. Hence, what matters most is an institution’s program and practices that set good opportunities for student engagement. Literature also indicates that private institutions are more engaging than public institutions (Kuh and Pascarella, 2004). This is explained by the residential nature of private institutions and their small size. However, given that private institutions in Ethiopia may not satisfy both factors, this finding may not hold to be true in Ethiopian case.

The Problem
The purpose of this study is to examine the extent to which students in Ethiopian private higher learning institutions are engaged in educationally useful practices. There is solid evidence that student engagement in educationally useful practices is very much related to add values higher learning institutions have on students (Coates, 2005; Kuh, 2004). The Ministry of Education uses accreditation and other follow up mechanisms in order to keep the standard of private higher learning institutions. Though useful this procedure is, it does not address the extent to which students are engaged in learning. Hence, as private higher education institutions enroll many students, data on students’ involvement on educationally useful practices is very much important to identify areas of improvement and is also a proxy indicator on the effect private higher institutions have on students.

Borrowing Kuh’s and other writers work on the area, student engagement is conceptualized in this study to include the five components identified as benchmarks. Because some of the benchmarks entail a lot of activities which are either culturally unfit to Ethiopian situation or unaffordable by Ethiopian students, the benchmarks were at times tailored to include only comprehensive aspects. For example, under enriching experiences aspects such as visiting universities in other countries and working as an employee of a faculty member were excluded from the study. Under collaborative learning, items such as working with minority ethnic group, disabled students, and students from other universities were also excluded from the study.

By doing so, this study intends to answer the following questions:

1. To what extent are students, in private higher learning institutions, engaged in effective educational practices?
2. To what extent are students involved in active and collaborative learning?
3. How often do students interact with faculty members on academic matters?
4. Do students get adequate support from faculty members?
5. Do students expend adequate effort for learning?
6. Are there differences in student engagement among students of various years of study?
7. Does the amount of time students spend in preparing for class vary across years of study?
8. Do senior students read more books and write papers than junior students?

**Method of the study**

The subjects of the study were undergraduate degree students at Admas University College, St.Mary’s University College and Unity University College. The three higher learning institutions were selected as they have the largest number of students compared to other private colleges. Students in degree programs were selected purposively for some of the dimensions of student engagement such as paper presentation, project works, and also for participation in educational seminars and conferences entail educational practices that are features of baccalaureate or postgraduate studies. Students from various departments were randomly selected. Those students who were in their classes during the data collection were asked to fill in the questionnaires. Some students refused to do so but the majority of them were volunteers.

**Instrument development and data collection**

Researchers in higher education (Kuh, 2003; Coates, 2005; Terenzini and Pascarella, 1991) have developed questionnaires to measure student involvement in educationally useful practices and the corresponding effect these practices have on critical thinking, persistence and grades. Some of the items developed by these scholars were adapted to Ethiopian situation and used for the purpose of this study. Those items which appeared to be unfit to Ethiopian culture were not included in the questionnaire. For example, items such as ‘discussed ideas with my instructor during coffee time or other informal sessions’, ‘visited a class in another country’, ‘took part in organizing and leading educational seminars’ and
so on. Though the relevance of these items to assess student engagement is quite obvious, they were excluded from the questionnaire. Some items were developed by the researcher. In doing so, five items for active and collaborative learning, six items on academic challenge, five items on enriching educational experiences, five items on institutional support and five items on faculty-student interaction were developed. The questionnaire asked students to report how frequently they carried out the activities indicated in the items in the academic year of 2007 in a four point rating scale that ranges from “Very Often” (4) to “Never” (1). At times, students were asked to rate the number of books they have read, papers they have written as requirement for courses, and time spent for class preparation and quality of campus support.

The questionnaire was administered by the researcher and instructors. The instructors were informed about the purpose of the study and students were given the questionnaire in their classrooms. Some wanted to take the questionnaire to their home and brought it in the next class session. The questionnaire was prepared in Amharic to enable students clearly comprehend the items. A total of 350 questionnaire was distributed to the students and 303 questionnaire returned. However, 21 of the questionnaire were found to be either incompletely or wrongly filled in, thus excluded from the analysis. One item from faculty-student interaction and two items from institutional support were deleted from the final analysis as many students left blank spaces.

In the analysis of the study, 28 fourth year, 76 third year, 126 second year, and 52 first year students were included. 144 students reported that they work either on permanent or part-time basis and 138 students reported that they are full-time students.

**Data Analysis**
Percentages and One-Way ANOVA together with HSD were used to analyze the data. Percentages were used in order to show the frequency of student engagement on each item of the questionnaire. One-Way ANOVA was used to examine differences on student engagement (preparation time for classes, written papers, and books read by the students) among students of various year of study.

Results

Table 1 indicates that large number of students (58.2%) are occasionally involved in asking questions and classroom discussions. Over half of the students (51.1%) have hardly discussed ideas from readings with instructors and students. Class presentations are also alien to many students (57.1%) as they have never presented assignments or papers to their class. On the other hand, more than two third of the students (69.8%) reported that they worked frequently (28.7 % “very often” and 41.1% often) with classmates outside of class on class assignments and about two third of the students (63.8%) worked on projects “sometimes” or “often”.

Table 1: Frequency on Active and Collaborative Learning

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Very often</th>
<th>Often</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Asked questions in class or contributed to class discussions</td>
<td>31 (11.0)</td>
<td>61 (21.6)</td>
<td>164 (58.2)</td>
<td>26 (9.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Made a class presentation based on assignments or readings</td>
<td>21 (7.4)</td>
<td>37 (13.1)</td>
<td>63 (22.3)</td>
<td>161 (57.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Worked with other students on projects</td>
<td>22 (7.8)</td>
<td>123 (43.6)</td>
<td>57 (20.2)</td>
<td>80 (28.4 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Discussed ideas from your readings with students and instructors</td>
<td>25 (8.9)</td>
<td>35 (12.4)</td>
<td>78 (27.7)</td>
<td>144 (51.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Worked with classmates outside of class to prepare class assignments</td>
<td>81 (28.7)</td>
<td>116 (41.1)</td>
<td>74 (26.2)</td>
<td>11 (3.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: The values in brackets refer to percentages.
Table 2 indicates that feedback provision is very sparse (47.9% of the students never received feedback) and discussion on academic matters is infrequent. In fact, many students (39.0%) reported that they do not discuss academic ideas with their instructors at all. Discussion on assignment appears to happen mainly occasionally and a little less than a quarter of the students (21.3%) reported they never discussed assignments with instructors. Student-faculty interaction on students’ career plans is also uncommon as the large majority of the students said that they “sometimes” (29.1%) or “never” (62.8%) talked on the matter.

Table 2: Frequency of Faculty-Student Interaction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Very often</th>
<th>Often</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Discussed assignments with an instructor outside class</td>
<td>35 (12.4)</td>
<td>38 (13.5)</td>
<td>149 (52.8)</td>
<td>60 (21.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Talked about career plans with a faculty member</td>
<td>8 (2.8)</td>
<td>15 (5.3)</td>
<td>82 (29.1)</td>
<td>177 (62.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Discussed academic matters from your readings or classes with instructors outside class</td>
<td>9 (3.2)</td>
<td>38 (13.5)</td>
<td>125 (44.3)</td>
<td>110 (39.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Received feedback from instructors on your academic performance (written or oral)</td>
<td>11 (3.9)</td>
<td>39 (13.8)</td>
<td>97 (34.4)</td>
<td>135 (47.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows that large number of students (73%) has never worked together on non-academic activities with faculty members. More than 70 percent of the students used libraries to enrich lecture notes although close to a quarter of the students (22.3%) never used libraries. Many students (63.9%) also reported that they used internet sources “often”

Table 3: Frequency on Enriching Learning Experiences
or “sometimes” to support their study. Taking part in seminars or conferences is unusual phenomenon as 58.9 % of the students never took part in such activities

Table 4 shows that many students are satisfied with the availability of books in their institution’s library and on the support they get from the institutions to succeed academically. On the availability of instructors for advising and other academic supports, nearly half of the students (47.2%) reported that it is fair.

### Table 4: Frequency on Institutional Support

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Very Often</th>
<th>Often</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Never</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Worked with faculty members on activities other than coursework</td>
<td>7 (2.5)</td>
<td>15 (5.3)</td>
<td>53 (18.8)</td>
<td>207 (73.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(committees, orientation, student life activities, etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Used libraries to enrich lecture notes and for further reading</td>
<td>19 (6.8)</td>
<td>79 (28.0)</td>
<td>121 (42.9)</td>
<td>63 (22.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Browsed internet to find articles or information related to your study</td>
<td>45 (16.0)</td>
<td>71 (25.1)</td>
<td>109 (38.7)</td>
<td>57 (20.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Went to organizations or communities to gather information related to your study</td>
<td>15 (5.3)</td>
<td>67 (23.8)</td>
<td>116 (41.1)</td>
<td>84 (29.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Attended seminars, conferences or presentations in the university or somewhere else</td>
<td>5 (1.8)</td>
<td>28 (9.9)</td>
<td>83 (29.4)</td>
<td>166 (58.9)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is believed that students’ effort on learning is related to the quality of learning. Table 5 shows that large number of students either do not read books (40.8 %), other than their lecture notes and modules, or read only 1 to 4 books in the academic year (39%). More than two-third of the students organize notes by reading textbooks “sometimes” (34.4 %) or do not do it at all (37.2 %). Nearly one third of the students (32.3 %) said they spend less than five hours in a week for class preparation and about the same number of students (31.9 %) said they spend nine to five hours, which is very well below the average time (thirteen to fourteen hours-per-week) for class preparation for first year undergraduate students (Kuh, 2007) and the hymn that college students have to spend at least two hours for every hour of classroom instruction. Interestingly — even spending very less time than the standard — about half of the students (51.4 %) think that they frequently (“very often” and “often”) work more than they expected to meet their instructors expectations. Paper work also appears to be uncommon as quarter of the students (25.5 %) has never done any paper work and about one third of the students (34.4 %) have done one or two papers in a year. More than three-fourth of the students (77.6%) reported that their instructors ask them to explain the application of theories “often” or “sometimes”.

### Table 5: Frequency on Academic Challenge

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Statements</th>
<th>Response options</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>How often have you worked harder than you thought to meet an instructor’s standards or expectations?</td>
<td>Very often</td>
<td>64 (22.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Often</td>
<td>81 (28.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sometimes</td>
<td>121 (42.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Never</td>
<td>16 (5.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Number of hours you spent preparing for class in a week</td>
<td>&gt; 15 hours</td>
<td>38 (13.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>10 to 14 hours</td>
<td>63 (22.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 to 9 hours</td>
<td>90 (31.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&lt;5 hours</td>
<td>91 (32.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Number of academic books you read in this academic year</td>
<td>5 to 9 books</td>
<td>57 (20.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 to 4 books</td>
<td>110 (39)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Read only lecture notes and modules</td>
<td>79 (28.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>None</td>
<td>115 (40.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Number of written papers or reports of</td>
<td>&gt;6 papers</td>
<td>33 (11.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3 to 5 papers</td>
<td>79 (28.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1 to 2 papers</td>
<td>98 (34.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>None</td>
<td>72 (25.5)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The study also examined using one-way ANOVA whether there are differences in preparation time, reading books, and writing of papers among first, second, third, and fourth year students. In the questionnaire, the number of books read by the students, time employed for preparation for classes and numbers of papers written by students were indicated in ranges. For example, with regard to the amount of time spent by students for class preparation, students were asked to choose one of these choices: >15 hours, 10-14 hours, 5-9 hours, and <5 hours. These ranges were changed into values of 4, 3, 2, and 1 respectively and the mean values for each group were calculated. The same was done for books read by the students (3, 2, and 1) and papers written (4, 3, 2, and 1) by the students.

Table 6 indicates that there are significant differences on books read by first, second, third, and fourth year students and papers written by them. There is no significant difference on the amount of time used for class preparation by students of various years of study. To identify the groups that significantly differ, Tukey’s HSD test was employed.

Table 6: One-Way ANOVA on Time for Preparation, number of Papers they more, and Books Read by Students of Different Years of Study
Table 7 indicates that there are significant differences on the books read by second year and third year students and between third year and fourth year students. Third year students have the highest mean value, and interestingly fourth year students have the lowest mean value, indicating that they read fewer books than other groups.

Table 7: Pairwise Comparison of Means on Books Read by Students of Various Years of Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>Year 2</th>
<th>Year 3</th>
<th>Year 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.8369</td>
<td>1.7381</td>
<td>2.0395</td>
<td>1.6250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>.08883</td>
<td>-.21255</td>
<td>.20192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2</td>
<td>-.30138*</td>
<td>-.30138</td>
<td>.11310</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-.30138*</td>
<td>.41447*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<0.05
Table 8 shows that third year students wrote more papers than first and second year students and fourth year students wrote more papers than first year students.

**Table 8: Pairwise Comparison of Means on Papers Written by Students of Various Years of Study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>Year 2</th>
<th>Year 3</th>
<th>Year 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Year 1</td>
<td>2.4615</td>
<td>2.6349</td>
<td>2.9474</td>
<td>3.0417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 2</td>
<td>-.17338</td>
<td>-.48583*</td>
<td>-.58013*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year 3</td>
<td></td>
<td>-.31245*</td>
<td>-.40675*</td>
<td>-.09430</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<0.05

**Discussion**

The findings of this study showed some promising and many unsatisfactory practices by students and institutions. The promising findings of this study are that many students work frequently with their peers outside class on assignments, ask questions or take part in discussions occasionally (see Table I), browse internet, go to libraries and organizations in their community to enrich their knowledge intermittently (see Table III), and are satisfied with the support they get from their institutions (see Table IV). Many students also reported that their instructors ask them to explain the application of theories and concepts (see Table V). On the other hand, there were findings that require the attention of faculty and institutional leaders. Of the five aspects of student engagement, faculty-student interaction and academic challenge were found to be very poor. Many of the students discuss with their instructors on academic matters and assignments outside class very infrequently and many students also reported that they do get feedback less frequently or not at all (see Table II). In fact, 62.8 % reported that they have never talked with their instructors on career plans, 39.0% reported that they have never discussed on academic
matters outside class, and 47.9% reported that they have never received feedback from instructors on their academic performance (see Table II). Supporting the mediocrity of student-faculty interaction, nearly half of the students (47.2%) rated the availability of their instructors for offering support as “fair”.

The findings on academic challenge were also worth considering. The amount of time students spend for class preparation is well below the standard and the number of books they read are few. For example, about two third of the students (see Table V) spend not more than nine hours for class preparation in a week and of these students nearly one third of them (32.3%) spend less than five hours. Moreover, 40.8% of the students reported that they read only lecture notes and modules in the academic year and 39% of the students indicated that they have read 1 to 4 books in the academic year. In addition, nearly one fourth of the students (22.3%) never used a library. The reason for reading few number of books by the students may be the availability of modules for many courses. Organizing notes and writing papers are also infrequent practices. Related to this, 57.2% of the students have never presented papers or assignments in their class (see Table I). Interestingly, however, large number of students thinks that they work more than they expected to cope with their teachers’ expectations, illustrating that students underestimate the challenges of college education.

The findings of the study also indicated that there is no variation in the amount of time spent for class preparation among beginning, junior, and senior students. Amazingly, fourth year students read fewer books than first year, second year, and third year students although the only significant differences were between third and second year and third and fourth year students (see Table VII). Third year students read more books than other groups of students. Writing of papers follows its logical order: fourth year students writing the highest number of papers and first year students writing the lowest number. Both third and fourth year students have written higher number of papers than first year and second year students (see Table VIII).
Conclusion

Although the samples of the study may not represent all private higher learning institutions in Ethiopia (which is one limitation of the study), the results of the study indicate that private higher education institution have to work a lot to create conducive situation for student engagement. Many students are not engaged in educational practices which have strong linkages with the quality of student learning. The first intervention should be to identify students who are less engaged in educational practices and design appropriate support strategies for them. Secondly, the results of this study make pretty clear that faculty-student interaction is so sparse that learning from instructors is very much limited on what happens only inside the classroom. Institutions can introduce practices and mechanisms which will avail instructors for students. Thirdly, students are less challenged academically that although the time they spend for preparation and the number of books they read are less than the standard, they think that they work more than they expected. Institutions must introduce various activities that will engage students in reading books and expending effort for learning. When designing courses, instructors may have to make clear that students have to read books, organize notes, and support their classroom lessons by reading books. One way of encouraging students to read books and expend more effort for learning is aligning assessment mechanisms with educationally useful practices — the positive wash back effect of testing on teaching. Students’ involvement on extracurricular activities is also very poor. This requires also the attention of institutional leaders.

This study has some limitations which readers may have to put into perspectives. The study is a small scale survey which poses a challenge on the generalizability of the findings. The study also does not identify factors that are related to student engagement which would have made intervention simpler. Validating the data through interviews and participant observation could have also helped to explain some of the results that need further interpretation.
References


An investigation of the Major Causes of Student Attrition in St. Mary's University College

Kassahun Habtamu
St. Mary's University College

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to investigate the major causes of student attrition (withdrawal, dismissal, and dropping out) in St. Mary's University College. Data was gathered from students, the registrar office head, the student affairs office head as well as the guidance and counseling worker through interviews and questionnaires. Relevant documents were also consulted from the registrar's office. The data collected was analyzed using both quantitative and qualitative approaches. Analysis of the data revealed that factors such as financial problems, academic failure, lack of study and note taking skills, lack of guidance and counseling services, grading system, frequent absenteeism from classes, large class size, unstable working conditions of employee students were responsible for students discontinuation of college education.

1. Introduction

Wastage in education in the forms of repetition, dropping out, dismissal, withdrawal etc., is a major problem of the education sector in developing countries like Ethiopia (Habtamu, 2002). High levels of attrition adversely affect an institution's funding, facilities and long-term planning. Hence, academic institutions are concerned with the withdrawal of students and would like to reduce the percentage who withdraws from their institution (Simpson, 2004).

Wastage in education includes missed opportunities for individuals, families and societies drop out, repetition, failure, brain drain, unemployment of graduates and attrition (Shiundu as cited in Habtamu, 2002). However, in this paper the concern will be on student attrition
(a gradual reduction in the number of students enrolled due to drop out, dismissal, withdrawal, and repetition).

According to Asmerom, et al (1989), the magnitude of attrition has become a cause for great concern, particularly in institutions of higher learning in Ethiopia. These authors argued that the country could hardly afford to waste such a productive labor force.

Supporting this idea, Simpson (2004) said that not only is recruitment extremely important but also the students retention is a mark of a quality education.

With regard to retention as a mark of quality education, Hirsch and Benjamin (2006) argued that high drop out is one indicator of teaching quality. Student retention should be the central component of any effort to measure the quality of an institution or program. Excellence and quality should be determined by the degree to which an institution develops students’ abilities to complete their education.

Yalew (2003) on his part said that the quality of education is partly determined by the success of students in the learning process. In higher learning institutions, there are a number of factors that affect the academic performance of students (Yalew, 2003). Personal factors such as motivation, interest, attitude, cognitive styles, and attribution styles affect learning strategies. Self-esteem and self-efficacy are also found to be important predictors of academic performance. Environmental attributes like climatic condition of the area, the learning atmosphere, social interactions among students and teachers account for variation in academic achievement among students. Moreover, the nature of the curriculum, the contents of subject matter to be learned, availability of learning materials and facilities, the administrative nature of the institution, access of students to relevant information are also important factors for their success.
Research work in the area, indicated that a large number of factors are responsible for students' discontinuation of education from higher learning institutions. Kelly as cited in Yalew (2003) classified the causes of student attrition in to two broad categories (psychological and socio-economic factors). The first include factors such as student behavior, performance in school, psychological states, and the students' family background. The second category of causes of attrition emphasizes unequal economic status among students to support themselves as well as the political and social structure and certain practices of the school.

Many researchers, however, found that academic performance is the most important factor for students' dismissal, withdrawal and dropout (Laekemariam, 1994; Hadre and Reeve, 2003; Asmerom, et al, 1989; Parkay and Stanford, 2004; Sadker and Sadker, 1997).

Lackemariam (1994) argued that students were dismissed, withdrawn or dropped out their college mainly due to low academic competence. Parkay and Standford (2004) have also said that students at risk of dropping out tend to get low grades, academically perform below grade level and have behavior problems in school. Hadre and Reeve (2003) on their part found that poor academic achievement is an especially strong predictor of dropout intentions, Poor academic performance for casts helps shape students intensions to drop out of school.

According to Asmerom, et al (1989) the causes of dropout are both academic and non-academic. However, the majority of students in institutions of higher learning in Ethiopia is dismissed largely for academic reasons and depends on performance.

Other researchers attributed the causes of student attrition mainly to administrative conditions and planning of the institution. Gebresellassie (1998) as cited in Yalew (2003) attributed the causes of attrition to poor administrative and educational services provided in higher learning institutions. Supporting this argument Husain (1987) as cited in Yalew
(2003) reported that the causes of student attrition at universities and colleges can be attributed to educational planning that gave little chance to students to get better jobs and varied educational opportunities.

Temesgen (1991) suggested that the family background of students and curriculum incompatibilities of secondary and tertiary education levels forced many students to quit their education or to be dismissed. In support of this Sadker and Sadker (1997) wrote students without a support structure at home face disadvantage at school. Students are more likely to drop out if they are members of large families and if their parents are poorly educated or working in low payed jobs. Students from low income, low skill and low education family backgrounds are several times more likely to drop out of school than are students from wealthy families. Hersh and Benjamin (2006) also have said that researchers confirmed the importance of high school curriculum for college persistence and retention. Other researchers found that financial matters contribute considerably to students discontinuation of college education (Hersh and Benjamin, 2006; Habtamu, 2002; Sadker and Sadker, 1997)

Yalew (2003) argued that although academic achievement is found to be the most determining factor for students' retention, it is in turn affected by many other variables. Academic failure by itself should not be considered as a cause for student attrition, rather it is a manifestation of the existence of other variables that affect students in academic settings.

Yalew (2003) further stated that researches have confirmed the role of institutional, personal, and environmental variables in shaping both attitudes and intents to persist or dropout. Cabrera, Nova and Castaneda as cited in Yalew (2003) in support of the above stated that attrition is mainly the result of adjustment problems and self-conceptions rather than low level of academic competence.
Those who verified the importance of adjustment problems for attrition argue that since students in college environments are subject to continuous evaluation and assessment and are usually bombarded with several academic and non-academic appraisals, they often experience adjustment problems which manifest in the form of frustration, anxiety, and emotional instability. Compared to high school, the college environment is characterized by homogeneous ability groups, highly competitive situations, strict grading systems, poor teacher-student relationships and the need to make important decisions on the part of the individual student. Such conditions induce anxiety, a sense of incapability, and feelings of inferiority.

According to social cognitive psychologists, no matter how frustrating and demanding a college environment may be, the level of self-efficacy individuals possess plays a significant role in facilitating their adjustment to the environment (Yalew, 2003).

In summary, Asmerom, et al, (1989) found that though academic performance is the major reason of attrition, they also found the following non-academic reasons.

- Inadequate facilities and services in the institutions;
- Lack of guidance and counseling;
- Inadequate background of students and their preparation before joining higher learning institutions;
- Inadequate qualification and competence among instructors;
- Poor social and recreational outlets for students;
- Absence of clear and uniform policy on student allocation to various institutions and departments; and
- Lack of adequate and standardized examination system policies.

Yalew (2003) summarized his findings on causes of attrition as follows.

- Exaggerated anxiety about performance and with students interaction and learning tasks;
Health problems;
- Social and environmental adjustment problems;
- Very low perception of one's ability;
- Lack of competence to deal with educational careers;
- Falling in love;
- Placed in a department or college which was not the student's choice;
- Lack of appropriate study skills;
- Inadequate availability of reference materials;
- Uncomfortable and crowded library;
- Curriculum incompatibilities of secondary and tertiary levels;
- Different teaching style of high school and college teachers;
- Difficulty to take notes during lecture and from textbooks;
- Distorted information provided from seniors to freshman students.

The major purpose of this study is, therefore, to investigate the causes of student attrition (drop out, withdrawal, dismissal, repetition etc) from private higher learning institutions with particular reference to St. Mary's University College. To this end, the following research questions were formulated.

- What is the general state of student attrition in St. Mary's University College?
- What are the major causes of student attrition in St. Mary's University College?

2. Methodology
2.1. Participants and sampling procedure

In line with the objective of the study, students, the registrar office head, students' affairs head and the counselor of the university college participated in the study. Of all students who are attending in the regular programs (extension and day-time), 215 were randomly selected. Proportional numbers of students from the degree program, teacher education
program and TVET program were selected for the study. Hence, simple random and stratified random sampling techniques were employed in the study.

2.2. Instruments

Different data gathering instruments were used in the study (questionnaire, interview and document analysis). The questionnaire was administered to students and consisted of two sets of items. The first set comprised five items which asked respondents about their personal characteristics such as sex, faculty, whether or not they plan to discontinue their education and whether the student is parttime or full time.

The second set consisted of 21 items. These items present possible causes of student attrition from higher learning institutions and respondents were asked to rate the importance of each cause on a five point scale (very important, moderately important, less important and not important).

In-depth interviews were conducted with the registrar office head, students' affairs office head and the counselor of the university college independently. The interviews were based on issues related to the conditions and trend of attrition in the University College and major causes that force students to discontinue their education from the university college. Moreover, documents were consulted from the registrar’s office to retrieve information about the condition, rate and pattern of attrition in the university college.

2.3. Methods of data analysis

Both qualitative and quantitative approaches were employed to analyze the collected data. Data gathered through interviews and documents were analyzed qualitatively. Descriptive statistics like tables, frequency distributions, percentages, mean and standard deviations were used to analyze the quantitative data gathered through the questionnaire.
3. Results and Discussion

A. Analysis of data collected from documents

Information about the general pattern or condition of student attrition in St. Mary's University College, documents was consulted from the registrar office.

Table 1: Total number of withdrawals and dropouts (1993 E.C to 1998 E.C)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of entry</th>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Number of withdrawals and dropouts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1993 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>45</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>74</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>89</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>423</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>English</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>319</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998 E.C</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Science</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Languages</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>327</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bulletin of student statistics, St. Mary's University College
The above table generally shows that there is dropout and withdrawal from different departments every year. In this regard the trend of attrition seems to increase from year to year.

**Table 2: Admitted to graduated rate (1991 E.C. to 1996 E.C)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of entry</th>
<th>Admitted</th>
<th>Graduated</th>
<th>Attrition rate in %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1991/1992</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>154</td>
<td>22.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992/1993</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>23.42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993/1994</td>
<td>597</td>
<td>508</td>
<td>14.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994/1995</td>
<td>2133</td>
<td>1710</td>
<td>19.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>1217</td>
<td>898</td>
<td>26.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>1068</td>
<td>741</td>
<td>30.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>5530</strong></td>
<td><strong>4253</strong></td>
<td><strong>23.09</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Bulletin of student statistics, St. Mary's University College

As it is shown in the table above, admission to graduation (retention rate) is low (less than 80%). Average attrition from 1991 to 1996 E.C is 23.09 and is increasing from year to year.

Complete information about dropouts and withdrawals of the 1999 E.C academic year was not obtained. However, the academic dean office dispatched a letter showing number of dropouts and withdrawals (from September to March) from different departments and is presented as follows.

**Table 3: Number of withdrawals and dropouts (September to March, 2007)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Department</th>
<th>Number of withdrawals and dropouts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Science</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing Management</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSOM</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Languages</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Sciences</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Science</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>384</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analysis of data collected through interviews

Interviews were conducted with relevant informants for the study (registrar office head, students affairs office head and the guidance and counseling worker). The interviews focused on three major issues.

What is the general pattern or condition of attrition in St. Mary's University College?

What are the major causes of attrition?

What should be done to reduce attrition?

With regard to the first question (general pattern of attrition), the registrar head said that attrition rate is increasing with the increase of admission. However, he believed that with the increase in the admission, attrition is not really a serious problem in the university college.

The student affairs head as well as the guidance and counseling worker have a little different view with regard to the pattern of attrition in the university college. They have said that so many students are discontinuing their education due to various reasons, it is becoming one of the serious problems of the university college. The prevalence of attrition is generally high. The problem is explained by the guidance and counseling service rendered for large number of students who decide to withdraw and sign for the withdrawal form. Signing on withdrawal forms and counseling those who decide to withdraw is becoming the major task of our office.

However there is agreement on the major causes identified by the above informants and are listed as follows.

Unstable working conditions such as conflict with bosses and change of workplace of those students who have jobs;

Financial problem;

Academic failure;

Maternal cases (pregnancy);
Family problems, such as having conflict with the parents;
To go to abroad (the counselor here emphasized that female students discontinue their education to go to Arab countries);
Transfer to other institutions.

The writer verified the above causes as important by tallying causes cited in a document which shows the department, causes and name of students who withdraw from the university college.

With regard to the solutions of the problem, the informants recommended the university college consider the following issues.

There should be flexible system to solve the problems of students of the University College.
Research has to be conducted to design a system which can accommodate the major problems of students;
Creating awareness about the college environment to increase self-esteem;
The guidance and counseling service should be well organized and improved;
More importantly, the university college should give attention to the problem of attrition.

Analysis of data collected through the questionnaire.

The questionnaire, having 21 items, was administered to students to gather data about major causes of student attrition in St. Mary's University College. The responses were analyzed as follows.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cause of attrition</th>
<th>Very important</th>
<th>Important</th>
<th>Moderately important</th>
<th>Less important</th>
<th>Not important</th>
<th>( \bar{X} )</th>
<th>Sd</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adjustment problem with other students and the university community</td>
<td>21 (11.6)</td>
<td>23 (12.7)</td>
<td>34 (18.8)</td>
<td>35 (19.3)</td>
<td>64 (35.4)</td>
<td>2.45</td>
<td>1.40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of competency to carry out educational careers properly</td>
<td>50 (27.6)</td>
<td>39 (21.5)</td>
<td>38 (21.0)</td>
<td>24 (13.3)</td>
<td>23 (12.7)</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>1.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being assigned to a department which is not ones choice</td>
<td>40 (22.1)</td>
<td>22 (12.2)</td>
<td>15 (8.3)</td>
<td>15 (8.3)</td>
<td>82 (45.3)</td>
<td>2.56</td>
<td>1.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of information and encouragement from the university college</td>
<td>54 (29.8)</td>
<td>25 (13.8)</td>
<td>39 (21.5)</td>
<td>26 (14.4)</td>
<td>31 (17.1)</td>
<td>3.26</td>
<td>1.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of study and note taking skills</td>
<td>54 (31.0)</td>
<td>36 (20.7)</td>
<td>45 (25.9)</td>
<td>21 (12.1)</td>
<td>18 (10.3)</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>1.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scarcity of reference materials</td>
<td>31 (17.1)</td>
<td>22 (12.4)</td>
<td>33 (18.6)</td>
<td>40 (22.6)</td>
<td>51 (28.8)</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td>1.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distorted information provided to freshman students from seniors</td>
<td>28 (15.5)</td>
<td>21 (12.2)</td>
<td>17 (9.9)</td>
<td>34 (19.8)</td>
<td>72 (41.9)</td>
<td>2.41</td>
<td>1.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grading policy of the university college</td>
<td>58 (33.7)</td>
<td>29 (16.9)</td>
<td>27 (15.5)</td>
<td>24 (14.0)</td>
<td>34 (19.8)</td>
<td>3.31</td>
<td>1.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of guidance and counseling services</td>
<td>53 (29.9)</td>
<td>50 (28.2)</td>
<td>35 (19.8)</td>
<td>20 (11.3)</td>
<td>19 (10.7)</td>
<td>3.55</td>
<td>1.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor academic performance</td>
<td>94 (53.7)</td>
<td>29 (16.6)</td>
<td>22 (12.2)</td>
<td>13 (7.4)</td>
<td>17 (9.7)</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>1.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inability to pay tuition fees and other expenses</td>
<td>95 (54.3)</td>
<td>27 (15.4)</td>
<td>20 (11.4)</td>
<td>17 (9.7)</td>
<td>16 (9.1)</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>1.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cause of attrition</td>
<td>Level of importance of the causes in frequency, percept and mean</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Very important</td>
<td>Important</td>
<td>Moderately important</td>
<td>Less important</td>
<td>Not important</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>Sd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long distance from home to the university college</td>
<td>38(21.8)</td>
<td>35(20.1)</td>
<td>36(20.7)</td>
<td>29(16.7)</td>
<td>36(20.7)</td>
<td>3.06</td>
<td>1.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fear of abduction and rape on the way to and from the university college</td>
<td>11(6.3)</td>
<td>10(5.7)</td>
<td>17(9.7)</td>
<td>29(16.5)</td>
<td>109(61.9)</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>1.21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructors being unsupportive and not motivating students</td>
<td>28(15.8)</td>
<td>32(18.1)</td>
<td>43(24.3)</td>
<td>39(22.0)</td>
<td>35(19.8)</td>
<td>2.88</td>
<td>1.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less qualified and unmotivated instructors and administrators</td>
<td>27(15.3)</td>
<td>34(19.2)</td>
<td>39(22.0)</td>
<td>43(24.3)</td>
<td>34(19.2)</td>
<td>2.87</td>
<td>1.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students’ low self-concept and belief that they cannot cope with academic demands</td>
<td>55(31.4)</td>
<td>38(21.7)</td>
<td>40(22.9)</td>
<td>24(13.7)</td>
<td>18(10.3)</td>
<td>3.50</td>
<td>1.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large class size and lack of teachers attention to those falling behind</td>
<td>42(24.1)</td>
<td>27(15.5)</td>
<td>40(23.0)</td>
<td>25(14.4)</td>
<td>40(23.0)</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>1.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of support and cooperation from the students’ supervisors at work place</td>
<td>78(44.6)</td>
<td>36(20.6)</td>
<td>32(18.3)</td>
<td>18(10.3)</td>
<td>11(6.3)</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>1.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being addicted to drugs and gambling</td>
<td>54(32.0)</td>
<td>16(9.5)</td>
<td>21(12.4)</td>
<td>36(21.3)</td>
<td>42(24.3)</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>1.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students’ family breakdown and divorce</td>
<td>54(34.2)</td>
<td>18(11.4)</td>
<td>28(17.7)</td>
<td>32(20.3)</td>
<td>26(16.5)</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequent absenteeism</td>
<td>82(46.9)</td>
<td>34(19.4)</td>
<td>29(16.6)</td>
<td>21(12.0)</td>
<td>9(5.1)</td>
<td>3.91</td>
<td>1.26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As it is shown in the table above, respondents reported that the following are important causes of attrition in St. Mary's University College.

- Lack of competency to carry out educational careers properly on the part of students;
- Lack of information and encouragement from the university college;
- Lack of study and note taking skills;
- Grading policy of the university college;
- Lack of guidance and counseling services;
- Poor academic performance of students;
- Inability to pay tuition fees and other expenses;
- Long distance from home to the university college;
- Students’ low self-concept and belief that they cannot cope with academic demands;
- Large class size and lack of teachers' attention to those falling behind;
- Lack of support and cooperation from the students' supervisors at the work place;
- Being addicted to drugs and gambling;
- Frequent absenteeism from class for various reasons;
- Family breakdown and divorce.

It is also possible to see from the table that respondents perceive that the following factors are less important or not important for students' discontinuation of their education.

- Adjustment problem with other students and the university community;
- Being assigned to a department which is not ones choice;
- Scarcity of reference materials;
- Distorted information provided to freshman students from seniors;
- Fear of abduction and rape on the way to and from the university college;
- Instructors being unsupportive and not motivating student
- Less qualified and unmotivated instructors.
As reported by students, it generally appears that the following causes are found to be exceptionally grave in making students withdraw, dismiss and drop out from their college.

- Poor academic performance;
- Inability to pay tuition fees and other expenses;
- Frequent absenteeism from class;
- Lack of support and cooperation from the students' supervisors at the work place;
- Lack of guidance and counseling services.

IV. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendation

Previous research showed that a number of factors are responsible for making students discontinuing their education from higher learning institutions. These factors could be economic, psychological, academic, administrative or social.

Analysis of the data collected revealed that the following are important causes of students' discontinuation of their education from St. Mary's University College.

- Academic failure;
- Financial problem;
- Unstable working conditions such as conflict with the bosses and change of work places of those students who have regular jobs;
- Maternal cases such as pregnancy;
- Family problems such as conflict with parents;
- Going abroad;
- Transfer to other institutions;
- Frequent absenteeism from class;
- Lack of guidance and counseling services;
- Lack of competency to carry out educational careers;
- Lack of study and note taking skills;
• Grading policy of the university college;
• Large class size and lack of teachers' attention to those falling behind.

Therefore, to reduce the magnitude of student attrition in the university college the writer of this paper would like to recommend the following.

The university college has to design a flexible system that could address the financial and family problems of the students and conduct practical research to design such a system.

• The guidance and counseling service in the University College should be well organized and improved. Special attention should also be given to the task of student advising and the professional competency of instructors.
• Training and orientation should be given to students on how they can take notes from reference materials and during lectures. Students should also be helped to develop good study skills.
• Students reported that the grading system is one cause of student attrition. So, the University College should revisit its grading policy. The university college should also devise mechanisms where those instructors who do not have knowledge of measurement and evaluation should be instructed accordingly.
• Extension students have problems getting cooperation from their employees. The university college could contact major employers of its students and discuss the issue.
• The university college is also advised to reduce the number of students in a class so that instructors can give support to those who are behind in their academic career.
References


Personal Reflections on the Importance of Continuing Professional Development for Teaching Staff in Private Higher Education Institutions

Catherine Kiddle
pckiddle@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract

This reflective paper considers the importance of continuing professional development at all stages of a teacher’s career and at all levels of education. The author uses her career in Traveller Education in England as a case study. She describes how action research played a large part in the development of a distance learning scheme for fairground children. Analysis of the challenges presented by the scheme resulted in further research into the development of independence in the learner and the recognition of the need for teachers and teacher educators to use active learning methodologies and to have professional development opportunities to develop these skills. The author draws parallels with her work in Ethiopia between 2002 and 2004 on the TESO programme, where in a different context there are similar issues. Here too, she makes the case for encouraging student centered teaching and continuing professional development in Higher Education Institutions. Finally, particular importance is given to peer discussion within the process of professional development, which will lead to greater quality assurance.

Introduction

This paper records a reflective journey that I have made as a teacher, a trainer and a researcher in Distance Learning, Independent Learning and Teacher Education in England and Ethiopia. It covers a period of almost 30 years, which has been a time of continuing professional development for me. At the beginning of my career in education I was a teacher of English and Cultural Studies, in secondary school, art colleges and as a tutor for the Open University. But in the mid 1970s I moved into what we call Traveller Education in England.
Let me explain what I mean by this term, ‘Traveller Education’, as I suspect it is unfamiliar in Ethiopia. In England we have a number of groups of people who live nomadic or semi-nomadic lives. They are not nomadic pastoralists as you have in Ethiopia, but people following various ways of life and operating businesses that make it necessary for the families to move regularly from place to place. For example, there are the Gypsy people, originally from Northern India, some of whom maintain a traditional nomadic way of life. They live in trailer caravans nowadays pulled by vehicles and provide goods and services to local communities around the country. There are circuses, independent businesses that travel from place to place presenting shows in a large tent, called a Big Top. The show usually consists of highly skilled acts of juggling, acrobatics, wire walking, clowning and so on. Sometimes there are performing animals. Then there are fairgrounds. Groups of families travel together with mechanical rides (like the small one by the Ghion Hotel swimming pool), entertainment stalls and other amusements. They build up the fair in a town or village and open it for a week or so. Then they take it down again and move on to the next place.

The Gypsy, Circus and Fairground families are all distinct travelling groups, separate from one another. But they all live in caravans and travel for their living. Also they share two reasons why education can be difficult for the children. They come as outsiders or strangers to local communities and this means that the settled people often regard them with suspicion. The Gypsy groups in particular experience this prejudice. Also the very fact of mobility, of travelling, makes school attendance and continuity of education difficult. So, when we are looking for educational solutions for these groups, we consider them together under the generic name of ‘Travellers’ – hence Traveller Education.

Most of the counties in England have a Traveller Education Service within the local authority. For over twenty years I was the head of one of these services in the South West of England, managing a team of teachers, training teachers, doing action research and
always continuing to learn myself. Then in 2002 I came to work in Ethiopia, in the Ministry of Education. So now you have a context for me.

A Case Study

I am only going to discuss the situation of one of the Traveller groups – the fairground people, or Showmen as they like to be called. Their particular travelling patterns, and the educational problems they caused, started me on the professional development journey I am describing here.

The fairground year traditionally goes like this. In the cold English winter months, say from November to March, the Showmen and their families live at winter bases. They park their caravans and vehicles in yards, called winter quarters, and the children attend school. The adults spend these months maintaining the rides and equipment and preparing for the next travelling season. A few weeks before Easter they leave the winter quarters and the children leave school. They go to the location of their first fair and build it up. All through the spring, summer and autumn months they move from place to place, building up the fair and taking it down. They spend perhaps an average of a week in each place until November, when they return to the winter quarters and the cycle starts again.

What does this mean for the children’s education?
In my university education and teacher education courses there had been no mention of the needs of nomadic groups.

Action Research

In the 1980s, when I started working with the fairground people, I discovered that the only regular schooling their children had was the three months each year when they were settled at their winter quarters. I did some research among the parents, asking what education the
children had during the traveling season. Some said the children had no schooling at all. They helped with the family business. Some said they sent the children to school in towns where they stayed for as long as two weeks, although some schools refused to take them in. Some said they sent the children to school in every place they stopped, sometimes for only two days at a time, but they felt this was a waste of time. And the children didn’t like constantly changing schools. One or two rich families sent the children to boarding school, but they didn’t like the children being away from home. None of the parents were satisfied with the situation. They regarded the schooling the children had in winter as very important. This was the only real educational chance for them.

Next I interviewed the head teachers of the schools, which the children attended at their winter bases – let’s call them the ‘base schools’. They had no idea what happened to the fairground children after they left the schools around Easter time. Often they left without notice. The base schools had no contact with the families until they reappeared again in November. Usually the children had regressed in their learning and needed extra tuition when they returned. The head teachers had no idea how important their school was to each of the families, as they saw them for such a short period each year.

**Reflection on the research and an action plan**

This action research had taught me a great deal about the needs of this group of children. Also it had shown me that there was a clear job for the Traveller Education Service. We could help to bridge the communication gap between the base schools and the families. Also we could try to set up an education system that would give the children some continuity of learning during their traveling season.

A Distance Learning scheme seemed to be the logical solution, but at that time in England it was unusual for Distance Learning to be tried with school-aged children. It would be a pioneering educational experiment. The Traveler Education Service would work with the base school teachers during the winter months to prepare packs of work. The materials
would cover the work that the rest of the class would be doing in school while the fairground children were away. But they would need to be presented in a way that the children could understand on their own. The materials would have to be relevant and engaging. When the children left school at the beginning of their travelling season they would take the Distance Learning packs with them.

The Traveller Education Service, the school staff, the parents and the children would all have to co-operate closely if the scheme was going to work. Parents would have to give adequate notice of their leaving dates and the logistics for exchanging completed work packs for new ones would have to be worked out with them. The parents would also have to give the children time and space and support to do the work at home. The Traveller Education Service and the base school staff would have to devise methods for feedback and the Traveller Education Service would have to put in place some kind of mobile tutorial support system. This, of course, was in the days before mobile phones and e-mail were in common use. Over the next few years we worked to establish a Distance Learning scheme along these lines (DTES, 1992).

**A continuing process of research, action and review**

I, together with my team of teachers and the teachers in the base schools, learned an enormous amount as we developed our scheme. Our Higher Education Institutions had not prepared us for this kind of work.

When I came to Ethiopia I discovered that Distance Learning was well established in some private Higher Education institutions. So I know that you will easily understand the initial difficulties we faced back in the 1980s. Issues about the quality of materials, distribution, feedback and support will be familiar to you all. When you set up Distance Learning for adults you can generally expect that they will have motivation, adequate literacy skills and the capacity to be an independent learner. But in our scheme in England, we were dealing
with children who were not necessarily motivated. Many of them preferred helping on the fairground to doing schoolwork at home in the caravan. Their standard of literacy was often poor, as they had already missed a great deal of school time. Very few of them knew how to study on their own, without a teacher to refer to. We could not rely on any of the basic factors that help to bring success in Distance Learning.

In the Traveller Education Service we looked for solutions to these problems. In order to help with motivation we tried to make the materials as interesting and relevant to the children’s lives as possible. We devised puzzles and games as supplementary activities. We included tapes and videos, although we could not rely on a regular electricity supply. The materials were prepared individually for each child, so that they would match the child’s literacy level, though this made a great deal of work for the teachers. We shared experience with other Traveller Services across the country and, with European funding, published a guide for base schools (EFECOT 1995).

But how could we make the children more capable independent learners? Experience showed us that if the children went for more than three weeks without any feedback or some support from a visiting teacher, they were likely to give up and stop working on the materials. I tried to organize the work of my team of teachers so that they could visit the children on the fairgrounds regularly to give support. But this was not always possible as there were many other demands on the teachers’ time. Also the families often travelled to other regions of the country. It was difficult for the parents to give academic support to their children, as many of them had had little or no education themselves. We gave the parents some training in the winter months about ways they could encourage and support their children with the Distance Learning packs (Kiddle, 1999 & 2000), but it was a continuing problem.

We needed to go back and look at how the children were taught in school. And we needed to look at how their teachers were trained in the Higher Education Institutions. Colleagues
in the North of England (particularly Angela Tierney, Durham and Darlington Traveller Education Service) did some action research on this issue. Looking at school practice in England at that time (and I think this is the same for Ethiopia now) it was clear that it did not prepare children to be independent learners. Far too much work and talking was done by the teachers. The teacher was the constant reference for the class. Without a teacher there, the children did not know how to organise themselves or how to approach their work.

The English National Curriculum is too much about facts and not enough about processes. If children are to be independent learners, they have to be taught how to learn. So it is important that teachers use active learning and student centred methodologies in school. Instead of simply teaching facts, teachers can show students how to find out facts for themselves using a range of resources. They can teach dictionary skills and demonstrate how to use reference books for research. These days, of course, this extends to gaining knowledge of and practise in how to use the internet. Teachers need to give students practical skills so that they can learn how to solve problems. A teacher can give a task to an individual or group of students and ask them to come up with a solution. The task can be either physical or mental, but the students must find their own way to the solution.

Rather than detailing the facts of some historical event, teachers can begin by questioning the students to discover their existing knowledge of it. Then they can facilitate a discussion about the event, allowing the students to think about their shared knowledge and start to develop an understanding.

Thinking and analytical skills are also best taught through student activity and discussion. Ideas can be generated about how to approach a given task and plan for its completion. The question to be asked if we want to encourage independent learning is not - ‘What is the answer?’ , but ‘How can we find this out?’
The role of self-assessment is also important for developing independence in the learner. The teacher can guide the student towards this by getting them to ask themselves searching questions. For example – ‘Did I find a solution to the task?’; ‘What were my difficulties?; ‘How could I get over those difficulties?’; ‘What were the steps I took to reach the solution?’; ‘Could I have done it more quickly/easily/efficiently another way?’; ‘What have I learned from this?’; ‘How will I change my approach next time?’ Using questions such as these, the students will begin to identify their own strengths and weaknesses. They will begin to see for themselves what they need to learn to fill gaps in knowledge or understanding and to improve their performance. They will think of ways to approach tasks and how to plan their work.

We discussed all this with the base-school teachers during in-service training sessions so that they could help the children towards this approach to learning. In their own initial training in the Higher Education Institutions very little attention was given to these kinds of methodologies.

So, constantly evaluating, revising, trying again, reviewing once more in an ongoing cycle, over 20 years we gradually improved our Distance Learning scheme and also the skills of teachers, students and parents. We also built strong relationships between all involved. The whole development was a continuing action research project within our Traveller Education Service and contributed greatly to our own professional development.

A new context in Ethiopia – but similar challenges

Then in 2002 I came to Ethiopia to work with colleagues in the Ministry of Education on the TESO programme. I found that here, teaching in schools; colleges and universities were also very teacher-centred. The lecture method was the most common form of teaching. The Minister, then W/o Genet Zewdie, was looking at all levels of teacher training, education and professional development. She wanted to shift the profession towards adopting active learning methods and developing the problem solving capacities,
not just the memories, of students. So my work in Ethiopia, on the Higher Diploma Programme (HDP), the English Language Improvement Programme (ELIP) and Continuous Professional Development programmes (CPD) was all about encouraging active learning and student centred approaches by teachers in schools, in the universities and on the teacher education courses. Though the context was very different, the methodological territory was very familiar to me. We were all on the same journey. We all need to continue with professional development throughout our careers.

I have been talking, about Distance Learning and Independent learning and I have said that to achieve success in Distance Learning it is necessary to be a capable independent learner. This is certainly the case for adults as well as children. Our teachers at every level of the education system must show their students how to learn. But most of our teachers, both in England and Ethiopia, were not themselves taught how to be independent learners when they were at school. So how do we start? We need to break into this circle somewhere. My belief is that this has to be in the Higher Education Institutions, through professional development opportunities for staff and a focus on the methodologies, which are suitable to use in the teacher education and other courses. A private Higher Education Institution like St. Mary’s University College runs both Distance Learning and Teacher Education courses and we can clearly see the connections between the two. We can see how important they are to one another. And how important continuing training opportunities are for staff. I know that the staff in St. Mary’s and in other private Higher Education Institutions have been doing the HDP in the last year or two, so already they have started along this road.

Let us look again at Distance Learning for a moment. St. Mary’s runs a large number of Distance Learning courses. Many of these are undertaken by serving teachers in order to improve their qualifications and to give themselves greater career prospects. What factors will determine their success in their distance learning courses?
First, the materials must be well prepared and presented, with clear instructions and layout. The content must be relevant and accessible. Visual and audio elements can help to add interest to the texts. Second, the distribution system must work – and this is obviously a major task in a large country like Ethiopia, with many communications difficulties. I know that a great deal of energy is spent here to make sure that the distribution system is effective. Third, a feedback and some kind of tutorial support system must be in place. Again this is a highly complex operation in Ethiopia, but the greater the support for Distance Learning students, the greater chance they will have of success. Because it is very hard to study in isolation. Everyone who has tried it knows this.

This brings me back to my former point and the fourth factor for success. Studying on one’s own, by Distance Learning, is only possible if the student is or develops into an independent learner. Who enabled them, or could enable them, whatever their age, to be independent learners? Their original teachers - if they used the appropriate methodologies. Teacher Education courses may be run separately from Distance Learning courses in St. Mary’s or other private higher education institutions, but in this sense they are closely inter-connected.

**Conclusion**

The quality of Teacher Education courses will ultimately affect the success rates of Distance Learning. One will support the other. If students are taught how to think and how to learn, they can take these abilities and use them in every situation where they find themselves. If we consider the skills needed by people undertaking Distance courses – the research skills, the practical and planning skills, the time management skills, the thinking and analytical skills, the reflective and evaluative skills – we will understand the approaches which the trainers of our teachers should follow. Enabling students to develop these skills is not only useful for success in Distance Learning. They are the core skills for
success in every field of activity. And not only students but also staff need opportunities to keep developing these skills.

Distance Learning, Independent Learning, Teacher Education – we use the terms in different contexts and often think about them separately. But I hope that this paper with its reflective journey has demonstrated the dynamic relationship between them and the real need for continuing professional development in Higher Education Institutions. I hope it has emphasized the importance of seeing and strengthening the connections between all these things. In conferences, such as this, colleagues gather together to look at aspects of higher education and have the opportunity for discussions on many topics. I urge that the synergies, the active connections between courses, are explored for their mutual benefit in the process of professional development. Discussions between colleagues, which seek to identify the elements of their work, which relate to each other, will always be fruitful. They will provoke developments, which in turn will lead to the assurance of greater quality in all departments.

REFERENCES


EFECOT (European Federation for the Education of the Children of Occupational Travellers), Project A4 Steering Committee (1995) *What is your school doing for Travelling children?- A guide to equal opportunities through Distance Learning.* Brussels:EFECOT

An Assessment of the Practicum as a Professional Development
Among Private Higher Education Institutions in Tigray

Banti Meselu
Mekelle College of Teacher Education, P.O.Box 605, Tel. 0914- 70 20 50

Abstract

This study is an account of the one-year long practicum assessment as professional development at four private colleges in the Tigray Region. It aimed at assessing the organizational structures and implementation approaches of the practice based on the perception of selected trainees and college staff, and documents. The findings show that the respondents greatly value the opportunities the practicum offers to the student teachers for developing various personal and teaching concerns (professional skills). However, the organizational and practical aspects of the trade were heavily criticized on several grounds. Finally, effective partnership with other stakeholder, revision of evaluation procedures, regular supervision and the like were recommended to make the practice a more constructive professional development exercise.

I. Introduction

Currently, teacher training and development trends that contribute to the professionalization of teaching are sought by numerous sources. For example, before and after being qualified as a teacher Lefoka, Jobo and Moeti (2001) claim for innovating (generating) new insight of teacher education. They, moreover, stress the need to explore how student teachers acquire the skills to teach effectively, and how they experience training and induction into the teaching profession in actual contexts. To such ends, it is worth looking into analytical and practical concerns with the structural organization of teacher education programmes as well as the form and substance of their curricula (Ibid).
In the Ethiopian context, due attention is paid to the practicum as a more integrated professional development part of the pre-service teacher education programmes (MoE, 2003). It aims to enrich student teachers' practical experiences and their understandings of the teaching profession in a plenty of situations as earlier as the initial training (Ibid). The Ministry's National Curriculum Guide, moreover, recommends that teacher trainees be provided with the opportunities to practice teaching skills and methods in a structured, guided, and well-supported way through the concerted efforts of all the stakeholders in the trade. However, its organizational structures and implementation approaches might vary from one context to the other. In the Tigray Region, the In-Out-In teacher education structure aims at providing trainees with ample opportunities in which professional skills can be developed further and internalized over lengthy but uninterrupted periods of practical experience. Thus, student teachers are spread out in various Woredas of the Region during the entire period of their second year to practice teaching in actual schools.

Private higher education institutions take a lion's share in producing professional teachers in line with the proposed internship structure (model). Though there is no documented evidence, many aspects of the one-year practicum as a professional development exercise are often criticized by many parties. Trainees, for instance, are frequently heard complaining of minimal support received from their colleges and schools benefit more from the actual practicum. Such complaints and pitfalls can better be understood when organizational and practical aspects of the practicum as well as perceptions of those with an immediate stake in the practice are evaluated and analyzed. Yet, studies that aim to help private higher education sectors review and improve their practicum exercises are almost absent. This study, therefore, is an evaluative account of the practicum exercise at four private higher institutions engaged in training second cycle primary school teachers. It focuses on the 1998 one-year practicum program to assess the various organizational structures and practical approaches of the practice dwelling on the perceptions of the stakeholders and documents.
2. Objectives

The study, generally, aims at evaluating the part(s) a one year practicum plays in the professional development of trainees after an assessment of the practice at four private colleges in Mekelle city: Greenwich, Hashenge, New Millennium, and Sheba colleges. Special attention in the study has been provided to address the following questions:

1. Assess the organizational structures and implementation approaches employed in the practice;
2. Investigate the trainees' and the trainers' perception of the exercise;
3. Evaluate the immediate stakeholders view about the effectiveness of the internship.

3. Methodology

Primary data for the study was collected from selected student teachers (N=100) and teacher educators (N=20) via the questionnaire, and education department heads and vice deans via interviews. Besides, document analysis served as a source of information about the organizational aspects of the practicum. Data collected via such approaches were analyzed using simple descriptive statistics and narrative modes.

4. Results and Discussion

4.1. Operational Structure and Organization

This section looks at the basic infrastructures and their organizational structures to serve as the building blocks of running the actual practicum among the selected institutions.
Operational Structure

As a more integrated professional development part of the teacher education program, the practicum should be institutionalized by itself with the necessary personnel and emphasis (Lefoka, Jobo, and Moeti, 2001; MOE, 2003). However, the interview responses of the key informants from the selected sectors revealed the absence of a separate department or office to coordinate and run the practicum in their respective colleges. They also pinpointed that the necessary processes and personnel are not well versed in the structure. The process of supervising and assisting student teachers with the required tutors/supervisors and coordinators have been hardly established or centralized both in the institution and partner schools. Thus, the current operational structure of the practicum among the institutions would appear to have hardly paved the way for the college tutors as well as school teachers to facilitate supervision for the professional development of the trainees.

4.1.2. Partnership with Schools

Schools take the lion's share in professional development of student teachers. To this end, Moorosi (1998) and Hopkin (1996) note that colleges need to set up training workshops to familiarize school principals and teachers with the importance of the practicum and the roles they play in helping the trainees. However, deans and heads reported that no training workshops were designed for schools and little attention has been paid to preparing principals and cooperating teachers to take on their roles, duties, and responsibilities of providing professional and social assistance to the trainees.

4.1.3. Placement and Orientation

In private higher education sectors, the system of allocating student teachers in schools tends to be difficult. The college staff informants indicated that their institutions usually
apply to the Woreda Education Offices to take in student teachers and place in schools. Since the offices are free to accept or reject to do so, some take the number of student teachers they want while most refuse to receive any trainees. In such instances, the student teachers, with the help of their institution are often urged to find host schools even without allowance/pay. The trainees' responses below support this problem.

Table 1: Student Teachers' Reaction to their School Placement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Responses</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Who found and selected you the Wereda school for your practicum?</td>
<td>A. Myself</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. My college</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>C. Any other</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Did you like/prefer it to learn a lot?</td>
<td>A. Yes</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>B. No</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the above table, the majority of the trainees (58) were responsible to place themselves for their practice and a large number of them (67) did not like the placement sites for professional development opportunities. The responses would imply that the college tended to relinquish control over the placement to student teachers. Hence, schools were chosen for personal and availability reasons rather than sound standards whereby student teachers could get opportunities to experience the teaching profession.

It would also appear that colleges have exerted minimal effort to make strong and formal partnerships, clear terms of reference, and long term arrangements with Woreda Education Offices as the key stakeholders responsible for receiving and placing student teachers as well as initiating schools to provide professional and social support for the trainees.

Placement and orientation are often inseparable issues. In this regard, Ntho (1998) emphasizes the need for an open and democratic orientation to the practicum for student teachers to communicate their perceptions and expectations freely. When asked to reflect on the 1998 orientation to the practicum, the department heads and deans indicated that the
session focused on the institutional requirements and expectations that student teachers were to live with. Thus, the practicum orientation tended to be a contrived collegiality manifest by one-sided presentations that caused the trainees to listen to what was being communicated to them.

4.1.4. Assessment Structures and Procedures

The colleges have two procedures for evaluating their trainees on the practicum; the portfolio and school evaluation. Student teachers were asked to produce a portfolio of their school experiences and make short reflective presentations. The school evaluation is done for the purpose of final grading of the practicing trainees. The institutions have developed forms to be completed by schools and sent back to the colleges where the instructors add the scores to arrive at a final grade in conjunction with the portfolio scores.

However, the contents of the school experience portfolio and evaluation forms as well as the ways they have been structured appear to have been less well thought out. They could hardly serve as important tools for helping prospective teachers as well as other stakeholders to achieve the goals of the practicum by practicing the theory of teaching. There are no assessment procedures that guide student teachers in evaluating themselves and for assisting one another. The assessment procedures and structures are of minimal assistance in supporting the trainees to reflect on their teaching experiences and progress. They do not let tutors, cooperating teachers, and heads pay regular classroom visits that allow the professional development of the student teachers.

4.2. The Actual Practicum in Action and Trainees' Experiences

This part of the study is devoted to the practice of supervision and the support of schools in helping the student teachers grow professionally during the practicum. In effect, some of the ways through which the practicum was undertaken and experienced by the student teachers are assessed.
4.2.1. Supervision

Respondents were asked to reflect on and evaluate the supervision issues of the 1998 practicum.

**Table 2: Trainees' Responses to the Number of Visits Made**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of Visits</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No visit</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twice</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thrice</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Four and above times</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The actual practicum, as a learning tool to teach developmental exercise, can be fruitful with an arranged and well-thought over supervision in which student teachers are visited sufficiently by college teacher trainers. However, from the above table, 76 of the students reported that they were not visited at all; while 15 reported only one visit and 9 reported two. There is an agreement amongst the respondents that the number of visits to give trainees regular professional support was totally inadequate.

**Table 3: Trainees' Responses to Trainer (Tutor) Visits**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>How many different Trainers visited?</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No trainer visited</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The same trainer</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two different trainers</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or more trainers</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In table 3, the majority of student teachers (69) indicated that they were not visited by any teacher trainer; and only 17 said they were visited by the same teacher trainer. Whereas very few, 11, reported they had two different visitors. The results suggest the absence or lack of tutor visits to offer professional support for trainees on practice.

**Table 4:** Trainees' Evaluation of Supervisory Feedback and Assistance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of supervisory feedback &amp; assistance</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No assistance</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Given a grade</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written feedback</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal feedback</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observed-but no feedback</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Student teachers were asked to reflect on the types of assistance they were given through supervision. The table shows that most of the trainees, 84, received no assistance. Supervisory feedback and assistance given to the trainees appeared very minimal. Both written and verbal feedback was uncommon. Student teachers were very rarely observed and given no feedback at all, frequently not told grades awarded.

Moreover, the instructors' views were in favour of the trainees'. They suggested the lack of an arranged and well-thought over supervision in which trainees were visited, given regular feedback, and their progress noted. They attributed the problem to transport and time constraints as well as poor college-school partnerships.

Thus, it could be inferred that the practical organization of the practicum in the college militated against sound supervision as a developmental exercise in which trainees are supported by college tutors and experienced school teachers.
4.2.2. Induction and Teaching Loads

This section looks at student teachers' evaluation of the schools' efforts in creating a supportive environment and introducing the trainees to teaching in supported as well as phased ways. When trainees start to practice teaching, they assume new responsibilities and face some problems when not prepared in advance (Good and Brophy, 1996; Goodson 1992).

Thus, Huling-Austin (1986) recommends induction programmes in schools to enhance trainees' personal and professional well-being or self-esteem.

Yet, most trainees commented that the schools did not create a supportive environment where the former could start to be introduced in the profession and the community. They complained about being left alone to cope, treated as children, and ignored or criticized. Besides, they were made to teach other subjects and more periods a week (20-30) as 43 trainees reported a teaching load of 20-24 periods, and 57 reported 25-30 periods.

4.2.3. Teaching Concerns / Professional skills

Teachers need to develop teaching concerns to deal with various issues at some stage. Fuller & Bown (1975) and Good & Brophy (1996) note that novice and student teachers must be assisted to work through and develop different personal as well as procedural teaching concerns before they pay attention to the effects of teaching and student learning. Thus, since novices and trainees-in-practice with different needs and skills react to teaching differently, the professional assistance they received from schools during the practicum.
An analysis of the level of their professional development rests on recognition of this variation (Glassberg, 1980; Good & Brophy, 1996). Thus, trainees' views of their practicum experience help to assess such issues. Student teachers were asked to reflect on their difficult experiences involved in some teaching concerns, and evaluating

**Table 5:** Student Teachers' Reaction to Some Teaching Concerns and the Support of Schools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teaching Concerns</th>
<th>Difficulty Level</th>
<th>SCHOOL ASSISTANCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>iffı</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scheming</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesson planning</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Record keeping</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deciding on proper teaching method</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom control/Discipline</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motivate students</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dealing with individual differences</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessing Learners</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communicate parents</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to express oneself</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Knowledge</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding proper teaching materials</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above it can be seen that the most serious problem/difficulty reported by the trainees was classroom discipline management. The next salient difficulty observed was dealing with individual differences among students. Other frequently reported problems
were use of appropriate teaching methods, content knowledge, finding proper teaching materials. Besides, a significant number of trainees face moderate difficulty to produce schemes of work, motivate students, and assess learners.

Moreover, schools are valuable sources of rich learning opportunities for student teachers to develop professional skills. As Veenman (1984), Zeichner and Tabachnicck (1984/5), Hart (1995), and Good and Brophy (1996) pointed out, experienced and successful teachers, mentors and principals are responsible for helping trainees adjust to their roles in schools and develop professional skills as well as skills in collegiality and in learning about themselves through regular observation and feedback. However, the responses in the table show that the majority of trainees had no support from school to enrich their different teaching concerns or professional skills; only few felt they received help. This would suggest the poor partnerships between colleges and schools. The college staff informants tended to confirm the views of the trainees. The instructors and the department heads seemed to be doubtful whether the schools provide trainees with the necessary professional support. Most suggested that the quality of school experience was less than satisfactory as schools were not selected on the basis of their good teaching.

4.2.4. Merits Obtained During the Practicum

Respondents were asked to figure out and comment on the most important things during the actual practicum. Despite the paucity of support from schools and colleges, the respondents suggested the following personal and professional skills experienced during the practice:

- Blackboard organization and use;
- The need for patience and sensitivity while managing young children;
- Difficulties in handling and teaching young learners;
- The importance of cooperation with teachers, students and the community;
Active participation in staff meetings;
Opportunities to prepare real lesson plans, records on works done, mark a registrar, set and mark tests/exams, select teaching materials, choose effective teaching methods;
Chances to learn so as to survive.

In a nutshell, the overall analysis of the responses would indicate that the practicum helped students acquire useful practical skills that they had been taught in college and put into practice on the job. This would appear to vindicate the need for an adequate period for the trainees to be on the practicum to learn, at different stages, different things from actual school situations that include mainly the real professional skills of handling the classroom, how to operate as a member of the school the community as well as the technical and administrative angles of teaching. The responses would also imply that the trainees' professional attitudes were good.

4.2.5. Problems During the practicum

Respondents were asked to reflect on the problems encountered during the practicum and comment on the following challenges which revolve around the schools, the colleges, money and resources. The responses are summarized as follows.

Not being welcomed on the part of the staffs in schools they went for practicum;
Viewed as inexperienced;
School teachers' unwillingness to help and give professional support;
Uncooperative school principals;
Minimal chances to participate in workshops;
Little or almost no payment;
Low probability in appropriately know individual students so as to help them due to large class size;
Teaching of different subjects that lead to many lesson preparations a week;
• Students' failure to grasp the content due to poor foundation;
• Inadequate college and school supervisor;
• Handling of students with undesirable behavior;
• Unreliable and less valid evaluation assessment system to measure trainees' competences.

4.2.5. Respondents' Views of the Practicum

This part looks at respondents' perceptions of the two-semester practicum: Its duration, what they felt trainees had learnt, and what frustrated them. Under normal circumstances, one-year block practicum is meant for student teachers to adequately put into operation what they have learned in colleges, and experience the demands of working in classrooms and schools. Trainees were asked to react to this lengthy and uninterrupted period of experience.

Table 6: Student Teachers' Views on the Length of the Practicum

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Length</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Right length</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be longer</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be shorter</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In two blocks</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in the above table, the great majority of the trainees felt that the time spent on the practicum should to be shorter. As few numbers of them felt either it should be broken in two blocks or it should continue as it had been. The great majority of the trainees who felt the time spent on the actual practicum needs to be reduced tended to reflect their own views. They, in the first place, perceived that the practicum is a process meant to help them practice but not necessarily to make them perfect. Secondly, they held that they benefited
little from it due to the lack or absence of professional support and sound assessment from their institutions and the hosting schools. They also complained of the overloaded teaching periods for two semesters with little or no payment.

By the same token, college staffs involved in the study were in favor of the trainees' perceptions regarding the reduction of the practicum period.

4.2.7. Follow up Discussion after the Practicum Return

Respondents were asked to look back and comment on how often the practicum experiences were followed up and discussed in the core courses in the institutions after the trainees returned from their respective practicing schools. Their reactions are given in the table below.

Table 7: Trainees' Responses to the Frequency of the Practicum Follow up Discussion in College Classes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Several times</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some times</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Once</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most responses in the table would suggest the trainees' practicum experiences were never discussed after they return. It would seem that no project work or assignment in other courses was linked to the practicum due to the loose integration of the college courses with the experiences in real (actual) classrooms. The instructors also suggested that the practicum exercises were not closely integrated into the curriculum so that follow-up discussions did not occur in the colleges afterwards. This would imply the emphasis placed
on content during the final training year so that there was less room whereby the trainees' teaching concerns/professional skills were related further to the actual school context and enriched.

5. Conclusions and Recommendations

Drawing on the perceptions of the respondents and document analysis, the practical and organizational aspects of the year-long practicum at four private colleges in Tigray have been discussed. The findings of the study indicated that the respondents greatly valued the program as a challenging and rewarding experience in which trainees' learn to teach before joining the profession as full-fledged teachers. The trainees felt that they experienced extra-mural activities in the schools as well as the practical, technical, and administrative sides of teaching. However, the respondents were very critical of its organization and implementation. The study found several problems peculiar in the system affecting the main objectives of the program. Thus, it came up with the following major problems inherent in the operational structure, administration, and practice of the original year-long practicum.

- The program tended to have low status within the institutions as it was not run by a separate department/office.
- Trainee placement appeared fairly disorganized as the colleges hardly made long-term arrangements with Woreda education offices to select sound partnerships.
- College and school visits for supervisory and assessment functions were so limited that trainees were not supported to develop their skills.
- The assessment and evaluation structures and procedures seemed fairly weak to measure the trainees' various competences by the relevant role players via different forms over a reasonable period of time.
• The respondents' perceptions posited a wide gap between the colleges and the schools. The trainees' complaints of the treatment and support from schools would show the lesser role of the schools to serve as partners in the training. This also suggests poor preparation on the part of the institutions to make closer links and create effective partnership with schools so that they can understand and complement each other.

• Trainees’ dissatisfaction with their experiences of the teaching concerns and the lack of follow up discussions after the practicum reveal the weak link between the practicum, and the school contexts. Consequently, people who participated in the study have criticized the practice on various grounds related to organizational and practical variables and it should be shorter. Dwelling on the respondents' suggestions and the study findings, the following recommendations are suggested to make the practicum a much more valuable and constructive professional development experience.

• Regional education bureaus and woreda education offices' enhanced assistance to the private higher education sector in their teacher education endeavors.

• Establishment of the practicum department/office and allocation of the personnel.

• Improved relations between colleges and other stakeholders, and enhanced liaison with schools, including workshops for mentor, heads, and principals.

• More efforts are needed on the part of institutions to integrate practicum with the rest of the curriculum and school context.

• Selection of schools that can offer models of good practice and support trainees.

• Better arrangements of visits for supervisory and assessment purposes.

• Revision of the assessment structures and procedures (the need to use various evaluation instruments for all concerned parties to assess trainees' competences.

• Institutions' efforts to develop understanding and collaboration for the same trade.
• Stakeholders' consensus up on a common set of guidelines about the structure and content of the practice.

• Colleges' and schools' enhanced efforts to set out realistic objectives about the trainees' expectations during the practicum.

• Enhancement of the research tradition in the education sector to evaluate and improve teacher training program.

REFERENCES


Glassberg, s (1980). 'A view of the beginning teacher from a developmental perspective; paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Education Association, Boston.


Moorosi, M. (1998). 'Effects of the Four-Month teaching practice on clinical supervision at the National Teacher Training College'


Developing Learner-Centered Approach Instructional Materials
St.Mary’s University College’s Experience

Desalegn Sherkabu
Ethiopian Civil Service College; Institute of Distance Education
sherkabu@yahoo.co.nz

Abstract

This study aimed at exploring the experience of St. Mary’s University College TVET Programmes in developing Learner-Centered Instructional Materials. Data were collected using interview and focus group discussion. Five material developers and a focus group of 8 trainees were selected using purposive sampling technique. Seven sample course materials were observed using the same method. Data were analyzed using a strategy called matrix analysis. It was found that the materials stipulated broad aims that can meaningfully address the rationale of particular bodies of knowledge, attitudes and skills included. The course materials have a clearly set bullet-list of detailed unit objectives. The materials are made up of well set notes which can be made more focused to Learners’ future work by modeling the Relevance strategy in the TVET curriculum guideline. The educationally significant exercises can be made more and more valid by encouraging application of theoretical knowledge. The series of pair, small and large group presentations as well as occasional individual presentations of Learners’ works and the resultant continuous assessment of Learners’ progress reflects the Modern Learner Centered Approach. The materials are broken down into units and sections. Concepts, theories and principles are logically sequenced from general to specific and from simple to complex. A good deal of precision can be achieved by plainly highlighting forthcoming points under discussion. The newness of the constructivist pedagogy to instructional material developers and the relative dependence on individual efforts of the latter are problems observed. Thus, it was recommended that St. Mary’s Uni-College should facilitate a review of the materials. Instructors in the Uni-College need to carry out an in-depth analysis on the materials under use for further step up in the quality of their training provision through up coming review of the materials. The validity, significance, comprehensiveness and relevance of contents shall be the focus of both investigations by instructors and review activity. The learning opportunities like the apprenticeship plan shall be made part and parcel of not only the applied but also the written curricula for best implementation.
1. Introduction

1.1. Background of the Study

It is true that a nation achieves development only on the condition that it provides quality educational provision to its citizens. The desired access to quality education, as one burning issue in the education system of the country, has been an issue of serious concern for the last ten years.

At this point, it can be said that the Ministry of Education (MoE) had so far worked closely with the Higher Education Institutes of the Nation to bring the desired quality of training to technical and vocational education and training programmes of colleges. However, quality educational provision in Ethiopia, including St Mary’s University College is under question. On one hand, not meeting this issue of quality poses not only a threat to our much longed for fast growth but also it is damaging to resources at hand.

On the other, quality of education is really a difficult issue to measure. This; however, should not mean that we cannot speak about the issue. Of course quality of education can be examined by looking into a set of quality indicators. A good indicator of quality instructional provision in college education is the presence and absence of well-prepared texts. The presence and absence of the said materials reminds us of the meaning of the concept of learning in formal education.

Learning can also be defined as an active process in which learners construct meanings as they interact with the course materials, their classmates and teachers (The Open University 2002). If the above definition, reflecting the constructivist’s concept of knowledge, is to be met in our higher education programs, instructional materials need to be prepared in line with modern approaches of an instructional material development learner-centered approach. For advocates of the constructivist theory originated by Lev Vygotsky like J. S. Bruner and George Miller, learner-centered instructional material development should
follow the latter’s popular idea of advance organizer- the intent of which is a bit-by-bit presentation of a body of text leading to a meaningful whole in the end (Bruner 2005).

St Mary’s University College has been developing and using instructional materials for its students and for its TVET programs for the last few years. The experience is worth considering in that the institution is one of the leading private University colleges in the country. The point here is whether the TVET course materials under reference are really prepared in line with the requirements of learner centered approach (LCA) instructional material preparation to benefit learners the most. This is where the need for research lies.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

There is no question that the quality of educational provision in our higher education institutions MoE (1994), including St. Mary’s University College, needs improvement. One way of bringing improved educational quality is through the application of important suggestions from research findings in the area. In other words, we need to continuously probe the issue to meet the desired quality. This particular study targets to investigate the efforts made by St. Mary’s University College to develop its instructional materials as per the standard of the MoE curricula. To this effect, the investigator has set the following basic questions:

1. Do St. Mary’s University College course material objectives clearly naddress the needs of learners?
2. Are the methods of the materials under reference presented in a way that they can engage trainees?
3. Do the course materials under reference show clear organization of the body of text?
4. Do the course materials under reference employ L-C-A assessment strategies?
5. What are the major problems that St. Mary’s University College encountered in the course material development process?

6. What is the reaction of St. Mary’s University College trainees towards their course materials?

7. What is the reaction of St. Mary’s University College course material developers towards the course materials?

**Purpose of the Study**

This study aims to examine the experience of St Mary’s University College in developing Learner-Centered instructional materials. It does so because in case the experiences deserve praise, all other colleges offering TVET will get an important basis for improving the quality of their educational provision. In this regard, if the experience shows letdown, the study will point out this and suggest solutions.

**1.4. Significance of the Study**

The full analysis of this paper is believed to:

- Provide the university college under reference with a genuine appraisal deserving of its efforts;
- Provide educators and other concerned bodies with evaluative information on the quality of educational materials currently in use in the university college;
- Provide all other institutes in the country with opportunities of sharing experience in instructional material preparation;
- Provide a related review of literature in the area of instructional materials preparation for TVET programs; and
- Initiate other researchers to undertake further research in the area.
1.5. Scope of the Study

This study focuses on examining the experience of St. Mary’s University College in developing learner-centered instructional materials. Although the experience can have implications to all other related Institutions in the nation, the findings and conclusions that will be reached will only be directly applicable to St. Mary’s University College.

1.6. Limitations of the Study

This study, if not for time constraint, would have been better informative had it also examined the material development processes in other private and public colleges and universities.

5.2. Definitions of terms

*Reaction:* what trainers and trainees feel about and in fact how much they took from the course materials which are important, demanding, attractive or appealing, etc.

*Learner Centered approach:* Varieties of modern instructional methods and strategies that provide learners with relatively better opportunities through direct involvement and through giving them much of the responsibility of learning to themselves rather than the instructor.

2. Review of Related Literature

In this section of the paper, the writer summarizes the pedagogical principles that underlie good instructional materials that are prepared inline with the LCA.
2.1. Pedagogical principles

Before discussing what the major pedagogical principles that course developers need to know, Pedagogy is the science of teaching. It came to be a science through time by taking several principles that contribute to effective learning. It took these principles from the field that education built itself upon. These include psychology, philosophy and sociology. These principles are mainly adapted from Aggarwal (1996) and manuals on instructional principles and methods by the researcher Desalegn (2005). However for the most part the writer owes these compilations to personal reading of books on educational Psychology and Pedagogy of the Oppressed by the famous Brazilian Professor, the late Paulo Freire. Teaching learning principles have implications for selecting approaches to curriculum development, syllabus design, teaching and learning, testing and assessment as well as on the how of the organization of teaching (Aggarwal 1994). Thus teacher educators and those who are involved in instructional material productions should closely watch these principles at all times. This is because the principles provide general rules of shaping teaching - learning processes, investigating methods and materials of instruction also serve as a basis for methodology, help to facilitate and ensure effective learning, Serve as a basic guide for the teacher to plan and organize contents, select and apply appropriate methods and materials of instruction, etc., and Serve all levels of school instruction.

2.2. LCA and Course Material Development

According to Burke and Carey (1994), a highly learner-centered instructional material is one presenting a short unit of learning which could be linked to its other parts to form a coherent program, and that each part should have a clearly defined aims and expected outcomes that should specify content in terms of knowledge, skills and understanding should refer to appropriate teaching and learning styles and explain the methods of
Table 1: Common Pedagogical principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principles</th>
<th>Theoretical basis</th>
<th>Implication for Teaching</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The principle of linking</td>
<td>-students learn more when they understand &amp; see the relevance</td>
<td>-Teachers should begin from the interest and maturity level and academic background of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instruction with life</td>
<td>of their subject in their day to day life</td>
<td>Students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Create situations and give examples relating to the local environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Begin from what the students know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Use real examples,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Encourage students to explore their environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The principle of systematic</td>
<td>-the arrangement and organization of the contents and activity of instruction in</td>
<td>-Necessary for effective teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>instruction</td>
<td>appropriate learning order to suit pupils understanding is shown.</td>
<td>-Learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Well organized materials are easily understood</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Students learn better if the presentation moves from heading to sub- heading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The principles of integration</td>
<td>Pupils better learn when subjects are presented integrated or at least when</td>
<td>-Follow teaching steps</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>conscious connections between them</td>
<td>-Use logical well organized presentation with clear language &amp; examples</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Encourage students to use concepts and skills that they learned in a subject to study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>their other subjects.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The principle of comprehensibility of instruction</td>
<td>-Students bring complete behavioral change only when they develop the combination of all the three domains of knowledge</td>
<td>-Teachers should teach and test all the three parts of knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The principle of motivation in</td>
<td>-Once students are motivated i.e. their interest is aroused, they are willing to</td>
<td>-Teachers should do their best to constantly motivate their students through a careful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>learning</td>
<td>concentrate &amp; work</td>
<td>planning and preparation drawn from the nature of the learners, the subject matter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>teaching materials, strategies and the like.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The principle of activity</td>
<td>-Students must participate in all stages and steps of teaching</td>
<td>-Encourage active involvement and participation of learners especially in learning such</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>learning</td>
<td></td>
<td>skills as maths, writing, grammar, drawing etc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The principle of individual</td>
<td>-For teaching to be effective it must be adapted to the individual differences of</td>
<td>-Teachers should understand the Ss' progress and give diagnosis &amp; use varieties of methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difference</td>
<td>children</td>
<td>&amp; visual aids to interest the students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The principle of stabilization</td>
<td>-Students knowledge attitude and skills could be made last long through bringing</td>
<td>-Teachers should in any of the various ways stabilize their presentation to guarantee the success of student learning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
assessment to be used. In verifying the above definition by Burke and Carey, Jenkins and Walker (1994:19) wrote to say:

“… The basic principles of … courses are well known and established: they involve the divisions of the curriculum into limited units or … of learning which are then assessed at the end of that unit, with the student building up a degree or award through such learning being credited…”

From the above point, it is clear that the focus is on the need to present a body of knowledge little by little and with frequent follow up in the form of formative evaluation. This being the major point, the approach is also advantageous in many other ways.

Table 2: LC Vs Traditional Approach course materials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Modern/LCA/ course materials</th>
<th>Traditional course materials</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Two-way communication</td>
<td>One-way communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner is actively involved</td>
<td>Learner is passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employs advance organizers</td>
<td>Interrelations little shown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner is guided</td>
<td>Self-directed learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly and encouraging</td>
<td>Impersonal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learner applies new knowledge and skills</td>
<td>Little application of knowledge and skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full of activities and exercises</td>
<td>Activities only at the end of chapters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content is divided into small chunks</td>
<td>Content in chapters or large blocks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment for marking</td>
<td>No assignment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Feedback provided on learner’s progress</td>
<td>No feedback</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The ability of materials to promote interdisciplinary connections through combinations of others in the series and dedicated interdisciplinary units of study is another. For example, according to Walker (1994), when studying using the modular approach, the learner is not usually made to re-attend a course that he had either studied it in another program or that he had experienced somewhere else. Students can also be supplied with modules that stress the practical applications of study through case study, project work and work-experience,
or modules which center on transferable skills such as information technology, financial management, and modern foreign languages (Williams and Horbins 1994).

The next few sub sections will be a brief discussion of using clear and meaningful statement of aims, structuring based on logical manner, using advance organizers, encouraging deep rather than superficial learning, and assessment strategies.

2.2.1. Using Clear and Meaningful Statement of Aims

At no point in the learning process should students be unclear as to what they have achieved or how this will contribute towards goals to be achieved. According to Ausubel (1968), the provision of a broad framework along the lines indicated will in fact facilitate the assimilation of the more detailed learning to follow with the framework becoming an integral part of the cognitive structure.

Similarly behavioralist theory (Tyler, 1949, Mager 1962; Popham, 1969) suggests that the goals to be achieved should be clearly identified. Students should also be provided with help and guidance to achieve their goals, and their achievements should gain appropriate recognition. Students need to see that they are making progress and need to feel that the goals ahead are achievable if they are to make further progress.

For some writers like, Melton (2002) statement of aims that module writers need to write at the beginning of each unit are broad statements of aims advising the learners what the expected competence are. He suggests that only broad statement of aims might be useful. On the other hand, for the behaviorists specific objectives are more effective in facilitating learning when placed close to a study session. Students can determine whether they have achieved these. Still according to Walker 1994 LCA course materials must have explicit aims, and must specify intended outcomes.
2.2.2. Structuring based on logical manner

This is about creating a logical framework of the instructional material under development by only including the various features that facilitate learning. These include the development of introduction to the module and the units, the presentation of content in a stimulating and well-structured manner (with the help of activities, projects, case studies, diagrams, illustrations, etc.), and the addition of a conclusion with a summary and checklist. In addressing issues of organization, the new curriculum of the MoE, year 1-3 programs are referred to be middle level TVET programs and it is suggested if organized by occupation titles, duties and tasks. Each occupation then had its tasks and duties included in major, supportive and common courses. For example, an occupational title: beginner accountant for year one TVET trainees aims at training students who have completed general secondary education (Grade 10) as Beginner Accountant in the Middle level TVET Program.

The modules for major courses are designed in such a way that the trainee will spend 30% of the allotted time in gaining theoretical knowledge and 70% in doing practical works, which will be given during the one year training program.

For each job area, recommended project work and apprenticeship training time has been allotted in order to help the trainees improve their practical skill. In general, trainees will spend most of their school time in practical work rather than on theoretical education.

The main courses, there are supportive courses and common courses, which are more of theoretical knowledge and designed to help the trainees follow the training or meet the exit profile, as far as the knowledge aspect of the training is concerned.
After completing the year one training program as Beginner Accountants, trainees are expected to create their own enterprises or be employed in any establishment in the country. Those who meet the requirements might have the possibility to continue their training in year two, and then year three TVET programme, which are designed to produce Accounting Clerks and Junior Accountants respectively. During the continuing two years, the following additional main courses will be given:

Perhaps, it is questionable if the curriculum itself need have to stop by limiting students to three year training.

Employing advance organizers provides ample opportunities to the writer in forming both vertical and horizontal integration among the body of text under presentation. It does this by helping the learner to identify topics to be addressed and the relationships between them. The intent is to provide students with a meaningful and well-organized framework for the assimilation of more detailed knowledge. With the absence of this, students would only be introduced to concepts after concepts without knowing where this is taking them or why they are studying the concepts concerned. According to Walker 1994 learner centered methodology (LCM) course materials must specify (where appropriate, any prior learning which is required).

2.2.3. LCM encouraging deep rather than superficial learning

According to Walker (1994), LCM course materials must make clear the methods of learning and the context in which learning activities take place; should provide for differentiated learning experience; and may be subject-specific, occupation specific, cross-curricular, or combination of these. What is required particularly in college education is what is called a “deep approach” to learning that is where students concentrate more on understanding the overall messages that is being conveyed and assumptions on which it is based Marton and Salijo (1976) and Temechegn (2004). According to these writers, self
instructing learners commonly adopt a surface approach to learning – tending to concentrate on memorizing facts and detailed information without reflecting on the underlining assumptions and arguments. The Open University of United Kingdom (UK OU) has made considerable efforts to encourage a deeper approach to learning through the building of activities and projects and courses (Melton 2002).

However, this writer strongly argues on the where and how to use activities. Accordingly, in recommending the use of activities, and projects to encourage deep learning, it is recognized that students often have quite distinct preferences as to how they learn. Some may prefer reading text, watching TV, or small group discussions etc. This reminds professional teachers about different learning styles. Whereas there are students who learn by doing more effectively, there are those who prefer listening to reading a body of text or important books for quick mastery of a body of knowledge. Materials can be activity based. However, it is also recognized that students can develop new learning styles (Bargar and Hoover, 1984; Hyman and Rosoff, 1984; Joyce, 1984) thereby increasing the variety of ways in which they might learn, but where students are expected to develop new ways of learning they need to be given appropriate guidance and support.

2.2.4. Assessment in learner centered (LC) Approach

In relation to course material preparation for college education, Walker (1994) noted that assessment in using the LC Approach: should be in relation to outcomes made explicit to students, staff and employers, should be based upon a range of strategies through which a student can demonstrate what he/she knows, understands or can do, should be based up on a range of evidence appropriate to a given activity, should include review and reflection, and lead to the identification of future goals and targets, should facilitate the formative
recording of achievement; should be supported by appropriate quality assurance; and should enable students to gain credits for their attainments.

On the other hand, the four main contexts through which the modular approach can enhance learners’ capability are: the extent to which the students use the assessment to improve the quality of future assignments the extent to which the assignment is not focusing narrowly on one aspect of performance (say, for example, on simple recall of facts) the extent to which assignments are fair and relevant and the presence and absence of an assessment framework to ensure the coherence and progress in students’ learning (Leask 1994). He further noted that students identify the assessments in modules that are in the middle of program (formative), positively for they keep them on track by clearly showing their progress. In the modular approach, learners like feedback close to activities and questions for different reasons. For example, they are said to create the opportunities for learners to investigate and thus consolidate their knowledge. Some of the common assessment strategies in the LCA are given by Leask (1994) as: production of resource packs; essay (usually on problematic education issues); teaching experience plans and evaluation; laboratory manual completion; staff and peer assessment of seminar work; display (using it or visual aids); presentation of a sequence dance or gym; formal examination (with a variety of types of questions); short tests; analysis of case studies; group displays; test with viva; seminar notes; logs or diaries; seen questions; investigations practical assessment; oral presentations.

Not common as some of the above methods sound in the Ethiopian higher education culture, others are really convincing and have been used frequently too. For example, essay or composition in language classes and group presentation and formal examinations are common assessment strategies. What we learn from the above lists of strategies other than the need for variety is that activities or questions that are well built on case or situation
analysis, based on visits, promote learning through investigations that are to be compiled by learners.

If learners are to probe deeply into the issues involved in their study, instructional materials need activities and projects to engage learners in the process of learning. Projects tend to be much more open-ended than activities with students being given considerable freedom to determine their own goals and the means of achieving them. However, even in projects where students are given a considerable freedom to determine the nature of their assignments, the process can be carefully structured. In this way, for example, students are expected to develop their thinking in stages-obtaining feedback even on their initial outline plans.

3. Methodology and Design Of The Study

In this section the methodology, subjects, sampling techniques, instruments of data gathering, and methods of data analyses employed in the studies are presented.

3.1 Methodology of the Study

This qualitative descriptive study attempts to examine the endeavors of modular instructional material preparation in St. Mary’s University College. The study investigated the modular approach being implemented by the university college against sound Pedagogical principles. Thus, this study attempts to evaluate instructional materials from three perspectives: trainees (i.e. as important determinants of a program), trainers (i.e. instructors who participated in the module development process), and the materials themselves (i.e. the modules under close examination of the researcher). Accordingly, data were collected using interview and focus group discussion. A focus group discussion was held with five material developers and 8 trainees who were selected using accessibility-
sampling technique. Seven sample course materials were observed using the same method. The collected data were finally analyzed using qualitative matrix analysis.

3.2. Sampling of Subjects

The subject modular materials under investigation were chosen on the basis of purposive and accessible sampling technique. Modules that the librarians presented to the researcher as those developed as per the TVET curricula requirements of the MoE were taken for close investigation. This is because the materials are made available to students only through the library’s immediate referencing service. A sample module was observed from each of the eight departments below. In brief, the sample informants listed in the table below include eight trainees. These eight trainees of the 10 + 3 diploma program were randomly chosen from 2nd year trainees.

Table 3: Sample of Course materials in their types

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dep’t</th>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Course Division</th>
<th>Further Detail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>Law of Contracts</td>
<td>Main course</td>
<td>Business Year 1: Banking and IT Y1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Multimedia and Virtual Reality Modeling with Authoware</td>
<td>Main</td>
<td>Business Year 2: Accounting Year 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Introduction to Management Accounting</td>
<td>Main course</td>
<td>Business Year 2: Banking and IT Y1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Introduction to Marketing</td>
<td>Supportive</td>
<td>Business Year 2: Banking and IT Y1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>All fields</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>Civic and ethical education: MI 10+3</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>All fields</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT</td>
<td>Basics of Data Structure and Algorithm</td>
<td>Supportive</td>
<td>Business Year 3: IT Y3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.3. Instruments of Data Gathering

The data gathering instruments used were interviews and observation checklist.

3.3.1. The Interviews

The interviews are prepared for the material developer trainers and the trainees. These two sets of interviews are attached. See Appendix A and B.

3.3.2. The Observation Checklist

The checklist indicated in annex D is just used for checking whether the basic principles of modular instructional materials have been met in the modules that St. Mary’s University College developed. The points included in the checklist are taken from a set of principles for examining a modular approach to the curriculum. According to Walker (1994), in 1992, the modular information network produced the principles after its decades of experience over the modular approach for higher education.

Methods of Data Analysis

This evaluative study has employed a qualitative description for both an in-depth treatment of issues discussed in the study. This qualitative description was used to analyze data, such as the researcher notes from focus group discussions with trainees, and data from open-ended interviews with trainers. Accordingly, the study followed an analytical approach of describing, interpreting, evaluating or appraising. Such matrix analysis was chosen for this study because it was suggested as an important strategy for reducing a large amount of qualitative raw data to manageable size for discussion (Goetz and Lecompte, 1994 in Savenye 1994; and Averill 2002).
Here the researcher used his own critical reflection and thematic and matrix analysis. A matrix is defined as a set of terms arranged in rows and columns that within which, or within and from which, something originates, takes form or develops (Agnes, 2000 as cited in Averill, 2002). The qualitative descriptive matrix in this study is used to display categorized data in individual cells, just to observe what appears.

4. Presentations and Analysis of the Data

This part of the paper treats presentation and analysis of the data gathered from trainees, trainers (module writers), and the researcher’s critical reflection on sample modules in St. Mary’s University College.

4.1. Presentation and Analysis of the Response Obtained from Interviews, from Focus Group discussion, and from the Researcher’s Critical Reflection

In this section the researcher used thematic and matrix analysis along with his critical reflection. The data-planning matrix below was used to display the research questions along the row headings, with a set of equivalent questions along the column headings.

Presentation of researcher’s notes on the instructional objectives

Do St. Mary’s University colleges’ course materials have clear objectives? Are there course, module and unit objectives in the materials? How appropriate are these when seen from an instructional point of view? Course objectives are stated in the course materials. For example, the course objectives for the course entrepreneurship go as follows. Upon successful completion of this course:

- Trainees of TVET will have to be aware of entrepreneurship and self employment options as a choice for their future career;
• Trainees will have to develop positive attitude towards entrepreneurship and self employment;
• They will develop entrepreneurial competencies that enable them to create venture and job opportunities for others also;
• They will be motivated to identify viable business ideas of their own;
• They will develop their own business plan for selected specific projects.

The objectives are well distributed across the knowledge domains. The emphasis given to the traditionally less treated knowledge domains-attitude and skills is encouraging.

Table 4: Summary tables on qualities of course and instructional objectives

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Course objectives</th>
<th>Chapter/unit/lesson objectives</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Law of Contracts</td>
<td>Well stated</td>
<td>Well stated</td>
<td>But should not be repetitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Marketing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basics of Data Structure and Algorithm</td>
<td>Interesting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The second groups of examples are the objectives for the course Introduction to Marketing. They have been well stated in specific and measurable behavioral terms as follows. At the end of this chapter, the trainees will be able to:

• Define marketing properly;
• Identify the core concepts of marketing;
• Point out the importance of marketing precisely;
• Identify the various demand states and the relative marketing tasks;
• Analyze marketing in respect to its various environmental factors.
4.1.2. Presentation of Researcher’s notes on course contents and methods

Are the course contents and methods of the materials under reference presented in a way that they can engage trainees? Are there enough activities in the newly developed instructional materials? The activity method of teaching is common in the following instances.

**Table 4.1:** Summary table on inclusion of activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Activities on page</th>
<th>Review questions</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multimedia and Virtual Reality Modeling with Authorware</td>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>Interesting ones at the end of each unit.</td>
<td>The presentation is more a series of text.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Management Accounting</td>
<td>Activity 3 Chapter 1 Page 17, Why…? Give examples…</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activity 3, chapter 2 Page 32: Classifying given data,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activity 4 page 36: Preparing an income statement,</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Activities 5-10: Compute….</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Marketing</td>
<td>Almost none and this is worrying. Only on page 183</td>
<td></td>
<td>Rich in in-the-middle of text questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Pages 44, 91 and 127.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Wonderful ones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic and ethical education: MI 10+3</td>
<td>Group and individual exercises on pages: 30, 32, 50, 51, 58, 61, 63, 79, 81, 85, 89. Class discussion Page 34, 37, 43.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basics of Data Structure and Algorithm</td>
<td>Application questions on the theories presented on pages: 29-32, 51-52, 60, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.3. Presentation of researcher’s notes on the clarity and organization of the body of text

How are the materials organized? Do the course materials under reference show clear organization of the body of the text? Are the activities in the newly developed instructional materials educationally significant?

Table 4.2: Summary table on inclusion of in-the-middle of text questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Activities on page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Law of Contracts</td>
<td>Pages: 14, 19, 30, 31, 40, 46, 51, 54, 64, 65, 66.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic and ethical education: MI 10+3</td>
<td>Almost on every page</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.3: Summary table on logical breakdown of contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Multimedia and Virtual Reality Modeling with Authoware</td>
<td>Pictures are used on pages: 38-39, 41, 43.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Usage of heading is good.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The introduction at the beginning is not clearly shown if it is for chapter unit or...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>References are all internet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to Management Accounting</td>
<td>Chapters, sections, sub sections, references, prose texts, bullet-listed texts,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>icons for activities and indices as well as</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic and ethical education: MI</td>
<td>Units, sections, subsections, in-text-questions, maps, but no glossary, no reference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basics of Data Structure and Algorithm</td>
<td>Diagrams, illustrations, charts and tables.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summaries, glossaries and references are missing.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.4. Presentation of Researcher’s notes on the appropriateness of the assessment strategies

What assessment techniques are involved in the materials prepared? Are these in line with the LCM? How successfully are the assessment strategies being used by instructors? How frequently are learners being assessed?

Table 4.4: Summary table on assessment techniques involved

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course title</th>
<th>Assessment</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Law of Contracts</td>
<td>In the middle of Text Questions; Self assessment questions</td>
<td>Final exam for the in school training Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multimedia and Virtual Reality Modeling with Authoware</td>
<td>Interesting review questions</td>
<td>Final exam for on the in school training Project Apprenticeship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic and ethical education: MI 10+3</td>
<td>ITQs Review questions Pages:28,48,69-72</td>
<td>Final exam for on the in school training Project Apprenticeship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basics of Data Structure and Algorithm</td>
<td>ITQs Review questions</td>
<td>Final exam for on the in school training Project Apprenticeship</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students are evaluated using individual and group project works and final examination. They are also evaluated by their apprenticeship training host institutions. Teachers have grave doubts on the validity and reliability of apprenticeship marks of trainees filled by host institutions. The reason is that trainees have been found to receive highly inflated marks where almost every student scores the highest possible. Students also complain that whereas those who were sent to certain institutions score highest marks from apprenticeship, others failed to score high marks and that makes the evaluation unfair and
invalid. Students also complain on both the unreliability and invalid nature of the grading scheme of the apprenticeship program. This would be worth considering especially when seen from the problem of the actual apprenticeship tasks given to students as compared with its theoretical purpose.

Presentation of Researcher’s Notes on the Challenges that St. Mary’s University College Course Material Development Process Faced

What major problems did St. Mary’s University College course material developers encounter? What mechanisms did you use to solve the problems? What related training did you receive to text book development? Who worked with you in developing the modules? An interview made to individual teachers indicated that teachers believe the materials to be very good. They express the qualities of the materials in terms of points like, simple English language, and proper level of demand that they pose to learners.

4.1.6. Presentation of Researcher’s Notes on Trainees’ Reaction towards the Course Materials

What is the reaction of St Mary’s University College trainees towards their course materials? What things do you St Mary’s University College trainees want to change if you are to rewrite the same materials? During the focus group discussion, students have raised the following points, that the classroom instruction provision is far better than that in other colleges in the country; that the college arranges visits and educational tours; that either the university college facilitates apprenticeship or students themselves look for alternatives; that apprenticeship and educational visits fail to meet their purpose; that the university college should arrange discussion forums with students so that they can address their problems like apprenticeship service and lack of sufficient play ground areas for students during their free time.
According to top management member of the institute, following the TVET curricula had been difficult because of the resistance from teachers in those other than the Secretarial Science Department. According to the same source the university college had even taken the initiative and prepared the HRM TVET program. Its representatives had worked closely with MoE throughout the TVET Curricula presentations. They had raised several questions on workshops-questions relating the need for conducting formal needs assessment and if there is a room to allow 10 + 3 graduates to join degree programmes. Absence of proper answers to these questions and criticisms over the TVET curricula caused a loss of confidence by the University College in the sustainability of the TVET program. It had already prepared new texts before it was told to strictly implement the TVET curricula. This had a cost implication and thus it did not write new texts.

On the other hand, the sample modules front cover-page had a note “Prepared as per TVET curricula of MoE.” However, the materials actually followed the old trend of preparing College level supplementary materials. As a result, major area courses couldn’t indicate the type of Occupation and Job corresponding to the particular course title. It is this that could have led towards making the contents highly relevant by way of breaking the course into self-contained modules for the trainings during each of the three years.

5. Summary, Conclusion and Recommendations

5.1. Summary of the Major Findings of the Study

This section of the paper tries to summarize the major findings of the study. The modules in use by the TVET course materials of the university college had clearly set objectives for the course material, for modules and units. It was found that the materials stipulated broad aims that can meaningfully address the rationale of particular bodies of knowledge, attitudes and skills under offer to the trainees. The course materials have a clearly set bullet-list of detailed unit objectives that address the learners.
The materials are made up of well set notes and educationally significant exercises which can be made more and more valid by encouraging application of theoretical knowledge. For example, they can be made more focused to trainees’ future work by following the TVET curriculum guideline. The series of pair, small and large group presentations as well as occasional individual presentations of trainees’ works and the resultant continuous assessment of trainees’ progress reflects the Modern Learner Centered Approach.

The materials are broken down into units and sections. Concepts, theories and principles are logically sequenced from general to specific and from simple to complex. A good deal of precision can be achieved by plainly highlighting forthcoming points under discussion.

The series of individual and group assignments, the project work, and the final exam along with the apprenticeship marking system coincides with the requirements of LCA.

The little confidence that the university college had to the TVET curricula that resulted from the rumors and certain findings contrary to it had been among the living challenges of the university college in relation to efforts of stepping up the qualities of the course materials.

Students think that they find education in the university college enjoyable except that apprenticeship programs relate little to the theory thought and that the evaluation is discouraging. They also comment that the university college had no play grounds for youth.

The newness of the constructivist pedagogy to instructional material developers and relative dependence on individual efforts are problems that course developers note
Conclusion

This paper has attempted to explore the experience in developing LCA Instructional Materials of St. Mary’s university college TVET Programs. Based on the thorough analysis made on the information collected, the early experience of employing LCA of material preparation by the university college is worthy of appreciation. The materials which were prepared even before the coming into force of the TVET curricula showed a good deal of effort towards making learners at the center of the lessons. The qualities of objectives formulated the flow of the contents, the varieties of LCA and assessment strategies are all encouraging. Up coming review activities on the materials can be geared towards further stepping up of the relevance and validity of contents by employing the good lessons from the TVET curricula of MoE.

Recommendations

Now that time had come, literatures were reviewed, data were collected and analyses were made. The preceding sections were on the findings obtained and conclusion reached. The suggestions and recommendations here in below.

St. Mary’s University College should facilitate a review of the materials so that the well-stated objectives can even be more fitting by taking the good lessons of relevance and thus validity from the TVET curricula.

St. Mary’s University College should keep on producing course materials that employ varieties of LCA.

St. Mary’s University College should keep on producing course materials that had a logical sequence that encourage learners.

The university college should make efforts towards interrelate the apprenticeship learning opportunities to the lessons in the material and in fact towards the follow up of the implementation.
The university college students have an amazing level of appreciation to their university college; they want it to facilitate extra curricula activities for learners by getting a playing ground.

Course developers of the university college need to carry out an in-depth analysis on the materials under use for further step up in the quality of their training provision through up coming review of the materials by close comparison of them with the TVET curricula. The validity, significance, comprehensiveness and relevance of contents shall be the focus of both investigations by instructors and the review activity.

The university college while conducting further review activities should facilitate conditions in which course material preparation be team works.

Reference


Marton, F. and Salijo, R. (1976) On Qualitative differences, outcomes and process, I and II. British Journal of Educational Psychology.


Acknowledgements

I am very much indebted to those staff members of IDE who showed me their honest professional and invaluable information. A special gratitude goes to the College boys who made themselves to an inspiring focus group discussion with me. I am also indebted to two of my Colleagues in Institute of Distance Education in Ethiopian Civil Service College: Ato Alemayehu Seberu and Ato Tewodros Gizachew for their invaluable comments and encouragement. Lastly, I am also very grateful to Ms Yimenashu Taye for her technical assistance.
**Topic:** Private colleges and leadership efficacy of TVET with particular reference to Tigray.

Presenter: Ato Nigus Kebedom  
Chairperson: Ato Dagnachew Yilma  
Rapporteur: Ato Wondu Haile

The presenter stated that the study investigated the efficacy of TVET leadership in managing private colleges in Tigray. It specifically addresses the following questions.

- To what extent is the responsibility of TVET compatible to its institutional capacity?
- How skilled are TVET officials (conceptual, human and technical)?
- What is the effect of TVET leadership on the organizational climate of privatel colleges?

The presenter stated four of the 27 Private colleges in Tigray were used as subjects of this study. In addition, 10 TVET officials and 40 instructors form the four private colleges (10 from each) were used. The colleges were Sheba information and Technical College, new millennium colleges, Hashenge College and Greenwich College, which were selected on random sampling technique.

The data collected through document were analyzed using mean, standard deviation and T-test. As a result, the following major summaries were made.

- There was inadequate supervision support to private colleges.
- TVET programs which demand technical skills were found to be unsuccessfully performed.
- The current TVET organizational structure perceived to be defective to manage private Colleges; besides, TVET and private colleges had no clearly defined intentions.
- TVET programs were found to have negative impact in the existing organizational climate of private colleges.
- TVET program trainees were found to be less capable in performing tasks, which demand conceptual skill.
- TVET programmes didn’t encourage private colleges to assume responsibilities. Thus, it seems to misunderstand that management is all about working with and through people or institutions.
- It is reported that there was not even short term training which enables the delegated officials lead private colleges in the region except the hand book (guide line) published in 1996 after most of the colleges come in to being.
- TVET had no skill and insight in educational strategic planning as a result of which one can’t expect substantive contribution by TVET.

Recommendation made:

- Periodic evaluation of TVET officials and private colleges should be made.
- TVET’s supervision should target on supportive measures and change to inbuilt supervision system.
- Adequacy of internal environment is decisive for any organization. Therefore, private Colleges leadership should work hard for open climate and attract outside support.
- Private colleges should balance income and quality service provision. In addition to this, collaborative work with others and strengthening their relations through festivals, sport, forums and others, should be given due attention.
- In assigning personnel, focus should be made on fields like educational leadership
- To maintain and improve managerial skills of TVET, TREB should set standards and establish procedures to assess effectiveness as well as and provide appropriate support, such as periodic evaluation, and in service training program.
Decisions regarding TVET programmes should be made in consultation with all the private stakeholders.

**Discussion**

A question of how to formulate standard for TVET while the program lacks different skills was raised, possible answer suggested by the presenter for this question was the need to collaboratively work with the private sector in this regard.

**Topic:** Perceptons of Public Educators about the Education and training provided by private college in Tigray.

Presenter: Ato Gebrekidan W/ Gebereal  
Chair Person: Dr. Kebede Yadete  
Rapporteur: Ato Wondu Haile

The presenter stated the following as objective of his study.
- Investigation of how private colleges had been viewed by the public education sector.

The presenter indicated that the subjects of his study are education officials, employees of private and public colleges and trainees in public and private colleges. It was stated that purposive and random sampling technique were used to select the subjects of for the study. The data was then analyzed using descriptive survey method.

- Private colleges enroll a large proportion of older students between 28-35 ages as compared to the public colleges.
- Teachers’ qualification is first degree and above in both private and public colleges except in the health education institutions, where 50% of them are diploma holders.
- The views of public educators towards the quality of Education provided by private Higher Education Institutions seem suspicious. They feel that grading is unfair and inflated, there is an admission and standard problem, and they feel that the private colleges focus on profile and attracting customers with out bothering about the quality of education.

On the other hand, respondents from private colleges’ staff and administrated the root causes for public educators distrust on private colleges suggested competition to share the scarce resources of the communities as one cause for public educators distrust on private colleges.

Recommendations made

- To support quality higher education, it necessary to mobilize educational resources from the various providers of adult learning opportunities such as the private higher education institutions;
- To realize greater private sector participation as businesses organizations;
- Strategies that meet the capacity and needs of potential beneficiaries should be developed by the regional education bureau;
- In designing training programs for adult learners of higher education, the need for better coordination of higher learning courses calls for wholehearted efforts;
- To minimize duplication of efforts in resource contribution, there is an urgent need for education officials and experts indifferent levels of the region to facilitate transparency and information flow among the relevant local government authorities, the concerned private investors and the intended beneficiaries adults, business and industry, and the community at large;
- Educational administrators should establish and strengthen a TVET counsel and occasionally organize conferences and symposia;
- The regional TVET commission (education bureau have to be based, as they should be, upon continual onsite visits to the private colleges, or establish a standardized quality control mechanism);

- The private colleges shall also consider their profit motive as the very strength of their existence and growth.

Due attention should be given by the private colleges to continue to capitalize upon flexibility and ability to respond quickly to adults educational and market oriented training needs.

Discussion

After the presentation, the floor was opened for discussion. A comment was suggested that the conclusion lacks balance. The person who suggested that in the conclusion public educators blame the private colleges for making profit, in the other hand, the recommendation that states that private colleges should strengthen their motive of making profit. He inquired if this doesn’t contradict.

The presenter responded as there is no contradiction and the conclusion states that private sectors should keep on striving to make reasonable profits considering the quality of training they provide.

In the conclusion, it was stated that the mistrust of public Education Institutions on the quality of education provided by private higher education institutions partially stems from the fact that private higher education institutions are profit making institutions. On the other hand, in the recommendation it was recommended for private colleges to strengthen their motive of profit for existence and growth. Doesn’t this contradict?
**Topic:** Partnership between Public and Private HEIs in Ethiopia: Some Key Policy Options.

**Presenter:** Ato Hailelel Zeleke  
**Chairperson:** Ato Getnet Tizazu  
**Rapporteur:** Ato Amha Tesfay

The objective of the paper is to identify the policy options for public and private higher education institutions (HEIs) partnership that help to create shared vision and responsibility among higher education institutions so that they can jointly work to provide quality education. It specifically prioritizes the responsibility of the government in establishing and sustaining the partnership. It underlined the significance of the development of team spirit, sense of affiliation and togetherness amongst the HEIs in providing quality and relevant education.

**The following were recommendations suggested in the presentation**

- The government should provide the private HEIs incentives of soft and long term loans with low interest rate for constructing self owned campuses and purchasing facilities.  
- The government should allow the private HEIs to get international support.  
- The government, together with the stakeholders, should develop criteria to access government incentives.  
- The government should create equal recruitment opportunity to graduates of both public and private higher education institutions.  
- The government should introduce special educational tax and exempt tax on imported goods.  
- There should be broad based ownership of private HEIs.
Questions raised during the discussion and possible answers forwarded.

Q1- How could government’s incentive to acquire land be taken as important area of partnership? Isn’t it possible to have partnership while the PHEIs are in a rented house?
A: - It is clear that there are PHEIS that contribute a lot without having their own campuses. But the point is they could contribute more had they own campuses. This is not the major criteria for the partnership, but it is one of the partnership points that were identified by a national study group.

Q2- You argued that 19.5% of the international support should go to PHEIs. But where do you get the figure? International support is owned and governed by foreigners, so is it possible for the government to intervene in this regard?
A: The figure is identified by a national study group where I am a member. The international supports for education like scholarships and research funds are being processed by the Ministry of education, so the government has a say in this regard.

Q3- Nowadays the public HEIs are expanding, so how are the private HEIs going to increase the number of new students?
A: I share the concern, and I think it needs separate study. And there are different opinions among the leaders of the PHEIs in this regard. However, I think that what pays at the end of the day is the quality of the service they deliver. If they manage to deliver quality education they can succeed.

Title: “The Relationship between Private Institutions of Higher Learning and Banking Industry”.

Presenters: Ato Tiruneh Legesse and Ato Zenegaw Abiy who are lecturers at St. Mary’s University College.
Chairperson: Ato Melaku Girma
Rapporteur: Ato Tekalign Zewdie
The study reviewed the relationship between the banking industry and the PHEls on the objective of assessing the level of co-operation between the banking industry and the PHEls. The justifications for the study include enhancing the level of cooperation of the banking industry and privte Higher Education institutions as well as gear the contents of courses of higher Education institutions towards the needs and practices of the banking industry among others.

The researchers have used different research methodologies. Open-ended and closed-ended questionnaires were dispatched to eight banks and ten PHEls.

**Results of the analysis:**

- The cooperation between banks and HEIs was found to be very weak. They have no collaboration.
- There is mismatch between the actual classroom learning (e.g. skills, knowledge) and that which is needed in employment.
- There is less research output from the academia since it is difficult to identify research topics from banks.
- Banks do not have scheme of sponsoring research topics (from educational institutions).
- Employees of the banks do not have access or chance to conduct research in their area.
- No cooperation between banks and PHEls was found with regard to ‘teaching-learning process.
- Unfair treatment (public and private graduates) during employment was noted. Thus, banks don’t like to employ from PHEIs. They (banks) pointed out that they had their own mechanism to screen the job placement.
In general, the level of collaboration in research, teaching-learning process, consultancy, service, internship and employment of PHEIs’ graduates was found to be minimal.

**Recommendation**

The study recommended on the need to strengthen the minimal cooperation between the banking industry and the private higher education institutions with respect to:

- Research and consultancy;
- Teaching-learning process;
- Employment;

**Raised and answers questions in the discussion time:**

Q1. Your subjects are only four banks. You then said, “80% of the respondents…” Don’t you think that your conclusion is shallow because few subjects were treated?

A1. We agreed that our samples are few, only four banks. We set ten banks as a subject but half of them responded for our questions. It should be recalled that we had open-ended and closed-ended questionnaires in addition to that of our observation.

Q2. You said graduates of PHEIs faced discrimination from banks during employment. I think this holds true not only in the banking industry but also in other sectors. What could be the case?

A2. It’s clear that there is a negative attitude towards graduates of PHEIs from different sectors. They believe that PHEIs motive is profit and because of this they feel that there is no quality education.
The other point is that when students join private college, they have less points/ scores and couldn’t enter Government College and universities. However, the reality for example at SMUC is that instructors exert their energy to provide proper lesson that could serve for the students’ future career to be competent in the labour market.

Q3. To what extent did you get your subjects to fill the questionnaire as long as they are far from the curriculum preparation? In relation to this, have you used qualitative method in your study?

A3. Concerning banks, we dispatched the questionnaire, to the public relation officers presuming that they could have access for any information in the banks. In the case of HEls, we also dispatched the questionnaire to the top management like Academic Dean’s Offices. As a result we got the information we needed.

**Topic:** Cross – Border Provision HE: Challenges and Opportunities for PHEIs in Ethiopia.

**Presenter:** Bob Campbell (Dr.)

**Chair Person:** Ato Dagnachew Yilma

**Rapporteur:** Tefera Belachew.

Today, there is a great need of higher education for Ethiopia by the public and private sectors. When we look unto the expansion of these sectors, the statistics is quite impressive.

The number of the young people who seek higher education is modest when compared to African countries, and minace compared to European nations.

Education is international in its character hitherto. Many Ethiopian professionals studied abroad, and work in different areas. The practices of international education had been
established long ago in these countries. Higher education thus, is international and it falls into many dimensions.

The development of both IT and transportation infrastructure, and the proliferation of methods and means have helped the overseas educator to customize the business global strategy to education, and to become franchisers. Thus cross-border provision of higher education has become a reality.

The distance between the location of the awarding institution and the country where the student resides is no longer a problem.

The need of governments to improve their workforce as a whole served as a pull-factor to cross-border provision of higher education. However, some are highly commercial while others are mission oriented.

These cross-border providers outreach through partnerships and consortium or virtual reality systems. It may have small office somewhere or an extension to other university.

The franchisers provision allowed the institutions in other countries to offer the courses. Some even allow students, to study at different university at the same time, in different area, and confer two degrees.

As to the short menu of cross boarder education this may satisfy us. However our concern here is quality, standards, relevance, recognition, accreditation, longevity and fees.

Along with the questions of quality there are still the unsolved riddles of acceptance. In some countries the quality assurance agency restricts institutions on the ground that some of the courses are insignificant to their environment (example South Africa).
Although, most cross-border providers of education charge higher fee, they have
evenience, and are qualified and reputed institutions.

However the question to regulate, detect and audit these institutions requires a connoisseur
in the are. Thus cross-Border must enhance higher quality.

At times some are seen giving a marginal cost, and may work towards damaging the
viability, acceptance, and established reputation of PHEIs.

In general, to solve some problems, the local private sector must provide services to the
cross-border providers, and through alliances or partnerships be able to tap the curriculum
development activities plus expertise.

On the other hand, there is no reason why the Ethiopian private higher institutions should
not go cross-border.

At the end of the presentation questions about massification of education in the African
and European context, and quality standard in the given African predicament were raised
and discussed.

**Topic:** The impact of Instructor student relationships on students’ Learning. The case of
SMUC and AAUCC

**Presenter:** Ato Aderajew Mihiiret

**Chairperson:** Dr. Kebede Yadeta

**Rapporteur:** Ato Wondu Haile

The following were the rational for the study. The importance of instructor student
relationship in the teaching learning process. This can be explained by the fact that an
instructor does not teach apart from what he/she feels toward a particular student. Nor do students learn as though they were receiving his information from a teaching machine.

- If the relationship is positive, there exists an enabling environment for the teaching learning process. If, on the other hand, the relationship is negative, it is considered as a barrier for the teaching-learning process.

The research was carried out on the basis of the following objectives.

- Explore the nature of relationships existing between instructors and students,
- Identify the factors influencing the relationships to be established.
- Assess the professional distance maintained by the instructors in both institutions,
- Analyze the impact of existing relationships on students’ learning

- The instrument used to collect data for the study was questionnaire for two sample groups of students and instructors.
- The subjects were 115 graduating class students from SMUC and 135 from AAUCC, taken arbitrarily and are selected randomly. Furthermore, 40 senior instructors, 20 from each institution took part in the study.
- The data gathered was categorized in line with students’ program and division of study. The data obtained from instructor’s response was compared to measure their awareness.

The following conclusions were drawn form the study.

- Large number of female students from the two institutions seemed to interact positively with their instructors in the classroom.
- Based on program of study, degree students of SMUC seemed to have good relationships with their instructors inside the classroom.
- Based on division of study regular student’s of SMUC seemed to have very good relationship inside the classroom with their instructors.

- With regard to students’ relations outside the classroom, except for SMUC male students who make use of their instructors’ office hour, large numbers of female students of both institutions and male students of AAUCC don’t use their instructors office hour.

- Regular students of both institutions seemed to miss advantages of clubs and extracurricular activities.

- On student’s interest to learning, both sexes of the two institutions seemed to attend classes regularly and arrive on times for classes.

**Recommendations forwarded**

- Female students should be encouraged to ask questions and participate in classroom discussion.

- Students should be motivated to challenge their instructors in their lessons.

- Students at regular division in AAUCC should be given guidance on how to evaluate their instructor’s performance in their teaching.

- Students of both institutions should be given orientation on the rules and regulations of the university (college).

- Students should be awarded for using their instructors office hours for consultation purpose.

- Instructors should keep professional distances to effectively function in the teaching-learning process.
**Topic:** An Evaluation of the Implementation of Continuous Assessment (CA): The case of St. Mary's University College.

Presenter: Ato Bekalu Atnafu,  
Chairperson: Ato Derese Endeshaw  
Rapporteur: Ato Habtamu Lemma

In the presentation it was stated that proper implementation of continuous assessment enables both teachers and students to gain continuous feedback on progress in student achievement and effectiveness of assessment tools used. Since CA is a natural way of assessment, it increases motivation and reduces stress on the part of students.

A number of CA tools were reviewed in the study. Tests, assignments, exam(s), portfolio preparation, peer and self assessment, interview, questioning, and observation field work, were some of them.

In light of the above facts, the research tried to evaluate how far instructors at SMUC employ CA. To this end, 40 instructors from various departments were given questionnaires and department heads were interviewed. In addition, St. Mary's assessment guideline and mark lists as well as grade reports were also consulted.

The analysis of data revealed useful results. Most of the instructors at SMUC seem to have a good awareness of CA, a result which contrasts with the finding of a research conducted at AAU. All instructors have also indicated that they used variety of CA tools. However, results obtained through document analysis indicated that instructors used two or three types of assessment tools, which makes it difficult to conclude that CA is well-practiced.

The research also tried to look into factors that hamper instructors from using CA tools. Some of the reasons were found to be large class size, tight schedule, shortage of time, lack
of commitment, on the part of teachers, broad course contents and the like. Because of these, the presenter concluded, instructors resort to the traditional way of assessment.

Following the presentation, a number of questions were raised by participants of the panel. Some of the questions forwarded for the presenter were:

1. What do you recommend so that instructors use variety of CA tools effectively?
2. Can all of the tools of CA be used for distance learners?
3. Have you looked into instructors' lack of skill to design assessment tools?
4. You have said that instructors at AAU lack awareness of CA. Does it mean that AAU instructors don't use CA?

The presenter briefly reacted to the above questions. He said that making class size manageable could curb many problems and encourage instructors to employ variety of CA tools. Regarding the practicality of using CA tools in distance education, the presenter explained the enormous contribution; CA may have, to quality in distance education. Although the research doesn't address distance learners, he said, CA tools that fit them could be designed and put to use. If there is the commitment, it is possible. He also said lack of skills on designing CA tools is not within the scope of this research. In the same way AAU instructors practices on CA, is out of the scope of this research, but a recent study has revealed that the instructors lack awareness about CA.

**Topic:** An Investigation of the Major Causes of Student Attrition in St. Mary's University College

**Presenter:** Ato Kassahun Habtamu
**Chairperson:** Ato Deresse Endeshaw
**Rapporteur:** Ato Habtamu Lemma
The presenter noted that in higher education institutions of countries like Ethiopia, where resources are scarce, and student attrition should be closely looked into, reducing attrition rate may have its own implication for quality of education.

A number of causes of attrition were indicated by the researcher. Among the causes were lack of interaction skills, college policy and system problems, the nature of the curricula used, lack of access to information and resources, family problems, unhealthy sexual relationships and the like. Each of the factors may affect students’ academic performance which in turn leads to high attrition rate. Other local studies showed that student anxiety, health problems and new teaching styles adopted in higher institutions, could be causes of attrition.

In light of the above findings, the presenter tried to investigate and analyze the true causes of student attrition at SMUC. Questionnaire was used to gather data from students, and interviews were held with the Registrar’s, Student Affair’s and Guidance Office heads. In addition, SMUC’s students statistics bulletin, and letters dispatched to departments form the Academic Dean were consulted.

The data was then analyzed and interpreted. As the result of the analysis reveals, attrition rate in the university college was found to be increasing from time to time.

Result of the interview held with the aforementioned office holders on the other hand showed the following to be frequent causes of student attrition:

- unstable working condition at the students’ work place;
- financial problems;
- family problems;
- maternity cases;
- going to Arab countries;
- transfer to other colleges for better grades, etc.
Similarly, analysis of data obtained through questionnaire designed to students revealed the following causes of attrition:

- lack of competence;
- lack of information;
- lack of note-taking and study skills;
- poor academic performance;
- financial problems;
- long distance between work and residence areas on the one hand and the university college on the other hand;
- lack of co-operation at work place (in case of extension students);
- low self concept;
- drug and gambling
- Absenteeism, etc.

Finally, the presenter recommended the management to design flexible system that will enable the university college to address students’ problems; organize and improve the counseling service rendered; assess its grading policy and give training on note-taking and study skills.

Following the presentation, questions and comments were forwarded by the participants

As one participant commented dealing with causes of attrition for males and females separately would have revealed interesting results.

Apart from the causes of attrition listed above, participants also mentioned peer pressure, sexual relationship and negative role of the media to be major causes of attrition. Others also felt that instructors handling of students could be a major cause of attrition. Poor student performance, another participant said, can’t be a cause of attrition. Rather, it
should be considered as an effect. He also suggested that it would be very interesting if the research addressed the underlining factors responsible for low academic performance.

According to another participant, the causes of attrition like maternity cases, long distance from work or residence areas to the university college, financial problems and problems associated with the students job can’t be solved by guidance and counseling.

The presenter reacted adequately to the questions, suggestions and comments raised by participants. He said, although some of the student problems that lead to attrition may not be solved by guidance and counseling, those related to psychological and social variables can effectively be addressed. Besides, students rated lack of proper guidance and counseling as a major factor for attrition.

He also said that all the possible causes of attrition cannot be included in one research and only major causes are included. As to the part instructors may have on student attrition, the presenter said, that was not a major focus of the study and according to the students’ response; instructors’ role in this regard was found to be insignificant.

**Topic:** Improvement of Students’ Academic Performance by Teachers – a new Approach.

**Presenter:** Mr. Ogbu Okonkowo Jeremiah  
**Chairperson:** Ato Getnet Tizazu  
**Rapporteur:** Ato Amha Tesfay

The objective of the paper was to demonstrate the role of education in changing the behaviour of students. It asserts that learning is an important tool to accomplish the objectives of education. Thus, the paper assesses different factors that are associated with effective learning.
The presenter recommended that teachers need to use different strategies to cope up with the multi-dimensional personalities of pupils.

**Question Raised:**

Q- Your title is all about a new approach, so where is your new approach?

**Answer for the following question raised.**

A-: The thing is society wants students to acquire good knowledge; this indirectly forces them to bother only about the acquisition of certificates. The teachers should impart practical knowledge to their students. Students should understand the fact that mere acquisition of certificates doesn’t help them.

**Title:** - Personal reflection on the importance of continuing professional development for teaching staff in Private Higher Education Institutions.

**Presenter:** Catherine Kiddle  
**Chairperson:** Ato Fikadu Begna  
**Rapporteur:** Ato Dagnachew Asrat

The fifth National Conference on PHEI in Ethiopia was officially opened by the welcoming and opening speeches made by Assistant Professor Wondwosen Tamirat, president of St. Mary’s University College and the guest of honor, H.E. Dr. Sintayehu W/Michael, Minster of Education respectively. Following the speeches, Ato Dagnachew Yilma, Chairperson and Managing Board of Ethiopia private Higher Education Institutions’ Association, has made a key note address to participants.

As per the program, since the first chunk of the morning session is set for plenary presentations, the facilitator of the program has called upon the chairperson (for the plenary
presentations) Dr. Eyayu Leuleseged and Rapporteur Selamawit Negassie to the podium. The Chairperson, in turn, called upon the three presenters, Dr. Teshome Yizengaw (on Government policies and institutional responsibilities of PHEIs in Ethiopia), Dr. Tesfaye Teshome (on institutional self evaluation (ISE): pre-requisite for external quality audit), and Professor Kate Ashcroft (on public private partnership in Ethiopia Higher Education. An analysis of the support the private sector needs, to present their presentation within the time allotted to them.

Following the presentations, a discussion session was undergone. Accordingly, questions were forwarded to the presenters who, in turn, have addressed all the questions meticulously.

After the tea break, the second portion of the conference, i.e. panel discussion were conducted in four different conference rooms on four different titles, namely, Improvement of Students’ Academic Performance by Teachers -A New Approach (by OgbU Okonkwo Jeremiah), Personal Reflections on the Importance of Continuing Professional Development for Teaching Staff in Private Higher Education Institutions (by Catherine Kiddle) – the panel on which this report was prepared, Student Engagement in Some Ethiopian Private Higher Education Institution (by Dr. Dawit Mekonnen), and “An Assessment of the Practicum as Professional Development Among Private Higher Institution in Tigray” (by Banti Meselu).

The following is, therefore, a report on the panel discussion held in conference Room 2. The theme of this panel discussion was personal reflections on the importance of continuing professional development for teaching staff in private higher education institutions.

The panel was opened following the opening speech by Ao Tedla Haile, Academic Dean at St. Mary’s University College. After having declared the opening of the panel, he called upon the chairperson, the presenter and the Rapporteur to come to the podium and conduct
the panel discussion. Accordingly, the chairperson, after having introduced the academic credentials and experience of the panelist, Catherine Kiddle, to participants, he availed the panelist and participants with a forum for discussion.

**Caption:**

Catherine Kiddle paper addresses a reflective journey she had made as a teacher, a trainer and a researcher in Distance Learning, Independent Learning and Teacher Education in England and Ethiopia. It covers a period of almost 30 years. At the beginning of her career, she was a teacher of English and cultural studies in Secondary school, Art College and as a tutor for the Open University. But in mid 1970’s she moved into what is called as Traveler Education in England. What is meant by Traveler Education, she explains, is an education given to “Travelers”, the Gypsies, Circus Groups and Fairground Families who lend nomadic or semi-nomadic lives.

The panelist tried to compare and contrast the “Travelers” of England, who follow various ways of life and operating businesses that make it mandatory for their families to move regularly from place to place, with nomadic pastoralist of Ethiopia.

She went on to explain who these Travelers are and the mode of life they lead. The Gypsies (people from Northern India), for instance, maintain a nomadic way of life as they live in trailer caravans pulled by vehicles and supply goods and services to local communities around the country. The circus group, on the other hand, run businesses that travel from place to place presenting shows in a large tent called a Big Top. The show, often, consists of highly skilled acts of juggling, acrobatics, wire walking, clowning and so on. In the case of the Fairground Families, they travel together with mechanical rides accompanied by entertainment stalls and various types of amusements. At every single place they stop, she explained, they build up the fair in a town or village and open it for a week or so. Then they take it down and move on to the next place.
As the Gypsies, the circus groups and fairground families do not have a settled life and live in caravans, their children do not readily get access to education. For one thing, she said, they come as outsiders or strangers to local communities and seen with suspicion by local community who has a settled life. For the other, the very fact of mobility and traveling makes school attendance and continuity very difficult, if not impossible.

She underlines that a way out has to be sought to the address the difficulty. Accordingly, “Traveler” education was put in place and most counties in England have a traveler education within the local authority.

Her study revolves on case study conducted on one of these Travelers-the Fairground people. She has figured out their particular traveling pattern, and educational problems they caused as factors that triggered her to conduct the research.

In her research, she discovered that the only regular schooling their children had was the three months time during which they settle at their winter quarters when they park their caravans and vehicles in yards. She had also inquired as to whether their children get education during the traveling season. Some responded that their children had no schooling at all as they helped with their family businesses. Others responded that they send their children to school in towns where they stayed for as long as two weeks. Yet others have responded that they have sent their children to schools in every place they stopped. One or two rich families sent the children to boarding school even though they didn’t like it because they don’t want the children being far away from home.

Overall, she reiterated, none of the parents were satisfied with the situation as the only education they regard as real education was the winter education.

In her interview with the head teachers of the base schools in which the children attended, she had learned that the teachers do not have the faintest idea about what has happened to these children, why they leave schools around Easter time, and similar matters.
What the researcher had grasped from her case study was, she remarked, the needs of this group of children. She had also learned that it is imperative to bridge the communication gap between the base schools’ teachers and the families and set up an education system that would give the children some continuity of learning during their traveling season.

To this effect, a distance learning scheme, which was unusual at the time in England to be tried with school-aged children, was sought to be a logical solution for the problem. Accordingly, the traveler education service would work with the base school teachers during the winter months to prepare understandable, relevant, and engaging materials that would cover the work that the rest of the class would be doing in school while the fairground children were away. These packs of materials would be handed out to those children at the beginning of their traveling season.

For this scheme to be effective, she remarked, the concerted effort of the Traveler Education Service, the school staff, the parents, and the children is of paramount importance.

When she came back to Ethiopia, she discovered that distance learning was well established in some Private Higher Education Institutions, including St. Mary’s University College unlike the distance learning for adults in Ethiopia who have reasonable degree of motivation, literacy skill and capacity to be an independent learner, they had to deal with children who had the minimum of motivation, literacy, and capacity to be an independent learner.

In order to tackle those problems, they (the panelist and her team of teachers) had devised such mechanisms as including puzzles and games as supplementary activities and providing them with tapes and videos. On top of this, as feedbacks are very important to foster such endeavors, she organized her team of teachers to visit the children on fair grounds to give them support in spite of the difficulty to do this regularly.
Despite their endeavors, she remarked, they learned that this did not prepare the children to be an independent learner as the teacher was regarded as constant reference for the class. The children didn’t know how to organize themselves or how to approach their work in the absence of a teacher.

According to panelist, if children are to become independent learners, they should be taught how to learn the process. To this effect, she underlined, active learning and student centered teaching methodologies have to be put in place. Rather than teaching facts, teachers should show students how to find facts. Teachers have to equip students with practical skills that would enable them solve problems using their own way.

She has also underscored the role of self-assessment as a very important input for developing independent learning. This can be done, according to the panelist, by letting student put themselves to such important queries as ‘Did I find a solution to the task?’ ‘What were my difficulties?’, ‘how could I get over those difficulties?’, ‘what were the steps I took to reach the solution?’, ‘could have I done it more quickly/easily/efficiently another way?’ ‘What have I learned from this?’ ‘How will I change my approach next time?’ such questions, undoubtedly, she stressed, would improve the students’ ability to have deep insights into their person and then assess their own weaknesses and strengths.

When she came to Ethiopia, in 2002, to work with the Ministry of Education, she discovered that the teaching methodology in schools, colleges and universities was, to her dismay, very much teacher-centered and the lecture method was the commonest form of teaching.

The then Minister of Education, W/o Genet Zewude, was aspiring to bring about a paradigm shift from the lecture method to student-centered teaching methodology and hence develop the problem solving capacity of students.
Thus, her work in Ethiopia on Higher Diploma Program (HDP), the English Language Improvement Programme (ELIP), Continuous Professional Development Programmes (CPD) were geared towards encouraging active learning and student centered approaches by teachers in schools, universities, and on teacher education courses.

With regard to distance learning, in order to achieve success in distance learning, she emphasized, it is highly imperative both for adults and children to be an independent and capable learner. For this to be realized, she recommended that the staffs in higher education institutions have to be given opportunities to be trained continuously as they were not themselves taught how to be independent learners when they were at school.

The last but not the least point she had raised relates to the factors that determine the success rate of any institution that run distance learning. Accordingly, an institution, such as St. Mary’s University College which runs a large number of distance learning courses, can succeed in reaching out the mass with distance learning, she remarked, only when; It manages to prepare and present materials, that have clear instruction and layout;

1. Effective distribution system is put in place;
2. Feedback and tutorial sessions are provided on a regular basis; and
3. The capacity of students to become independent learners is somehow enhanced.

Finally, the panelist recapitulated her presentation by underlining the existence a dynamic relationship between distance learning, independent learning, and teacher education and the overriding need to continue professional development in Higher Education Institutions. She has also remarked that there needs to be continuous discussions/conferences between colleges as it will foster development which in turn will lead to the assurance of greater quality in all departments.

With this, Miss Catherine Kiddle’s presentation came to an end. Following her presentation, the chairperson opened a forum for questions and answers.
Accordingly, the following questions were forwarded to the panelist and she responded to each questions in style:

**Question 1**

Why is it that the Gypsies move from place to place? Is it their philosophy of life?

As to why Gypsies move from place to place, their reasons are, she replied, basically attributable to their mode of life and stereotyped prejudices perpetrated against them by people who have settled life. As I have tried to state earlier, she said, they live on buying and reselling different items by moving from place to place.

**Question 2**

Do you think it is possible to implement active learning and independent learning in Ethiopian context, in particular with regard to nomadic people? In her reply to this question, she remarked that as mobile school is a possibility in Ethiopia too, and distance learning has long been put in place, it is possible to implement independent learning. With regard to active learning, once the staffs in higher education institutions are availed with necessary training, on a continuous basis, active learning can also be implemented.

Another participant had asked the panelist to impart her success history in relation to her journey which covers a period of 30 years to participants.

The panelist replied stating that her success is to be measured in generation. Accordingly, she believes that she has seen a steady increase in the access for these peoples’ children to primary and secondary education. She has also witnessed an attitudinal change on the families of these children and those who lead a settled life. This is, she exclaimed, a success for her.
The same participant has put another question to her by questioning the possibility of creating an effective independent learner in an extremely crowded and poorly resourced environment. The panelist stated her strong belief in the possibility of creating an effective independent learner even under such circumstance as the best resource any one can have is, she said, human resource. In fact, she hasn’t disregarded the importance of other resources but human resource is, in her opinion, far more important than other material resources.

The last question that was put to her relates to the attitude of students. The participant stated that some students want the certificate only at any cost. Thus, how do you think, continued the participant, it is possible to bring about attitude change. The response of the panelist was short and precise. Students should know the reason why they are in schools (college); it is not for their own self development rather it is for the good of the public at large. Thus, it is imperative that they are enabled to know the reasons why they are learning.

**Topic:** An Assessment of the Practicum as a Professional Development among Private Higher Education Institutions in Tigray.

Presenter: Banti Meselu  
Chairperson: Goitom Abraham  
Rapporteur: Kidist Mulugeta

One if the objective of the study was to evaluate the contribution of practicum in professional development of trainees.

In the study;

- organizational structures and implementation approaches employed for practices,  
- perception of the trainees and trainers on the program; and,
• Views of stakeholders about the effectiveness of the program were given due attention. To this end, four private colleges in Mekele were taken as a sample and were assessed.

The presenter used both primary and secondary data’s in analyzing the facts and framing the problems encountered by the institutions while undertaking practicum programs.

The research output shows that

• The institutions did not give due attention to the program. Besides the practicum program is not carried out by a separate department/office, it is rather incorporated within continued or distance education program division.
• Trainees’ placement appeared fairly disorganized due to poor linkage between the woreda educational bureaus, the schools and the institutions.
• Trainees were not supported well to develop their skills due to limited school visit by supervisors.
• There is lack of follow up discussion after the practicum among others.

Finally, the presenter forwarded some recommendations to make the practicum more valuable as follows:

• The practicum sessions should be shorter; instead of taking one year it should at least be given within half a semester;
• The institutions should be supported by the regional educational bureaus and the woreda education offices;
• The link between the institutions and the schools should be strengthened;
• The institutions should reform their organizational structure and establish a separate department for running the program;
• The practicum program should be integrated with the rest of the curriculum in the institutions.

Despite some limitations, the study mentioned the positive advantages students gained from the program.

The following questions were raised by participants of the conference.

Q1 - How do you think the new government policy on teachers education on private colleges affect the practicum program?

A1 - This question should not be forwarded to me; it is beyond the scope of my paper. And the presenter forwarded the question to be discussed by participants (the presenter). One of the participants, who didn’t want his name to be mentioned, commented that the rational for prohibiting private higher education institutions not to train teachers must be clearly stated by the government. In a situation where the country needs more institutions to train teachers, I personally don’t think that it is appropriate to issue such a policy. We must know the rationales first.

Q2 - It is known that the regional educational bureaus are involved and play a significant role in the practicum program; did your study tries to investigate in the role of these organs in the practicum programme.

A2 - No, due to time and financial constraint the presenter was unable to include these stakeholders in the study.

Q3 - In your presentation you have mentioned that there is no discussion after the students finished the practicum program. Don’t you see one of the practicum phases, reflection, as a way of discussion?

A3 - I meant to say, after the students finished the one year practicum program, the third year program will begin and there is no any discussion on the program. In other
words, there is no linkage between the courses given at third year level and the practicum. It should rather be integrated throughout the courses.

Q4- When you recommend that the institutions should reform their organizational structure and establish an independent practicum department/office, did you take into consideration the number of students in the colleges and financial capacities of the institutions?

A4 – Well, in the current teachers training package more emphasis is given to practicum program. So separate department should be established and resource should be allocated to make the program effective as per the National Curriculum Guide.

Q5- When you assess the practice of practicum in the four private colleges, did you find out any variation on the problems encountered by the colleges? Is the degree of the problem the same in all sample institutions?

A5-. In my study, I hardly found any variation in this regard.

Q6- Can you comment on the in-out-in practicum model, which is practiced in Tigray and Amhara with block-out model practiced in other areas?

A6- As I have mentioned in my presentation the in-out-in program is criticized for taking too much time (one year), which is too costly for the students. It should have been at least reduced to half a semester.

Comment

In the discussion session, it was commented that the researcher should have included other stakeholders of the practicum programme in the study. This would give a fuller picture of the overall evaluation.
**Topic:** Developing Learner-Centered Instructional Materials- the Experience of St. Mary’s University College

**Presenter:** Desalegn Sherkabu  
**Chairperson:** Deress Endeshaw  
**Rapporteur:** Habtamu Lemma

There is a growing concern, from school teachers to MoE officials, about the quality of education in our country. One area of evaluating the quality of education is to see if the curriculum and instructional materials are well-prepared and up to standard.

According to the literature, learner-centered materials should be two way and friendly. They should also make learners active and encourage them to probe deep.

In light of this, the researcher tried to look into the practices of St. Mary's University College in preparing learner-centered instructional materials for TVET (10+2) learners.

Data was collected through interview and focus group discussions with the trainees and trainers. Sample course materials were also analyzed.

Analysis of data showed valuable results. The materials were found to have clearly stated objectives, well-set notes and questions at intervals which facilitate the interaction of learners with the materials, rather than encouraging rote memorization. On top of that, caution was taken to present lessons from simple to complex and from general to specific. Students have found the materials friendly, enjoyable and easy understand. However, they said that they were not able to benefit from the apprenticeship program. Too few copies of the materials was also mentioned as a problem.

Finally, some of the recommendations of the study are:
- further in-depth analysis of the materials is needed to continuously improve the validity, significance, comprehensiveness and relevance of contents.
- close assistance to students during apprenticeship and making it part and parcel of the written curriculum.
- reduce the relative dependence on individual efforts to complete tasks and exercise.
Closing Remarks

Fifth National Conference on PHE (August 2007)
Wondwosen Tamirat (Asst. Prof)

Dear Guests and Participants
Ladies and Gentlemen

It is gratifying to see that we have been able to deliberate successfully on the major aspects, challenges and prospects of private higher education in Ethiopia. I feel that the various issues raised and discussed mainly focus on three major aspects that would determine the future growth and prospect of the sector. These are:

i. Private institutions need to develop a great sense of social responsibility that would help them win the proper respect from students, parents and the community at large;

ii. Institutions need to be concerned about ensuring their own quality and should make sure that they can fulfill national requirements and standards in this regard;

iii. There needs to be a strong private – public partnership scheme in Ethiopia whereby a substantial support is given to the private sector which is susceptible to possible dangers due to their excessive reliance on student tuition and fees.

I hope we shall all take these responsibilities and work towards ensuring that the growth of the private sector would continue unabated in the next millennium.

After a very long and undoubtedly successful day, please allow me to thank all who have contributed a great deal to the success of the conference. First and for most, I thank his Excellency Dr. Sintayehu W/Michael for opening the conference and sharing his precious
time with us. The Ministry’s concern and assistance will help the sector thrive, and is especially needed at a time when private institutions are currently facing a variety of challenges.

My thanks are also due to all paper presenters (local and international experts who have traveled thousands of miles), participants and discussants who have provided all the needed flesh for the all day deliberations.

The UN Conference Center staff and the Sheraton Addis Crew need also be thanked for their kind hospitality and assistance.

Last but not least, I thank all the St. Mary’s staff and faculty who have worked extensively to make this day a reality. As usual your efforts have been special. What other word is there other than to say that the University College loves and respects you all.

Thanking you all again and fervently hoping that we will still be relying on your future assistance, I now declare the conference closed.

Thank you for your attention.